



EUROPEAN COURT OF HUMAN RIGHTS
COUR EUROPÉENNE DES DROITS DE L'HOMME

Communicated on 28 August 2014

FIRST SECTION

Application no. 11421/13
Khamid Khatutovich KABARDOKOV and others against Russia
and 33 other applications
(see list appended)

STATEMENT OF FACTS

The applicants are 223 Russian nationals listed in Appendix 1. They live in various towns of the Republic of Kabardino-Balkaria.

The facts of the case, as submitted by the applicants, may be summarised as follows.

A. The circumstances of the case

The applicants were clean-up workers at the site of the Chernobyl nuclear plant accident. As a result they suffered from extensive exposure to radioactive emissions which later led to their disability.

In late 2010 the applicants lodged a complaint with the Nalchik Town Court of the Republic of Kabardino-Balkaria (“the Town Court”) against the Russian Ministry of Finance seeking compensation of non-pecuniary damage in the above connection.

In the period between January and April 2011 (see Appendix 2, column no. 2) the Town Court allowed the applicants’ claims in part and awarded the applicants compensations between 1,200,000 - 1,600,000 Russian roubles (approximately 25,000 - 33,000 euros) (see Appendix 3).

The judgments above have not been appealed against and became final and enforceable.

In the period between June and November 2011 the Department of the Federal Treasury Fund in the Republic of Kabardino-Balkaria (“the FTF”) on behalf of the Russian Ministry of Finance lodged an appeal with the Supreme Court of the Republic of Kabardino-Balkaria (“the Supreme Court

of Kabardino-Balkaria”) against the final judgments in the applicants’ favour through the Town Court (Appendix 2, column no. 2). They also requested that the statutory ten-day time-limit for lodging such an appeal against the judgments be restored.

In the same period (Appendix 2, column no. 3) the Town Court refused to restore the time-limit for appealing against the main judgments, stating that the FTF provided no valid reasons for missing it. The latter decisions were not appealed against and became final.

Meantime some of the applicants received the awarded compensations while the others were waiting (see Appendix 3).

In the period between July and November 2012 the FTF lodged an appeal with the Town Court against the previous refusals (Appendix 2, column no. 3). They also requested that the ten-day statutory time-limit for appealing against those decisions be restored on the grounds that their copies had not been forwarded to the FTF.

In the same period (Appendix 2, column no. 4) the Town Court ordered that the time-limit for appeal be extended on the grounds that there was no evidence that the FTF had received refusals in due course.

In the period between July and November 2012 the applicants appealed against the latter decisions before the Supreme Court of Kabardino-Balkaria on the grounds that according to the domestic law the court should forward a copy of its decision only to those parties, which were not present at the court hearings. However, according to the applicants, since the FTF’s representative participated in the proceedings, the court was not required to forward them a copy of the decision.

In the period between August and December 2012 (Appendix 2, column no. 4) the Supreme Court of Kabardino-Balkaria found that the Town Court lawfully extended the time-limits for appeals but held that the grounds for the extensions were incorrect. The Supreme Court of Kabardino-Balkaria in particular held that the Russian Ministry of Finance could not be said to have been duly represented in those proceedings as the transcript of a hearing did not provide the details regarding the power of attorney of Ms B., who had acted as a representative of the Russian Ministry of Finance. In such circumstances the Town Court should have forwarded a copy of the decision to the defendant but had failed to do so. Accordingly, the Supreme Court held that the Russian Ministry of Finance had valid excuse in missing the statutory time-limit for appealing against the Town Court’s decisions taken between June and November 2011 (Appendix 2, column no. 3).

In the period between September 2012 and February 2013 (Appendix 2, column no. 5) the Supreme Court of Kabardino-Balkaria quashed the Town Court’s refusals (Appendix 2, column no. 3) and restored the time-limit for appealing against the main judgments (Appendix 2, column no. 2). It noted, in particular, as follows:

“... As it transpires from the case materials the defendant [the Russian Ministry of Finance] was represented by Ms B. ... who participated in the first instance court hearing on examination of the case on the merits and, accordingly, was aware of the delivered judgment [Town Court’s judgment in the applicants’ favour].

Therefore submission of an appeal against that judgment [Town Court] within the time-limit provided by Article 338 of the Russian Code of Civil Procedure depended on the representative’s good faith ... Accordingly, failure to comply with the time-limit by the defendant evidently was a consequence of improper fulfillment of the obligations by the representative, which obviously led to substantial violation of the Russian Federation’s rights in supporting its position before the court of appeal.”

In the period between September 2012 and March 2013 (Appendix 2, column no. 6) the Supreme Court of Kabardino-Balkaria quashed the Town Court’s main judgment and dismissed the applicants’ claims in full. It noted that the domestic law concerning compensation for non-pecuniary damage had been introduced on 31 May 1991 after the Chernobyl nuclear accident had occurred, therefore the applicants were not entitled to any compensation. The Supreme Court further ordered the applicants to return the money they had received pursuant to the Town Court’s judgments taken between January and April 2011 (Appendix 2, column no. 2).

Three applicants, Mr Kolomiyets (applicant no. 67), Mr Lepekhin (applicant no. 78) and Mr Apanasenko (applicant no. 101) died on 30 and 26 March and 23 July 2013 respectively, after they filed their applications with the Court. By letter of 17 April 2014 the applicants’ wives informed the Court about their husbands’ decease and expressed the intention to continue proceedings.

B. Relevant domestic law and practice

Article 112 of the Russian Code of Civil Procedure (“CCP”) provides that a competent court may extend a time-limit for procedural actions, such as lodging an appeal, if the court finds that a party has a valid excuse for a failure to comply with that time-limit.

Article 227 of the CCP stipulates that a copy of a decision concerning termination of proceedings shall be forwarded to the parties to the proceedings if they were not present at the hearing within three days after its delivery.

Under Article 338 of the CCP, in force before 1 January 2012, an appeal in a civil case could be lodged within ten days after the delivery of a first-instance judgment in its final form. After 1 January 2012 the time-limit for lodging an appeal has been extended to one month under Article 321 of the CCP.

Under Article 392 of the CCP a final judgment in a case may be reviewed, *inter alia*, on the ground that the European Court of Human Rights found a violation of the Convention on account of the domestic

judicial proceedings or decisions taken in that case. Articles 393-94 set out a procedure for reopening of domestic judicial proceedings in any such case.

Article 1109 § 3 of the CCP stipulates that, if a decision to grant compensations for damages to health to a person in the absence of a bad faith and miscalculations on his or her part is quashed on appeal or by way of supervisory review, the compensation itself cannot be claimed back.

COMPLAINTS

The applicants complain under Article 6 § 1 of the Convention that restoration of the time-limit for an appeal resulting in quashing of the final judgment in their favour violated the principle of legal certainty. The applicants further complain under Article 1 of Protocol No. 1 of the Convention that reversal of the compensations awarded by the Town Court, which had already been paid to some of the applicants, violated their right to property.

QUESTIONS TO THE PARTIES

1. Regard being had to the decisions listed in columns nos. 5 and 6 of Appendix 2, by which the Supreme Court of the Republic of Kabardino-Balkaria, at requests of the Russian Ministry of Finance, restored a time-limit for appealing against decisions listed in columns nos. 3 and 2 of Appendix 2 respectively, were the guarantees of Article 6 § 1 of the Convention, and in particular the principle of legal certainty, respected (see *Bezrukovy v. Russia*, no. 34616/02, §§ 32-36, 10 May 2012)?

2. Have there been any other examples, not stemming from the facts as described in the present case, where a time-limit for an appeal was restored on similar grounds? The Government are invited to submit their reply with references to domestic practice, if any.

3. Did the quashing of the final judgments in the applicants' favour constitute an interference with the applicants' right to the peaceful enjoyment of the possession in the form of the judgment debt? If so, was such interference justified in terms of Article 1 of Protocol No. 1?

APPENDIX 1

1. Application no. 11421/13 lodged on 22 January 2013:

1. Khamid Khatutovich KABARDOKOV, born on 12/03/1949;
2. Viktor Vladimirovich BOCHARNIKOV, born on 19/04/1954;
3. Yuriy Khadisovich GERGOV, born on 16/04/1947;
4. Mukhadin Adamovich DOTKULOV, born on 29/08/1949;
5. Zamir Misostovich KARDANOV, born on 02/05/1951;
6. Gali Ezdanovich SHAOV, born on 27/09/1956;

2. Application no. 15459/13 lodged on 9 February 2013:

7. Baydulakh Magometovich AYTEKOV, born on 08/01/1952;
8. Askerbiy Aslanovich BAYSIYEV, born on 29/09/1957;
9. Ivan Grigoryevich ZAIKA, born on 18/02/1953;
10. Viktor Mikhaylovich KREMENTSOV, born on 29/08/1955;
11. Vasiliy Vasilyevich POPOVICH, born on 05/01/1953;
12. Mikhail Mikhaylovich PANCHENKO, born on 14/11/1954;
13. Sergey Ivanovich SOBAKAR, born on 04/09/1958;
14. Ruslan Galiyevich UMAROV, born on 02/03/1954;

3. Application no. 15473/13 lodged on 9 February 2013:

15. Sergey Ivanovich ANTONOV, born on 02/02/1951;
16. Assad Ogly Abassovich BABAYEV, born on 28/11/1963;
17. Vladimir Petrovich BORIYEV, born on 10/04/1949;
18. Khamid Khasanovich GUZIYEV, born on 02/11/1956;
19. Viktor Vasilyevich DEYKIN, born on 03/11/1955;
20. Urazay Musayevich KOKKEZOV, born on 08/07/1950;
21. Ramazan Mustafayevich MOKAYEV, born on 27/04/1956;
22. Marat Vladimirovich SRUKOV, born on 29/08/1961;

4. Application no. 15625/13 lodged on 9 February 2013:

23. Timur Khasanovich GUKEZHEV, born on 07/09/1968;
24. Gisa Musayevich GUCHAPSHEV, born on 15/10/1956;
25. Isuf Abuzedovich KUMYKOV, born on 30/12/1955;
26. Mikhail Aniuarovich SARAHOV, born on 28/02/1957;
27. Arsen Khasanbiyevich URUSMAMBETOV, born on 29/10/1960;
28. Seyfu Yusufovich KHAIROV, born on 31/03/1954;
29. Muayed Khasanovich KHOKONOV, born on 15/08/1954;

5. Application no. 15651/13 lodged on 9 February 2013:

30. Ivan Timofeyevich ARKHIPOV, born on 17/10/1945;

31. Muayed Sultanovich GEDMISHKHOV, born on 23/05/1957;
32. Aleksey Dmitriyevich DADONOV, born on 19/03/1951;
33. Khasen Vladimirovich ZHUZHUYEV, born on 05/10/1964;
34. Vladimir Andreyevich KUDRITSKIY, born on 16/11/1954;
35. Aleksandr Alekseyevich LARIN, born on 18/05/1957;
36. Nikolay Fedorovich MENYAYLO, born on 12/08/1951;
37. Vladimir Abramovich SHPAKOV, born on 15/09/1952;
38. Zhora Khasanovich ERZHIBOV, born on 12/05/1953;

6. Application no. 18295/13 lodged on 20 February 2013:

39. Saladin Khautiyevich TAOV, born on 15/12/1950;
40. Stanislav Sergeyevech ANOSOV, born on 02/09/1954;
41. Aleksandr Aleksandrovich BORISENKO, born on 25/03/1954;
42. Sergey Maratovich MAGOMEDOV, born on 21/04/1954;
43. Ruslan Khadisovich MISROKOV, born on 29/04/1968;
44. Aleksandr Nikolayevich SVIRIDENKO, born on 16/07/1952;
45. Sultan Batyrbiyevich KHAMSHOKOV, born on 07/11/1968;

7. Application no. 18767/13 lodged on 12 February 2013:

46. Vladimir Grigoryevich TANKANAG, born on 18/10/1938;
47. Andemirkan Muratovich KUCHMENOV, born on 01/07/1937;
48. Karalbi Gidovich KEREFOV, born on 09/12/1939;

8. Application no. 18775/13 lodged on 22 February 2013:

49. Viktor Mikhaylovich TSYB, born on 11/05/1951;
50. Igor Anatolyevich RYABTSEV, born on 26/09/1968;
51. Aleksandr Ilyich KAGITIN, born on 02/05/1945;
52. Mustafa Bekiyevich MANIYAYEV, born on 19/02/1954;

9. Application no. 19142/13 lodged on 22 February 2013:

53. Khasym Yusupovich BITTIROV, born on 31/12/1956;
54. Aleksandr Mukharbiyevich ZRUMOV, born on 14/04/1950;
55. Viktor Khazhmuratovich KUGOTOV, born on 02/04/1956;

10. Application no. 19161/13 lodged on 14 February 2013:

56. Auyes Khapitovich TSIRKHOV, born on 07/03/1953;
57. Yuriy Alekseyevich NEKRASOV, born on 25/05/1951;
58. Nikolay Ivanovich KHRUSHCHEV, born on 05/12/1926;
59. Vasiliy Maksimovich LASHIN, born on 25/01/1939;
60. Anatoliy Alekseyevich VARCHENKO, born on 28/08/1941;
61. Magarram Vali Ogly NASIBOV, born on 15/07/1939;
62. Vladimir Ivanovich PARSHAKOV, born on 16/03/1949;
63. Viktor Nikolayevich YURCHENKO, born on 25/07/1954;
64. Vasiliy Alekseyevich BOBROVENKO, born on 22/04/1930;

65. Vladimir Timofeyevich SAVCHENKO, born on 09/09/1939;

11. Application no. 19179/13 lodged on 13 February 2013:

- 66. Nikolay Petrovich VLASOV, born on 21/11/1948;
- 67. Vladimir Mikhaylovich KOLOMIYETS, born on 19/04/1945;
- 68. Nikolay Ivanovich PRASOL, born on 22/09/1948;
- 69. Leonid Spiridonovich PURKIN, born on 28/01/1946;
- 70. Aleksandr Nikolayevich PEKAR, born on 26/09/1967;
- 71. Aslanbi Adamovich TANASHEV, born on 10/08/1947;
- 72. Aleksandr Mikhaylovich TOKAREV, born on 01/09/1959;

12. Application no. 19237/13 lodged on 12 February 2013:

- 73. Vladimir Nikolayevich VELICHKO, born on 22/04/1952;
- 74. Vladimir Pavlovich ISTOMIN, born on 06/06/1951;
- 75. Nikolay Nikolayevich KONONOV, born on 04/01/1955;
- 76. Yevgeniy Aleksandrovich KILDISHOV, born on 30/08/1964;
- 77. Leonid Talovich KAZHAROV, born on 06/03/1949;
- 78. Sergey Filippovich LEPEKHIN, born on 25/09/1945;
- 79. Pavel Ilyich LOGACHEV, born on 31/01/1951;
- 80. Aleksandr Maksimovich LITYAYEV, born on 05/05/1958;
- 81. Vasiliy Anatolyevich NIKOLAYENKO, born on 18/11/1961;

13. Application no. 19259/13 lodged on 15 February 2013:

- 82. Sarazhdin Talovich KHATSUKOV, born on 15/11/1954;
- 83. Ruslan Leonidovich GUKEPSHOKOV, born on 02/06/1964;
- 84. Murid Ayubovich BARAGUNOV, born on 09/06/1937;
- 85. Sergey Ivanovich ARCHAKOV, born on 15/10/1954;
- 86. Murid Borisovich BZHAUMYKHOV, born on 02/12/1957;
- 87. Arsen Khabasovich KODZOKOV, born on 07/01/1958;
- 88. Ashir Margeldyevich ASHIROV, born on 15/01/1961;

14. Application no. 19320/13 lodged on 9 February 2013:

- 89. Albek Auyesovich AFAUNOV, born on 02/11/1960;
- 90. Boris Sarzhudinovich BOKOV, born on 16/10/1948;
- 91. Valeriy Emilevich GUBER, born on 24/12/1939;
- 92. Viktor Semenovich KONTORIN, born on 23/02/1956;
- 93. Vladimir Viktorovich LUKYANOV, born on 16/02/1959;
- 94. Kazbek Safarbiyevich SHAOV, born on 17/12/1966;
- 95. Vitaliy Viktorovich TSARKOV, born on 21/05/1951;

15. Application no. 19398/13 lodged on 13 February 2013:

- 96. Murik Blitovich BORIYEV, born on 09/12/1955;
- 97. Anatoliy Adalgeriyevich KUMYKOV, born on 25/05/1952;
- 98. Mukhazhid Mukhamedovich ORGANOKOV, born on 04/12/1949;
- 99. Sergey Semenovich PANYAKIN, born on 02/12/1954;

100. Boris Timofeyevich KHOKHLACHEV, born on 11/03/1953;

16. Application no. 19408/13 lodged on 14 February 2013:

- 101. Nikolay Konstantinovich APANASENKO, born on 25/11/1938;
- 102. Oleg Valentinovich VOLODIN, born on 28/08/1968;
- 103. Viktor Vladimirovich GLYBIN, born on 22/08/1951;
- 104. Viktor Ivanovich KLOCHKOV, born on 15/01/1950;
- 105. Viktor Petrovich LIKHTINOV, born on 25/04/1952;
- 106. Amir Musarbiyevich PSHIGUSOV, born on 01/12/1957;
- 107. Khasan Kilchukovich SIZHAZHEV, born on 10/12/1949;
- 108. Nikolay Grigoryevich CHIKALENKO, born on 08/03/1955;
- 109. Timosha Khazhpagovich SHADOV, born on 20/07/1956;

17. Application no. 19422/13 lodged on 9 February 2013:

- 110. Mikhail Lukmanovich BOTTAYEV, born on 31/10/1956;
- 111. Bilyal Khangeriyevich KARDANOV, born on 01/12/1956;
- 112. Taymoraz Khadzimussayevich MATAROV, born on 15/01/1946;
- 113. Khazrit Tutovich MARGUSHEV, born on 08/04/1965;
- 114. Vasiliy Alekseyevich TOKAREV, born on 08/01/1956;
- 115. Shamil Khamidovich UYANAYEV, born on 25/06/1966;
- 116. Ruslan Bashirovich KHATSUKOV, born on 10/09/1954;

18. Application no. 19541/13 lodged on 17 February 2013:

- 117. Anzor Khabilovich GEDMISHKHOV, born on 15/10/1968;
- 118. Nikolay Ivanovich ZARKOV, born on 24/10/1954;
- 119. Khasan Khazhimurzovich KOCHESOKOV, born on 20/05/1949;
- 120. Mukhadin Aliyevich KOKOV, born on 13/02/1967;
- 121. Bail Lyaliyevich NAGOYEV, born on 07/04/1956;
- 122. Valeriy Yuryevich PUTEVTSOV, born on 28/08/1967;
- 123. Khusen Gazaliyevich SABANCHIYEV, born on 07/11/1951;

19. Application no. 19549/13 lodged on 11 February 2013:

- 124. Igor Grigoryevich GREDASOV, born on 23/12/1946;
- 125. Boris Ivanovich DEGTYARENKO, born on 09/02/1940;
- 126. Khamid Bubovich KARDANOV, born on 23/12/1954;
- 127. Yaroslav Yaroslavovich MORSIN, born on 04/08/1965;
- 128. Nikolay Petrovich POTAPKIN, born on 25/11/1954;
- 129. Aleksandr Dmitriyevich SEMOCHKIN, born on 26/07/1954;
- 130. Viktor Gennadyevich SHVEDOV, born on 24/05/1954;
- 131. Igor Aleksandrovich YURLOV, born on 20/06/1965;

20. Application no. 19556/13 lodged on 11 February 2013:

- 132. Magomet Tokayevich GOROYEV, born on 21/03/1956;
- 133. Amir Kushbiyevich GELOYEV, born on 01/04/1966;
- 134. Boris Pshimakhovich DZUGANOV, born on 07/04/1949;

135. Nyusya Shagbanovna DOKSHUKINA, born on 23/03/1954;
136. Vladimir Andreyevich POTKALO, born on 08/11/1954;
137. Zalingeri Gisovich TUROV, born on 08/01/1947;
138. Zaur Shagirovich SHOMAKHOV, born on 24/11/1955;
139. Artur Khatsuyevich SHOMAKHOV, born on 22/05/1956

21. Application no. 19687/13 lodged on 11 February 2013:

140. Khusen Mazanovich AYBAZOV, born on 28/02/1948;
141. Kharun Satyvaldyevich GYZYYEV, born on 01/09/1956;
142. Aleksandr Viktorovich KOSTENKO, born on 18/11/1965;
143. Zhamal Zhapayevich KULBAYEV, born on 24/01/1951;
144. Dmitriy Anatolyevich MININ, born on 19/05/1955;
145. Mustafir Muradinovich OSMANOV, born on 11/05/1956;
146. Aleksandr Nikolayevich FINOGENOV, born on 27/02/1953;

22. Application no. 19697/13 lodged on 11 February 2013:

147. Viktor Ivanovich BIDADAK, born on 21/11/1950;
148. Vladimir Aleksandrovich BUDNIKOV, born on 18/05/1957;
149. Anatoliy Khambiyevich DOKHOV, born on 18/10/1954;
150. Khazhmurat Yakhyayevich DZHANKULAYEV, born on 19/08/1966;
151. Nikolay Mikhaylovich MUKOZHEV, born on 06/03/1966;
152. Alisag Mukhamedovich TAKHUSHEV, born on 04/08/1953;
153. Aleksandr Nikolayevich STEPANENKO, born on 27/02/1957;
154. Vyacheslav Anibalovich TSIRKHOV, born on 06/02/1966;

23. Application no. 19722/13 lodged on 13 February 2013:

155. Mutalis Mikhaylovich ALKHASOV, born on 18/10/1967;
156. Khyzyr Khadzhimuratovich KABARDOKOV, born on 12/08/1954;
157. Anatoliy Talevich KONGAPSHEV, born on 30/01/1951;
158. Aleksandr Nikolayevich PLAKHOV, born on 01/06/1949;
159. Vasiliy Ilyich STRIZHAK, born on 13/07/1954;
160. Akhmet Khasultanovich KHARSIYEV, born on 02/01/1955;
161. Makhamadzhan Narbayevich KHAYNAZAROV, born on 01/05/1954;
162. Aleksandr Aleksandrovich CHERNYSHOV, born on 03/12/1949;
163. Nikolay Khadinovich SHIKLYASHEV, born on 02/02/1954;

24. Application no. 22925/13 lodged on 13 February 2013:

164. Sergey Sobirovich ABDURAKHMONOV, born on 14/06/1963;
165. Ruslan Khazhislamovich GONGAPSHEV, born on 13/10/1954;
166. Vladimir Anatolyevich DEREPOVKO, born on 26/02/1940;
167. Valeriy Aleksandrovich KOROVIN, born on 09/09/1952;
168. Aleksey Timofeyevich KOZLOVTSEV, born on 23/01/1952;
169. Sergey Petrovich LAPTEV, born on 30/07/1957;
170. Pavel Alekseyevich NIKITENKO, born on 18/12/1954;

- 171. Muayed Mastafovich SURMAMETOV, born on 07/02/1956;
- 172. Zaurbek Ismagilovich SHANIBOV, born on 12/02/1959;

25. Application no. 22935/13 lodged on 13 February 2013:

- 173. Eduard Chartiyevich ABAZOV, born on 17/06/1968;
- 174. Fedya Khuseynovich ZHEMGURAZOV, born on 29/07/1956;
- 175. Sergey Konstantinovich ZYKOV, born on 25/09/1953;
- 176. Yevgeniy Nikolayevich LAZAREV, born on 09/02/1947;

26. Application no. 22953/13 lodged on 25 February 2013:

- 177. Tobi Khasanbiyevich KUSHKHOV, born on 07/02/1953;
- 178. Vladimir Kurgokovich SIBILOV, born on 10/08/1949;
- 179. Viktor Andreyevich KHALIN, born on 27/09/1954;

27. Application no. 23006/13 lodged on 12 February 2013:

- 180. Shota Aleksandrovich YERMOLOV, born on 10/07/1939;
- 181. Vasiliy Ivanovich SHEVYAKOV, born on 01/09/1947;
- 182. Eduard Borisovich CHIKHRADZE, born on 14/08/1967;
- 183. Valentina Grigoryevna POLYAKOVA, born on 07/07/1935;
- 184. Khuseyn Seyfullakhovich GEKKIYEV, born on 06/01/1968;
- 185. Sergey Otarovich GOBEDZHISHVILI, born on 03/01/1967;
- 186. Anatoliy Khizirovich ZHAMBIKOV, born on 10/12/1939

28. Application no. 23109/13 lodged on 13 February 2013:

- 187. Mikhail Vladimirovich BELUNIN, born on 01/01/1955;
- 188. Nikolay Nikolayevich MARCHENKO, born on 24/07/1949;
- 189. Gennadiy Andreyevich MOISEYENKO, born on 28/05/1949;
- 190. Yuriy Grigoryevich MEDVEDEV, born on 23/10/1955;
- 191. Talgat Avzalovich NURMUKHAMETOV, born on 01/01/1947;
- 192. Aleksandr Vladimirovich PINYAYEV, born on 06/06/1952;
- 193. Petr Ivanovich SLIPENKO, born on 15/08/1958;
- 194. Tayib Ayubovich TADZHIBOV, born on 14/11/1958;

29. Application no. 23135/13 lodged on 13 February 2013:

- 195. Ivan Semenovich KACHANOV, born on 10/08/1942;
- 196. Viktor Petrovich LICHMANOV, born on 16/08/1947;
- 197. Sergey Timofeyevich NIKOLAYEV, born on 24/12/1954;
- 198. Yuriy Stepanovich OBUKHOV, born on 25/09/1950;
- 199. Garri Mikhaylovich POGOSOV, born on 03/01/1958;
- 200. Sergey Leonidovich SADOVOY, born on 31/08/1962;
- 201. Sergey Viktorovich KHARITONOV, born on 19/10/1950;

30. Application no. 23145/13 lodged on 13 February 2013:

- 202. Valeriy Akhmatovich GURTUYEV, born on 01/03/1968;

- 203. Muayed Khusenovich LIGIDOV, born on 29/08/1950;
- 204. Mukhamed Anatolyevich MAREMSHAOV, born on 25/10/1950;
- 205. Vasiliy Ivanovich MARTYNYUK, born on 23/09/1951;
- 206. Zamir Gumarovich TUKHUZHEV, born on 11/12/1956;
- 207. Khusein Abdullayevich SHAKHABOV, born on 03/04/1955;
- 208. Nikolay Yakovlevich SHTELVAKH, born on 19/06/1956;
- 209. Mukharbek Mukhadinovich SHOMAKHOV, born on 29/11/1962;

31. Application no. 23177/13 lodged on 26 March 2013:

- 210. Vyacheslav Vladimirovich BEZYANOV, born on 26/02/1946;
- 211. Viktor Ivanovich GAYDAR, born on 18/07/1949;
- 212. Nikolay Nikolayevich STOLYARENKO, born on 20/09/1958;
- 213. Viktor Konstantinovich SANKOV, born on 21/07/1947;

32. Application no. 26466/13 lodged on 11 February 2013:

- 214. Muzafar Tatukovich ATABIYEV, born on 13/05/1966;
- 215. Boris Aliyevich BEPPAYEV, born on 25/01/1956;
- 216. Aleksandr Vladimirovich KATASONOV, born on 28/08/1952;
- 217. Khachim Dinovich PSHIKHACHEV, born on 29/09/1957;
- 218. Ruslan Yuryevich TUMOV, born on 28/07/1968;
- 219. Aniuar Zhansitovich TAOV, born on 07/04/1955;
- 220. Aleksandr Amirkhanovich SHOMAKHOV, born on 10/06/1955;
- 221. Eduard Dikanovich SHOMAKHOV, born on 28/02/1956;

33. Application no. 58066/13 lodged on 26 August 2013:

- 222. Ruslan Marufovich NISHANOV, born on 07/06/1964;

34. Application no. 60167/13 lodged on 5 September 2013:

- 223. Boris Nashkhovich KODZOKOV, born on 10/10/1946.

APPENDIX 2

No.	Application no. / Case Title	Main judgment taken on (final on)	Refusal to restore time-limit for appealing against the main judgment	Decision to grant restoration of time-limit for appealing against refusal to restore time-limit (final on)	Decision to grant restoration of time-limit for appealing against the main judgment	Decision to quash the main judgment
	<i>Column no. 1</i>	<i>Column no. 2</i>	<i>Column no. 3</i>	<i>Column no. 4</i>	<i>Column no. 5</i>	<i>Column no. 6</i>
1.	11421/13 KABARDOKOV and others v. Russia	12/04/11 (25/04/11)	08/06/11	20/07/12 (22/08/12)	07/09/12	7/09/12
2.	15459/13 AYTEKOV and others v. Russia	18/02/11 (01/03/11)	08/06/11	24/08/12 (27/09/12)	10/10/12	10/10/12
3.	15473/13 ANTONOV and others v. Russia	12/04/11 (22/04/11)	16/06/11	20/07/12 (22/08/12)	07/09/12	07/09/12
4.	15625/13 GUKEZHEV and others v. Russia	18/02/11 (01/03/11)	08/06/11	20/07/12 (22/08/12)	07/09/12	7/09/12
5.	15651/13 ARKHIPOV and others v. Russia	10/03/11 (22/03/11)	08/06/11	24/08/12 (26/09/12)	12/10/12	12/10/12
6.	18295/13 TAOV and others v. Russia	12/04/11 (22/04/11)	16/06/11	24/08/12 (26/09/12)	12/10/12	12/10/12
7.	18767/13 TANKANG and others v. Russia	11/04/11 (22/04/11)	08/06/11	24/08/12 (26/09/12)	12/10/12	12/10/12
8.	18775/13 TSYB and others v. Russia	24/05/11 (07/06/11)	01/11/11	24/08/12 (20/09/12)	04/10/12	04/10/12
9.	19142/13 BITTIROV and others v. Russia	05/04/11 (18/04/11)	07/06/11	20/07/12 (22/08/12)	07/09/12	07/09/12
10.	19161/13 TSIRKHOV and others v. Russia	11/04/11 (22/04/11)	08/06/11	24/08/12 (26/09/12)	12/10/12	12/10/12

KABARDOKOV AND OTHERS v. RUSSIA AND OTHER APPLICATIONS –
STATEMENT OF FACTS AND QUESTIONS

13

11.	19179/13 VLASOV and others v. Russia	10/03/11 (22/03/11)	08/06/11	24/08/12 (26/09/12)	12/10/12	12/10/12
12.	19237/13 VELICHKO and others v. Russia	10/03/11 (22/03/11)	08/06/11	24/08/12 (27/09/12)	10/10/12	10/10/12
13.	19259/13 KHATSUKOV and others v. Russia	11/04/11 (21/04/11)	16/06/11	20/07/12 (22/08/12)	07/09/12	07/09/12
14.	19320/13 AFAUNOV and others v. Russia	15/02/11 (01/03/11)	09/06/11	20/07/12 (22/08/12)	07/09/12	07/09/12
15.	19398/13 BORIYEV and others v. Russia	14/02/11 (25/02/11)	09/06/11	20/07/12 (22/08/12)	07/09/12	7/09/12
16.	19408/13 APANASENKO and others v. Russia	10/03/11 (22/03/11)	09/06/11	24/08/12 (26/09/12)	12/10/12	12/10/12
17.	19422/13 BOTTAEV and others v. Russia	12/04/11 (25/04/11)	16/06/11	24/08/12 (27/09/12)	10/10/12	10/10/12
18.	19541/13 GEDMISHKOV and others v. Russia	10/03/11 (22/03/11)	09/06/11	20/07/12 (22/08/12)	07/09/12	07/09/12
19.	19549/13 GERDASOV and others v. Russia	10/03/11 (22/03/11)	09/06/11	24/08/12 (27/09/12)	10/10/12	10/10/12
20.	19556/13 GOROYEV and others v. Russia	12/04/11 (25/04/11)	06/06/11	20/07/12 (22/08/12)	07/09/12	07/09/12
21.	19687/13 AYBAZOV and others v. Russia	04/04/11 (15/04/11)	08/06/11	20/07/12 (22/08/12)	07/09/12	07/09/12
22.	19697/13 BIDAK and others v. Russia	04/04/11 (15/04/11)	07/06/11	20/07/12 (22/08/12)	07/09/12	07/09/12
23.	19722/13 ALKHASOV and others v. Russia	04/04/11 (15/04/11)	09/06/11	20/07/12 (22/08/12)	07/09/12	07/09/12
24.	22925/13 ABDURAKHMONOV and others v. Russia	10/03/11 (22/03/11)	09/06/11	24/08/12 (27/09/12)	10/10/12	10/10/12

KABARDOKOV AND OTHERS v. RUSSIA AND OTHER APPLICATIONS –
STATEMENT OF FACTS AND QUESTIONS

25.	22935/13 ABAZOV and others v. Russia	10/03/11 (22/03/11)	08/06/11	20/07/12 (22/08/12)	07/09/12	07/09/12
26.	22953/13 KUSHKHOV and others v. Russia	12/04/11 (25/04/11)	08/06/11	20/07/12 (22/08/12)	07/09/12	07/09/12
27.	23006/13 YERMOLOV and others v. Russia	11/04/11 (21/04/11)	08/06/11	24/08/12 (26/09/12)	12/10/12	12/10/12
28.	23109/13 BELUNIN and others v. Russia	16/02/11 (01/03/11)	09/06/11	20/07/12 (22/08/12)	07/09/12	7/09/12
29.	23135/13 KACHANOV and others v. Russia	04/04/11 (15/04/11)	09/06/11	20/07/12 (22/08/12)	07/09/12	07/09/12
30.	23145/13 GURTUYEV and others v. Russia	12/04/11 (22/04/11)	16/06/11	24/08/12 (27/09/12)	10/10/12	10/10/12
31.	23177/13 BEZYANOV and others v. Russia	18/02/11 (01/03/11)	08/06/11	15/11/12 (27/12/12)	27/02/13	27/02/13
32.	26466/13 ATABIYEV and others v. Russia	10/03/11 (22/03/11)	09/06/11	20/07/12 (22/08/12)	07/09/12	07/09/12
33.	58066/13 NISHANOV v. Russia	17/01/11- (27/02/11)	06/06/11	16/11/12 (26/12/12)	28/02/13	28/02/13
34.	60167/13 KODZOKOV v. Russia	18/01/11 (28/02/11)	08/06/11	16/11/12 (26/12/12)	28/02/13	06/03/13

APPENDIX 3

No.	Applicants	Amount of awarded compensation (RUB)	Compensation paid: ✓ - “yes” ✗ - “no”
1.	Khamid Khatutovich KABARDOKOV	1,500,000	✗
2.	Viktor Vladimirovich BOCHARNIKOV	1,500,000	✗
3.	Yuriy Khadisovich GERGOV	1,500,000	✓
4.	Mukhadin Adamovich DOTKULOV	1,500,000	✗
5.	Zamir Misostovich KARDANOV	1,500,000	✗
6.	Gali Ezdanovich SHAOV	1,500,000	✗
7.	Baydulakh Magometovich AYTEKOV	1,500,000	✗
8.	Askerbiy Aslanovich BAYSIYEV	1,500,000	✗
9.	Ivan Grigoryevich ZAIKA	1,500,000	✓
10.	Viktor Mikhaylovich KREMENTSOV	1,500,000	✗
11.	Vasiliy Vasilyevich POPOVICH	1,500,000	✗
12.	Mikhail Mikhaylovich PANCHENKO	1,200,000	✗
13.	Sergey Ivanovich SOBAKAR	1,500,000	✗
14.	Ruslan Galiyevich UMAROV	1,500,000	✗
15.	Sergey Ivanovich ANTONOV	1,500,000	✗
16.	Assad Ogly Abassovich BABAYEV	1,500,000	✗
17.	Vladimir Petrovich BORIYEV	1,500,000	✗
18.	Khamid Khasanovich GUZIYEV	1,500,000	✗
19.	Viktor Vasilyevich DEYKIN	1,500,000	✗
20.	Urazay Musayevich KOKKEZOV	1,500,000	✗
21.	Ramazan Mustafayevich MOKAYEV	1,500,000	✗
22.	Marat Vladimirovich SRUKOV	1,500,000	✗
23.	Timur Khasanovich GUKEZHEV	1,500,000	✓
24.	Gisa Musayevich GUCHAPSHEV	1,500,000	✗
25.	Isuf Abuzedovich KUMYKOV	1,500,000	✗
26.	Mikhail Aniuarovich SARAHOV	1,500,000	✗
27.	Arsen Khasanbiyevich URUSMAMBETOV	1,500,000	✓
28.	Seyfu Yusufovich KHAIROV	1,500,000	✗
29.	Muayed Khasanovich KHOKONOV	1,300,000	✗
30.	Ivan Timofeyevich ARKHIPOV	1,300,000	✗
31.	Muayed Sultanovich GEDMISHKHOV	1,300,000	✗
32.	Aleksey Dmitriyevich DADONOV	1,300,000	✗
33.	Khasen Vladimirovich ZHUZHUYEV	1,300,000	✗
34.	Vladimir Andreyevich KUDRITSKIY	1,300,000	✗

35.	Aleksandr Alekseyevich LARIN	1,300,000	✗
36.	Nikolay Fedorovich MENYAYLO	1,300,000	✗
37.	Vladimir Abramovich SHPAKOV	1,300,000	✗
38.	Zhora Khasanovich ERZHIBOV	1,300,000	✓
39.	Saladin Khautiyevich TAOV	1,600,000	✗
40.	Stanislav Sergeyevich ANOSOV	1,500,000	✗
41.	Aleksandr Aleksandrovich BORISENKO	1,300,000	✗
42.	Sergey Maratovich MAGOMEDOV	1,500,000	✓
43.	Ruslan Khadisovich MISROKOV	1,300,000	✗
44.	Aleksandr Nikolayevich SVIRIDENKO	1,500,000	✗
45.	Sultan Batyrbiyevich KHAMSHOKOV	1,500,000	✗
46.	Vladimir Grigoryevich TANKANAG	1,200,000	✓
47.	Andemirkan Muratovich KUCHMENOV	1,200,000	✗
48.	Karalbi Gidovich KEREF OV	1,200,000	✗
49.	Viktor Mikhaylovich TSYB	1,200,000	✗
50.	Igor Anatolyevich RYABTSEV	1,200,000	✗
51.	Aleksandr Ilyich KAGITIN	1,200,000	✗
52.	Mustafa Bekiyevich MANIYAYEV	1,200,000	✗
53.	Khasym Yusupovich BITTIROV	1,500,000	✓
54.	Aleksandr Mukharbiyevich ZRUMOV	1,300,000	✗
55.	Viktor Khazhmuratovich KUGOTOV	1,500,000	✗
56.	Auyes Khapitovich TSIRKHOV	1,200,000	✗
57.	Yuriy Alekseyevich NEKRASOV	1,200,000	✗
58.	Nikolay Ivanovich KHRUSHCHEV	1,200,000	✗
59.	Vasilij Maksimovich LASHIN	1,200,000	✗
60.	Anatolij Alekseyevich VARCHENKO	1,200,000	✗
61.	Magarram Vali Ogly NASIBOV	1,200,000	✓
62.	Vladimir Ivanovich PARSHAKOV	1,200,000	✓
63.	Viktor Nikolayevich YURCHENKO	1,200,000	✗
64.	Vasilij Alekseyevich BOBROVENKO	1,200,000	✗
65.	Vladimir Timofeyevich SAVCHENKO	1,200,000	✗
66.	Nikolay Petrovich VLASOV	1,500,000	✗
67.	Vladimir Mikhaylovich KOLOMIYETS	1,500,000	✗
68.	Nikolay Ivanovich PRASOL	1,500,000	✗
69.	Leonid Spiridonovich PURKIN	1,500,000	✗
70.	Aleksandr Nikolayevich PEKAR	1,300,000	✗
71.	Aslanbi Adamovich TANASHEV	1,300,000	✗
72.	Aleksandr Mikhaylovich TOKAREV	1,300,000	✗
73.	Vladimir Nikolayevich VELICHKO	1,300,000	✗
74.	Vladimir Pavlovich ISTOMIN	1,300,000	✗

75.	Nikolay Nikolayevich KONONOV	1,300,000	✗
76.	Yevgeniy Aleksandrovich KILDISHOV	1,300,000	✗
77.	Leonid Talovich KAZHAROV	1,300,000	✗
78.	Sergey Filippovich LEPEKHIN	1,300,000	✗
79.	Pavel Ilyich LOGACHEV	1,300,000	✗
80.	Aleksandr Maksimovich LITYAYEV	1,300,000	✗
81.	Vasilij Anatolyevich NIKOLAYENKO	1,300,000	✗
82.	Sarazhdin Talovich KHATSUKOV	1,200,000	✓
83.	Ruslan Leonidovich GUKESHOV	1,200,000	✓
84.	Murid Ayubovich BARAGUNOV	1,200,000	✓
85.	Sergey Ivanovich ARCHAKOV	1,200,000	✓
86.	Murid Borisovich BZHAUMYKHOV	1,200,000	✓
87.	Arsen Khabasovich KODZOKOV	1,200,000	✓
88.	Ashir Margeldyevich ASHIROV	1,200,000	✓
89.	Albek Auyesovich AFAUNOV	1,500,000	✓
90.	Boris Sarzhudinovich BOKOV	1,500,000	✓
91.	Valeriy Emilevich GUBER	1,500,000	✓
92.	Viktor Semenovich KONTORIN	1,300,000	✓
93.	Vladimir Viktorovich LUKYANOV	1,300,000	✓
94.	Kazbek Safarbiyevich SHAOV	1,500,000	✓
95.	Vitaliy Viktorovich TSARKOV	1,300,000	✓
96.	Murik Blitovich BORIYEV	1,500,000	✓
97.	Anatolij Adalgeriyevich KUMYKOV	1,500,000	✓
98.	Mukhazhid Mukhamedovich ORGANOKOV	1,500,000	✓
99.	Sergey Semenovich PANYAKIN	1,300,000	✗
100.	Boris Timofeyevich KHOKHLACHEV	1,500,000	✗
101.	Nikolay Konstantinovich APANASENKO	1,500,000	✗
102.	Oleg Valentinovich VOLODIN	1,200,000	✗
103.	Viktor Vladimirovich GLYBIN	1,300,000	✓
104.	Viktor Ivanovich KLOCHKOV	1,500,000	✗
105.	Viktor Petrovich LIKHTINOV	1,500,000	✗
106.	Amir Musarbiyevich PSHIGUSOV	1,300,000	✗
107.	Khasan Kilchukovich SIZHAZHEV	1,300,000	✗
108.	Nikolay Grigoryevich CHIKALENKO	1,500,000	✓
109.	Timosha Khazhpagovich SHADOV	1,300,000	✗
110.	Mikhail Lukmanovich BOTTAYEV	1,500,000	✗
111.	Bilyal Khangeriyevich KARDANOV	1,500,000	✗
112.	Taymoraz Khadzimussayevich MATAROV	1,500,000	✗
113.	Khazrit Tutovich MARGUSHEV	1,500,000	✗
114.	Vasilij Alekseyevich TOKAREV	1,500,000	✗

115.	Shamil Khamidovich UYANAYEV	1,500,000	✓
116.	Ruslan Bashirovich KHATSUKOV	1,500,000	✓
117.	Anzor Khabilovich GEDMISHKHOV	1,300,000	✗
118.	Nikolay Ivanovich ZARKOV	1,300,000	✗
119.	Khasan Khazhimurzovich KOCHESOKOV	1,300,000	✗
120.	Mukhadin Aliyevich KOKOV	1,300,000	✗
121.	Bail Lyaliyevich NAGOYEV	1,300,000	✗
122.	Valeriy Yuryevich PUTEVTSOV	1,300,000	✗
123.	Khusen Gazaliyevich SABANCHIYEV	1,300,000	✗
124.	Igor Grigoryevich GREDASOV	1,300,000	✓
125.	Boris Ivanovich DEGTYARENKO	1,300,000	✗
126.	Khamid Bubovich KARDANOV	1,200,000	✗
127.	Yaroslav Yaroslavovich MORSIN	1,500,000	✗
128.	Nikolay Petrovich POTAPKIN	1,300,000	✗
129.	Aleksandr Dmitriyevich SEMOCHKIN	1,300,000	✓
130.	Viktor Gennadyevich SHVEDOV	1,300,000	✗
131.	Igor Aleksandrovich YURLOV	1,300,000	✗
132.	Magomet Tokayevich GOROYEV	1,500,000	✓
133.	Amir Kushbiyevich GELOYEV	1,500,000	✓
134.	Boris Pshimakhovich DZUGANOV	1,500,000	✓
135.	Nyusya Shagbanovna DOKSHUKINA	1,500,000	✓
136.	Vladimir Andreyevich POTKALO	1,500,000	✓
137.	Zalimgeri Gisovich TUROV	1,500,000	✓
138.	Zaur Shagirovich SHOMAKHOV	1,500,000	✓
139.	Artur Khatsuyevich SHOMAKHOV	1,500,000	✓
140.	Khusen Mazanovich AYBAZOV	1,500,000	✓
141.	Kharun Satyvaldyevich GYZYYEV	1,500,000	✓
142.	Aleksandr Viktorovich KOSTENKO	1,500,000	✗
143.	Zhamal Zhapayevich KULBAYEV	1,500,000	✗
144.	Dmitriy Anatolyevich MININ	1,500,000	✗
145.	Mustafir Muradinovich OSMANOV	1,500,000	✓
146.	Aleksandr Nikolayevich FINOGENOV	1,500,000	✗
147.	Viktor Ivanovich BIDAK	1,300,000	✗
148.	Vladimir Aleksandrovich BUDNIKOV	1,300,000	✗
149.	Anatoliy Khambiyevich DOKHOV	1,500,000	✓
150.	Khazhmurat Yakhyayevich DZHANKULAYEV	1,500,000	✓
151.	Nikolay Mikhaylovich MUKOZHEV	1,500,000	✗
152.	Alisag Mukhamedovich TAKHUSHEV	1,500,000	✗
153.	Aleksandr Nikolayevich STEPANENKO	1,300,000	✗
154.	Vyacheslav Anibalovich TSIRKHOV	1,500,000	✗

155.	Mutalis Mikhaylovich ALKHASOV	1,500,000	✗
156.	Khyzyr Khadzhimuratovich KABARDOKOV	1,500,000	✗
157.	Anatoliy Talevich KONGAPSHEV	1,500,000	✗
158.	Aleksandr Nikolayevich PLAKHOV	1,500,000	✗
159.	Vasilij Ilyich STRIZHAK	1,500,000	✗
160.	Akhmet Khasultanovich KHARSIYEV	1,500,000	✗
161.	Makhamadzhnan Narbayevich KHAYNAZAROV	1,500,000	✗
162.	Aleksandr Aleksandrovich CHERNYSHOV	1,500,000	✗
163.	Nikolay Khadinovich SHIKLYASHEV	1,500,000	✗
164.	Sergey Sobirovich ABDURAKHMONOV	1,500,000	✗
165.	Ruslan Khazhislamovich GONGAPSHEV	1,300,000	✗
166.	Vladimir Anatolyevich DEREPOVKO	1,500,000	✗
167.	Valeriy Aleksandrovich KOROVIN	1,500,000	✗
168.	Aleksey Timofeyevich KOZLOVTSEV	1,300,000	✗
169.	Sergey Petrovich LAPTEV	1,300,000	✓
170.	Pavel Alekseyevich NIKITENKO	1,500,000	✗
171.	Muayed Mastafovich SURMAMETOV	1,300,000	✗
172.	Zaurbek Ismagilovich SHANIBOV	1,200,000	✓
173.	Eduard Chartiyevich ABAZOV	1,300,000	✗
174.	Fedya Khuseynovich ZHEMGURAZOV	1,300,000	✗
175.	Sergey Konstantinovich ZYKOV	1,300,000	✓
176.	Yevgeniy Nikolayevich LAZAREV	1,300,000	✗
177.	Tobi Khasanbiyevich KUSHKHOV	1,500,000	✓
178.	Vladimir Kurgokovich SIBILOV	1,500,000	✗
179.	Viktor Andreyevich KHALIN	1,500,000	✗
180.	Shota Aleksandrovich YERMOLOV	1,200,000	✓
181.	Vasilij Ivanovich SHEVYAKOV	1,200,000	✗
182.	Eduard Borisovich CHIKHRADZE	1,200,000	✗
183.	Valentina Grigoryevna POLYAKOVA	1,200,000	✓
184.	Khuseyn Seyfullakhovich GEKKIYEV	1,200,000	✓
185.	Sergey Otarovich GOBEDZHISHVILI	1,200,000	✗
186.	Anatoliy Khizirovich ZHAMBIKOV	1,200,000	✓
187.	Mikhail Vladimirovich BELUNIN	1,500,000	✗
188.	Nikolay Nikolayevich MARCHENKO	1,300,000	✓
189.	Gennadiy Andreyevich MOISEYENKO	1,300,000	✗
190.	Yuriy Grigoryevich MEDVEDEV	1,500,000	✓
191.	Talgat Avzalovich NURMUKHAMETOV	1,500,000	✓
192.	Aleksandr Vladimirovich PINYAYEV	1,500,000	✓
193.	Petr Ivanovich SLIPENKO	1,300,000	✓
194.	Tayib Ayubovich TADZHIBOV	1,300,000	✓

195.	Ivan Semenovich KACHANOV	1,300,000	✗
196.	Viktor Petrovich LICHMANOV	1,300,000	✗
197.	Sergey Timofeyevich NIKOLAYEV	1,300,000	✗
198.	Yuriy Stepanovich OBUKHOV	1,300,000	✗
199.	Garri Mikhaylovich POGOSOV	1,300,000	✗
200.	Sergey Leonidovich SADOVOY	1,300,000	✓
201.	Sergey Viktorovich KHARITONOV	1,300,000	✗
202.	Valeriy Akhmatovich GURTUYEV	1,500,000	✗
203.	Muayed Khusenovich LIGIDOV	1,500,000	✗
204.	Mukhamed Anatolyevich MAREMSHAOV	1,500,000	✓
205.	Vasiliy Ivanovich MARTYNYUK	1,500,000	✗
206.	Zamir Gumarovich TUKHUZHEV	1,200,000	✗
207.	Khusein Abdullayevich SHAKHABOV	1,500,000	✗
208.	Nikolay Yakovlevich SHTELVAKH	1,500,000	✗
209.	Mukharbek Mukhadinovich SHOMAKHOV	1,500,000	✓
210.	Vyacheslav Vladimirovich BEZYANOV	1,500,000	✗
211.	Viktor Ivanovich GAYDAR	1,500,000	✗
212.	Nikolay Nikolayevich STOLYARENKO	1,500,000	✗
213.	Viktor Konstantinovich SANKOV	1,500,000	✗
214.	Muzafar Tatukovich ATABIYEV	1,500,000	✗
215.	Boris Aliyevich BEPPAYEV	1,500,000	✓
216.	Aleksandr Vladimirovich KATASONOV	1,500,000	✗
217.	Khachim Dinovich PSHIKHACHEV	1,500,000	✓
218.	Ruslan Yuryevich TUMOV	1,500,000	✓
219.	Aniuar Zhansitovich TAOV	1,500,000	✗
220.	Aleksandr Amirkhanovich SHOMAKHOV	1,500,000	✗
221.	Eduard Dikanovich SHOMAKHOV	1,500,000	✗
222.	Ruslan Marufovich NISHANOV	1,500,000	✓
223.	Boris Nashkhovich KODZOKOV	1,500,000	✓