



EUROPEAN COURT OF HUMAN RIGHTS  
COUR EUROPÉENNE DES DROITS DE L'HOMME

FIFTH SECTION

**CASE OF FEYA, MPP AND OTHERS v. UKRAINE**

*(Application no. 27617/06 and 126 other applications)*

JUDGMENT

STRASBOURG

21 February 2013

*This judgment is final. It may be subject to editorial revision.*



**In the case of Feya, MPP and Others v. Ukraine,**

The European Court of Human Rights (Fifth Section), sitting as a Committee composed of:

Boštjan M. Zupančič, *President*,

Ann Power-Forde,

Helena Jäderblom, *judges*,

and Stephen Phillips, *Deputy Section Registrar*,

Having deliberated in private on 29 January 2013,

Having noted that the underlying legal issue in the applications is already the subject of well-established case-law of the Court (see *Yuriy Nikolayevich Ivanov v. Ukraine*, no. 40450/04, 15 October 2009),

Delivers the following judgment, which was adopted on that date:

## PROCEDURE

1. The case originated in 127 applications against Ukraine lodged with the Court under Article 34 of the Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms (“the Convention”) by Ukrainian and Russian nationals and companies based in Ukraine, whose details are specified in the appended tables.

2. The applicants in applications nos. 46250/08, 22257/10 and 36266/10 died. The applications were pursued in their name by the persons of the required standing, their relatives or heirs to their estate.

3. The Ukrainian Government (“the Government”) were represented by their Agent, Mr Nazar Kulchytskyy.

4. The applications, which mainly concern the issues of lengthy failure to enforce domestic decisions given in the applicants’ favour, were communicated to the Government on various dates.

5. On various dates the Government submitted to the Court a number of unilateral declarations aimed at resolving the non-enforcement issues. The Government requested the Court to strike the applications concerned out of the list of cases pursuant to Article 37 § 1 (c) of the Convention on the basis of the declarations. The Court examined the declarations and decided to reject the Government’s request.

6. The Russian Government, having been informed of their right to intervene in the proceedings in respect of the applicants in applications nos. 35071/10 and 53963/10 (Article 36 § 1 of the Convention and Rule 44 of the Rules of Court), indicated that they did not wish to exercise that right.

## THE FACTS

### THE CIRCUMSTANCES OF THE CASE

7. On the dates set out in the appended tables domestic courts and commissions on labour disputes delivered judgments and decisions according to which the applicants were entitled to various pecuniary amounts or to have certain actions taken in their favour. The decisions became final and enforceable. However, the applicants were unable to obtain the enforcement of the decisions in due time because of State's failure to comply with these decisions.

8. Some of the applicants also made submissions concerning factual and legal matters unrelated to the above non-enforcement issues.

## THE LAW

### I. JOINDER OF THE APPLICATIONS

9. In view of the similarity of the applications in terms of the principal legal issue raised, the Court finds it appropriate to join them.

### II. THE STANDING OF THE APPLICANTS IN APPLICATIONS Nos. 46250/08, 22257/10 AND 36266/10

10. The Court considers that the applicants' heirs or next-of-kin in the applications nos. 46250/08, 22257/10 and 36266/10 (see paragraph 2 above) have standing to continue the proceedings in the applicants' stead (see, among other authorities, *Mironov v. Ukraine*, no. 19916/04, § 12, 14 December 2006).

### III. ALLEGED VIOLATION OF ARTICLES 6 AND 13 OF THE CONVENTION AND OF ARTICLE 1 OF PROTOCOL No. 1

11. The applicants complained about the lengthy non-enforcement of the decisions given in their favour and about the lack of effective domestic remedies in respect of those complaints. They relied on, expressly or in substance, Articles 6 and 13 of the Convention and Article 1 of Protocol No. 1.

12. The Court notes that the applicants' above complaints are not manifestly ill-founded within the meaning of Article 35 § 3 (a) of the

Convention. It further notes that they are not inadmissible on any other grounds. They must therefore be declared admissible.

13. The Court finds that the decisions in the applicants' favour were not enforced in due time, for which the State authorities were responsible.

14. Having regard to its well-established case-law on the subject (see *Yuriy Nikolayevich Ivanov*, cited above, §§ 56-58 and 66-70), the Court finds that there has been a violation of Article 6 § 1 of the Convention and Article 1 of Protocol No. 1 on account of the prolonged non-enforcement of the decisions in the applicants' favour. It also considers that there has been a violation of Article 13 of the Convention in that the applicants did not have an effective domestic remedy to redress the damage created by such non-enforcement.

#### IV. OTHER ALLEGED VIOLATIONS OF THE CONVENTION

15. Some of the applicants raised other complaints under the Convention which the Court has carefully examined. In the light of all the material in its possession, and in so far as the matters complained of are within its competence, the Court finds that they do not disclose any appearance of a violation of the rights and freedoms set out in the Convention or its Protocols.

16. It follows that those complaints are manifestly ill-founded and must be rejected in accordance with Article 35 §§ 3 (a) and 4 of the Convention.

#### V. APPLICATION OF ARTICLE 41 OF THE CONVENTION

17. Article 41 of the Convention provides:

“If the Court finds that there has been a violation of the Convention or the Protocols thereto, and if the internal law of the High Contracting Party concerned allows only partial reparation to be made, the Court shall, if necessary, afford just satisfaction to the injured party.”

18. In the present case, bearing in mind its previous decision on the matter (see *Kharuk and Others v. Ukraine* [Committee], no. 703/05 and 115 other applications, § 25, 26 July 2012), the Court considers it reasonable and equitable to award amounts of EUR 3,000 jointly to the applicants in applications nos. 32178/09 and 50804/09, and in the remainder of the applications it awards 3,000 euros (EUR) to each applicant in the applications which concern non-enforcement delays exceeding three years (the applications tabulated in Appendix 1) and EUR 1,500 to each applicant in the other applications (the applications tabulated in Appendix 2). These sums are to cover any pecuniary and non-pecuniary damage, as well as costs and expenses.

19. The Court further notes that the respondent State has an outstanding obligation to enforce the decisions which remain enforceable.

20. The Court considers it appropriate that the default interest rate should be based on the marginal lending rate of the European Central Bank, to which should be added three percentage points.

## FOR THESE REASONS, THE COURT UNANIMOUSLY

1. *Decides* to join the applications;
2. *Declares* the applicants' complaints under Article 6 § 1 and Article 13 of the Convention and Article 1 of Protocol No. 1 about the lengthy non-enforcement of the decisions given in their favour and about the lack of effective domestic remedies in respect of those complaints admissible and the remainder of the applications inadmissible;
3. *Holds* that there has been a violation of Article 6 § 1 of the Convention and of Article 1 of Protocol No. 1;
4. *Holds* that there has been a violation of Article 13 of the Convention;
5. *Holds*
  - (a) that the respondent State is to enforce the domestic decisions in the applicants' favour which remain enforceable and is to pay, within three months, EUR 3,000 (three thousand euros) jointly to the applicants in applications nos. 32178/09 and 50804/09, EUR 3,000 (three thousand euros) to each applicant or his or her estate in the applications tabulated in Appendix 1 and EUR 1,500 (one thousand five hundred euros) to each applicant or his or her estate in the applications tabulated in Appendix 2 in respect of pecuniary and non-pecuniary damage, and costs and expenses, plus any tax that may be chargeable to the applicants on the above amounts which are to be converted into the national currency at the rate applicable at the date of settlement;
  - (b) that from the expiry of the above-mentioned three months until settlement simple interest shall be payable on the above amounts at a rate equal to the marginal lending rate of the European Central Bank during the default period plus three percentage points.

Done in English, and notified in writing on 21 February 2013, pursuant to Rule 77 §§ 2 and 3 of the Rules of Court.

Stephen Phillips  
Deputy Registrar

Boštjan M. Zupančič  
President

**APPENDIX 1**  
(non-enforcement delays more than three years)

No.	Application no. and date of introduction	Applicant's name date of birth (if known)	Relevant domestic decisions
1.	27617/06 19/06/200	<b>FEYA, MPP</b>	1) Snizhne Court, 26/01/2004 2) Snizhne Court, 26/01/2004 3) Donetsk Regional Commercial Court, 14/10/2004 4) Donetsk Regional Commercial Court, 12/11/2004
2.	44628/06 27/10/2006	<b>SHLYAKHOVE REMONTNO-BUDIVELNE UPRAVLINNYA 33, VAT</b>	1) Kharkiv Regional Commercial Court, 15/10/2003 2) Kharkiv Regional Commercial Court, 15/10/2003 3) Kharkiv Regional Commercial Court, 19/08/2004
3.	47368/06 09/11/2006	<b>Mykola Yevgeniyovych SEMZENIS</b> 15/05/1967	1) Kotovsk Court, 25/07/2005 2) Kotovsk Court, 03/03/2005
4.	21136/07 07/05/2007	<b>Natalya Timofeyevna BEREZKINA</b> 24/12/1959 <b>Eduard Vladislavovich BEREZKIN</b> 14/05/1986	1) Zhovtnevy District Court of Lugansk, 12/09/2001 2) Zhovtnevy District Court of Lugansk, 13/12/2004
5.	26935/07 18/06/2007	<b>Valeriy Yegorovich SUBBOTIN</b> 04/02/1950	1) Torez Court, 28/07/2000 2) Torez Court, 02/07/2001 3) Torez Court, 05/11/2003 4) Torez Court, 15/08/2005
6.	30251/07 31/05/2007	<b>SNABMASHOBSBYT, PP</b>	Lugansk Regional Commercial Court, 02/03/2001
7.	43621/07 26/09/2007	<b>Nikolay Yemelyanovich MALOVICHKO</b> 05/12/1944	Tsentrarno-Misky District Court of Makiyivka, 20/05/2002
8.	49573/07 03/11/2007	<b>Ryurik Petrovich RODICHEV</b> 26/02/1937	Krasnyy Luch Court, 24/07/2003
9.	35243/08 04/07/2008	<b>CHERNIGIVTORGBUD, VAT</b>	Chernigiv Regional Commercial Court, 03/02/2004
10.	40933/08 22/07/2008	<b>CHERNIGIVTORGBUD, VAT</b>	Chernigiv Regional Commercial Court, 05/07/2007
11.	46250/08 31/07/2008	<b>Aleksandr Georgiyevich LUPONOSOV</b> 26/06/1951	Tsentrarno-Mistsky District Court of Makiyivka, 22/09/2006
12.	53963/08 18/10/2008	<b>Vladlen Yuryevich DMITRIYEV</b> 23/12/1956	Primorsky District Court of Odesa, 29/05/2007
13.	55114/08 03/11/2008	<b>VYROBNYCHA FIRMA ASTEYS, TOV</b>	Kyiv City Commercial Court, 03/11/2005
14.	4519/09 11/12/2008	<b>Viktor Vladimirovich SHPAK</b> 04/08/1950	Krasnyy Luch Court, 04/05/2005
15.	12629/09 23/02/2009	<b>Ivan Ivanovich DENISOV</b> 10/05/1945 <b>Igor Ivanovich DENISOV</b> 05/06/1977	<b>Applicant 1:</b> 1) Kerch Court, 29/07/2004 2) Kerch Court, 19/07/2005 <b>Applicant 2:</b> 1) Kerch Court, 06/08/2004 2) Kerch Court, 19/07/2005
16.	17384/09 10/02/2009	<b>Volodymyr Mykolayovych PAVLENKO</b> 04/03/1973	Korolovskyy District Court of Zhytomyr, 13/09/2007, as amended by the Zhytomyr Regional Court of Appeal on 29/11/2007



No.	Application no. and date of introduction	Applicant's name date of birth (if known)	Relevant domestic decisions
17.	20888/09 02/04/2009	<b>Andrey Andreyevich BRYANTSEV</b> 25/09/1953	Yevpatoriya Court of the Autonomous Republic of Crimea, 04/08/2006
18.	22588/09 07/04/2009	<b>Stanislav Yuryevich POPOVICH</b> 22/10/1954	Tsentralno-Miskyy Court of Gorlivka, 11/03/2004
19.	29900/09 22/05/2009	<b>Aleksandr Nikolayevich LOKHMATOV</b> 26/08/1960	1) Kerch Court of the Autonomous Republic of Crimea, 03/09/2004 2) Kerch Court of the Autonomous Republic of Crimea, 14/12/2004
20.	29904/09 20/05/2009	<b>Boris Fedorovich SOLODKIY</b> 30/04/1955	Babushkynskyy District Court of Dnipropetrovsk, 05/05/2006
21.	30355/09 12/05/2009	<b>Aleksandr Vladimirovich VOVK</b> 29/06/1964	Selydove Court, 30/11/2005
22.	30807/09 29/05/2009	<b>Mykola Stepanovych KHOBOT</b> 15/09/1950	Feodosiya Court of the Autonomous Republic of Crimea, 16/10/2006
23.	31440/09 25/05/2009	<b>Aleksandr Ivanovich VASILYEV</b> 13/03/1957	1) Oleksandriya Court of Kirovograd Region, 07/08/2006 2) Oleksandriya Court of Kirovograd Region, 17/11/2006
24.	31815/09 03/04/2009	<b>Dmitriy Anatolyevich KLYAKHIN</b> 08/10/1965	1) Labour Disputes Commission of Avtosklo, State Enterprise, 14/05/1998 2) Kostyantynivka Court of the Donetsk Region, 30/01/2001
25.	31959/09 08/06/2009	<b>Oleksandr Mykolayovych DRACHENKO</b> 23/08/1964	Oleksandriya Court of the Kirovograd Region, 31/07/2008
26.	32061/09 05/06/2009	<b>Grygoriy Oleksandrovych OBUSHCHAK</b> 14/02/1960	Zamostyansky District Court of Vinnytsya, 15/11/2006
27.	32178/09 05/06/2009	<b>Vadym Oleksandrovych MOLCHANOV</b> 25/10/1937 <b>Kateryna Vasylivna MOLCHANOVA</b> 10/12/1937	Kherson Regional Court of Appeal, 07/12/2006
28.	33252/09 05/06/2009	<b>Vitaliy Nikolayevich VOLKOBOY</b> 16/06/1954	1) Kostyantynivka Court, 21/08/2006 2) Labour Disputes Commission of the Avtosklo, State Enterprise, 12/03/2001
29.	33390/09 05/06/2009	<b>Alla Andreyevna OMELCHENKO</b> 22/09/1941	Kostyantynivka Court, 14/03/2003
30.	35661/09 23/06/2009	<b>Vasyl Ivanovych VERZHYKOVSKYY</b> 22/10/1924	Shepetivka Court, 28/11/2007
31.	38664/09 07/07/2009	<b>Volodymyr Mykhaylovych SHALAYEV</b> 08/08/1949	1) Oleksandriya Court, 20/03/2008 As Amended by the Dnipropetrovsk Regional Administrative Court of Appeal on 04/12/2008 2) Oleksandriya Court, 19/05/2008
32.	39734/09 02/06/2009	<b>Vitaliy Yevgenyevich SAMOFALOV</b> 16/07/1979	Krasnyy Luch Court, 14/06/2007
33.	40678/09 20/07/2009	<b>Vera Alekseyevna KITCHENKO</b> 21/09/1947	Vyshgorod Court, 21/04/2008
34.	41045/09 21/07/2009	<b>Aleksandr Mikhaylovych STUPAKOV</b> 16/08/1941	Krasnyy Luch Court, 25/06/2007
35.	42857/09 27/07/2009	<b>Stanislava Eduardivna FURSOVA</b> 04/01/1954	Krasnyy Luch Court, 27/05/2005
36.	43017/09 27/07/2009	<b>Yuriy Alekseyevich FURSOV</b> 21/02/1949	1) Krasnyy Luch Court, 06/06/2005 2) Krasnyy Luch Court, 28/04/2006

No.	Application no. and date of introduction	Applicant's name date of birth (if known)	Relevant domestic decisions
37.	45905/09 12/08/2009	<b>Volodymyr Semenovych VERESHCHAKA</b> 20/08/1946	1) Oleksandriya Court, 28/01/2008 as amended by the Dnipropetrovsk Administrative Court of Appeal, 25/09/2008  2) Oleksandriya Court, 11/04/2008 as amended by the Dnipropetrovsk Administrative Court of Appeal, 10/12/2008  3) Oleksandriya Court, 10/07/2008 as amended by the Dnipropetrovsk Administrative Court of Appeal, 23/04/2009, quashed by the Higher Administrative Court on 30/11/2012
38.	46475/09 17/08/2009	<b>Igor Olegovich BUTENIN</b> 06/09/1972	Zamostyansky District Court of Vinnytsya, 05/03/2007
39.	47329/09 20/08/2009	<b>Yevgeniy Nikolayevich MATSKIY</b> 16/07/1971	Zhytomyr Circuit Administrative Court, 31/01/2008
40.	48647/09 26/08/2009	<b>Galyna Mykhaylivna BRZHEZITSKA</b> 27/08/1958	Mukacheve Court, 13/11/2006
41.	50168/09 25/08/2009	<b>Gennadiy Grigoryevich SERENKO</b> 29/12/1966	Berdiansk Court, 16/01/2006
42.	50804/09 07/09/2009	<b>Aleksandra Zakharovna ZHUKOVA</b> 29/06/1945 <b>Dmitriy Vladimirovich ZHUKOV</b> 30/08/1968	Dzerzhinskyy District Court of Kharkiv, 11/10/2004
43.	53644/09 27/09/2009	<b>Volodymyr Ivanovych SPINOV</b> 29/11/1953	Kalininskyy District Court of Donetsk, 14/06/2006
44.	54647/09 28/09/2009	<b>Sergiy Yakovlevych TORGAN</b> 19/10/1971	Malynovskyy District Court of Odesa, 20/06/2008
45.	54747/09 28/09/2009	<b>Sergiy Mykolayovych PODGURSKYY</b> 15/06/1976	Malynovskyy District Court of Odesa, 20/06/2008
46.	58907/09 27/10/2009	<b>Veletyna Ivanivna NAZARCHUK</b> 16/05/1954	Volodarka Court, 16/10/2006
47.	1284/10 11/12/2009	<b>Anatoliy Mykolayovych SHERSHUN</b> 1955	1) Tetiyiv Court, 07/12/2007  2) Tetiyiv Court, 07/03/2008
48.	1299/10 24/12/2009	<b>SKLADNI SPLAVY, PP</b>	Commercial Court of Kyiv, 16/10/2007
49.	1301/10 21/12/2009	<b>Sergey Nikolayevich LYUBENKIY</b> 16/12/1977	Zamostyansky District Court of Vinnytsya, 05/03/2007
50.	2495/10 31/12/2009	<b>Venera Ilmar- Voldemarivna MAROCHKYNA</b> 04/09/1962	1) Krasnyy Luch Court, 13/05/2005  2) Krasnyy Luch Court, 03/06/2008
51.	2946/10 04/12/2009	<b>Maya Vasylivna MRACHEK</b> 10/05/1944	Komsomolsky District Court of Kherson, 06/06/2008
52.	3073/10 05/01/2010	<b>Viktor Vasylyovych KOPYLTSIV</b> 01/03/1963	Kolomyia Court, 25/06/2004
53.	3191/10 25/12/2009	<b>Volodymyr Vikentiyovych KHARITONOV</b> 04/09/1963	Kolomyia Court, 22/02/2005
54.	3275/10 12/01/2010	<b>Larysa Sergiyivna KASHPRUK</b> 18/03/1972	Kalynivka Court, 31/01/2007
55.	4412/10 06/01/2010	<b>Lyudmila Vladimirovna SIDENKO</b> 13/02/1965	Kupyansk Court, 13/03/2008
56.	4524/10 06/01/2010	<b>Viktor Anatolyevich TKACHEV</b> 12/04/1959	Labour Disputes Commission the Kupyanskyy Lyvarnyy Zavod, 01/11/2001
57.	4541/10 06/01/2010	<b>Yuriy Nikolayevich KARDASH</b> 21/05/1963	Kupyansk Court, 20/01/2007
58.	4743/10 06/01/2010	<b>Valentina Alekseyevna BURYAK</b> 17/07/1952	Kupyansk Court, 01/10/2007
59.	6128/10 22/01/2010	<b>Vira Volodymyrivna BAGNO</b> 11/11/1959	Dubno Court, 11/01/2007

No.	Application no. and date of introduction	Applicant's name date of birth (if known)	Relevant domestic decisions
60.	9452/10 09/02/2010	<b>Alla Mykolayivna SHEVCHUK</b> 22/03/1963	1) Zhytomyr Circuit Administrative Court, 12/12/2007 2) Zhytomyr Circuit Administrative Court, 14/05/2009
61.	9642/10 09/02/2010	<b>Nina Oleksandrivna KALENCHENKO</b> unspecified	Pecherskyy District Court of Kyiv, 02/04/2008
62.	9650/10 09/02/2010	<b>Valentyn Rostyslavovych SHROL</b> 01/07/1964	Pecherskyy District Court of Kyiv, 02/04/2008
63.	9699/10 09/02/2010	<b>Liliya Ivanivna KASYANENKO</b> 26/12/1952	Pecherskyy District Court, 02/04/2008
64.	9705/10 09/02/2010	<b>Svitlana Anatoliyivna GOLUB</b> 24/03/1964	Pecherskyy District Court of Kyiv, 02/04/2008
65.	9711/10 08/02/2010	<b>Olga Mykolayivna KAPICHON</b> 06/11/1965	Pecherskyy District Court of Kyiv, 02/04/2008
66.	9720/10 08/02/2010	<b>Oleksandr Ivanovych SLIPCHENKO</b> 31/10/1965	Pecherskyy District Court of Kyiv, 02/04/2008
67.	10008/10 08/02/2010	<b>Oleksiy Mykolayovych DANILOV</b> 28/03/1953	Pecherskyy District Court of Kyiv, 02/04/2008
68.	10016/10 08/02/2010	<b>Mykhaylo Anatoliyovych POLISHCHUK</b> 20/11/1961	Pecherskyy District Court of Kyiv, 02/04/2008
69.	10023/10 08/02/2010	<b>Ruslana Viktorivna BEREZOVENKO</b> unspecified	Pecherskyy District Court of Kyiv, 02/04/2008
70.	10034/10 08/02/2010	<b>Anatoliy Ivanovych OREL</b> 16/12/1958	Pecherskyy District Court of Kyiv, 02/04/2008
71.	10118/10 08/02/2010	<b>Valentyna Ivanivna KHEYFITS</b> 06/02/1953	Kupyansk Court, 27/09/2001
72.	10124/10 04/02/2010	<b>Vera Vladimirovna GODIYAK</b> 09/01/1958	Krasnyy Luch Court, 18/07/2005
73.	10126/10 03/02/2010	<b>Mykola Mykhaylovych MOSHKIVSKYY</b> 10/10/1970	Kyiv Administrative Court of Appeal, 28/04/2009
74.	10171/10 09/02/2010	<b>Oleg Volodymyrovych IGNATYUK</b> 11/01/1966	Pecherskyy District Court of Kyiv, 02/04/2008
75.	10278/10 08/02/2010	<b>Mykola Grygorovych AVRAMENKO</b> 05/10/1957	Pecherskyy District Court of Kyiv, 02/04/2008
76.	10302/10 08/02/2010	<b>Volodymyr Mykolayovych CHERKASOV</b> 25/03/1959	Pecherskyy District Court of Kyiv, 02/04/2008
77.	10411/10 09/02/2010	<b>Rayisa Mykolayivna GAYDAY</b> 26/03/1955	Pecherskyy District Court of Kyiv, 02/04/2008
78.	10453/10 05/02/2010	<b>Irina Yevgenyevna KRASEVICH</b> 20/03/1955	Labour Disputes Commission of the State Company "Techbudsklo", 18/04/2002
79.	10575/10 09/02/2010	<b>Oleksandr Ivanovych VLASENKO</b> 05/11/1974	Court's order of the Kyivskyy District Court of Poltava, 30/03/2009
80.	10598/10 05/02/2010	<b>Volodymyr Ivanovych MALTSEV</b> 17/08/1938	Darnytskyy District Court of Kyiv, 15/12/2006
81.	11480/10 08/02/2010	<b>Nataliya Semenivna VOROBYOVA</b> 12/03/1954	Pecherskyy District Court of Kyiv, 02/04/2008
82.	11641/10 11/02/2010	<b>Nikolay Ivanovich KANDAUROV</b> unspecified	Pervomaysk Court of the Lugansk Region, 08/05/2002
83.	11721/10 10/02/2010	<b>Lidiya Fedorivna SAMKO</b> 13/12/1953	Kharkiv Administrative Court of Appeal, 02/12/2008
84.	11837/10 17/02/2010	<b>Valeriy Yevgeniyovych PANKOV</b> 13/05/1956	Fastiv Court, 20/11/2007
85.	12328/10 19/02/2010	<b>FPK GROSS OOO</b>	Donetsk Regional Commercial Court, 11/04/2005
86.	12338/10 24/02/2010	<b>Oleksandr SENCHYLO</b> 01/12/1949	Kyiv City Court of Appeal, 27/09/2007
87.	13643/10 10/02/2010	<b>Volodymyr Yevgenovych SMYRNOV</b> 23/11/1978	Commercial Court of the Autonomous Republic of Crimea, 25/03/2008
88.	13673/10 23/02/2010	<b>Grygoriy Vasylyovych TABACHUK</b> 03/07/1962	Zamostyansky District Court of Vinnytsya, 22/12/2006

No.	Application no. and date of introduction	Applicant's name date of birth (if known)	Relevant domestic decisions
89.	14611/10 02/03/2010	<b>Grygoriy Yakovych KOVROVSKYY</b> 01/08/1955	1) Vyshgorod Court, 25/02/2008 2) Vyshgorod Court, 27/02/2009 3) Vyshgorod Court, 26/05/2009
90.	14912/10 03/03/2010	<b>Igor Mykolayovych SOLOMOYCHENKO</b> 21/07/1956	Pecherskyy District Court of Kyiv, 15/12/2004 (as amended by the Kyiv Court of Appeal, 14/03/2005)
91.	17874/10 19/03/2010	<b>Sergiy Volodymyrovych STRYZHAK</b> 02/06/1956	Novi Sanzhary Court, 18/10/2007
92.	18112/10 10/03/2010	<b>Igor Anatoliyovych LIPANOV</b> 22/07/1962	1) Korolyovskyy District Court of Zhytomyr, 17/10/2007 2) Bogunskyy District Court of Zhytomyr, 15/01/2010 3) Zhytomyr Circuit Administrative Court, 10/12/2008
93.	18276/10 16/03/2010	<b>Viktor Ivanovych YAREMCHUK</b> 10/07/1961	Berezan Court, 19/02/2008
94.	20170/10 23/03/2010	<b>Yuriy Mykolayovych STRYZHAK</b> 04/05/1962	Kryukivskyy District Court of Kremenchuk, 17/09/2008
95.	20448/10 29/03/2010	<b>FIRMA DILAYN, PP</b>	Lugansk Regional Commercial Court, 12/12/2000
96.	20511/10 23/11/2009	<b>Oleksandr Ivanovych POBEREZHNYY</b> 18/09/1971	1) Court's order of the Kolomyia Court, 16/03/2007 2) Court's Order of the Kolomyia Court, 15/06/2007
97.	21733/10 30/03/2010	<b>Nikolay Ivanovich TISHCHENKO</b> 25/03/1958	Leninskyy District Court of Sevastopol, 07/08/2008
98.	22024/10 12/03/2010	<b>Yuriy Yevgenyevich KRASNOKUTSKIY</b> 20/03/1949	Krasnyy Luch Court, 30/03/2009
99.	22257/10 02/04/2010	<b>Ivan Yefimovich MAKSYUK</b> 1932	Krasnyy Luch Court, 15/06/2007
100.	22336/10 02/04/2010	<b>Yelena Yakovlevna BENDA</b> 29/12/1965	1) Krasnyy Luch Court, 20/08/2008 2) Krasnyy Luch Court, 29/10/2008
101.	22493/10 27/03/2010	<b>Oleksandra Fedorivna SHAGA</b> 04/12/1951	Novozavodskyy District Court of Chernigiv, 17/12/2007
102.	23629/10 20/04/2010	<b>Tetyana Mykolayivna DIDYK</b> 11/02/1961	Zamostyansky District Court of Vinnytsya, 11/12/2006
103.	24443/10 20/04/2010	<b>Lyudmyla Pavlivna MANKIVSKA</b> 21/08/1962	Zamostyansky District Court of Vinnytsya, 30/11/2006
104.	25298/10 23/04/2010	<b>Lyubov Fedorivna SYDORENKO</b> 17/06/1948	1) Krasnyy Liman Court, 21/08/1999 2) Krasnyy Liman Court, 17/08/1999
105.	25989/10 20/04/2010	<b>Igor LYSAK</b> 13/01/1947	Lychakivskyy District Court of Lviv, 07/11/2007
106.	26673/10 19/04/2010	<b>Fedir Frolovych FIRSOV</b> 20/09/1941	Mukachevo Court, 01/11/2006
107.	30056/10 17/05/2010	<b>Galyna Stepanivna YAKOVYSHYNA</b> 27/03/1932	Lviv Administrative Court of Appeal, 05/08/2008
108.	30631/10 20/05/2010	<b>Tamara Mykolayivna MANDRYKA</b> 27/11/1941	1) Labour Disputes Commission of the Khimprom, Pervomayskyy State Enterprise, 11/12/2007 2) Pervomayskyy Court, 06/05/2008
109.	33325/10 07/06/2010	<b>Volodymyr Valeriyovych KRAL</b> unspecified	Golosiyvskyy District Court of Kyiv, 02/06/2005
110.	33691/10 02/06/2010	<b>Svitlana Ivanivna DY GAS</b> 21/07/1965	Zamostyansky District Court of Vinnytsya, 27/03/2007
111.	35071/10 03/06/2010	<b>Anastasiya Semenovna DIKAREVA</b> 31/10/1934 (Russian)	Severodonetsk Court, 15/04/2009
112.	35124/10 31/05/2010	<b>Viktor Semenovych MOVCHAN</b> 29/07/1937	1) Kyiv Administrative Court of Appeal, 02/04/2009 2) Kyiv Circuit Administrative Court, 15/10/2008
113.	36266/10 16/06/2010	<b>Mykola Andriyovych NESOLYONYY</b> 14/08/1922	Lugansk Circuit Administrative Court, 07/05/2009

No.	Application no. and date of introduction	Applicant's name date of birth (if known)	Relevant domestic decisions
114.	42839/10 17/07/2010	<b>Yefim Mikhaylovich TIMOSHENKO</b> 17/05/1926	Krasnoarmiysk Court, 20/02/2009
115.	45624/10 27/07/2010	<b>Ivan Pavlovyeh BUSHUYEV</b> 12/02/1923	Leninsky District Court of Lugansk, 04/12/2009
116.	45785/10 31/07/2010	<b>Larisa Viktorovna VYSOTSKAYA</b> 04/02/1960	1) Kerch Court, 28/02/2003 2) Kerch Court, 05/05/2005
117.	49215/10 09/08/2010	<b>Pavlo Vasylyovych GELYUNENKO</b> 23/06/1966	Bila Tserkva Court, 19/05/2009
118.	53963/10 10/09/2010	<b>Olga Pavlivna PASHATSKA</b> 12/02/1956 (Russian)	Higher Administrative Court, 08/10/2008
119.	60317/10 07/10/2010	<b>Kateryna Avksentiyivna KUYTUKLU</b> 23/12/1953	1) Pokrovske Court, 02/02/2009 2) Pokrovske Court, 02/02/2009
120.	61768/10 07/10/2010	<b>FEYA, MPP</b>	1) Donetsk Regional Commercial Court, 24/05/2007 2) Donetsk Regional Commercial Court, 18/02/2008
121.	66873/10 05/11/2010	<b>Nina Petrivna MOZGOVA</b> 19/01/1947	1) Svitlovodsk Court, 15/08/2005 2) Svitlovodsk Court, 31/07/2006 3) Svitlovodsk Court, 20/07/2007
122.	68454/10 11/11/2010	<b>Oleksandr Kostyantynovych SHEVCHENKO</b> 11/02/1957	1) Oleksandriya Court, 14/11/2007 2) Oleksandriya Court, 04/11/2008 3) Oleksandriya Court, 04/11/2008
123.	69251/10 18/11/2010	<b>Nina Ivanivna PINUS</b> 16/04/1957	1) Svitlovodsk Court, 20/12/2007 2) Svitlovodsk Court, 26/08/2009
124.	70834/10 25/11/2010	<b>Grigoriy Yefimovich LIZOGUB</b> 13/04/1933	Lugansk Circuit Administrative Court, 02/02/2009
125.	71290/10 19/11/2010	<b>Lidiya Petrivna CHUNYKHINA</b> 01/01/1954	Shostka Court, 13/05/2008

**APPENDIX 2**  
(non-enforcement delays less than three years)

<b>No.</b>	<b>Application no. and date of introduction</b>	<b>Applicant's name date of birth (if known)</b>	<b>Relevant domestic decisions</b>
126.	42136/09 23/07/2009	<b>Volodymyr Yakovych GOLOTA</b> 12/07/1953	Shakhtarsk Court, 07/12/2007
127.	71588/10 27/11/2010	<b>Oleksiy Illich LOPATIN</b> 24/03/1917 <b>Rayisa Mykhaylivna KORZHOVA</b> 30/03/1921	Khmelnyskyy Circuit Administrative Court, 17/10/2008 (award given to each of the applicants)