



EUROPEAN COURT OF HUMAN RIGHTS
COUR EUROPÉENNE DES DROITS DE L'HOMME

FIRST SECTION

DECISION

*This decision is to be read in view of the decision adopted on 17 December 2020
in respect of application no. 15641/09*

Application no. 51249/08
Anatoliy Vyacheslavovich KARULIN against Russia
and 29 other applications
(see list appended)

The European Court of Human Rights (First Section), sitting on 12 June 2012 as a Committee composed of:

Peer Lorenzen, *President*,

Elisabeth Steiner,

Khanlar Hajiyev, *judges*,

and André Wampach, *Deputy Section Registrar*,

Having regard to the above applications lodged on different dates tabulated in the appendix below,

Having deliberated, decides as follows:

THE FACTS

The applicants are thirty Russian nationals whose names and dates of birth are tabulated in the appendix below. The Russian Government (“the Government”) were represented by Mr G. Matyushkin, the Representative of the Russian Federation at the European Court of Human Rights.

In these cases the applicants complained under Article 6 § 1 of the Convention and under Article 1 of Protocol No. 1 about non-enforcement of domestic judgements ordering to provide them with monetary subsidy for housing.

On 10 March 2010 the Court communicated the applicants' complaints to the respondent Government under Rule 54 § 2 (b) of the Rules of Court. The Government submitted their observations on the admissibility and merits of the cases on 15 September 2010.

By letters of 27 September 2010, the applicants were invited to submit, by 29 November 2010, their comments on the Government's observations, together with any claims for just satisfaction. No replies were received to the Court's letters.

In view of the absence of the applicants' replies, by letters of 16 February 2011, sent by registered mail, the applicants were informed that the time-limit for submission of their observations and/or claims for just satisfaction had expired on 29 November 2010, and that no extension of time had been requested. No responses followed. In the case of Mr S.L. Sinichenkov, the letter was returned to the Court because of the applicant's death. No relatives expressed their wish to maintain the application in his stead.

THE LAW

The Court considers that, in these circumstances, the applicants may be regarded as no longer wishing to pursue their applications, within the meaning of Article 37 § 1 (a) of the Convention. Furthermore, in accordance with Article 37 § 1 *in fine*, the Court finds no special circumstances regarding respect for human rights as defined in the Convention and its Protocols which require the continued examination of the cases.

In view of the above, it is appropriate to strike the cases out of the list.

For these reasons, the Court unanimously

Decides to join the applications;

Decides to strike the applications out of its list of cases.

André Wampach
Deputy Registrar

Peer Lorenzen
President

No	Application No	Lodged on	Applicant Date of birth Place of residence
1.	51249/08	13/08/2008	Anatoliy Vyacheslavovich KARULIN 12/08/1972 Perm
2.	59831/08	07/11/2008	Aleksandr Viktorovich KOLESNICHENKO 28/06/1972 Perm
3.	1723/09	08/11/2008	Natalya Borisovna MAYSTRENKO 25/11/1951 Perm
4.	3735/09	22/12/2008	Valentina Vitalyevna VASILYEVA 25/03/1951 Perm
5.	5673/09	05/12/2008	Albert Salavatovich GARYAYEV 16/02/1976 Yubileynyy, Perm Region
6.	8531/09	31/12/2008	Vladimir Vitalyevich CHEBOTAREV 29/09/1948 Yubileynyy, Perm Region
7.	10068/09	22/01/2009	Anton Vladimirovich CHEBOTAREV 23/05/1977 Perm
8.	10073/09	20/01/2009	Vladimir Andreyevich NADUYALOV 27/09/1948 Yubileynyy, Perm Region
9.	10359/09	23/01/2009	Lyudmila Aleksandrovna SHCHERBAKOVA 08/06/1951 Yubileynyy, Perm Region
10.	11212/09	20/01/2009	Oleg Nikolayevich KHOROBRYKH 04/11/1956 Perm
11.	12694/09	28/01/2009	Rimma Nikolayevna PECHENKINA 26/05/1953 Perm
12.	15641/09	10/02/2009	Ivan Alekseyevich VDOVIN 05/01/1945 Perm

No	Application No	Lodged on	Applicant Date of birth Place of residence
13.	18103/09	16/02/2009	Vladimir Viktorovich VAKHRUSHEV 27/04/1952 Chernushka, Perm Region
14.	18708/09	15/11/2008	Aleksandra Nikolayevna SHULAKOVA 21/10/1952 Kultayevo, Perm Region
15.	18710/09	14/11/2008	Olga Nikitichna POPOVA 18/10/1946 Gornyy, Perm Region
16.	21927/09	04/04/2009	Gennadiy Yuryevich MELNIKOV 24/10/1967 Perm
17.	23916/09	04/04/2009	Konstantin Petrovich FOMINTSEV 05/08/1958 Perm
18.	23933/09	04/04/2009	Viktor Ivanovich ZAKHAROV 21/11/1945 Perm
19.	25866/09	14/04/2009	Igor Nikolayevich LEBEDEV 07/12/1971 Perm
20.	25960/09	14/04/2009	Zinaida Aleksandrovna LEBEDEVA 07/01/1951 Solikamsk, Perm Region
21.	25962/09	14/04/2009	Iraida Alekseyevna KOREPANOVA 06/03/1951 Perm
22.	28966/09	25/04/2009	Mikhail Vasilyevich VYLEGZHANIN 13/08/1963 Perm
23.	31359/09	03/03/2009	Vladimir Vasilyevich KOROVKIN 23/04/1953 Perm
24.	32843/09	20/05/2009	Aleksandr Petrovich TSENEV 01/03/1952 Perm
25.	45738/09	27/07/2009	Sergey Leonidovich SINICHENKOV 24/01/1960 Shumikhinskiy, Perm Region

No	Application No	Lodged on	Applicant Date of birth Place of residence
26.	50484/09	03/08/2009	Lyudmila Tikhonovna SHIROKOVA 26/09/1974 Solikamsk, Perm Region
27.	51679/09	06/04/2009	Sergey Viktorovich ZAKHAROV 03/03/1976 Perm
28.	54393/09	17/09/2009	Nadezhda Vasilyevna LYALINA 06/03/1956 Gremyachinsk, Perm Region
29.	63422/09	07/11/2009	Aleksandr Arkadyevich BERDNIKOV 18/04/1958 Gremyachinsk, Perm Region
30.	66046/09	27/11/2009	Nikolay Vasilyevich SHAPEYEV 07/12/1960 Kondratovo, Perm Region