

EUROPEAN COURT OF HUMAN RIGHTS
COUR EUROPÉENNE DES DROITS DE L'HOMME

FIFTH SECTION

DECISION

Application no. 15387/08
Olena Ivanivna SKUTELNYK and Others against Ukraine
and 3 other applications
(see appended table)

The European Court of Human Rights (Fifth Section), sitting on 21 September 2017 as a Committee composed of:

Nona Tsotsoria, *President,*
Gabriele Kucsko-Stadlmayer,
Lətif Hüseynov, *judges,*

and Liv Tigerstedt, *Acting Deputy Section Registrar,*

Having regard to the above applications lodged on the various dates indicated in the appended table,

Having regard to the observations submitted by the respondent Government and the observations in reply submitted by the applicants,

Having deliberated, decides as follows:

FACTS AND PROCEDURE

The list of applicants and the relevant details of the applications are set out in the appended table.

The applicants' complaints under Articles 6 § 1 and 13 of the Convention concerning the excessive length of civil proceedings and the lack of any effective remedy in domestic law were communicated to the Ukrainian Government ("the Government"). Some applicants also raised other complaints under the provisions of the Convention.

THE LAW

A. Joinder of the applications

Having regard to the similar subject matter of the applications, the Court finds it appropriate to examine them jointly in a single decision.

B. Complaints under Articles 6 § 1 and 13 of the Convention (excessive length of civil proceedings and the lack of any effective remedy in domestic law)

The Court, having examined all the materials submitted to it and having regard to its case-law on the subject, considers that the applicants' complaints under this head are inadmissible since the length of the proceedings was not excessive or unreasonable (see, *Yuryeva and Yuryev v. Ukraine*, no. 3431/03, § 43, 31 July 2012).

Furthermore, the complaints raised by the applicants in application no. 13561/12 concerning the proceedings between 6 August 2004 and 24 July 2009 must be dismissed for having been introduced out of time.

In view of the above, the Court finds that these complaints must be rejected in accordance with Article 35 §§ 1, 3 and 4 of the Convention.

C. Remaining complaints

In applications nos. 15387/08 and 13561/12, the applicants also raised other complaints under various articles of the Convention.

The Court has examined the applications and considers that, in the light of all the material in its possession and in so far as the matters complained of are within its competence, these complaints either do not meet the admissibility criteria set out in Articles 34 and 35 of the Convention or do not disclose any appearance of a violation of the rights and freedoms enshrined in the Convention or the Protocols thereto.

It follows that this part of the applications must be rejected in accordance with Article 35 § 4 of the Convention.

For these reasons, the Court, unanimously,

Decides to join the applications;

Declares the applications inadmissible.

Done in English and notified in writing on 12 October 2017.

Liv Tigerstedt
Acting Deputy Registrar

Nona Tsotsoria
President

APPENDIX

List of applications raising complaints under Article 6 § 1 and Article 13 of the Convention
(excessive length of civil proceedings and lack of any effective remedy in domestic law)

No.	Application no. Date of introduction	Applicant name Date of birth	Start of proceedings	End of proceedings	Total length Level of jurisdiction
1.	15387/08 14/03/2008	**Olena Ivanivna Skutelnyk** 07/07/1951	11/04/2000	05/05/2000	25 days 3 levels of jurisdiction
		Alla Mykolaivna Skutelnyk 26/11/1973	29/08/2000	20/11/2000	2 months and 23 days 3 levels of jurisdiction
			12/07/2004	25/09/2007	3 years, 2 months and 14 days 3 levels of jurisdiction
		Mykola Ivanovych Skutelnyk 21/01/1951	12/07/2004	25/09/2007	3 years, 2 months and 14 days 3 levels of jurisdiction
2.	13561/12 25/02/2012	**Eduard Sergiyovych Semyrenskyy** 22/01/1981	30/11/2005	03/02/2006	2 months and 5 days 3 levels of jurisdiction
		Olga Vasylivna Strygina 29/04/1955	07/06/2006	03/06/2008	1 year, 11 months and 28 days 3 levels of jurisdiction
			12/03/2009	30/11/2009	8 months and 19 days 3 levels of jurisdiction
			10/03/2010	14/12/2011	1 year, 9 months and 5 days 3 levels of jurisdiction
3.	10386/14 17/01/2014	**Oleg Ruslanovich Dobrodomov** 29/09/1964	02/10/2007	09/09/2013	5 years, 11 months and 8 days 3 levels of jurisdiction
4.	79022/16 09/11/2016	**Mykola Fedorovych Denysenko** 13/02/1943	01/03/2010	21/12/2011	1 year, 9 months and 21 days 3 levels of jurisdiction
			21/08/2015	20/05/2016	9 months 3 levels of jurisdiction