EUROPEAN COURT OF HUMAN RIGHTS
COUR EUROPÉENNE DES DROITS DE L'HOMME

SECOND SECTION

DECISION

Application no. 8090/09
Mevludi JIOSHVILI against Russia
and 58 other applications
(see list appended)

The European Court of Human Rights (Second Section), sitting on 19 October 2021 as a Chamber composed of:

Jon Fridrik Kjølbro, *President,*
Carlo Ranzoni,
Aleš Pejchal,
Dmitry Dedov,
Egidijus Kūris,
Pauliine Koskelo,
Marko Bošnjak, *judges,*

and Hasan Bakırcı, *Deputy Section Registrar*,

Having regard to the above applications lodged on the various dates indicated in the Appendix,

Having regard to the decision of 24 August 2011 to give notice of the applications to the Russian Government ("the Government") for information,

Having deliberated, decides as follows:

THE FACTS

1. A list of the applicants, all of whom are Georgian nationals, and the relevant details of the applications are set out in the Appendix.

2. The facts of the case, as submitted by the applicants, may be summarised as follows.

3. As a result of the armed conflict in August 2008 (see *Georgia v. Russia (II)* [GC], no. 38263/08, §§ 30-44, 21 January 2021), the applicants were forcibly displaced from their respective villages in South Ossetia and Abkhazia. To this day, they have no access to their homes and property.

COMPLAINTS

4. Relying on Article 1 of Protocol No. 1, all the applicants complain that they have been displaced because of the August 2008 armed conflict and have been unable to access their homes and property. They also allege that their property was destroyed or damaged as a result of the hostilities, sometime between 8 and 12 August 2008.

5. All the applicants, except those in applications nos. 14681/09 and 47954/09, reiterate the complaint concerning their inability to access their homes and property (see the previous paragraph) (i) under Article 8 of the Convention and Article 2 of Protocol No. 4 in respect of applications nos. 8153/09, 8204/09, 8525/09, 8538/09, 8554/09, 8603/09, 8799/09, 8912/09, 8989/09, 8996/09, 9218/09, 9239/09, 9891/09, 9913/09, 10046/09, 10341/09, 16518/09, 16574/09, 17296/09, 19795/09, 19810/09 and 52486/09; and (ii) only under Article 8 of the Convention in respect of applications nos. 8090/09, 8104/09, 8121/09, 8129/09, 8133/09, 8135/09, 8145/09, 8154/09, 8168/09, 8180/09, 8182/09, 8202/09, 8228/09, 8233/09, 8237/09, 8239/09, 8240/09, 8262/09, 8375/09, 8724/09, 9000/09, 9035/09, 9089/09, 9099/09, 9465/09, 19779/09, 20397/09, 20828/09, 22334/09, 22528/09, 25906/09, 25965/09, 26010/09, 26674/09 and 45691/09.

6. All the applicants – except those in applications nos. 14681/09, 45691/09 and 47954/09 – complain under Article 14 of the Convention that they have been discriminated against, on the basis of their ethnicity, in the enjoyment of their rights under the Convention.

7. All the applicants – except those mentioned in paragraph 6 above and those in application no. 19810/09 – also complain of not having been provided with an effective remedy in respect of their various complaints, as required by Article 13 of the Convention.

8. Relying on Article 2 of the Convention, the applicants in applications nos. 8090/09, 8104/09, 8121/09, 8129/09, 8133/09, 8135/09, 8145/09, 8153/09, 8154/09, 8168/09, 8180/09, 8182/09, 8202/09, 8204/09, 8228/09, 8233/09, 8237/09, 8239/09, 8240/09, 8262/09, 8375/09, 8525/09, 8538/09, 8603/09, 8912/09, 9089/09, 9239/09, 9891/09, 16574/09, 17296/09, 19795/09 and 47954/09 complained, in generic terms and without submitting evidence regarding the extent to which they or their relatives had been affected, about the active phase of hostilities and (i) the alleged risk to their relatives' and their own lives during the hostilities between 8 and 12 August 2008; (ii) the injuries allegedly received during that period; and/or (iii) the death of relatives.

9. The substance of the complaints under Article 2 of the Convention (see paragraph 8 above) was also raised under Article 3 of the Convention in applications nos. 8135/09, 8153/09, 8204/09, 8538/09, 8603/09, 8799/09, 8912/09, 8989/09, 8996/09, 9000/09, 9218/09, 9239/09, 9891/09, 9913/09, 10046/09, 10341/09, 17296/09, 19779/09, 19795/09, 20397/09, 20828/09,

22334/09, 22528/09, 25906/09, 25965/09, 26010/09, 26674/09 and 52486/09. Various applicants in the latter group of applications further alleged, without submitting evidence regarding the extent to which they might have been affected, that they had watched their homes burn while fleeing the hostilities. The applicants in application no. 9000/09 also complained of having been detained in poor conditions and having been subjected to ill-treatment during their detention.

10. The applicants in applications nos. 8204/09, 8799/09 and 8996/09 complained – without submitting evidence regarding their whereabouts or the extent to which they might have been affected – of having been unlawfully detained at different points in time in August 2008, in breach of Article 5 of the Convention. The applicants in application no. 9000/09 submitted that they had been detained in Tskhinvali and had been victims of forced labour, in breach of Articles 4 and 5 of the Convention. The first applicant in the same application submitted a poorly legible copy of a detainee identification document issued by the International Committee of the Red Cross to an individual under a different name and year of birth, explaining that he had given a false name at the time, out of fear of reprisals owing to his Ossetian ethnicity. The applicants in application no. 19810/09 complained, under Articles 5 and 7 of the Convention, of the potential risk of detention if they were to return to their village.

THE LAW

A. Joinder of the applications

11. Given their similar factual and legal background, the Court decides that the present fifty-nine applications (see the Appendix) should be joined pursuant to Rule 42 § 1 of the Rules of Court.

B. General considerations

12. The Court reiterates its findings reached in the inter-State case of *Georgia v. Russia (II)* ([GC], no. 38263/08, §§ 125-44 and 162-75, 21 January 2021) and in *Dzhioyeva and Others v. Georgia* ((dec.), nos. 24964/09, 20548/09 and 22469/09, §§ 23-30, 20 November 2018), *Naniyeva and Bagayev v. Georgia* ((dec.), nos. 2256/09 and 2260/09, §§ 19-26, 20 November 2018) and *Kudukhova v. Georgia* ((dec.), nos. 8274/09 and 8275/09, §§ 21-28, 20 November 2018). Those findings also apply to the present applications, in so far as relevant.

C. Complaints under Articles 8, 13 and 14 of the Convention, Article 1 of Protocol No. 1 and Article 2 of Protocol No. 4

13. Relying on Article 1 of Protocol No. 1, all the applicants argue that as a result of the armed conflict, their homes and other property were damaged and/or destroyed. They also complain that they were forced to flee their respective villages and, to date, have been unable to return.

14. Some of the applicants reiterated their complaint regarding their alleged inability to access their homes and property under Article 8 of the Convention and/or Article 2 of Protocol No. 4 (see paragraph 5 above).

15. Furthermore, various applicants complain under Article 13 of the Convention of the absence of an effective domestic remedy for their grievances and under Article 14 of having suffered discrimination in the enjoyment of their Convention rights (see paragraphs 6-7 above).

16. In support of their allegations, the applicants provided the Court with various items of *prima facie* evidence. In particular, the majority of the applicants submitted certificates issued by local authorities indicating their ownership of property. Other applicants submitted extracts from the Public Registry confirming the registration of their respective property rights. One applicant submitted a tenancy agreement in relation to a plot of land. Various other materials were also submitted, such as identification documents indicating residence in the respective villages, confirmation of the status of an internally displaced person, and/or local authorities' confirmation of residence in the villages concerned.

17. The relevant provisions relied on by the applicants read as follows:

Article 1 of Protocol No. 1

"Every natural or legal person is entitled to the peaceful enjoyment of his possessions. No one shall be deprived of his possessions except in the public interest and subject to the conditions provided for by law and by the general principles of international law.

..."

Article 8 of the Convention

"1. Everyone has the right to respect for his private and family life, his home and his correspondence.

2. There shall be no interference by a public authority with the exercise of this right except such as is in accordance with the law and is necessary in a democratic society in the interests of national security, public safety or the economic well-being of the country, for the prevention of disorder or crime, for the protection of health or morals, or for the protection of the rights and freedoms of others."

Article 13 of the Convention

"Everyone whose rights and freedoms as set forth in this Convention are violated shall have an effective remedy before a national authority notwithstanding that the violation has been committed by persons acting in an official capacity."

Article 14 of the Convention

"The enjoyment of the rights and freedoms set forth in this Convention shall be secured without discrimination on any ground such as sex, race, colour, language, religion, political or other opinion, national or social origin, association with a national minority, property, birth or other status."

18. At the outset, and in so far as the applicants complain regarding the alleged destruction of and/or damage to their property as a result of the hostilities, the Court reiterates its findings in the inter-State case of *Georgia v. Russia (II)* (cited above, § 144) that the events which occurred during the active phase of the hostilities (8 to 12 August 2008) did not fall within the jurisdiction of the Russian Federation for the purposes of Article 1 of the Convention. On that basis it declares inadmissible, in accordance with Article 35 §§ 3 (a) and 4 of the Convention, this limb of the applicants' complaints.

19. As to the complaints regarding the applicants' alleged inability to access their homes and property, the Court can accept, on the basis of the *prima facie* evidence submitted by them (see paragraph 16 above), that the applicants could have been adversely affected by the events of the conflict in question. The relevant circumstances, as described by the applicants, may, according to the Court's case-law, engage Articles 8, 13 and 14 of the Convention, Article 1 of Protocol No. 1 and/or Article 2 of Protocol No. 4 (see *Sargsyan v. Azerbaijan* [GC], no. 40167/06, §§ 219-26 and §§ 252-61, ECHR 2015, and *Georgia v. Russia (II)*, cited above, §§ 292-98).

20. The Court considers that it cannot, on the basis of the case file, determine the admissibility of the applicants' complaints relating to their alleged inability to access their homes and property. It is therefore necessary, in accordance with Rule 54 § 2 (b) of the Rules of Court, to give notice of this part of the applications (see paragraph 19 above) to the respondent Government.

D. Complaints under Article 5 of the Convention

21. The Court takes note of the complaints made by several applicants under Article 5 of the Convention (see paragraph 10 above).

22. It observes that only the first applicant in application no. 9000/09 submitted evidence in support of the allegation of having been detained in Tskhinvali. However, that document indicated a different name and year of birth from those of the applicant concerned. In the absence of any other corroborating evidence, the Court cannot take at face value the applicant's

explanation of his having given a false name to avoid negative repercussions based on his Ossetian ethnicity. The complaint is therefore unsubstantiated and must be rejected as manifestly ill-founded, in accordance with Article 35 §§ 3 and 4 of the Convention.

23. As regards the remaining complaints under Article 5, in view of the absence of any evidence to substantiate them, the Court finds them to be manifestly ill-founded. They must likewise be rejected in accordance with Article 35 §§ 3 (a) and 4 of the Convention.

E. Other complaints

24. The Court takes note of the complaints under Articles 2, 3, 4 and 7 of the Convention raised by several applicants (see paragraphs 8-10 above).

25. In the light of all the material in its possession, and in so far as the matters complained of are within the Court's competence, these complaints do not disclose any appearance of a violation of the rights and freedoms set out in the Convention or the Protocols thereto.

26. It follows that this part of the applications is manifestly ill-founded and must be rejected in accordance with Article 35 §§ 3 and 4 of the Convention.

For these reasons, the Court, unanimously

Decides to join the applications;

Decides to adjourn the examination of the applicants' complaints under Article 8 of the Convention, Article 1 of Protocol No. 1 and Article 2 of Protocol No. 4 in so far as their alleged inability to access their homes and property is concerned, and of the complaints under Articles 13 and 14 of the Convention, where relevant;

Declares the remainder of the applications inadmissible.

Done in English and notified in writing on 18 November 2021.

{signature_p_2}

Hasan Bakırcı
Deputy Registrar

Jon Fridrik Kjølbro
President

Appendix

No.	Application no.	Case name	Lodged on	Applicant Year of birth Place of residence before August 2008	Represented by
1.	8090/09	Jioshvili v. Russia	08/02/2009	**Mevludi JIOSHVILI** 1967 Kurta Village	Ms Ts. Javakhishvili
2.	8104/09	Sopio Gogidze v. Russia	08/02/2009	**Sopio GOGIDZE** 1977 Zemo Achabeti Village	Ms Ts. Javakhishvili
3.	8121/09	Gochashvili v. Russia	08/02/2009	**Lavrenti GOCHASHVILI** 1950 Kheiti Village	Ms Ts. Javakhishvili
4.	8129/09	Iveri Gochashvili v. Russia	08/02/2009	**Iveri GOCHASHVILI** 1990 Kheiti Village	Ms Ts. Javakhishvili
5.	8133/09	Chovelidze v. Russia	08/02/2009	**Ilia CHOVELIDZE** 1970 Achabeti Village	Ms Ts. Javakhishvili
6.	8135/09	Durglishvili v.	08/02/2009	**Bagrati DURGLISHVILI**	Ms Ts. Javakhishvili

No.	Application no.	Case name	Lodged on	Applicant Year of birth Place of residence before August 2008	Represented by
		Russia		1952 Avnevi Village	
7.	8145/09	Kakhniashvili v. Russia	08/02/2009	**Kristo KAKHNIASHVILI** 1949 Kurta Village	Ms Ts. Javakhishvili
8.	8153/09	Bugianishvili and Others v. Russia	06/02/2009	**1. Vazha BUGIANISHVILI** 1956 Kheiti Village **2. Otari GOCHASHVILI** 1949 Kheiti Village **3. Badri GOCHASHVILI** 1971 Kheiti Village	Mr N. Legashvili
9.	8154/09	Gherkenashvili v. Russia	08/02/2009	**Teimurazi GHERKENASHVILI** 1956 Kurta Village	Ms Ts. Javakhishvili
10.	8168/09	Melanashvili v. Russia	08/02/2009	**Nona MELANASHVILI** 1971 Kekhvi Village	Ms Ts. Javakhishvili

No.	Application no.	Case name	Lodged on	Applicant Year of birth Place of residence before August 2008	Represented by
11.	8180/09	Ivane Babutsidze v. Russia	08/02/2009	**Ivane BABUTSIDZE** 1925 Achabeti Village	Ms Ts. Javakhishvili
12.	8182/09	Giorgi Babutsidze v. Russia	08/02/2009	**Giorgi BABUTSIDZE** 1965 Achabeti Village	Ms Ts. Javakhishvili
13.	8202/09	Givi Babutsidze v. Russia	08/02/2009	**Givi BABUTSIDZE** 1936 Achabeti Village	Ms Ts. Javakhishvili
14.	8204/09	Gogidze and Others v. Russia	06/02/2009	**1. Lova GOGIDZE** 1962 Dzartsemi Village **2. Mamuka MAISURADZE** 1974 Dzartsemi Village **3. Kakha METREVELI** 1974 Dzartsemi Village **4. Mikheil GOGIDZE**	Mr. N. Legashvili

No.	Application no.	Case name	Lodged on	Applicant Year of birth Place of residence before August 2008	Represented by
				1930 Dzartsemi Village **5. Savjenko GUNDISHVILI** 1954 Dzartsemi Village **6. Zhenia MAISURADZE** 1926 Dzartsemi Village **7. Mania GUNDISHVILI** 1979 Dzartsemi Village **8. Sandro GUNDISHVILI** 1982 Dzartsemi Village **9. Kakha MAISURADZE** 1969 Dzartsemi Village	

No.	Application no.	Case name	Lodged on	Applicant Year of birth Place of residence before August 2008	Represented by
				10. Beglari GOGIDZE 1947 Dzartsemi Village **11. Elo GOGIDZE** 1930 Dzartsemi Village **12. Davit GOGIDZE** 1961 Dzartsemi Village **13. Khvicha GOGIDZE** 1967 Dzartsemi Village **14. Kolia CHOVELIDZE** 1960 Dzartsemi Village **15. Tarieli METREVELI** 1954 Dzartsemi Village	

No.	Application no.	Case name	Lodged on	Applicant Year of birth Place of residence before August 2008	Represented by
				16. Izolda OTINASHVILI 1940 Dzartsemi Village **17. Aleksandre GOGIDZE** 1958 Dzartsemi Village	
15.	8228/09	Kvrivishvili v. Russia	08/02/2009	**Tina KVRIVISHVILI** 1968 Achabeti Village	Ms Ts. Javakhishvili
16.	8233/09	Dali Jioshvili v. Russia	08/02/2009	**Dali JIOSHVILI** 1947 Kurta Village	Ms Ts. Javakhishvili
17.	8237/09	Megrelishvili v. Russia	08/02/2009	**Megi MEGRELISHVILI** 1972 Zemo Achabeti Village	Ms Ts. Javakhishvili
18.	8239/09	Lapachi v. Russia	08/02/2009	**Nana LAPACHI** 1967 Kurta Village	Ms Ts. Javakhishvili
19.	8240/09	Marine	08/02/2009	**Marine KAKHNIASHVILI**	Ms Ts. Javakhishvili

No.	Application no.	Case name	Lodged on	Applicant Year of birth Place of residence before August 2008	Represented by
		Kakhniashvili v. Russia		1963 Nuli Village	
20.	8262/09	Zangaladze v. Russia	08/02/2009	**Nora ZANGALADZE** 1936 Kekhvi Village	Ms Ts. Javakhishvili
21.	8375/09	Roin Babutsidze v. Russia	08/02/2009	**Roini BABUTSIDZE** 1965 Achabeti Village	Ms Ts. Javakhishvili
22.	8525/09	Khetagashvili and Others v. Russia	06/02/2009	**1. Kristo KHETAGASHVILI** 1949 Sveri Village **2. Emzar KHETAGASHVILI** 1979 Kemerti Village **3. Evgenia PAPELISHVILI** 1940 Sveri Village	Mr N. Legashvili
23.	8538/09	Shoshitashvili and Others v. Russia	06/02/2009	**1. Ramaz SHOSHITASHVILI** 1966 Ksuisi Village	Mr N. Legashvili

No.	Application no.	Case name	Lodged on	Applicant Year of birth Place of residence before August 2008	Represented by
				The applicant died on 4 April 2010; his wife, Tsisana Vazagovi, expressed her wish to pursue the application. **2. Klimenti VAZAGOVI** 1948 Ksuisi Village **3. Maia SHERAZADISHVILI** 1966 Ksuisi Village **4. Emzar SHOSHITASHVILI** 1970 Ksuisi Village	
24.	8554/09	Mindiashvili and Others v. Russia	06/02/2009	**1. Giorgi MINDIASHVILI** 1942 Kemerti Village **2. Mania KASRADZE** 1958 Kemerti Village	Mr N. Legashvili

No.	Application no.	Case name	Lodged on	Applicant Year of birth Place of residence before August 2008	Represented by
				3. Akaki GHERKENASHVILI 1956 Kemerti Village **4. Aleko OTINASHVILI** 1980 Kemerti Village **5. Vano OTINASHVILI** 1975 Kemerti Village **6. Tamaz KASRADZE** 1977 Kemerti Village **7. Nugzar KAULASHVILI** 1963 Kemerti Village **8. Roini GHERKENASHVILI** 1953	

No.	Application no.	Case name	Lodged on	Applicant Year of birth Place of residence before August 2008	Represented by
				Kemerti Village **9. Nikoloz OTINASHVILI** 1948 Kemerti Village **10. Nugzar KASRADZE** 1971 Kemerti Village **11. Elguja KASRADZE** 1940 Kemerti Village **12. Nukri KASRADZE** 1968 Kemerti Village **13. Dali GOCHASHVILI** 1956 Kemerti Village **14. Guram OTINASHVILI**	

No.	Application no.	Case name	Lodged on	Applicant Year of birth Place of residence before August 2008	Represented by
				1970 Kemerti Village **15. Gela OTINASHVILI** 1963 Kemerti Village **16. Khvicha OTINASHVILI** 1969 Kemerti Village **17. Jondo KASRADZE** 1960 Kemerti Village **18. Rusiko MAGHALDADZE** 1930 Kemerti Village **19. Data OTINASHVILI** 1954 Kemerti Village	

No.	Application no.	Case name	Lodged on	Applicant Year of birth Place of residence before August 2008	Represented by
				20. Badri GHERKENASHVILI 1966 Kemerti Village **21. Zaza OTINASHVILI** 1978 Kemerti Village **22. Rezo KASRADZE** 1957 Kemerti Village **23. Zurab OTINASHVILI** 1969 Kemerti Village **24. Guram KAULASHVILI** 1939 Kemerti Village **25. Zurab KAULASHVILI** 1966 Kemerti Village	

No.	Application no.	Case name	Lodged on	Applicant Year of birth Place of residence before August 2008	Represented by
				26. Omar GHERKENASHVILI 1969 Kemerti Village **27. Zurab METREVELI** 1969 Kemerti Village	
25.	8603/09	Kakhniashvili and Others v. Russia	06/02/2009	At the material time, all the applicants were residents of the Kekhvi Village **1. Nina KAKHNIASHVILI** 1935 **2. Nodar KAKHNIASHVILI** 1965 **3. Nugzar KAKHNIASHVILI** 1962 **4. Bichiko BLIADZE** 1979	Mr N. Legashvili

No.	Application no.	Case name	Lodged on	Applicant Year of birth Place of residence before August 2008	Represented by
				5. Malkhaz MELANASHVILI 1962 **6. Gusein MELANASHVILI** 1938 **7. Koba MELANASHVILI** 1971 **8. Ivane MELANASHVILI** 1963 **9. Tamar KAPANADZE** 1959 **10. Kristepore NEBIERIDZE** 1965 **11. Korneli KAKHNIASHVILI** 1941 **12. Rezo ZANGALADZE**	

No.	Application no.	Case name	Lodged on	Applicant Year of birth Place of residence before August 2008	Represented by
				1929 **13. Levan KAKHNIASHVILI** 1961 **14. Genadi KAKHNIASHVILI** 1951 **15. Nikoloz MELANASHVILI** 1973 **16. Mamuka MELANASHVILI** 1972	
26.	8724/09	Terashvili v. Russia	08/02/2009	**Irina TERASHVILI** 1958 Beloti Village	Ms Ts. Javakhishvili
27.	8799/09	Shoshitashvili v. Russia	09/02/2009	**Revaz SHOSHITASHVILI** 1966 Ksuisi Village	Ms J. Evans
28.	8912/09	Zubashvili and Others v. Russia	09/02/2009	**1. Zaur ZUBASHVILI** 1946 Kheiti Village	Ms J. Evans

No.	Application no.	Case name	Lodged on	Applicant Year of birth Place of residence before August 2008	Represented by
				2. Tamaz KULICHISHVILI 1960 Kheiti Village *The applicant died on 19 September 2012; his wife expressed her wish to pursue the application. The case-file material does not include any documents demonstrating kinship.* **3. Giorgi KULICHISHVILI** 1953 Kheiti Village	
29.	8989/09	Shoshitashvili and Others v. Russia	09/02/2009	**1. Revaz SHOSHITASHVILI** 1933 Ksuisi Village **2. Opelia SHOSHITASHVILI** 1957 Ksuisi Village **3. Ioseb SHOSHITASHVILI**	Ms J. Evans

No.	Application no.	Case name	Lodged on	Applicant Year of birth Place of residence before August 2008	Represented by
				1967 Ksuisi Village *The applicant died on 19 September 2012; his wife expressed her wish to pursue the application.*	
30.	8996/09	Askilashvili and Others v. Russia	09/02/2009	**1. Ilia ASKILASHVILI** 1934 Atsriskhevi Village **2. Gocha ASKILASHVILI** 1972 Atsriskhevi Village **3. Jemal VAZAGASHVILI** 1952 Atsriskhevi Village **4. Givi ASKILASHVILI** 1956 Atsriskhevi Village	Ms J. Evans
31.	9000/09	Jioevi and Kakhniashvili v.	06/02/2009	**1. Aslani JIOEVI** 1949	Ms V. Jijelava

No.	Application no.	Case name	Lodged on	Applicant Year of birth Place of residence before August 2008	Represented by
		Russia		Kekhvi Village **2. Nikolozi KAKHNIASHVILI** 1932 Kekhvi Village	
32.	9035/09	Chulukhadze and Others v. Russia	06/02/2009	**1. Vladimer CHULUKHADZE** 1958 Zemo Achabeti Village **2. Roman ZOZIASHVILI** 1942 Zemo Achabeti Village **3. Salome KALIASHVILI** 1987 Zemo Achabeti Village **4. Jimsheri BABUTSIDZE** 1953 Zemo Achabeti Village **5. Bela CHULUKHADZE**	Ms V. Jijelava

No.	Application no.	Case name	Lodged on	Applicant Year of birth Place of residence before August 2008	Represented by
				1969 Zemo Achabeti Village **6. Bagrat TSERTSVADZE** 1982 Zemo Achabeti Village	
33.	9089/09	Davit Babutsidze and Others v. Russia	06/02/2009	**1. Davit BABUTSIDZE** 1978 Kvemo Achabeti Village **2. Elene ROMELASHVILI** 1950 Kvemo Achabeti Village **3. Tamar CHULUKHADZE** 1971 Kvemo Achabeti Village	Ms V. Jijelava
34.	9099/09	Begheluri v. Russia	06/02/2009	**Aleksandre BEGHELURI** 1930 Disevi Village	Ms V. Jijelava
35.	9218/09	Maraneli and Others v. Russia	09/02/2009	**1. Tania TASOEVA** 1937	Ms J. Evans

No.	Application no.	Case name	Lodged on	Applicant Year of birth Place of residence before August 2008	Represented by
				Avnevi Village **2. Zaira MARANELI** 1954 Avnevi Village **3. Gurgen DURGLISHVILI** 1935 Avnevi Village	
36.	9239/09	Nebieridze and Others v. Russia	09/02/2009	**1. Almiza NEBIERIDZE** 1936 Kekhvi Village *Following the death of the applicant, his daughter expressed her wish to pursue the application. The case-file material does not include any documents demonstrating kinship.* **2. Nazi BERUASHVILI** 1949 Kekhvi Village	Ms J. Evans

No.	Application no.	Case name	Lodged on	Applicant Year of birth Place of residence before August 2008	Represented by
				3. Suliko MELANASHVILI 1934 Kekhvi Village **4. Merab KASRADZE** 1953 Kekhvi Village **5. Malkhaz KAKHNIASHVILI** 1959 Kekhvi Village **6. Vladimer KAKHNIASHVILI** 1933 Kekhvi Village **7. Koba KAKHNIASHVILI** 1968 Kekhvi Village **8. Bidzina KAKHNIASHVILI** 1964 Kekhvi Village	

No.	Application no.	Case name	Lodged on	Applicant Year of birth Place of residence before August 2008	Represented by
37.	9465/09	Gherkenashvili and Others v. Russia	06/02/2009	**1. Maia GHERKENASHVILI** 1972 Kekhvi Village **2. Mzevinar KAKHNIASHVILI** 1963 Kekhvi Village **3. Mzia NEBIERIDZE** 1964 Kekhvi Village **4. Nodar MELANASHVILI** 1957 Kekhvi Village	Ms Ts. Javakhishvili
38.	9891/09	Gochashvili v. Russia	11/02/2009	**1. Eliko GOCHASHVILI** 1952 Kheiti Village **2. Akaki GOCHASHVILI** 1951 Kheiti Village	Mr N. Legashvili

No.	Application no.	Case name	Lodged on	Applicant Year of birth Place of residence before August 2008	Represented by
39.	9913/09	Datashvili and Others v. Russia	13/02/2009	At the material time, all the applicants were residents of the Tamarasheni Village **1. Venera DATASHVILI** 1938 *Following the death of the applicant, her daughter expressed her wish to pursue the application. The case-file material does not include any documents demonstrating kinship.* **2. Guram KHETERELI** 1934 *Following the death of the applicant, his daughter expressed her wish to pursue the application. The case-file material does not include any documents demonstrating kinship.* **3. Vasil GOGIDZE** 1970 **4. Gaioz GOGIDZE**	Mr E. Wesselink, Russian Justice Initiative

No.	Application no.	Case name	Lodged on	Applicant Year of birth Place of residence before August 2008	Represented by
				1943 **5. Ana DATASHVILI** 1935 **6. Aleksi NASUASHVILI** 1928 *Following the death of the applicant, his wife expressed her wish to pursue the application. The case-file material does not include any documents demonstrating kinship.* **7. Eter NASUASHVILI** 1928 **8. Alexandre DATASHVILI** 1965 **9. Merab NASUASHVILI** 1950 **10. Vladimer DATASHVILI**	

No.	Application no.	Case name	Lodged on	Applicant Year of birth Place of residence before August 2008	Represented by
				1985 **11. Emzari DATASHVILI** 1961 **12. Dali GIUNASHVILI** 1973 **13. Tsira DATASHVILI** 1948 **14. David DZADZAMIA** 1977 **15. Maia SANAKOEVA** 1968 **16. Ivane GOGIDZE** 1962 **17. Zakhar GOGIDZE** 1930	

No.	Application no.	Case name	Lodged on	Applicant Year of birth Place of residence before August 2008	Represented by
				18. Kartlos DATASHVILI 1947 **19. Valia AIDARASHVILI** 1945 **20. Koba TABATADZE** 1966 **21. Levan KUSIANI** 1938 **22. Davit ELBAKIDZE** 1971 **23. Lamara OTINASHVILI** 1956 **24. Guram DATASHVILI** 1933 **25. Giorgi DATASHVILI** 1981	

No.	Application no.	Case name	Lodged on	Applicant Year of birth Place of residence before August 2008	Represented by
40.	10046/09	Tsitsiloshvili v. Russia	10/02/2009	**Ramaz TSITSILOSHVILI** 1955 Vanati Village	Ms T. Dekanosidze
41.	10341/09	Beruashvili and Others v. Russia	17/02/2009	**1. Iason BERUASHVILI** 1931 Berula Village **2. Elene BERUASHVILI** 1928 Berula Village **3. Mevlud BERUASHVILI** 1960 Berula Village **4. Seriozha BERUASHVILI** 1957 Berula Village **5. Roland BERUASHVILI** 1959 Berula Village	Ms J. Evans

No.	Application no.	Case name	Lodged on	Applicant Year of birth Place of residence before August 2008	Represented by
				6. Givi BERUASHVILI 1947 Berula Village **7. Gia BERUASHVILI** 1960 Berula Village **8. Elguja BERUASHVILI** 1955 Berula Village **9. Guram BERUASHVILI** 1956 Berula Village **10. Nunu BERUASHVILI** 1942 Berula Village **11. Amiran MAISURADZE** 1956	

No.	Application no.	Case name	Lodged on	Applicant Year of birth Place of residence before August 2008	Represented by
				Berula Village **12. Tamaz ARCHUADZE** 1957 Berula Village **13. Dimitri BERUASHVILI** 1942 Berula Village **14. Vepkhia BERUASHVILI** 1969 Berula Village **15. Mikheil VAKHTANGASHVILI** 1926 Berula Village **16. Giorgi VAKHTANGASHVILI** 1958 Berula Village **17. Ia OZGEBISHVILI**	

No.	Application no.	Case name	Lodged on	Applicant Year of birth Place of residence before August 2008	Represented by
				1973 Berula Village **18. Maro VAKHTANGASHVILI** 1925 Berula Village **19. Nugzar VAKHTANGASHVILI** 1950 Berula Village **20. Davit OTINASHVILI** 1970 Berula Village **21. Alexander MAISURADZE** 1964 Berula Village **22. Nino BERUASHVILI** 1945 Berula Village	

No.	Application no.	Case name	Lodged on	Applicant Year of birth Place of residence before August 2008	Represented by
				The case file contains a supplementary list of applicants with additional names. *What link these additional names had to the application was not clarified.*	
42.	14681/09	Basishvili v. Russia	10/02/2009	**Grigol BASISHVILI** 1979 Kurta Village	N/A
43.	16518/09	Khaduri and Others v. Russia	20/03/2009	**1. Tamara KHADURI** 1935 Berula Village *The applicant died on 5 July 2013; her grandson expressed his wish to pursue the application. The case-file material does not include any documents demonstrating kinship.* **2. Zurabi KHADURI** 1987 Berula Village **3. Tariel BERUASHVILI**	Ms J. Evans

No.	Application no.	Case name	Lodged on	Applicant Year of birth Place of residence before August 2008	Represented by
				1957 Berula Village **4. Elnari VAKHTANGASHVILI** 1951 Berula Village	
44.	16574/09	Tsotniashvili v. Russia	20/03/2009	**Ivlite TSOTNIASHVILI** 1938 Eredvi Village	Ms J. Evans
45.	17296/09	Datashvili v. Russia	08/02/2009	**Zakaria DATASHVILI** 1946 1946 Tamarasheni Village	Mr B. Botchorishvili
46.	19779/09	Balashvili v. Russia	12/02/2009	**Merab BALASHVILI** 1950 Akhalgori	N/A
47.	19795/09	Beruashvili v. Russia	02/03/2009	**Sonia BERUASHVILI** 1927 Berula Village	Mr N. Legashvili
48.	19810/09	Iamze and Zaza Machabelli v.	15/02/2009	**1. Iamze MACHABELLI** 1963	Mr B. Maghradze

No.	Application no.	Case name	Lodged on	Applicant Year of birth Place of residence before August 2008	Represented by
		Russia		Tbilisi/Kurta Village **2. Zaza MACHABELLI** 1964 Tbilisi/Kurta Village	
49.	20397/09	Merab Beruashvili and Others v. Russia	17/02/2009	**1. Merab BERUASHVILI** 1947 Eredvi Village **2. Beglar BOTSVADZE** 1941 Mamisaantubani Village **3. Irma MESHVILDISHVILI** 1964 Village Berula **4. Koba BOTSVADZE** 1980 Mamisaantubani Village **5. Grunia ODIKADZE**	Mr E. Paksadze

No.	Application no.	Case name	Lodged on	Applicant Year of birth Place of residence before August 2008	Represented by
				1947 Gori	
50.	20828/09	Kekelishvili and Others v. Russia	17/02/2009	**1. Tariel KEKELISHVILI** 1946 Kheiti Village **2. Guram KULICHISHVILI** 1955 Kheiti Village **3. Gela KEKELISHVILI** 1960 Kheiti Village **4. Zaza SHERAZADASHVILI** 1967 Kheiti Village **5. Mamuka KEKELISHVILI** 1971 Kheiti Village	Mr E. Paksadze
51.	22334/09	Zangaladze and	17/02/2009	**1. Mamuka ZANGALADZE**	Mr E. Paksadze

No.	Application no.	Case name	Lodged on	Applicant Year of birth Place of residence before August 2008	Represented by
		Others v. Russia		1974 Kekhvi Village **2. Mamuka NEBIERIDZE** 1971 Kekhvi Village **3. Natela NEBIERIDZE** 1946 Kekhvi Village **4. Merab ZANGALADZE** 1949 Kekhvi Village **5. Teimuraz NEBIERIDZE** 1956 Kekhvi Village **6. Ramaz GHONGHADZE** 1965 Kekhvi Village	

No.	Application no.	Case name	Lodged on	Applicant Year of birth Place of residence before August 2008	Represented by
				7. Teimuraz KAKHNIASHVILI 1947 Kekhvi Village **8. Otar KAKHNIASHVILI** 1949 Kekhvi Village	
52.	22528/09	Nikorashvili v. Russia	17/02/2009	**Narimand NIKORASHVILI** 1951 Prisi Village	Mr E. Paksadze
53.	25906/09	Ketevan Nikolishvili v. Russia	17/02/2009	**Ketevan NIKOLISHVILI** 1928 Vanati Village	Mr E. Paksadze
54.	25965/09	Tchovelidze and Others v. Russia	17/02/2009	**1. Elizbar TCHOVELIDZE** 1963 Dzartsemi Village Georgian **2. Ioseb METREVELI** 1960 Dzartsemi Village	Mr E. Paksadze

No.	Application no.	Case name	Lodged on	Applicant Year of birth Place of residence before August 2008	Represented by
				3. Vakhtang METREVELI 1931 Dzartsemi Village **4. Zurab METREVELI** 1951 Dzartsemi Village **5. Alik TCHOVELIDZE** 1977 Dzartsemi Village **6. Goderdzi TCHOVELIDZE** 1980 Dzartsemi Village **7. Vazha TCHOVELIDZE** 1958 Dzartsemi Village **8. Arsen TCHOVELIDZE** 1932 Dzartsemi Village	

No.	Application no.	Case name	Lodged on	Applicant Year of birth Place of residence before August 2008	Represented by
55.	26010/09	Guram Otinashvili and Others v. Russia	17/02/2009	**1. Guram OTINASHVILI** 1946 Kemerti Village **2. Teimuraz BERUASHVILI** 1958 Kemerti Village **3. Severian KASRADZE** 1931 Kemerti Village **4. Tengiz KASRADZE** 1949 Kemerti Village **5. Kristo KASRADZE** 1947 Kemerti Village **6. Natela METREVELI** 1930 Kemerti Village	Mr E. Paksadze

No.	Application no.	Case name	Lodged on	Applicant Year of birth Place of residence before August 2008	Represented by
				7. Mikheil KASRADZE 1957 Kemerti Village **8. Vazha KASRADZE** 1954 Kemerti Village **9. Morisi GHERKENASHVILI** 1970 Kemerti Village **10. Akaki METREVELI** 1957 Kemerti Village **11. Ivane OTINASHVILI** 1941 Kemerti Village **12. Vaso OTINASHVILI** 1977	

No.	Application no.	Case name	Lodged on	Applicant Year of birth Place of residence before August 2008	Represented by
				Kemerti Village **13. Vazha METREVELI** 1953 Kemerti Village **14. Jemal METREVELI** 1962 Kemerti Village **15. Emzar MINDIASHVILI** 1967 Kemerti Village **16. Givi METREVELI** 1959 Kemerti Village **17. Anzor KASRADZE** 1965 Kemerti Village **18. Zurab KASRADZE**	

No.	Application no.	Case name	Lodged on	Applicant Year of birth Place of residence before August 2008	Represented by
				1968 Kemerti Village **19. Gia METREVELI** 1974 Kemerti Village **20. Ramaz OTINASHVILI** 1987 Kemerti Village **21. Tamaz OTINASHVILI** 1956 Kemerti Village **22. Levan OTINASHVILI** 1959 Kemerti Village **23. Guram Otinashvili** 1946 Kemerti Village	

No.	Application no.	Case name	Lodged on	Applicant Year of birth Place of residence before August 2008	Represented by
				24. Elene ZAALISHVILI 1945 Kemerti Village **25. Leri GHERKENASHVILI** 1963 Kemerti Village **26. Parven METREVELI** 1939 Gori Georgian **27. Zurab OTINASHVILI** 1982 Kemerti Village **28. Temur OTINASHVILI** 1992 Kemerti Village **29. Vladimer OTINASHVILI** 1925	

No.	Application no.	Case name	Lodged on	Applicant Year of birth Place of residence before August 2008	Represented by
				Kemerti Village **30. Daro MAGHALDADZE** 1936 Kemerti Village **31. Elo KASRADZE** 1929 Kemerti Village **32. Aleksandre KASRADZE** 1954 Kemerti Village **33. Genari KASRADZE** 1974 Kemerti Village	
56.	26674/09	Nasuashvili and Others v. Russia	17/02/2009	**1. Shalva NASUASHVILI** 1972 Tamarasheni Village **2. Mamuka NASUASHVILI** 1968	Mr E. Paksadze

No.	Application no.	Case name	Lodged on	Applicant Year of birth Place of residence before August 2008	Represented by
				Tamarasheni Village **3. Vera NASUASHVILI** 1938 Tamarasheni Village **4. Rusudan GOCHASHVIILI** 1985 Tamarasheni Village **5. Jemal MINDIASHVILI** 1942 Tamarasheni Village **6. Malkhaz KHUBULOVI** 1970 Tamarasheni Village **7. Zurab TCHOVELIDZE** 1957 Tamarasheni Village **8. Maia KAKHNIASHVILI**	

No.	Application no.	Case name	Lodged on	Applicant Year of birth Place of residence before August 2008	Represented by
				1966 Tamarasheni Village	
57.	45691/09	Maghaldadze v. Russia	22/01/2009	**1. Ramin MAGHALDADZE** 1980 Kemerti Village **2. Vladimer MAGHALDADZE** 1946 Kemerti Village	N/A
58.	47954/09	Maruashvili v. Russia	03/08/2009	**Liana MARUASHVILI** 1959 Ptishi Village	N/A
59.	52486/09	Turashvili and Others v. Russia	10/02/2009	**1. Tristan TURASHVILI** 1943 Argvitsi Village **2. Vakhtang ASKILASHVILI** 1930 Argvitsi Village **3. Zuriko MIDODASHVILI** 1965	Ms J. Evans

No.	Application no.	Case name	Lodged on	Applicant Year of birth Place of residence before August 2008	Represented by
				Argvitsi Village **4. Nona GIGUASHVILI** 1973 Argvitsi Village **5. Valeri MIDODASHVILI** 1954 Argvitsi Village **6. Gia MIDODASHVILI** 1962 Argvitsi Village **7. Durmishkhan MIDODASHVILI** 1956 Argvitsi Village **8. Vazha MIDODASHVILI** 1965 Argvitsi Village **9. Zuriko ROMELASHVILI**	

No.	Application no.	Case name	Lodged on	Applicant Year of birth Place of residence before August 2008	Represented by
				1967 Argvitsi Village	