EUROPEAN COURT OF HUMAN RIGHTS
COUR EUROPÉENNE DES DROITS DE L'HOMME

# FIFTH SECTION

# DECISION

Application no. 56042/07
Mariya Petrovna DYOMINA against Ukraine
and 9 other applications
(see list appended)

The European Court of Human Rights (Fifth Section), sitting on 15 December 2016 as a Committee composed of:

Khanlar Hajiyev, *President,*
Faris Vehabović,
Carlo Ranzoni, *judges,*
and Hasan Bakırcı, *Deputy Section Registrar,*

Having regard to the above applications lodged on the various dates indicated in the appended table,

Having regard to the observations submitted by the respondent Government and the observations in reply submitted by some of the applicants,

Having deliberated, decides as follows:

## FACTS AND PROCEDURE

The list of applicants and the relevant details of the applications are set out in the appended table.

The applicants' complaints under Articles 6 § 1 and 13 of the Convention concerning the excessive length of civil proceedings and the lack of any effective remedy in domestic law were communicated to the Ukrainian Government ("the Government"). Some applicants also raised other complaints under the provisions of the Convention.

# THE LAW

## A. Joinder of the applications

Having regard to the similar subject matter of the applications, the Court finds it appropriate to examine them jointly in a single decision.

## B. Complaints under Articles 6 § 1 and 13 of the Convention (excessive length of civil proceedings and lack of any effective remedy in domestic law)

The Court, having examined all the materials submitted to it and having regard to its case-law on the subject (see, for example, *Yuryeva and Yuryev v. Ukraine*, no. 3431/03, § 43, 31 July 2012), considers that the applicants' complaints under this head are inadmissible since the length of the proceedings was not excessive or unreasonable. It further notes that in applications nos. 9851/08, 48227/10 and 63025/15 the applicants' complaints have been introduced out of time.

In view of the above, the Court finds that these complaints are manifestly ill-founded and must be rejected in accordance with Article 35 §§ 1, 3 and 4 of the Convention.

## C. Remaining complaints

Some applicants also raised other complaints under various articles of the Convention.

The Court has examined the applications listed in the appended table and considers that, in the light of all the material in its possession and in so far as the matters complained of are within its competence, these complaints either do not meet the admissibility criteria set out in Articles 34 and 35 of the Convention or do not disclose any appearance of a violation of the rights and freedoms enshrined in the Convention or the Protocols thereto.

It follows that this part of the applications must be rejected in accordance with Article 35 § 4 of the Convention.

For these reasons, the Court, unanimously,

*Decides* to join the applications;

*Declares* the applications inadmissible.

Done in English and notified in writing on 12 January 2017.

Hasan Bakırcı
Deputy Registrar

Khanlar Hajiyev
President

# APPENDIX

List of applications raising complaints under Article 6 § 1 and Article 13 of the Convention
(excessive length of civil proceedings and lack of any effective remedy in domestic law)

| No. | Application no.<br>Date of introduction | Applicant name<br>Date of birth | Start of proceedings | End of proceedings | Total length<br>Level of jurisdiction |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| 1. | 56042/07<br>04/12/2007 | **Mariya Petrovna DYOMINA**<br>01/01/1929 | 02/02/2003 | 29/01/2008 | 4 years, 11 months and 28 days<br>3 levels of jurisdiction |
| 2. | 753/08<br>29/11/2007 | **Valeriy Nikolayevich BONDAR**<br>26/04/1954 | 31/07/2001<br><br>10/02/2003 | 31/10/2002<br><br>04/07/2007 | 1 year, 3 months and 1 day<br>3 levels of jurisdiction<br><br>4 years, 4 months and 25 days<br>3 levels of jurisdiction |
| 3. | 9851/08<br>19/02/2008 | **Mykola Vasylyovych MAZURKEVYCH**<br>14/06/1941 | 11/09/1997 | 26/02/2004 | 6 years, 5 months and 16 days<br>3 levels of jurisdiction |
| 4. | 20369/08<br>12/04/2008 | **Valentyna Vasylivna LUKIYENKO**<br>28/03/1982 | 30/11/2001<br><br>19/06/2006 | 14/05/2002<br><br>09/02/2008 | 5 months and 15 days<br>3 levels of jurisdiction<br><br>1 year, 7 months and 22 days<br>3 levels of jurisdiction |
| 5. | 59448/08<br>22/11/2008 | **Boguslav Stanislavovych SKOKOVSKYY**<br>27/05/1952 | 26/09/2002 | 02/06/2008 | 5 years, 8 months and 8 days<br>3 levels of jurisdiction |
| 6. | 8649/09<br>04/02/2009 | **Petro Ivanovych YAREMA**<br>26/06/1960 | 19/02/2003 | 11/12/2008 | 5 years, 9 months and 23 days<br>3 levels of jurisdiction |

| No. | Application no.<br>Date of introduction | Applicant name<br>Date of birth | Start of proceedings | End of proceedings | Total length<br>Level of jurisdiction |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| 7. | 18435/09<br>27/02/2009 | **Lidiya Panteleyevna DERKACH**<br>01/07/1950 | 21/01/2002 | 18/05/2007 | 5 years, 3 months and 28 days<br>3 levels of jurisdiction |
| 8. | 48227/10<br>07/08/2010 | **Mykola Pavlovych LOZOVYY**<br>15/05/1947 | 20/06/2002 | 29/10/2008 | 6 years, 4 months and 10 days<br>3 levels of jurisdiction |
| 9. | 74637/10<br>07/12/2010 | **Svitlana Oleksandrivna BUDYNSKA**<br>19/08/1938 | 31/05/2006 | 09/06/2010 | 4 years and 10 days<br>3 levels of jurisdiction |
| 10. | 63025/15<br>20/01/2016 | **Oleg Oleksandrovych VITYUTNEV**<br>30/03/1975 | 01/02/2008 | 21/05/2015 | 7 years, 3 months and 21 days<br>3 levels of jurisdiction |