EUROPEAN COURT OF HUMAN RIGHTS
COUR EUROPÉENNE DES DROITS DE L'HOMME

SECOND SECTION

DECISION

Application no. 24077/19
Muzaffer AYDIN against Türkiye
and 18 other applications
(see list appended)

The European Court of Human Rights (Second Section), sitting on 20 May 2025 as a Committee composed of:

Jovan Ilievski*, President*,
Péter Paczolay,
Davor Derenčinović*, judges*,
and Dorothee von Arnim, *Deputy Section Registrar,*

Having regard to:

the applications against the Republic of Türkiye lodged with the Court under Article 34 of the Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms ("the Convention") by nineteen Turkish nationals, whose relevant details are listed in Appendix I ("the applicants"), on the various dates indicated therein;

the decision to give notice of the complaints concerning conditions of detention under Article 3 of the Convention to the Turkish Government ("the Government") represented by their Agent at the time, Mr Hacı Ali Açıkgül, former Head of the Department of Human Rights of the Ministry of Justice of the Republic of Türkiye, and to declare the remainder of the applications inadmissible;

the parties' observations;

Having deliberated, decides as follows:

SUBJECT MATTER OF THE CASE

1. At the time of the events giving rise to the present applications, the applicants were detained in closed penal institutions for terrorism-related offences in connection with the attempted coup of 15 July 2016.

2. The applications concern the allegedly inadequate conditions of the applicants' detention, in particular overcrowding, under Article 3 of the Convention (see for the relevant information Appendices II and III below).

3. All applicants brought proceedings before enforcement judges on different dates. Their objections were later dismissed by the assize courts. Subsequently, they submitted individual applications complaining about their conditions of detention to the Constitutional Court, which rejected them as inadmissible on various dates specified in Appendix I.

THE COURT'S ASSESSMENT

A. Joinder of the applications

4. Having regard to the similar subject matter of the applications, the Court finds it appropriate to examine them jointly.

B. The Government's request to strike out certain applications under Article 37 of the Convention

5. In their observations submitted in respect of certain applications (nos. 2186/20, 14870/20, 39382/20 and 45424/20), the Government argued that the applicants in those cases had failed to appoint a representative and, accordingly, invited the Court to strike the applications out of its list of cases, under Article 37 § 1 (a) of the Convention.

6. The Court notes that at the time the Government were given notice of the applications, the President of the Section granted leave to the applicants who were not represented by a lawyer to present their own case before the Court, in application of Rule 36 § 2 of the Rules of Court. That being the case, the Government's request must be dismissed.

C. Alleged violation of Article 3 of the Convention

1. The parties' submissions

7. Before the Court, all applicants complained of overcrowding (see for further details Appendices II and III below).

8. In addition to their complaints of overcrowding, the applicants in applications nos. 27572/19; 33060/19; 4517/20; 6514/20; no. 11531/20; 14870/20; 39382/20 and 41743/20 also complained about having to sleep on mattresses on the floor. The Government acknowledged these conditions but argued that the applicants had always been provided with individual mattresses and bedding and had not been required to sleep in shifts. They further stated that the issue had been resolved as soon as the population of the affected units had been reduced to match the number of available bunk beds.

9. The applicants in applications nos. 11531/20; 34246/20; 41743/20; 41780/20; 45065/20 and 55315/20 also complained of the sanitary and hygiene conditions in the prisons. The applicants in applications nos. 50207/20; 55194/20 and 55315/20 also complained, among other issues, about the insufficient number of toilets and showers in the unit, which had resulted in long queues. The Government responded that each cell was equipped with at least two sanitary facilities, depending on its size, and that these facilities were fully enclosed by doors. They asserted that all applicants had daily access to both cold and hot water, and that in certain prisons usage of hot and cold water had been capped at 50 to 200 litres respectively per prisoner. Furthermore, cleaning supplies were provided by the prison administration free of charge.

10. The applicant Kutlay Telli (application no. 34246/20) alleged that he had been exposed to passive smoking at Silivri No. 6 L-Type Prison from 23 July 2016 to 4 April 2018. In support, he submitted a decision of the Silivri Enforcement Judge on his petition of 30 July 2018, in which he had complained of overcrowding, requested improved conditions and sought a transfer to a non-smoking ward. The judge acknowledged the increase in detainees but found that the prison was not required to provide non-smoking units and that no such ward existed for inmates in the applicant's offence category. The Assize Court upheld this decision. The applicant also submitted a petition to the Constitutional Court, arguing that, despite his later transfer to a non-smoking ward, the domestic courts had ruled as if he had remained in smoking wards.

11. The Government submitted that during his detention, the applicant had access to a 65 sq. m outdoor yard for 10–11 hours daily and that his unit had 12 windows ensuring ventilation. They cited regulations restricting smoking to designated areas and noted that non-smoking wards were available for detainees with specific needs. In 2018, room A-3 was designated as a non-smoking ward, where the applicant was accommodated from 4 April 2018.

12. The applicant contested these claims, stating that his repeated requests for a non-smoking ward between 2016 and 2018 had been ignored. He alleged that smoke from the dining hall infiltrated his cell, preventing him from using communal areas, eating or sleeping and causing breathing difficulties. Despite multiple complaints, he claimed no measures were taken to address the issue.

2. The Court's assessment

13. In their observations, the Government raised several objections as to the admissibility of the applications, most of them concerning exhaustion of domestic remedies. However, it is not necessary to examine these objections as the applications are in any event inadmissible for the reasons stated below.

14. As to the complaints of overcrowding, the Government submitted tables to the Court containing specific details about each applicant's detention, including the measurements of the cells where they had been held. These tables also indicated the minimum and maximum living space available to each applicant, depending on the number of persons detained with them during the relevant period (see Appendix II). However, these figures were not supported by a prison register, and the periods when the number of inmates was below the maximum were not specified.

15. In the light of the methodology adopted in *İlerde and Others v. Türkiye* (nos. 35614/19 and 10 others, § 175, 5 December 2023), the Court decides to revise the figures submitted by the Government, excluding the sanitary facilities and outdoor yards from the calculation of the overall space. The revised figures for each applicant are set out in Appendix III.

16. The Court refers to the principles established in its case-law regarding inadequate conditions of detention (see *Muršić v. Croatia* [GC], no. 7334/13, §§ 96-141, 20 October 2016). It reiterates that a serious lack of space in a prison cell weighs heavily as a factor to be taken into account for the purpose of establishing whether the detention conditions described are "degrading" from the point of view of Article 3 and may disclose a violation, both alone or taken together with other shortcomings (see *Muršić*, cited above, §§ 122-41, and *Ananyev and Others v. Russia*, nos. 42525/07 and 60800/08, §§ 149-59, 10 January 2012).

17. In *İlerde and Others* (cited above), the Court has examined issues similar to those in the present case. It assessed the complaints of the applicants regarding their conditions of detention in three categories based on personal space: less than 3 sq. m, between 3 sq. m and 4 sq. m, and more than 4 sq. m. (ibid., §§ 169-99). The Court will apply the same categorisation in its assessment of the current applications.

(a) **Conclusion in respect of the applicant who had less than 3 sq. m of personal space**

18. The Court notes that only Talat Akbaş had less than 3 sq. m of personal living space in cell A-2 of the Sincan T-Type Prison between 1 August 2018 and 5 August 2018, after which he was transferred to another unit providing more than 3 sq. m of personal space. In respect of that period of detention, the Court notes that a strong presumption of a violation of Article 3 arises. This presumption can be rebutted only where the following requirements are cumulatively met, namely where short, occasional and minor reductions of personal space are accompanied by sufficient freedom of movement outside the cell and adequate out-of-cell activities and confinement in what is, when viewed generally, an appropriate detention facility (see *Muršić*, cited above, §§ 137-38).

19. The Court notes that the applicant's personal space was reduced to below 3 sq. m for four days, during which he had 2.97 sq. m of space. This

period can be considered a short and minor reduction in personal space, during which the applicant had sufficient freedom of movement and access to the outdoor yard. Furthermore, he was detained in what, overall, was an appropriate detention facility. Therefore, his complaint concerning the above-mentioned period of detention is manifestly ill-founded and must be declared inadmissible pursuant to Article 35 §§ 3 (a) and 4 of the Convention.

(b) Conclusion in respect of applicants who had between 3 sq. m and 4 sq. m of personal space

20. The Court notes that all applicants except Muzaffer Aydın and Kutlay Telli had personal space ranging from 3 to 4 sq. m at some point during their detention, although the exact duration cannot be determined from the information submitted by the parties.

21. The Court has previously examined in *İlerde and Others* (cited above, §§ 190-95) conditions such as those experienced by the applicants, including issues such as sleeping on a mattress on the floor, inadequate ventilation, insufficient sanitary facilities and hygiene and restrictions on water, and considered that the cumulative impact of these conditions did not meet the severity threshold required to qualify as inhuman or degrading under Article 3 of the Convention. The Court observes that all complaints from the applicants regarding their conditions of detention encompass the same issues as those addressed in *İlerde and Others v. Türkiye* (cited above).

22. In line with the findings in *İlerde and Others v. Türkiye* (cited above, §§ 191-95) the Court does not find that these conditions met the threshold of severity required to characterise the treatment as inhuman or degrading under Article 3 of the Convention. Accordingly, these complaints must be rejected in accordance with Article 35 §§ 3 (a) and 4 of the Convention as manifestly ill-founded.

(c) Conclusion in respect of applicants who had more than 4 sq. m of personal space

23. The Court reaffirms its previous conclusion regarding the periods during which the applicants had more than 4 sq. m of personal living space. It reiterates that in cases where a detainee had more than 4 sq. m of personal space at his disposal in multi-occupancy accommodation in prison, no issue with regard to the question of personal space arises, yet other aspects of physical conditions of detention including those referred to above (see paragraph 21) remain relevant for the Court's assessment.

24. The Court observes that all applicants' complaints regarding their conditions of detention raise the same issues as those addressed in *İlerde and Others v. Türkiye.* Kutlay Telli is the only applicant to raise an additional complaint concerning passive smoking. In this regard, the Court notes the following: (i) The applicant appears to have tolerated the smoking, and although he refers to both written and oral complaints submitted to the

authorities, he has failed to provide any proof that he lodged complaints regarding passive smoking with the prison authorities during his detention in a smoking ward from 23 July 2016 to 4 April 2018; (ii) The only evidence the applicant submits is a petition dated 30 July 2018, in which he requested a transfer to a non-smoking ward, yet his statement in his individual application before the Constitutional Court indicates that he had already been transferred to such a ward on 4 April 2018; (iii) While he generally refers to lung-related health issues caused by passive smoking, he has failed to provide any supporting evidence to have suffered any health issues himself (see, by contrast, *Elefteriadis v. Romania*, no. 38427/05, § 51, 25 January 2011). Based on these findings, the Court is not convinced that this issue, either alone or in combination with other significant aspects of his detention, subjected him to distress or hardship beyond the inevitable suffering inherent in detention.

25. Considering its earlier findings on other aspects of the applicants' detention and the conditions in the relevant prisons, the Court concludes that the conditions of the applicants' detention do not meet the threshold of severity required to characterise the treatment as inhuman or degrading under Article 3 of the Convention. As a result, this complaint is manifestly ill-founded and must be declared inadmissible in accordance with Article 35 §§ 3(a) and 4 of the Convention.

For these reasons, the Court, unanimously,

Decides to join the applications;

Rejects the Government's request to strike applications nos. 2186/20, 14870/20, 39382/20 and 45424/20 out of its list of cases;

Declares the applications inadmissible.

Done in English and notified in writing on 12 June 2025.

Dorothee von Arnim Deputy Registrar	Jovan Ilievski President

APPENDIX
APPENDIX I: LIST OF CASES

No.	Application no.	Case name	Lodged on	Applicant Year of Birth Place of Residence Nationality	Represented by	Date of the Constitutional Court's decisions
1.	24077/19	Aydın v. Türkiye	17/04/2019	**Muzaffer AYDIN** 1971 Bursa Turkish	Betül Feyza UĞUR AYDIN	27/03/2019
2.	27572/19	Mert v. Türkiye	19/04/2019	**Ramazan MERT** 1986 Afyonkarahisar Turkish	Ahmet ZEYBEKOĞLU	22/02/2019
3.	33060/19	Çaylı v. Türkiye	28/05/2019	**Ramazan ÇAYLI** 1978 Zonguldak Turkish	Ahmet Can DEMİRCİ	10/01/2019
4.	2186/20	Kali v. Türkiye	23/12/2019	**İbrahim KALİ** 1971 Ankara Turkish		22/7/2019
5.	4517/20	Akbaş v. Türkiye	07/01/2020	**Talat AKBAŞ** 1970 Adana Turkish	Enes Malik KILIÇ	01/07/2019 (notified on 09/07/2019)
6.	4526/20	Öbekçi v. Türkiye	26/12/2019	**Yusuf ÖBEKÇİ** 1971 Ankara Turkish	Hüseyin YALÇIN	04/12/2019
7.	6514/20	Yirik v. Türkiye	13/01/2020	**Şevket YİRİK** 1983 Kocaeli Turkish	Metehan USLUEROL	18/11/2019

No.	Application no.	Case name	Lodged on	Applicant Year of Birth Place of Residence Nationality	Represented by	Date of the Constitutional Court's decisions
8.	11531/20	Uzan v. Türkiye	19/02/2020	**Ahmet UZAN** 1978 İzmir Turkish	Yüksel ERSOY	17/12/2019
9.	14870/20	Pirim v. Türkiye	12/02/2020	**Yasin PİRİM** 1981 İzmir Turkish		17/12/2019
10.	34246/20	Telli v. Türkiye	24/07/2020	**Kutlay TELLİ** 1979 Ankara Turkish	İhsan MAKAS	10/04/2020
11.	39382/20	Fidan v. Türkiye	07/08/2020	**Mehmet Mahsun FİDAN** 1994 İzmir Turkish	Kadir ÖZTÜRK	30/06/2020
12.	41743/20	İpek v. Türkiye	21/08/2020	**Mustafa İPEK** 1977 İzmir Turkish	İbrahim TOKTAMIŞ	16/07/2020
13.	41780/20	Çiçek v. Türkiye	15/09/2020	**Bedretin ÇİÇEK** 1981 Şanlıurfa Turkish	Melek KOÇYİĞİT	11/06/2020
14.	45065/20	Öbekçi v. Türkiye	16/09/2020	**Yusuf ÖBEKÇİ** 1971 Ankara Turkish	Hüseyin YALÇIN	23/07/2020

No.	Application no.	Case name	Lodged on	Applicant Year of Birth Place of Residence Nationality	Represented by	Date of the Constitutional Court's decisions
15.	45424/20	Coşkun v. Türkiye	29/09/2020	**Ali COŞKUN** 1987 Osmaniye Turkish		30/06/2020
16.	50050/20	Arukan v. Türkiye	14/10/2020	**Ali ARUKAN** 1980 Kastamonu Turkish	Neda BUYRUKÇU	30/06/2020
17.	50207/20	Eryılmaz v. Türkiye	20/10/2020	**Ali ERYILMAZ** 1979 Karabük Turkish	Zehra KARAKULAK BOZDAĞ	06/10/2020
18.	55194/20	Çiçin v. Türkiye	24/11/2020	**Aydın ÇİÇİN** 1974 Tekirdağ Turkish	Tarık Said GÜLDİBİ	30/09/2020
19.	55315/20	Vuruşkan v. Türkiye	02/12/2020	**Yunus VURUŞKAN** 1989 Çorum Turkish	Neda BUYRUKÇU	03/09/2020

APPENDIX II: DATA SUBMITTED BY THE GOVERNMENT

No.	Application No.	Name of the applicant	Relevant Penitentiary Institution	Cell no.	Detention Period	Min. Number of Persons	Max. Number of Persons	Days with max. number of persons	Outdoor Yard	Dormitory	Common Area	Sanitary facilities	Personal space with min. number of detainees	Personal space with max. number of detainees
1.	24077/19	Muzaffer AYDIN	Silivri No. 6 L-Type Prison	A-8	13/08/2016-24/09/2016	22	28	40	65.00	83.72	100.91	5.38	11.59	9.11
				A-9	24/09/2016-08/02/2018	22	34	450	65.00	83.72	100.91	5.38	11.59	7.50
				A-6	08/02/2018-04/04/2018	33	40	40	65.00	83.72	100.91	5.38	7.73	6.38
				A-3	04/04/2018 - ongoing	33	41	900	65.00	83.72	100.91	5.38	7.73	6.22

No.	Application No.	Name of the applicant	Relevant Penitentiary Institution	Cell no.	Detention Period	Min. Number of Persons	Max. Number of Persons	Days with max. number of persons	Outdoor Yard	Dormitory	Common Area	Sanitary facilities	Personal space with min. number of detainees	Personal space with max. number of detainees
2.	27572/19	Ramazan MERT	İzmir T-Type Prison	C-13	10/01/2017-22/11/2017	19	23	23	35.00	45.00	32.50	4.00	6.13	5.07
				A-5	22/11/2017-29/05/2018	21	25	43	35.00	45.00	32.50	4.00	5.55	4.66
				A-12	29/05/2018-27/03/2020	18	25	8	35.00	45.00	32.50	4.00	6.47	4.66
3.	33060/19	Ramazan ÇAYLI	Kocaeli No. 2 T-Type Prison	A-21	28/06/2017-22/01/2021	3	10	55	25.00	32.00	23.30	3.06	27.79	8.34
				A-23	20/09/2016-28/06/2017	6	7	205	25.00	32.00	23.30	3.06	13.89	11.91

No.	Application No.	Name of the applicant	Relevant Penitentiary Institution	Cell no.	Detention Period	Min. Number of Persons	Max. Number of Persons	Days with max. number of persons	Outdoor Yard	Dormitory	Common Area	Sanitary facilities	Personal space with min. number of detainees	Personal space with max. number of detainees
				C-11	C-11 30/07/2016-20/09/2016	21	23	45	34.00	43.90	32.00	2.47	5.35	4.89
4.	2186/20	İbrahim KALİ	Şanlıurfa No.2 T-Type Prison	A-27	26/10/2016-29/11/2016	13	22	24	44.00	60.00	36.00	10.00	11.54	6.82
				A-17	29/11/2016-11/08/2017	17	25	1	44.00	60.00	36.00	10.00	8.82	6.00
				A-9	11/08/2017	26	26	1	44.00	60.00	36.00	10.00	5.77	5.77
				A-10	11/08/2017-20/11/2017	21	24	34	44.00	60.00	36.00	10.00	7.14	6.25

No.	Application No.	Name of the applicant	Relevant Penitentiary Institution	Cell no.	Detention Period	Min. Number of Persons	Max. Number of Persons	Days with max. number of persons	Outdoor Yard	Dormitory	Common Area	Sanitary facilities	Personal space with min. number of detainees	Personal space with max. number of detainees
				C-17	20/11/2017-11/11/2018	21	25	25	44.00	60.00	36.00	10.00	7.14	6.00
5.	4517/20	Talat AKBAŞ	Sincan T-Type Prison	A-2	01/08/2016 05/08/2016	30	30	5	46.50	54.29	34.87	4.13	4.66	4.66
				D-1	05/08/2016-31/08/2016	17	27	7	46.50	54.29	34.87	4.13	8.22	5.18
				A-16	31/08/2016-16/09/2017	18	25	90	46.50	54.29	34.87	4.13	7.77	5.59
6. + 14.	4526/20 and 45065/20	Yusuf ÖBEKÇİ	Çorum L-Type Prison	TEMPORARY	07/08/2016-08/08/2016	14	14	2	N/A	42	42	5.4	N/A	N/A

No.	Application No.	Name of the applicant	Relevant Penitentiary Institution	Cell no.	Detention Period	Min. Number of Persons	Max. Number of Persons	Days with max. number of persons	Outdoor Yard	Dormitory	Common Area	Sanitary facilities	Personal space with min. number of detainees	Personal space with max. number of detainees
				E-11	08/08/2016-07/09/2016	42	43	28	64	84	90	17.32	6.08	5.94
				C-17	07/09/2016-15/09/2016	29	30	7	64	84	90	17.32	8.80	8.51
				E-10	15/09/2016-15/09/2016	32	32	1	64	84	90	17.32	7.98	7.98
				C-17	15/09/2016-17/11/2016	27	43	53	64	84	90	17.32	9.46	5.94
				E-10	17/11/2016-17/11/2016	30	30	1	64	84	90	17.32	8.51	8.51

No.	Application No.	Name of the applicant	Relevant Penitentiary Institution	Cell no.	Detention Period	Min. Number of Persons	Max. Number of Persons	Days with max. number of persons	Outdoor Yard	Dormitory	Common Area	Sanitary facilities	Personal space with min. number of detainees	Personal space with max. number of detainees
				C-17	17/11/2016-17/03/2017	30	38	88	64	84	90	18.42	8.51	6.72
				F-5	17/03/2017-21/03/2017	39	39	5	64	84	90	18.42	6.55	6.55
				C-17	21/03/2017-21/03/2017	38	38	1	64	84	90	18.42	6.72	6.72
				F-5	21/03/2017-08/03/2018	39	45	207	64	84	90	18.42	6.55	5.67
				F-10	08/03/2018-26/03/2021	24	38	464	64	84	90	18.42	10.64	6.72

No.	Application No.	Name of the applicant	Relevant Penitentiary Institution	Cell no.	Detention Period	Min. Number of Persons	Max. Number of Persons	Days with max. number of persons	Outdoor Yard	Dormitory	Common Area	Sanitary facilities	Personal space with min. number of detainees	Personal space with max. number of detainees
7.	6514/20	Şevket YİRİK	Antalya L-Type Prison	C-17	16/08/2016-10/09/2017	27	45	240	65.19	83.72	56.59	7.00	7.87	4.72
8.	11531/20	Ahmet UZAN	İzmir No. 4 T-Type Prison	A-12	16/01/2017-27/03/2020	16	25	10	35.00	45.00	32.50	4.00	7.28	4.66
9.	14870/20	Yasin PİRİM	İzmir No.4 T-Type Prison	C-13	24/10/2017 - 29/05/2018	18	25	4	35.00	45.00	32.50	4.00	6.47	4.66
				A-3	29/05/2018-26/02/2021	18	25	1	35.00	45.00	32.50	4.00	6.47	4.66
10.	34246/20	Kutlay TELLİ	Silivri No.6 L-Type Prison	A-4	21/07/2016-28/07/2017	22	28	250	65.00	83.72	100.91	5.38	11.59	9.11

No.	Application No.	Name of the applicant	Relevant Penitentiary Institution	Cell no.	Detention Period	Min. Number of Persons	Max. Number of Persons	Days with max. number of persons	Outdoor Yard	Dormitory	Common Area	Sanitary facilities	Personal space with min. number of detainees	Personal space with max. number of detainees
				A-7	28/07/2017-03/08/2017	23	29	29	65.00	83.72	100.91	5.38	11.09	8.79
				A-6	03/08/2017-04/04/2018	29	40	150	65.00	83.72	100.91	5.38	8.79	6.38
				A-3	04/04/2018-29/07/2019	35	41	300	65.00	83.72	100.91	5.38	7.29	6.22
11.	39382/20	Mehmet Mahsun FİDAN	Manisa T-Type Prison	C-13	30/04/2018-21/06/2018	8	15	52	29.00	42.50	32.00	2.40	13.24	7.06
				A-28	21/06/2018-12/07/2018	8	9	21	23.00	36.50	26.00	2.40	10.99	9.77

No.	Application No.	Name of the applicant	Relevant Penitentiary Institution	Cell no.	Detention Period	Min. Number of Persons	Max. Number of Persons	Days with max. number of persons	Outdoor Yard	Dormitory	Common Area	Sanitary facilities	Personal space with min. number of detainees	Personal space with max. number of detainees
				B-6	12/07/2018-09/01/2020	13	21	546	29.00	42.50	32.00	2.40	8.15	5.04
12.	41743/20	Mustafa İPEK	İzmir No. 4 T-Type Prison	C-13	09/01/2017-22/11/2017	18	23	N/A	35	45	32.5	4	6.48	5.07
				A-5	22/11/2017-29/05/2018	20	24	N/A	35	45	32.5	4	5.83	4.86
				A-12	29/05/2018-27/03/2020	17	24	N/A	35	45	32.5	4	6.86	4.86
				A-3	27/10/2017-26/02/2021	21	24	N/A	35	45	32.5	4	5.55	4.86

No.	Application No.	Name of the applicant	Relevant Penitentiary Institution	Cell no.	Detention Period	Min. Number of Persons	Max. Number of Persons	Days with max. number of persons	Outdoor Yard	Dormitory	Common Area	Sanitary facilities	Personal space with min. number of detainees	Personal space with max. number of detainees
13.	41780/20	Bedretin ÇİÇEK	Şanlıurfa No.2 T-Type Prison	A-22	26/10/2016-15/03/2019	19	27	N/A	44	60	36	10	7.90	5.56
				C-17	15/03/2019-27/03/2019	28	28	N/A	44	60	36	10	5.36	5.36
				A-21	27/10/2017-03/07/2020	16	32	N/A	44	60	36	10	9.38	4.69
				C-2	03/07/2020-ongoing	23	26	N/A	44	60	36	10	6.53	5.77
15.	45424/20	Ali COŞKUN	Osmaniye No.1 T- Type Prison	C-14	19/10/2018-the exact period is not indicated	16	16	N/A	33.44	39.27	24.37	2.5	6.23	6.23

No.	Application No.	Name of the applicant	Relevant Penitentiary Institution	Cell no.	Detention Period	Min. Number of Persons	Max. Number of Persons	Days with max. number of persons	Outdoor Yard	Dormitory	Common Area	Sanitary facilities	Personal space with min. number of detainees	Personal space with max. number of detainees
16.	50050/20	Ali ARUKAN	Çorum L-Type Prison	B-3	13/05/2016-26/07/2016	27	37	47	64	84	90	17.32	9.46	6.90
				E-3	26/07/2016-31/08/2016	31	47	24	64	84	90	17.32	8.24	5.43
				E-12	31/08/2016-22/09/2016	31	31	22	64	84	90	17.32	8.24	8.34
				B-6	22/09/2016-31/01/2017	10	13	96	64	36	48.5	13.5	16.20	12.46
				F-6	31/01/2017-24/03/2017	13	16	38	64	36	48.5	13.5	12.46	10.13

No.	Application No.	Name of the applicant	Relevant Penitentiary Institution	Cell no.	Detention Period	Min. Number of Persons	Max. Number of Persons	Days with max. number of persons	Outdoor Yard	Dormitory	Common Area	Sanitary facilities	Personal space with min. number of detainees	Personal space with max. number of detainees
				C-17	24/03/2017-27/12/2017	39	44	186	64	84	90	17.32	6.55	5.80
				A-10	27/12/2017-29/05/2018	30	44	117	64	84	90	17.32	5.80	8.51
				F-10	29/05/2018-04/01/2021	34	42	604	64	84	90	17.32	7.51	6.08
				C-13	04/01/2021-04/03/2021	20	31	28	64	84	90	17.32	12.77	8.24
17.	50207/20	Ali ERYILMAZ	Kayseri No.1 T-Type Prison	A-1	14/05/2018-30/11/2018	21	26	N/A	46.5	54.29	34.88	3.84	6.65	5.37

No.	Application No.	Name of the applicant	Relevant Penitentiary Institution	Cell no.	Detention Period	Min. Number of Persons	Max. Number of Persons	Days with max. number of persons	Outdoor Yard	Dormitory	Common Area	Sanitary facilities	Personal space with min. number of detainees	Personal space with max. number of detainees
				B-16	30/11/2018-15/10/2020	20	28	N/A	46.5	54.29	34.88	3.84	6.98	4.99
				A-10	15/10/2020-12/01/2021	18	25	N/A	46.5	54.29	34.88	3.84	7.75	5.58
				D-2	12/01/2021-03/02/2021	14	23	N/A	46.5	54.29	34.88	3.84	9.97	6.07
				A-10	03/02/2021-ongoing	23	23	N/A	46.5	54.29	34.88	3.84	6.07	6.07
18.	55194/20	Aydın ÇİÇİN	Tekirdağ No.1 T-Type Prison	C-7	23/08/2016-21/09/2016	21	21	N/A	33.75	44.55	32.4	11.48	5.82	5.82

No.	Application No.	Name of the applicant	Relevant Penitentiary Institution	Cell no.	Detention Period	Min. Number of Persons	Max. Number of Persons	Days with max. number of persons	Outdoor Yard	Dormitory	Common Area	Sanitary facilities	Personal space with min. number of detainees	Personal space with max. number of detainees
				C-9	21/09/2016-14/11/2016	7	7	N/A	33.75	44.55	32.4	11.48	17.46	17.47
				A-8	14/11/2016-14/03/2019	10	16	N/A	25	33	24	6.12	8.20	5.13
				A-27	14/03/2019-ongoing	10	16	N/A	25	33	24	6.12	8.81	5.51
19.	55315/20	Yunus VURUŞKAN	Çorum L - Type Prison	E-10	09/12/2016-29/11/2017	30	45	206	64	84	90	17.32	8.51	5.67
				E-12	29/11/2017-14/12/2017	46	46	46	64	84	90	17.32	5.55	5.55

No.	Application No.	Name of the applicant	Relevant Penitentiary Institution	Cell no.	Detention Period	Min. Number of Persons	Max. Number of Persons	Days with max. number of persons	Outdoor Yard	Dormitory	Common Area	Sanitary facilities	Personal space with min. number of detainees	Personal space with max. number of detainees
				C-17	14/12/2017-24/01/2018	45	45	41	64	84	90	17.32	5.67	5.67
				C-5	24/01/2018-08/03/2018	38	40	33	64	84	90	17.32	6.72	6.38
				F-10	08/03/2018-ongoing	20	38	603	64	84	90	17.32	12.77	6.72

APPENDIX III
CALCULATION BASED ON THE METHODOLOGY ADOPTED IN *İLERDE AND OTHERS*

No.	Application No.	Name of the applicant	Relevant Penitentiary Institution	Cell no.	Detention Period	Min. Number of Persons	Max. Number of Persons	Dormitory	Common Area	Personal space with min. number of detainees calculated using the methodology adopted in *İlerde and Others*	Personal space with max. number of detainees calculated using the methodology adopted in *İlerde and Others*
1.	24077/19	Muzaffer AYDIN	Silivri No. 6 L-Type Prison	A-8	13/08/2016-24/09/2016	22	28	83.72	100.91	8.39	6.59
				A-9	24/09/2016-08/02/2018	22	34	83.72	100.91	8.39	5.43
				A-6	08/02/2018-04/04/2018	33	40	83.72	100.91	5.59	4.61
				A-3	04/04/2018 - ongoing	33	41	83.72	100.91	5.59	4.5

No.	Application No.	Name of the applicant	Relevant Penitentiary Institution	Cell no.	Detention Period	Min. Number of Persons	Max. Number of Persons	Dormitory	Common Area	Personal space with min. number of detainees calculated using the methodology adopted in *İlerde and Others*	Personal space with max. number of detainees calculated using the methodology adopted in *İlerde and Others*
2.	27572/19	Ramazan MERT	İzmir T-Type Prison	C-13	10/01/2017-22/11/2017	19	23	45.00	32.50	4.07	3.36
				A-5	22/11/2017-29/05/2018	21	25	45.00	32.50	3.69	3.1
				A-12	29/05/2018-27/03/2020	18	25	45.00	32.50	4.3	3.1
3.	33060/19	Ramazan ÇAYLI	Kocaeli No. 2 T-Type Prison	A-21	28/06/2017-22/01/2021	3	10	32.00	23.30	18.43	5.53
				A-23	20/09/2016-28/06/2017	6	7	32.00	23.30	9.21	7.9

No.	Application No.	Name of the applicant	Relevant Penitentiary Institution	Cell no.	Detention Period	Min. Number of Persons	Max. Number of Persons	Dormitory	Common Area	Personal space with min. number of detainees calculated using the methodology adopted in *İlerde and Others*	Personal space with max. number of detainees calculated using the methodology adopted in *İlerde and Others*
				C-11	C-11 30/07/2016-20/09/2016	21	23	43.90	32.00	3.61	3.3
4.	2186/20	İbrahim KALİ	Şanlıurfa No.2 T-Type Prison	A-27	26/10/2016-29/11/2016	13	22	60.00	36.00	7.38	4.36
				A-17	29/11/2016-11/08/2017	17	25	60.00	36.00	5.64	3.84
				A-9	11/08/2017	26	26	60.00	36.00	3.69	3.69
				A-10	11/08/2017-20/11/2017	21	24	60.00	36.00	4.57	4

No.	Application No.	Name of the applicant	Relevant Penitentiary Institution	Cell no.	Detention Period	Min. Number of Persons	Max. Number of Persons	Dormitory	Common Area	Personal space with min. number of detainees calculated using the methodology adopted in *İlerde and Others*	Personal space with max. number of detainees calculated using the methodology adopted in *İlerde and Others*
				C-17	20/11/2017-11/11/2018	21	25	60.00	36.00	4.57	3.84
5.	4517/20	Talat AKBAŞ	Sincan T-Type Prison	A-2	01/08/2016 05/08/2016	30	30	54.29	34.87	2.97	2.97
				D-1	05/08/2016-31/08/2016	17	27	54.29	34.87	5.24	3.3
				A-16	31/08/2016-16/09/2017	18	25	54.29	34.87	4.95	3.56
6. + 14.	4526/20 and 45065/20	Yusuf ÖBEKÇİ	Çorum L - Type Prison	TEMPORARY	07/08/2016-08/08/2016	14	14	42	42	6	6

No.	Application No.	Name of the applicant	Relevant Penitentiary Institution	Cell no.	Detention Period	Min. Number of Persons	Max. Number of Persons	Dormitory	Common Area	Personal space with min. number of detainees calculated using the methodology adopted in *İlerde and Others*	Personal space with max. number of detainees calculated using the methodology adopted in *İlerde and Others*
				E-11	08/08/2016-07/09/2016	42	43	84	90	4.14	4.04
				C-17	07/09/2016-15/09/2016	29	30	84	90	6	5.8
				E-10	15/09/2016-15/09/2016	32	32	84	90	5.43	5.43
				C-17	15/09/2016-17/11/2016	27	43	84	90	6.44	4.04
				E-10	17/11/2016-17/11/2016	30	30	84	90	5.8	5.8

No.	Application No.	Name of the applicant	Relevant Penitentiary Institution	Cell no.	Detention Period	Min. Number of Persons	Max. Number of Persons	Dormitory	Common Area	Personal space with min. number of detainees calculated using the methodology adopted in *İlerde and Others*	Personal space with max. number of detainees calculated using the methodology adopted in *İlerde and Others*
				C-17	17/11/2016-17/03/2017	30	38	84	90	5.8	4.57
				F-5	17/03/2017-21/03/2017	39	39	84	90	4.46	4.46
				C-17	21/03/2017-21/03/2017	38	38	84	90	4.57	4.57
				F-5	21/03/2017-08/03/2018	39	45	84	90	4.46	3.86
				F-10	08/03/2018-26/03/2021	24	38	84	90	7.25	4.57

No.	Application No.	Name of the applicant	Relevant Penitentiary Institution	Cell no.	Detention Period	Min. Number of Persons	Max. Number of Persons	Dormitory	Common Area	Personal space with min. number of detainees calculated using the methodology adopted in *İlerde and Others*	Personal space with max. number of detainees calculated using the methodology adopted in *İlerde and Others*
7.	6514/20	Şevket YİRİK	Antalya L-Type Prison	C-17	16/08/2016-10/09/2017	27	45	83.72	56.59	5.19	3.11
8.	11531/20	Ahmet UZAN	İzmir No. 4 T-Type Prison	A-12	16/01/2017-27/03/2020	16	25	45.00	32.50	4.84	3.1
9.	14870/20	Yasin PİRİM	İzmir No. 4 T-Type Prison	C-13	24/10/2017 - 29/05/2018	18	25	45.00	32.50	4.3	3.1
				A-3	29/05/2018-26/02/2021	18	25	45.00	32.50	4.3	3.1
10.	34246/20	Kutlay TELLİ	Silivri No.6 L-Type Prison	A-4	21/07/2016-28/07/2017	22	28	83.72	100.91	8.39	6.59

No.	Application No.	Name of the applicant	Relevant Penitentiary Institution	Cell no.	Detention Period	Min. Number of Persons	Max. Number of Persons	Dormitory	Common Area	Personal space with min. number of detainees calculated using the methodology adopted in *İlerde and Others*	Personal space with max. number of detainees calculated using the methodology adopted in *İlerde and Others*
				A-7	28/07/2017-03/08/2017	23	29	83.72	100.91	8.02	6.36
				A-6	03/08/2017-04/04/2018	29	40	83.72	100.91	6.36	4.61
				A-3	04/04/2018-29/07/2019	35	41	83.72	100.91	5.27	4.5
11.	39382/20	Mehmet Mahsun FİDAN	Manisa T-Type Prison	C-13	30/04/2018-21/06/2018	8	15	42.50	32.00	9.31	4.96
				A-28	21/06/2018-12/07/2018	8	9	36.50	26.00	7.81	6.94

No.	Application No.	Name of the applicant	Relevant Penitentiary Institution	Cell no.	Detention Period	Min. Number of Persons	Max. Number of Persons	Dormitory	Common Area	Personal space with min. number of detainees calculated using the methodology adopted in *İlerde and Others*	Personal space with max. number of detainees calculated using the methodology adopted in *İlerde and Others*
				B-6	12/07/2018-09/01/2020	13	21	42.50	32.00	5.73	3.54
12.	41743/20	Mustafa İPEK	İzmir No. 4 T-Type Prison	C-13	09/01/2017-22/11/2017	18	23	45	32.5	4.3	3.36
				A-5	22/11/2017-29/05/2018	20	24	45	32.5	3.87	3.22
				A-12	29/05/2018-27/03/2020	17	24	45	32.5	4.55	3.22
				A-3	27/10/2017-26/02/2021	21	24	45	32.5	3.69	3.22

No.	Application No.	Name of the applicant	Relevant Penitentiary Institution	Cell no.	Detention Period	Min. Number of Persons	Max. Number of Persons	Dormitory	Common Area	Personal space with min. number of detainees calculated using the methodology adopted in *İlerde and Others*	Personal space with max. number of detainees calculated using the methodology adopted in *İlerde and Others*
13.	41780/20	Bedretin ÇİÇEK	Şanlıurfa No.2 T-Type Prison	A-22	26/10/2016-15/03/2019	19	27	60	36	5.05	3.55
				C-17	15/03/2019-27/03/2019	28	28	60	36	3.42	3.42
				A-21	27/10/2017-03/07/2020	16	32	60	36	6	3
				C-2	03/07/2020-ongoing	23	26	60	36	4.17	3.69
15.	45424/20	Ali COŞKUN	Osmaniye No.1 T- Type Prison	C-14	19/10/2018-the exact period is not indicated	16	16	39.27	24.37	3.97	3.97

No.	Application No.	Name of the applicant	Relevant Penitentiary Institution	Cell no.	Detention Period	Min. Number of Persons	Max. Number of Persons	Dormitory	Common Area	Personal space with min. number of detainees calculated using the methodology adopted in *İlerde and Others*	Personal space with max. number of detainees calculated using the methodology adopted in *İlerde and Others*
16.	50050/20	Ali ARUKAN	Çorum L - Type Prison	B-3	13/05/2016-26/07/2016	27	37	84	90	6.44	4.7
				E-3	26/07/2016-31/08/2016	31	47	84	90	5.61	3.7
				E-12	31/08/2016-22/09/2016	31	31	84	90	5.61	5.61
				B-6	22/09/2016-31/01/2017	10	13	36	48.5	8.45	6.5
				F-6	31/01/2017-24/03/2017	13	16	36	48.5	6,5	5.28

No.	Application No.	Name of the applicant	Relevant Penitentiary Institution	Cell no.	Detention Period	Min. Number of Persons	Max. Number of Persons	Dormitory	Common Area	Personal space with min. number of detainees calculated using the methodology adopted in *İlerde and Others*	Personal space with max. number of detainees calculated using the methodology adopted in *İlerde and Others*
				C-17	24/03/2017-27/12/2017	39	44	84	90	4.46	3.95
				A-10	27/12/2017-29/05/2018	30	44	84	90	5.8	3.95
				F-10	29/05/2018-04/01/2021	34	42	84	90	5.11	4.14
				C-13	04/01/2021-04/03/2021	20	31	84	90	8.7	5.61
17.	50207/20	Ali ERYILMAZ	Kayseri No. 1 T-Type Prison	A-1	14/05/2018-30/11/2018	21	26	54.29	34.88	4.24	3.42

No.	Application No.	Name of the applicant	Relevant Penitentiary Institution	Cell no.	Detention Period	Min. Number of Persons	Max. Number of Persons	Dormitory	Common Area	Personal space with min. number of detainees calculated using the methodology adopted in *İlerde and Others*	Personal space with max. number of detainees calculated using the methodology adopted in *İlerde and Others*
				B-16	30/11/2018-15/10/2020	20	28	54.29	34.88	4.45	3.18
				A-10	15/10/2020-12/01/2021	18	25	54.29	34.88	4.95	3.56
				D-2	12/01/2021-03/02/2021	14	23	54.29	34.88	6.36	3.87
				A-10	03/02/2021-ongoing	23	23	54.29	34.88	3.87	3.87
18.	55194/20	Aydın ÇİÇİN	Tekirdağ No.1 T-Type Prison	C-7	23/08/2016-21/09/2016	21	21	44.55	32.4	3.66	3.66

No.	Application No.	Name of the applicant	Relevant Penitentiary Institution	Cell no.	Detention Period	Min. Number of Persons	Max. Number of Persons	Dormitory	Common Area	Personal space with min. number of detainees calculated using the methodology adopted in *İlerde and Others*	Personal space with max. number of detainees calculated using the methodology adopted in *İlerde and Others*
				C-9	21/09/2016-14/11/2016	7	7	44.55	32.4	10.99	10.99
				A-8	14/11/2016-14/03/2019	10	16	33	24	5.7	3.56
				A-27	14/03/2019-ongoing	10	16	33	24	5.7	3.56
19.	55315/20	Yunus VURUŞKAN	Çorum L - Type Prison	E-10	09/12/2016-29/11/2017	30	45	84	90	5.8	3.86
				E-12	29/11/2017-14/12/2017	46	46	84	90	3.78	3.78

No.	Application No.	Name of the applicant	Relevant Penitentiary Institution	Cell no.	Detention Period	Min. Number of Persons	Max. Number of Persons	Dormitory	Common Area	Personal space with min. number of detainees calculated using the methodology adopted in *İlerde and Others*	Personal space with max. number of detainees calculated using the methodology adopted in *İlerde and Others*
				C-17	14/12/2017-24/01/2018	45	45	84	90	3.86	3.86
				C-5	24/01/2018-08/03/2018	38	40	84	90	4.57	4.35
				F-10	08/03/2018-ongoing	20	38	84	90	8.7	4.57