

EUROPEAN COURT OF HUMAN RIGHTS
COUR EUROPÉENNE DES DROITS DE L'HOMME

FIFTH SECTION

DECISION

Application no. 3544/23
Maryna Oleksandrivna ATAMANOVA against Ukraine
and 1 other application
(see appended table)

The European Court of Human Rights (Fifth Section), sitting on 17 October 2024 as a Committee composed of:

Kateřina Šimáčková*, President*,
Mykola Gnatovskyy,
Artūrs Kučs*, judges*,

and Viktoriya Maradudina, *Acting Deputy Section Registrar,*

Having regard to the above applications lodged on the various dates indicated in the appended table,

Having regard to the observations submitted by the respondent Government and the observations in reply submitted by the applicants,

Having deliberated, decides as follows:

# FACTS AND PROCEDURE

The list of applicants is set out in the appended table.

The applicants' complaints under Article 6 § 1 and Article 13 of the Convention concerning the excessive length of civil proceedings and the lack of any effective remedy in domestic law were communicated to the Ukrainian Government ("the Government").

# THE LAW

## A. Joinder of the applications

Having regard to the similar subject matter of the applications, the Court finds it appropriate to examine them jointly in a single decision.

### B. Complaints under Article 6 § 1 and Article 13 of the Convention (excessive length of civil proceedings and lack of any effective remedy in domestic law)

In the present applications, having examined all the material before it, the Court considers that for the reasons stated below, the applicants' complaints about the excessive length of the civil proceedings and lack of any effective remedy in domestic law are inadmissible.

After a thorough examination of all the materials submitted to it, the Court, guided by its case-law on the subject, finds the applicant's complaints under Article 6 of the Convention in application no. 3544/23 manifestly ill-founded because the length of the proceedings was not excessive or unreasonable (see *Zolotov v. Ukraine* [Committee] (dec.), no. 46410/22, 16 May 2024).

Concerning application no. 27484/23, the Court observes that the final decision in the case was taken on 14 December 2022 and was served on the applicant's lawyer on 27 December 2022. However, the application form was only submitted to the Court on 14 June 2023, that is after the expiration of the four-month time-limit and therefore belatedly (see *Vuytsiv v. Ukraine* [Committee] (dec.), no. 13498/23, 4 April 2024).

In view of the above, the Court finds that these complaints are inadmissible in accordance with Article 35 §§ 1, 3 and 4 of the Convention.

The applicants also raised a complaint under Article 13 of the Convention. However, having regard to the conclusions which it has reached above, the Court finds that this complaint must be rejected as being manifestly ill-founded pursuant to Article 35 §§ 3 and 4 of the Convention.

For these reasons, the Court, unanimously,

*Decides* to join the applications;

*Declares* the applications inadmissible.

Done in English and notified in writing on 14 November 2024.

| | |
|---|---|
| Viktoriya Maradudina | Kateřina Šimáčková |
| Acting Deputy Registrar | President |

# APPENDIX

## List of applications raising complaints under Article 6 § 1 and Article 13 of the Convention (excessive length of civil proceedings and lack of any effective remedy in domestic law)

| No. | Application no.<br>Date of introduction | Applicant's name<br>Year of birth | Start of proceedings | End of proceedings | Total length Levels of jurisdiction |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| 1. | 3544/23<br>30/12/2022 | **Maryna Oleksandrivna ATAMANOVA**<br>1969 | 24/07/2018 | 04/12/2023 | 5 years and<br>4 months and<br>11 days<br>3 levels of jurisdiction |
| 2. | 27484/23<br>14/06/2023 | **Svitlana Sergiyivna DOBRYNSKA**<br>1974 | 29/04/2015 | 14/12/2022 | 7 years and<br>7 months and<br>16 days<br>3 levels of jurisdiction |