



EUROPEAN COURT OF HUMAN RIGHTS
COUR EUROPÉENNE DES DROITS DE L'HOMME

FIFTH SECTION

CASE OF KHAYNATSKYY AND OTHERS v. UKRAINE

(Application no. 12895/08 and 249 others – see list appended)

JUDGMENT

STRASBOURG

9 January 2014

This judgment is final. It may be subject to editorial revision.

In the case of Khaynatskyy and Others v. Ukraine,

The European Court of Human Rights (Fifth Section), sitting as a Committee composed of:

Boštjan M. Zupančič, President,

Ann Power-Forde,

Helena Jäderblom, judges,

and Stephen Phillips, Deputy Section Registrar,

Having deliberated in private on 3 December 2013,

Delivers the following judgment, which was adopted on that date:

PROCEDURE

1. The case originated in 250 applications (against Ukraine lodged with the Court under Article 34 of the Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms (“the Convention”) by Ukrainian nationals and legal entities registered in Ukraine. Their details are specified in the appended tables (“the applicants”).

2. In applications nos. 67987/10, 13752/12 and 21067/12 the applicants died in course of the proceedings before the Court. The next of kin of the applicants in applications nos. 13752/12 and 21067/12 expressed a wish to maintain the applications of their deceased relatives.

3. In applications nos. 45361/09, 29845/10, 57977/10, 35665/11, 35760/11, 39367/11, 8406/12, 12661/13 and 12663/13 court decisions were delivered in favour of the applicants’ deceased relatives. The applicants claim to be their lawful successors in title.

4. The Government (“the Government”) were represented by their Agent, Mr Nazar Kulchytskyy.

5. On 28 May 2013 the applications were communicated to the Government.

THE FACTS

THE CIRCUMSTANCES OF THE CASE

6. On the dates set out in the appended tables domestic courts and labour disputes commissions delivered decisions according to which the applicants were entitled to various pecuniary amounts or to have certain actions taken in their favour. The decisions became final and enforceable. However, the applicants were unable to obtain the enforcement of the decisions in due time.

7. Some of the applicants also made submissions concerning factual and legal matters unrelated to the above non-enforcement issues.

THE LAW

I. THE GOVERNMENT'S REQUEST TO STRIKE OUT THE APPLICATION LODGED BY Ms ANTONINA YOSYFIVNA GORDEYUK (APPLICATION No. 67987/10)

8. The Court notes that by letter dated 25 September 2013, sent by registered post to the address of the applicant, "those whom it might concern" were invited to inform the Court by 23 October 2013 whether they wished to maintain the application of the deceased Ms Gordeyuk. The letter was received on 4 October 2013, however no reply followed.

9. In view of the above the Court decides to strike out from its list of cases the application lodged by Ms Antonina Yosyfivna Gordeyuk, since the applicant died and there are no persons wishing to pursue the application. Furthermore, in accordance with Article 37 § 1 in fine, there are no special circumstances regarding respect for human rights as defined in the Convention and its Protocols which require the continued examination of the complaints.

II. AS TO THE *LOCUS STANDI* OF THE APPLICANTS IN APPLICATIONS Nos. 45361/09, 29845/10, 57977/10, 35665/11, 35760/11, 39367/11, 8406/12, 21067/12, 12661/13, 12663/13 and 13752/12.

10. The Court notes that applications nos. 45361/09, 29845/10, 57977/10, 35665/11, 35760/11, 39367/11, 8406/12, 21067/12, 12661/13, 12663/13 and 13752/12 concern a property right which is in principle transferable to the heirs. In these circumstances the Court considers that the applicants or their next of kin have standing to continue the present proceedings in their stead (see, among other authorities, *Mironov v. Ukraine*, no. 19916/04, § 12, 14 December 2006).

III. ALLEGED VIOLATION OF ARTICLES 6 AND 13 OF THE CONVENTION AND OF ARTICLE 1 OF PROTOCOL No. 1

11. The applicants complained about the lengthy non-enforcement of the decisions given in their favour and about the lack of effective domestic remedies in respect of those complaints. They relied on, expressly or in

substance, Articles 6 § 1 and 13 of the Convention and Article 1 of Protocol No. 1.

A. Applications set out in Appendix 1

12. In view of the similarity of the applications listed in Appendix 1 in terms of the principal legal issue raised, the Court finds it appropriate to join them.

13. The Court notes that in several applications the Government made specific comments on the admissibility of the case, including that the judgment had been enforced, that the applicant had not suffered any significant disadvantage, that the applicant was not entitled to sums of money claimed, that the application was an abuse of the right of petition or that the State was otherwise not responsible for the delay. The Court has considered these submissions as they have been made, notes that they are similar to submissions which have been made in previous cases and finds that, for similar or related reasons, they do not affect the outcome of the present case.

14. The Court further notes that the complaints of the applicants enumerated in Appendix 1 are not manifestly ill-founded within the meaning of Article 35 § 3 (a) of the Convention. It further notes that they are not inadmissible on any other grounds. They must therefore be declared admissible.

15. The Court finds that the decisions in the applicants' favour were not enforced in due time, for which the State authorities were responsible.

16. Having regard to its well-established case-law on the subject (see *Yuriy Nikolayevich Ivanov v. Ukraine*, no. 40450/04, § §§ 56-58 and 66-70, 15 October 2009), the Court finds that in the applications listed in Appendix 1 there has been a violation of Article 6 § 1 of the Convention and Article 1 of Protocol No. 1 on account of the prolonged non-enforcement of the decisions in the applicants' favour. It also considers that there has been a violation of Article 13 of the Convention in that the applicants did not have an effective domestic remedy to redress the damage created by such non-enforcement.

B. Applications set out in Appendix 2

17. In view of the similarity of the applications listed in Appendix 2 in terms of the principal legal issue raised, the Court finds it appropriate to join them.

1. Application no. 29227/10

18. The Court notes that in application no. 29227/10 the delay in enforcement concerned the payment of relatively small award (UAH 590 – equivalent of EUR 60) and the applicant did not submit any arguments or evidence to suggest that the delay in the payment of such awards had a significant impact on his personal life. The Court has previously found a lack of “significant disadvantage” in the cases, where the amount in question was equal or inferior to roughly EUR 500 (see, for instance, *Gururyan v. Armenia* (dec.), no. 11456/05, 24 January 2012; *Ștefănescu v. Romania* (dec.), no. 11774/04, 12 April 2011). The Court finds that in the present case the applicant did not suffer any significant disadvantage as a result of the non-enforcement of the final judgments.

19. The Court also notes that “respect for human rights”, as defined in the Convention and the Protocols thereto, does not require examination of the present complaint on the merits, as the problem of non-enforcement of final decisions has already been addressed in the Court’s pilot judgment against Ukraine adopted in the case of *Yuriy Nikolaevich Ivanov v. Ukraine* (see *Yuriy Nikolayevich Ivanov v. Ukraine*, cited above) and in a number of other cases examined against Ukraine, which are moreover currently examined under “the well-established case-law procedure”.

20. The Court further notes that the applicant’s case was duly considered by the domestic tribunal within the meaning of Article 35 § 3 (b) with the decision favourable to the applicant.

21. In view of the foregoing, the Court concludes that application no. 29227/10 should be rejected as inadmissible in accordance with Article 35 § 3 (b) of the Convention.

2. Application no. 26028/13

22. In application no. 26028/13 the applicant complains about the lengthy non-enforcement of the judgment adopted by the Avtozavodskyy District Court of Kremenchuk on 5 May 2009.

23. In their observations to the application the Government informed the Court that the decision of the Avtozavodskyy District Court of Kremenchuk had been quashed by the Kharkiv Administrative Court of Appeal on 26 April 2010 (copy of the judgment provided). The Government proposed to declare application no. 26028/13 inadmissible *ratione personae*, as the applicant did not have an enforceable and final judgment adopted in his favour.

24. The Court notes that according to the Code of Civil Procedure the decision of the first instance court becomes enforceable if not appealed against within the time limit for appeal or if immediate enforcement is specially ordered by the first instance court in the law part of the decision. In the present case the State authorities appealed against the decision of the

first instance court and the decision did not become enforceable. In the course of the appeal proceedings the relevant decision was quashed by the higher court.

25. Therefore the Court agrees with the argument of the Government that the decision of the Avtozavodskyy District Court of Kremenchuk did not become enforceable, so that the application is to be declared inadmissible in accordance with Article 35 § 3 (a) of the Convention.

3. Applications nos. 59349/11, 61732/11, 9341/12 and 25081/12

26. In their observations in respect of applications nos. 59349/11, 61732/11, 9341/12 and 25081/12 the Government submitted that the relevant domestic decisions had been fully enforced within reasonable periods of time. They claimed, in particular, that the enforcement had been completed within four (in application 59349/11) and three (in applications nos. 61732/11 and 9341/12) months. In application no. 25081/12 the Government note that the decision of the domestic court dealt with the recalculation of the regular payments (pension); that the enforcement started without delay and that it ended on 22 July 2011 (final date of the period for which the pension was awarded by the domestic court). The Government, therefore, maintained that applications nos. 59349/11, 61732/11, 9341/12 and 25081/12 were manifestly ill-founded. The applicants failed to refute the Government's contentions.

27. The Court agrees with the Government's position that the length of enforcement in applications 59349/11, 61732/11, 9341/12 and 25081/12 was not excessive and that the applications are manifestly ill-founded within the meaning of Article 35 § 3, and must be rejected pursuant to Article 35 § 4 of the Convention (see *Andreyenko and Others v. Ukraine* (dec.), no. 22312/03, 19 June 2007; *Zbaranskaya v. Ukraine* (dec.), no. 43496/02, 11 October 2005).

4. Application no. 18293/12

28. In application no. 18293/12 the applicant complains of lengthy non-enforcement of the judgment delivered by the Energodar Court on 23 June 2011.

29. On 28 May 2013 the Dnipropetrovsk Administrative Court of Appeal modified the first instance court's judgment.

30. The Court observes that the period of non-enforcement starts running from the date the decision becomes enforceable (see § 24 above) and thus in the present case is equal to six months (taking to consideration the judgment of the court of appeal).

31. The Court notes that this period is not so excessive as to raise an arguable claim under the Convention (see *Soloshenko v. Ukraine* (dec.), no. 3952/04, 15 November 2005; *Comandari v. Moldova* (dec.),

no. 12224/05, 27 January 2009). It follows that the application is manifestly ill-founded within the meaning of Article 35 § 3, and must be rejected pursuant to Article 35 § 4 of the Convention.

5. Application no. 35206/12

32. In application no. 35206/12 the applicant complains of lengthy non-enforcement of the judgment delivered by the Crimean Circuit Administrative Court on 29 April 2011 and amended by the Sevastopol Administrative Court of Appeal on 8 February 2012.

33. In their observations to the Court the Government state that by a decision of the Crimean Circuit Administrative Court of 13 September 2012 the non-activity of the State bailiffs was declared unlawful and the applicant was awarded compensation for the lengthy non-enforcement of the judgment in the amount of UAH 10,000 (equivalent of EUR 1,000). The Government invited the Court to declare application no. 35206/12 inadmissible, as the applicant lost her victim status after the domestic courts afforded her appropriate and sufficient redress.

34. The Court notes that the domestic courts acknowledged the alleged breach of the applicant's rights and awarded compensation.

35. The Court agrees with the Government's position that, in the present case, the applicant has lost her victim status. Therefore the Court declares application no. 35206/12 manifestly ill-founded within the meaning of Article 35 § 3, and rejects it pursuant to Article 35 § 4 of the Convention.

IV. OTHER ALLEGED VIOLATIONS OF THE CONVENTION

36. Some of the applicants raised other complaints under the Convention, which the Court has examined carefully. In the light of all the material in its possession, and in so far as the matters complained of are within its competence, the Court finds that they do not disclose any appearance of a violation of the rights and freedoms set out in the Convention or its Protocols.

37. It follows that those complaints are manifestly ill-founded and must be rejected in accordance with Article 35 §§ 3 (a) and 4 of the Convention.

V. APPLICATION OF ARTICLE 41 OF THE CONVENTION

38. Article 41 of the Convention provides:

“If the Court finds that there has been a violation of the Convention or the Protocols thereto, and if the internal law of the High Contracting Party concerned allows only partial reparation to be made, the Court shall, if necessary, afford just satisfaction to the injured party.”

39. In the present case, the Court considers it reasonable and equitable (see *Kononova and Others v. Ukraine* [Committee], no. 11770/03 and 89 other applications, § 24, 6 June 2013; *Tsibulko and Others v. Ukraine* [Committee], no. 65656/11 and 249 other applications, § 19, 20 June 2013; *Pysarskyy and Others v. Ukraine* [Committee], no. 20397/07 and 164 other applications, § 24, 20 June 2013) to award 2,000 euros (EUR) to each of the applicants in Appendix 1. This sum is to cover any pecuniary and non-pecuniary damage, as well as costs and expenses.

40. The Court further notes that the respondent State has an outstanding obligation to enforce the decisions which remain enforceable.

41. The Court considers it appropriate that the default interest rate should be based on the marginal lending rate of the European Central Bank, to which should be added three percentage points.

FOR THESE REASONS, THE COURT UNANIMOUSLY

1. *Decides* to join the applications set out in Appendix 1;
2. *Declares* admissible the complaints of the applicants listed in Appendix 1 under Article 6 § 1 and Article 13 of the Convention and Article 1 of Protocol No. 1 about the lengthy non-enforcement of the decisions given in their favour and about the lack of effective domestic remedies in respect of those complaints and declares inadmissible the remainder of the applications;
3. *Holds* that there has been a violation of Article 6 § 1 of the Convention and of Article 1 of Protocol No. 1;
4. *Holds* that there has been a violation of Article 13 of the Convention;
5. *Holds*
 - (a) that within three months the respondent State is to enforce the domestic decisions in the applicants' favour which remain enforceable, and is to pay EUR 2,000 (two thousand euros) to each applicant or his or her estate in the applications enumerated in Appendix 1 in respect of pecuniary and non-pecuniary damage, and costs and expenses, plus any tax that may be chargeable to the applicants on the above amounts, which are to be converted into the national currency at the rate applicable at the date of settlement;
 - (b) that from the expiry of the above-mentioned three months until settlement simple interest shall be payable on the above amounts at a

rate equal to the marginal lending rate of the European Central Bank during the default period plus three percentage points;

6. *Decides* to join the applications set out in Appendix 2, and to declare them inadmissible;
7. *Decides* to strike application no. 67987/10 lodged by Ms Antonina Yosyfivna Gordeyuk out of its list of cases (Appendix 3).

Done in English, and notified in writing on 9 January 2014, pursuant to Rule 77 §§ 2 and 3 of the Rules of Court.

Stephen Phillips
Deputy Registrar

Boštjan M. Zupančič
President

APPENDIX 1

ADMISSIBLE APPLICATIONS

| No. | Application no. and date of introduction | Applicant name date of birth place of residence | Relevant domestic decision |
|-----|--|---|---|
| 1. | 12895/08 06/03/2008 | Mykola Oleksandrovych KHAYNATSKYY 30/06/1969 Zhytomyr | Korolovskyy District Court of Zhytomyr, 10/10/2007 |
| 2. | 43078/08 28/08/2008 | Yuriy Olegovych CHERNOUS 04/06/1984 Oleksandriya Oleg Igorovych CHERNOUS 01/12/1954 Oleksandriya | Applicant 1 Oleksandriya Court, 26/02/2008 Applicant 2 Oleksandriya Court, 26/02/2008 |
| 3. | 45361/09 22/07/2009 | Viktoriya Nikolayevna ROZHKOVA 22/02/1970 Krasnyy Luch | Krasnyy Luch Court, 11/05/2005 |
| 4. | 58076/09 21/10/2009 | Vasyl Vasylyovych OLIYNYK 06/10/1950 Kotelva | Kotelevskyy District Court of Poltava Region, 03/10/2007, as amended by the Poltava Regional Court of Appeal on 19/11/2007 |
| 5. | 29845/10 14/05/2010 | Yuzefa Ivanivna YANUSHEVYCH 06/09/1930 Zhytomyr | Zhytomyr Circuit Administrative Court, 23/01/2008 |
| 6. | 57977/10 23/09/2010 | Oleksandra Mykytivna YESIPKO 01/04/1939 Makiyivka | Chervonogvardiyskyy District Court of Makiyivka, 24/12/2001 |
| 7. | 74181/10 22/11/2010 | Lyudmyla Volodymyrivna GOLODNYAK 10/10/1976 Luts'k | Luts'k Court, 28/08/2009, as amended by the Lviv Administrative Court of Appeal on 01/06/2010 |
| 8. | 23683/11 07/04/2011 | Vasyl Fokovych POLYARUSH 19/07/1960 Tetiiv | Tetiiv Court, 05/12/2007 |
| 9. | 23848/11 23/03/2011 | Mariya Zakharivna ZINCHUK 11/04/1949 Khmelnitskyy | Khmelnitskyy Court, 09/07/2008 |
| 10. | 34066/11 25/05/2011 | Yuriy Stanislavovich MEKENZIN 06/12/1961 Artemivsk | 1) Donetsk Circuit Administrative Court, 10/09/2007 2) Artemivsk Court, 12/11/2010 3) Artemivsk Court, 15/03/2011 4) Artemivsk Court, 26/04/2010 |
| 11. | 34318/11 27/05/2011 | Volodymyr Arnoldovych KHATSYANOV 20/11/1959 Lviv | 1) Shevchenkivskyy District Court of Lviv, 03/12/2004 2) Shevchenkivskyy District Court of Lviv, 13/07/2006 |
| 12. | 35027/11 31/05/2011 | Lyubov Andriyivna VLASENKO 01/10/1924 Lisovychi | Tarashcha Court, 25/07/2008 |
| 13. | 35302/11 30/05/2011 | Larisa Teodorivna TSURKAN 19/06/1956 Chernivtsi | Sadgirs'kyy District Court of Chernivtsi, 12/01/1998 |
| 14. | 35390/11 17/05/2011 | Lyubov Georgiyevna VOLCHKOVA 22/08/1959 Vakhrusheve | Krasnyy Luch Court, 16/06/2005 |

| No. | Application no. and date of introduction | Applicant name date of birth place of residence | Relevant domestic decision |
|-----|--|--|--|
| 15. | 35665/11 30/05/2011 | Valentyna Ivanivna GUZOVSKA 07/11/1935 Zhytomyr | 1) Bogunskyy District Court of Zhytomyr, 11/06/2010 2) Bogunskyy District Court of Zhytomyr, 31/12/2010 |
| 16. | 35760/11 31/05/2011 | Svetlana Petrovna MARTYNYUK 13/02/1956 Krasnyy Luch | Krasnyy Luch Court, 24/04/2009 |
| 17. | 36210/11 09/06/2011 | Ivan Adolfovyh VYSOTSKYY 01/12/1937 Kyiv | 1) Shevchenkivskyy District Court of Kyiv, 04/12/2007 2) Shevchenkivskyy District Court of Kyiv, 15/03/2011 |
| 18. | 37983/11 16/06/2011 | Sergiy Vasylyovych LOZHKA 01/02/1942 Dovgalivske | Kyiv Administrative Court of Appeal, 17/07/2008 |
| 19. | 39204/11 08/06/2011 | Vladyslav Vasylyovych GORBATYY 14/04/1940 Vinnytsya | Leninskyy District Court of Vinnytsya, 29/03/2007 |
| 20. | 39367/11 15/06/2011 | Iryna Mykhaylivna GADKOVA 20/02/1963 Kerch | Zhdaniv Court, 22/10/2007 |
| 21. | 41620/11 12/05/2011 | Oleksandr Stepanovych SHEPSHELEY 22/10/1967 Lutsk | Lutsk Court, 03/12/2007 |
| 22. | 48363/11 22/07/2011 | Tamara Dmitriyevna RESHETNYAK 13/10/1948 Konstantinovka | Labour Disputes Commission of the State enterprise "Avtosklo", decision no. 382 from 2001 |
| 23. | 53955/11 17/08/2011 | Nataliya Mykhaylivna DESYATNYK 11/07/1980 Chervonograd | Chervonograd Court, 07/08/2009 |
| 24. | 60947/11 23/09/2011 | Grygoriy Volodymyrovych POKORA 24/05/1951 Oleksandriya | 1) Oleksandriya Court, 07/08/2006 (case no. 2-427/06) 2) Oleksandriya Court, 14/12/2006 |
| 25. | 61866/11 23/09/2011 | Lyudmyla Grygorivna BAGLAY 29/04/1951 Kremenchuk | Kryukivskyy District Court of Kremenchuk, 27/12/2004 |
| 26. | 66294/11 25/08/2011 | Mariya Zakharivna ZINCHUK 11/04/1949 Khmelnitskyy | Khmelnitskyy Court, 26/01/2010 |
| 27. | 75189/11 01/12/2011 | Viktor Fedorovych SHATROV 27/10/1958 Brovary | 1) Kyiv Administrative Court of Appeal, 23/12/2009 2) Brovary Court, 17/11/2009 |
| 28. | 23/12 07/12/2011 | Yuriy Ivanovych IVANOV 10/06/1949 Alchevsk | 1) Alchevsk Court, 01/10/2009, as amended by the Lugansk Regional Court of Appeal on 29/11/2011 2) Alchevsk Court, 12/09/2011 3) Alchevsk Court, 25/09/2009, as amended by the Lugansk Regional Court of Appeal on 30/05/2011 4) Alchevsk Court, 26/01/2011 |
| 29. | 27/12 10/12/2011 | Lidiya Mykhaylivna TIMAKOVA 02/03/1941 Alchevsk | Alchevsk Court, 01/03/2011 |
| 30. | 266/12 09/12/2011 | Galyna Yosypivna MARCHENKO 05/01/1941 Kyiv | Svyatoshynskyy District Court of Kyiv, 18/11/2010 |
| 31. | 3549/12 06/01/2012 | Alla Ivanivna NALAPIY 16/02/1974 Ovruch | Ovruch Court, 17/02/2009 |

| No. | Application no. and date of introduction | Applicant name date of birth place of residence | Relevant domestic decision |
|-----|--|--|---|
| 32. | 3749/12 06/01/2012 | Rynat Sabirzhanovych SALAKHUTDINOV 06/02/1960 Zaporizhzhya | Shevchenkivskyy District Court of Zaporizhzhya, 24/12/2007 |
| 33. | 4242/12 05/01/2012 | Anatoliy Mikhaylovich BORTNIK 17/08/1957 Pershotravneve | Ovruch Court, 22/06/2009 |
| 34. | 5474/12 05/01/2012 | Viktor Ilyich GUDSKOV 07/04/1959 Mariupol | Donetsk Curcuit Administrative Court, 21/08/2008 |
| 35. | 5604/12 17/01/2012 | Valentyn Yakovych DOLGANOV 23/01/1947 Teplodar | Teplodar Court, 08/06/2011 |
| 36. | 5748/12 16/01/2012 | Mykola Volodymyrovych MOVCHANYUK 27/03/1957 Korosten Roman Mykolayovych MOVCHANYUK 31/05/1986 Korosten Galyna Vyacheslavivna MOVCHANYUK 26/09/1959 Korosten | 1) Korosten Court, 03/11/2009 (case no. 2a-7708-2009) 2) Korosten Court, 03/11/2009 (case no. 2a-5374-2009) 3) Korosten Court, 03/11/2009 (case no. 2a-9900-2009) |
| 37. | 5810/12 18/01/2012 | Leonid Mykolayovych BUGERA 09/07/1949 Boyarka | Kyyevo-Svyatoshynskyy District Court of Kyiv Region, 23/10/2009 |
| 38. | 5837/12 17/01/2012 | Nataliya Ivanivna ZHUK 04/02/1974 Ovruch | Ovruch Court, 12/03/2009 |
| 39. | 5941/12 18/01/2012 | Mykola Yuriyovych RYBYSKY 23/10/1967 Ovruch | Ovruch Court, 02/03/2009 |
| 40. | 5997/12 17/01/2012 | Oleksandr Kostyantynovych SHEVCHENKO 11/02/1957 Oleksandriya | 1) Oleksandriya Court, 10/06/2010 2) Oleksandriya Court, 15/06/2010 |
| 41. | 6300/12 12/01/2012 | Ganna Fedorivna GRUSHKOVSKA 27/11/1941 Kryvyi Rig | Dnipropetrovsk Administrative Court of Appeal, 16/12/2010 |
| 42. | 6313/12 16/01/2012 | Lyubov Grygorivna BARANOVSKA 13/02/1940 Ignatpil | 1) Ovruch Court, 27/02/2009 2) Ovruch Court, 15/03/2010 |
| 43. | 6421/12 20/01/2012 | Galyna Ivanivna ZYOLKO 31/10/1957 Ovruch | Ovruch Court, 06/07/2010 |
| 44. | 6430/12 20/01/2012 | Valentina Petrovna BESARABCHIK 24/06/1958 Ovruch | Ovruch Court, 20/03/2009 |
| 45. | 6450/12 19/01/2012 | Igor Anatoliyovych RAZBORSKY 29/12/1967 Chasiv Yar | 1) Artemivsk Court, 27/05/2008 2) Artemivsk Court, 16/10/2008 |

| No. | Application no. and date of introduction | Applicant name date of birth place of residence | Relevant domestic decision |
|-----|--|---|--|
| 46. | 6471/12 10/01/2012 | Rynat Sabirzhanovych SALAKHUTDINOV 06/02/1960 Zaporizhzhya | Shevchenkivskyy District Court of Zaporizhzhya, 05/05/2006 |
| 47. | 6560/12 20/01/2012 | Vitaliy Ivanovych BUSLAYEV 05/03/1944 Korosten | Korosten Court, 24/04/2009 |
| 48. | 6565/12 20/01/2012 | Lyudmyla Mykhaylivna BUSLAYEVA 21/02/1949 Korosten | Korosten Court, 24/04/2009 |
| 49. | 6600/12 20/01/2012 | Oleksandr Ivanovych KHANCHYCH 12/11/1979 Ovruch | Ovruch Court, 13/03/2009 |
| 50. | 6651/12 21/01/2012 | Ivan Stepanovych ANTONYUK 21/03/1947 Mariupol | Donetsk Circuit Administrative Court, 29/07/2008 as amended by the Donetsk Administrative Court of Appeal, 10/10/2008 |
| 51. | 6749/12 16/01/2012 | Liliya Viktorivna TYSHKEVYCH 24/06/1969 Ovruch | 1) Zhytomyr Circuit Administrative Court, 22/09/2008 2) Ovruch Court, 03/03/2009 3) Ovruch Court, 16/06/2010 |
| 52. | 6981/12 19/01/2012 | Vladimir Aleksandrovich NOSIKOV 16/03/1958 Odesa | Malynovskyy District Court of Odesa, 12/11/2010 |
| 53. | 7142/12 20/01/2012 | Ganna Vasylivna BUGAYETS 17/12/1956 Kremenchuk | Krukivskyy District Court of Kremenchuk, 04/07/2005 |
| 54. | 7212/12 18/01/2012 | Viktor Ivanovych BARANOVSKYY 28/03/1940 Ignatpil | 1) Ovruch Court, 27/02/2009 2) Ovruch Court, 21/05/2009 3) Ovruch Court, 18/03/2010 4) Ovruch Court, 08/09/2010 |
| 55. | 7541/12 14/01/2012 | Anatoliy Filippovich KHODAK 29/08/1961 Khmelnitskyy | Khmelnitskyy Court, 18/12/2008 |
| 56. | 7603/12 17/01/2012 | Ivan Mykolayovych SYDORENKO 30/05/1957 Pryluky | 1) Korosten Court, 15/06/2009 2) Korosten Court, 24/02/2010 3) Korosten Court, 15/12/2010 4) Korosten Court, 30/01/2012 |
| 57. | 8247/12 31/01/2012 | Nadiya Petrivna RAYENOK 03/08/1942 Volodarka | Volodarka Court, 09/04/2009 |
| 58. | 8272/12 26/01/2012 | Volodymyr Viktorovych CHUVPYLO 23/04/1955 Kaniv | Kaniv Court, 28/01/2010 |
| 59. | 8289/12 30/01/2012 | Anatoliy Vasylyovych KOSHYK 13/09/1945 Ovruch | Ovruch Court, 27/08/2009 |
| 60. | 8294/12 31/01/2012 | Angelina Mykhaylivna BOGUSH 25/07/1982 Ovruch | 1) Ovruch Court, 12/03/2009 2) Ovruch Court, 08/07/2009 |

| No. | Application no. and date of introduction | Applicant name date of birth place of residence | Relevant domestic decision |
|-----|--|--|---|
| 61. | 8305/12 31/01/2012 | Olena Mykhaylivna PAPKA 24/11/1963 Ovruch | Ovruch Court, 02/03/2009 |
| 62. | 8365/12 31/01/2012 | Olga Volodymyrivna MOROZ 12/09/1979 Korosten | 1) Korosten Court, 31/07/2009 2) Korosten Court, 04/12/2009 3) Korosten Court, 17/12/2010 |
| 63. | 8378/12 26/01/2012 | Galyna Volodymyrivna VERGUN 08/05/1956 Kyiv | Podilskyy District Court of Kyiv, 23/07/2010 |
| 64. | 8406/12 25/01/2012 | Svitlana Stanislavivna TEMCHENKO 03/10/1965 Zhytomyr | Zhytomyr Circuit Administrative Court, 18/03/2008 |
| 65. | 8439/12 27/01/2012 | Valentyna Petrivna LENKO 14/11/1968 Ovruch | Ovruch Court, 08/12/2009 |
| 66. | 8452/12 27/01/2012 | Ivan KELMAN 22/09/1938 Lviv | 1) Frankivskyy District Court of Lviv, 06/06/2005 2) Frankivskyy District Court of Lviv, 26/08/2005 |
| 67. | 8457/12 28/01/2012 | Ruslan Volodymyrovych KAMINSKYI 23/02/1964 Khmelnysky | Khmelnysky Court, 23/07/2008 |
| 68. | 8671/12 31/01/2012 | Mykhaylo Mykhaylovych BARANOVSKYY 11/05/1980 Ovruch | Ovruch Court, 22/09/2009 |
| 69. | 8679/12 27/01/2012 | Aleksandr Nikolayevich REUKA 07/12/1953 Kramatorsk | Kramatorsk Court, 09/06/2009 |
| 70. | 8858/12 25/01/2012 | Yuriy Sergiyovych DYVINSKYI 07/01/1959 Ovruch | Zhytomyr Circuit Administrative Court, 01/10/2008 |
| 71. | 8869/12 22/01/2012 | Mykola Yuhymovych SACHOK 12/09/1935 Cherepyn | Ovruch Court, 18/05/2010 |
| 72. | 8873/12 22/01/2012 | Kateryna Ivanivna SACHOK 20/06/1943 Cherepyn | Ovruch Court, 18/05/2010 |
| 73. | 8959/12 01/02/2012 | Mariya Andriyivna KHOMUTOVSKA 17/05/1977 Korosten | 1) Korosten Court, 14/11/2008 2) Korosten Court, 10/04/2009 3) Korosten Court 22/02/2011 |
| 74. | 9076/12 30/01/2012 | Vasyl Pavlovych DUBOVSKYY 02/11/1965 Ovruch | Ovruch Court, 08/09/2009 |
| 75. | 9084/12 31/01/2012 | Nataliya Vasylivna KOVALCHUK 09/07/1984 Ovruch | Ovruch Court, 13/10/2009 |
| 76. | 9196/12 04/02/2012 | Mariya Vasylivna VASYLCHUK 04/11/1959 Kuznetsovsk | Kuznetsovsk Court, 15/02/2011 |
| 77. | 9207/12 27/01/2012 | Yevgeniy Miroslavovich SOBOL 31/01/1958 Donetsk | 1) Donetsk Circuit Administrative Court, 16/09/2008 2) Kirovskyy District Court of Donetsk, 10/12/2008 |

| No. | Application no. and date of introduction | Applicant name date of birth place of residence | Relevant domestic decision |
|-----|--|--|---|
| 78. | 9311/12 27/01/2012 | Ivan Ivanovich KRIVOLAPCHUK 08/03/1969 Krasylivka | Ovruch Court, 20/03/2009 |
| 79. | 9351/12 02/02/2012 | Valentyna Oleksandrivna SAMARSKA 17/04/1956 Kyiv | Svyatoshynskyy District Court of Kyiv, 04/11/2010, as amended by the Kyiv City Court of Appeal, 21/04/2011 |
| 80. | 9381/12 03/02/2012 | Viktor Stepanovych KANDUR 07/09/1963 Besidka | 1) Stavyshe Court, 28/02/2008 2) Stavyshe Court, 15/06/2009 |
| 81. | 9522/12 30/01/2012 | Mariya Oleksiyivna RENGEVYCH 1946 Tetiiv | Tetiiv Court, 21/11/2007 |
| 82. | 9591/12 03/02/2012 | Ivan Grigoryevich TERESHCHUK 02/05/1942 Ovruch | Ovruch Court, 01/07/2009 |
| 83. | 9774/12 31/01/2012 | Izolda Anatoliyivna FRANCHUK 02/12/1941 Volodymyr-Volynskyy | 1) Volodymyr-Volynskyy Court, 14/11/2007 1) Volodymyr-Volynskyy Court, 09/12/2009, as amended by the Lviv Administrative Court of Appeal, 21/06/2011 |
| 84. | 9805/12 09/02/2012 | Yuriy Valeriyovych MYKHAYLOV 02/11/1966 Kyiv | Kyiv City Commercial Court, 10/09/2010 |
| 85. | 9853/12 01/02/2012 | Valentyna Adamivna LEVKIVSKA 13/01/1967 Zhytomyr | Zhytomyr Circuit Administrative Court, 03/02/2009 |
| 86. | 9872/12 31/01/2012 | Oleksandr Illich VOLOKH 13/07/1937 Kyiv | Kyiv City Court of Appeal, 12/11/2008 |
| 87. | 9878/12 01/02/2012 | Mykhaylo Grygorovych YAKUKHNO 08/12/1942 Ovruch | 1) Kyiv Administrative Court of Appeal, 03/12/2008 2) Ovruch Court, 11/02/2009 3) Ovruch Court, 29/05/2009 4) Ovruch Court, 04/01/2010 5) Ovruch Court, 05/01/2010 6) Ovruch Court, 23/08/2010 7) Ovruch Court, 07/09/2010 8) Ovruch Court, 21/03/2011 9) Zhytomyr Administrative Court of Appeal, 12/01/2012 |
| 88. | 9986/12 31/01/2012 | Petro Fedorovych FRANCHUK 03/09/1937 Volodymyr-Volynskyy | 1) Volodymyr-Volynskyy Court, 13/11/2007 2) Lviv Administrative Court of Appeal, 27/12/2010 |
| 89. | 10044/12 07/02/2012 | Viktor Ivanovych SINELNYK 17/06/1952 Tetiiv | Tetiiv Court, 11/12/2007 |
| 90. | 10295/12 09/02/2012 | Mykola Kuzmovych KOVAL 1956 Tetiiv | Tetiiv Court, 27/11/2007 |

| No. | Application no. and date of introduction | Applicant name date of birth place of residence | Relevant domestic decision |
|------|--|--|--|
| 91. | 10375/12 10/02/2012 | Vitaliy Oleksandrovych KIRSANOV 04/10/1986 Chernigiv | 1) Desnyanskyy District Court of Chernigiv, 10/11/2010 2) Desnyanskyy District Court of Chernigiv, 25/06/2011 3) Desnyanskyy District Court of Chernigiv, 26/10/2011 |
| 92. | 10398/12 31/01/2012 | Stepan Vasylovych SKRYPNYK 28/01/1967 Klishkiivtsi | Khotyn Court, 25/06/2011 |
| 93. | 10875/12 10/01/2012 | Igor Valentynovych UVAROV 10/06/1957 Chernigiv | Desnyanskyy District Court of Chernigiv, 16/01/2008 as amended by judgments of Desnyanskyy District Court of Chernigiv of 26/05/2010 and of 27/04/2011 |
| 94. | 11032/12 16/02/2012 | Oksana Pavlivna LEVKIVSKA 09/04/1978 Ovruch | Ovruch Court, 17/11/2010 |
| 95. | 11038/12 15/02/2012 | LUGPROM, TOV Lugansk | Commercial Court of Lugansk, 03/06/2005 |
| 96. | 11313/12 15/02/2012 | Volodymyr Vasylyovych POPELYANSKY 15/12/1926 Vchorayshe | Zhytomyr Circuit Administrative Court, 14/01/2009 |
| 97. | 11317/12 14/02/2012 | Nataliya Anatoliyivna PATSALO 02/07/1960 Ovruch | Ovruch Court, 05/10/2010 |
| 98. | 11520/12 27/01/2012 | Dmytro Semenovych BALATSKO 17/11/1958 Glyboke | Bogorodchany Court, 15/10/2010 |
| 99. | 11630/12 16/02/2012 | Grygoriy Sergiyovych SYVUKHIN 28/09/1978 Zolotonosha | Zolotonosha Court, 02/12/2010 |
| 100. | 11772/12 25/01/2012 | Galyna Petrivna PYLYPCHUK 24/11/1951 Ovruch | Ovruch Court, 21/10/2010 |
| 101. | 11928/12 09/02/2012 | Anatoliy Mykolayovych VIZNYI 09/09/1956 Illichivka | Prymorskyi Distrikt Court of Odesa, 15/07/2011 |
| 102. | 12080/12 03/02/2012 | Ihona Vitaliyivna ZAKHAROVA 17/03/1975 Korosten | Korosten Court, 08/02/2011 |
| 103. | 12105/12 20/02/2012 | Volodymyr Anatoliyovych GOLOVATYY 17/04/1958 Kyiv | Darnytskyi District Court of Kyiv, 30/12/2009 |
| 104. | 12790/12 22/02/2012 | Oksana Ivanivna SHEVTSOVA 23/02/1971 Ovruch | Ovruch Court, 23/03/2009 |
| 105. | 12794/12 22/02/2012 | Leonid Vasiliyevich GOLUBNICHYI 30/06/1955 Shakhtarsk | Shakhtarsk Court, 14/10/2008 |
| 106. | 13205/12 16/02/2012 | Artur Dmytrovych RASHKO 17/10/1984 Zhytomyr | Korosten Court, 22/10/2009 |
| 107. | 13291/12 20/02/2012 | Anatoliy Anatoliyovych KANEVSKYY 06/09/1947 Tarashcha | Tarashcha Court, 22/12/2010 |

| No. | Application no. and date of introduction | Applicant name date of birth place of residence | Relevant domestic decision |
|------|--|---|---|
| 108. | 13390/12 21/02/2012 | Galyna Oleksandrivna PREDCHENKO 27/02/1964 Sumy | Kovpakivskyy District Court of Sumy, 07/03/2011, as amended by the Kharkiv Administrative Court of Appeal, 17/08/2011 |
| 109. | 13396/12 24/02/2012 | Tamara Mykolayivna MASNEVA 19/02/1951 Kharkiv | Kominternivskyy District Court of Kharkiv, 04/07/2011 |
| 110. | 13400/12 24/02/2012 | Vitaliy Mykolayovych DANILOV 28/07/1954 Uzyn | 1) Bila Tserkva Court, 14/12/2009 2) Bila Tserkva Court, 18/04/2011 |
| 111. | 13584/12 24/02/2012 | Lyudmyla Ivanivna SHMUYLO 31/01/1978 Zarichchya | Ovruch Court, 24/11/2009 |
| 112. | 13615/12 01/03/2012 | Nikolay Ivanovich KRAVCHENKO 20/05/1959 Lugansk | Artemivskyy District Court of Lugansk, 03/06/2011 |
| 113. | 13627/12 11/02/2012 | Galyna Volodymyrivna VERGUN 08/05/1956 Kyiv | Podilskyy District Court of Kyiv, 06/08/2010 |
| 114. | 13629/12 27/02/2012 | Nadiya Petrivna DAVLETCINA 04/07/1949 Kuznetsovsk | Kuznetsovsk Court, 16/11/2010 |
| 115. | 13674/12 01/03/2012 | Sergey Vladimirovich VOVK 29/07/1963 Lugansk | Lugansk Circuit Administrative Court, 20/11/2008 |
| 116. | 13752/12 01/03/2012 | Sergiy Mytrofanovych ZUBCHENKO 21/03/1919 Zhytomyr | Zhytomyr Circuit Administrative Court, 02/04/2008 |
| 117. | 13792/12 01/03/2012 | Valentyna Ivanivna DUBNYTSKA 23/06/1954 Ovruch | Ovruch Court, 03/04/2009 |
| 118. | 13824/12 27/02/2012 | Mykola Petrovych SMYKOVSKYY 21/03/1952 Ovruch | Ovruch Court, 03/06/2009 |
| 119. | 14283/12 01/03/2012 | Oleksiy Oleksiyovych MAKAROV 1951 Oleksandriya | Oleksandriya Court, 17/06/2004 |
| 120. | 14304/12 05/03/2012 | Olena Vitaliyivna TARASYUK 13/03/1964 Bila Tserkva | Bila Tserkva Court, 04/06/2009 |
| 121. | 14463/12 03/03/2012 | Svitlana Oleksandrivna GANZHA 15/05/1971 Kyiv | Solomyanskyy district Court of Kyiv, 29/04/2011 |
| 122. | 14497/12 03/03/2012 | Sergiy Volodymyrovych BURA 15/09/1936 Rivne | Rivne Court, 10/11/2009 |
| 123. | 14698/12 29/02/2012 | Mariya Teodorivna ZAGARUK 17/10/1924 Stetseva | Snyatyn Court, 10/09/2010 |
| 124. | 14717/12 22/02/2012 | Mykola Ivanovych MUZYCHUK 04/05/1967 Rivne | Rivne Court, 27/12/2010 as modified by the Lviv Administrative Court of Appeal on 05/03/2013 |
| 125. | 14726/12 01/03/2012 | Vera Nikolayevna IVAKINA 13/10/1952 Lugansk | Lugansk Circuit Administrative Court, 03/03/2008 |

| No. | Application no. and date of introduction | Applicant name date of birth place of residence | Relevant domestic decision |
|------|--|---|---|
| 126. | 15332/12 05/01/2012 | Vladimir Aleksandrovich LISHCHENKO 03/01/1952 Mariupol | Prymorsky district Court of Mariupol, 09/07/2010 |
| 127. | 15519/12 06/03/2012 | Oleksandr Volodymyrovych LYSYUK 30/09/1961 Ovruch | Ovruch Court, 02/06/2009 |
| 128. | 15587/12 07/03/2012 | UGLESTROYSERVIS, OOO Krasnyy Luch | Lugansk Regional Commercial Court, 06/04/2009 |
| 129. | 15675/12 29/02/2012 | Aleksandr Anatolyevich BELOUSOV 28/12/1960 Lugansk | Zhovtnevy District Court of Lugansk, 17/01/2011 |
| 130. | 16089/12 13/03/2012 | Lyubov Yosypivna BELIKOVA 28/01/1941 Bila Tserkva | Bila Tserkva Court, 04/03/2009 |
| 131. | 16150/12 12/03/2012 | Valentyna Pavlivna YANCHUK 28/03/1959 Kuznetsovsk | 1) Lviv Administrative Court of Appeal, 21/06/2011 2) Kuznetsovsk Court, 01/07/2011 |
| 132. | 16242/12 13/03/2012 | Mykola Volodymyrovych SOLOMANIN 15/01/1952 Izyum | Izyum Court, 15/02/2010 |
| 133. | 16601/12 26/01/2012 | Leonid Semenovich KNEVETS 29/07/1948 Ovruch Vira Fedorivna KNEVETS 15/05/1949 Ovruch | Applicant 1 1) Ovruch Court, 12/08/2009 2) Ovruch Court, 11/03/2010 Applicant 2 Ovruch Court, 11/06/2010 |
| 134. | 16684/12 14/03/2012 | Viktor Trokhymovich BONDARENKO 19/06/1955 Skvyra | Skvyra Court, 01/06/2009 (as partly amended by the Kyiv Regional Court of Appeal on 30/06/2011) |
| 135. | 16865/12 14/03/2012 | Olena Mykolayivna PESHKO 27/01/1969 Korosten | Korosten Court, 17/05/2010 |
| 136. | 17048/12 15/03/2012 | Tetyana Mykolayivna POTIYCHUK 08/08/1976 Gladkovychi | 1) Ovruch Court, 03/08/2009 2) Ovruch Court, 27/09/2010 |
| 137. | 18014/12 19/03/2012 | Aleksey Georgiyevich KUTIKOV 20/07/1949 Vasylivka | 1) Vasylivka Court, 14/12/2010 2) Vasylivka Court, 20/01/2011 (as partly amended by the Dnipropetrovsk Administrative Court of Appeal on 04/11/2011) |
| 138. | 18058/12 19/03/2012 | Svetlana Ivanovna SHVAB 09/12/1970 Ovruch | Ovruch Court, 25/05/2009 |
| 139. | 18159/12 19/03/2012 | Natalya Ivanovna DIVINSKAYA 02/10/1975 Korchevka | Ovruch Court, 18/01/2010 |
| 140. | 18188/12 19/03/2012 | Valentyna Sergiyivna YAROSHYK 24/02/1968 Kuznetsovsk | 1) Kuznetsovsk Court, 30/08/2010 (as partly amended by the Lviv Administrative Court of Appeal on 27/09/2011) 2) Kuznetsovsk Court, 31/03/2011 |

| No. | Application no. and date of introduction | Applicant name date of birth place of residence | Relevant domestic decision |
|------|--|--|---|
| 141. | 18216/12 19/03/2012 | Vyacheslav Oleksiyovych YATSKOVETS 10/11/1976 Korosten | Korosten Court, 30/03/2010 |
| 142. | 18267/12 20/03/2012 | Volodymyr Oleksandrovych GONCHAROV 13/06/1959 Energodar | Energodar Court, 06/06/2011 |
| 143. | 18273/12 15/03/2012 | Svetlana Sergeyevna NEVMERZHITSKAYA 04/10/1964 Ovruch | Ovruch Court, 23/04/2009 |
| 144. | 18337/12 20/03/2012 | Lidiya Petrivna ANANYEVA 02/01/1960 Energodar | Energodar Court, 19/07/2011 |
| 145. | 18354/12 06/03/2012 | Iryna Oleksiyivna NECHYPORENKO 20/08/1938 Tarashcha | Tarashcha Court, 11/05/2007 |
| 146. | 18384/12 24/03/2012 | Petro Petrovych MUKSHYMENKO 24/01/1954 Kyiv | Solomyanskyy District Court of Kyiv, 16/06/2010 |
| 147. | 18417/12 23/03/2012 | Svitlana Yakivna DEMYDCHUK 10/10/1969 Ovruch | Ovruch Court, 21/07/2009 |
| 148. | 18418/12 23/03/2012 | Ivan Ivanovych DEMYDCHUK 21/12/1963 Ovruch | Ovruch Court, 21/07/2009 |
| 149. | 18522/12 19/03/2012 | Valeriy Pavlovych SEKATSKYY 16/08/1954 Lugansk | Kyiv Administrative Court of Appeal, 18/02/2009 |
| 150. | 18542/12 21/03/2012 | Sergey Vasilyevich MAKAREVICH 17/12/1969 Ovruch | Ovruch Court, 30/09/2009 |
| 151. | 18545/12 21/03/2012 | Natalya Vladimirovna MAKAREVICH 21/02/1970 Ovruch | Ovruch Court, 30/09/2009 |
| 152. | 18560/12 21/03/2012 | Yuriy Pavlovych KOVALCHUK 10/12/1954 Chernigiv | Desnyanskyy District Court of Chernigiv, 10/12/2009 |
| 153. | 18599/12 13/03/2012 | Sergey Leonidovich BOBROV 14/03/1958 Ovruch | Zhytomyr Circuit Administrative Court, 13/01/2009 |
| 154. | 18609/12 12/03/2012 | Vasyl Volodymyrovych SAPIY 03/09/1961 Ivano-Frankivsk | Ivano-Frankivsk Court, 18/11/2009 |
| 155. | 18618/12 22/03/2012 | Ruslana Volodymyrivna YAKUKHNO 03/12/1972 Korosten | Korosten Court, 24/05/2010 |
| 156. | 18694/12 23/03/2012 | Nadiya Volodymyrivna VOYTOVYCH 05/05/1973 Poliske | Ovruch Court, 04/08/2009 |
| 157. | 18815/12 16/03/2012 | Stepan Aleksandrovich NEVMERZHITSKIY 06/01/1961 Ovruch | Zhytomyr Circuit Administrative Court, 20/05/2008 |

| No. | Application no. and date of introduction | Applicant name date of birth place of residence | Relevant domestic decision |
|------|--|---|--|
| 158. | 19059/12 22/03/2012 | Oleksiy Oleksiyovych MOZHAROVSKYY 28/03/1969 Ovruch | Ovruch Court, 18/11/2010 |
| 159. | 19073/12 01/03/2012 | Mykola Stepanovych OPANASYUK 18/05/1959 Rivne | 1) Rivne Court, 28/04/2009 2) Rivne Court, 06/04/2011 |
| 160. | 19279/12 22/03/2012 | Mariya Yuriyivna KOVALENKO 08/08/1965 Ovruch | Ovruch Court, 07/09/2009 |
| 161. | 19409/12 21/03/2012 | Galyna Andriyivna KHURAVA 10/04/1956 Odessa | Suvorovskyy District Court of Odessa, 12/05/2009 |
| 162. | 19550/12 20/03/2012 | Lyudmyla Yosypivna PIDGORNA 14/12/1958 Znamyanka | Leninskyy District Court of Kirovograd, 17/04/2003 |
| 163. | 19551/12 26/03/2012 | Tamara Petrovna ZOLOTAREVA 02/10/1954 Ovruch | Ovruch Court, 11/06/2009 |
| 164. | 19556/12 15/03/2012 | Vladimir Vladimirovich YABLONENKO 02/08/1957 Lugansk | Lugansk Circuit Administrative Court, 11/12/2007 |
| 165. | 19853/12 20/03/2012 | Mikhail Vasilyevich FILATOV 17/04/1966 Ivanivka | 1) Antratsyt Court, 05/11/2009 2) Antratsyt Court, 27/09/2010 3) Antratsyt Court, 04/08/2010 |
| 166. | 20004/12 23/03/2012 | Vasyl Viktorovych MOVCHAN 02/04/1961 Krasnoarmiysk | Donetsk Administrative Court of Appeal, 04/07/2008 |
| 167. | 20019/12 23/03/2012 | Svitlana Oleksiyivna BOZHKO 02/04/1979 Krasnoarmiysk | 1) Donetsk Administrative Court of Appeal, 23/07/2008 2) Krasnoarmiysk Court, 29/03/2010 |
| 168. | 20092/12 28/03/2012 | Svyatoslav Mykhaylovych SHYPITKO 16/10/1983 Ovruch | 1) Zhytomyr Circuit Administrative Court, 20/03/2009 2) Ovruch Court, 08/07/2009 3) Ovruch Court, 05/07/2010 |
| 169. | 20096/12 29/03/2012 | Nina Volodymyrivna KURANTSOVA 06/07/1955 Ovruch | Ovruch Court, 23/06/2009 |
| 170. | 20105/12 29/03/2012 | Mykola Petrovych GARASHCHUK 02/01/1957 Kyrdany | Ovruch Court, 12/03/2009 |
| 171. | 20112/12 29/03/2012 | Galyna Stepanivna CHYCHEBA 19/02/1954 Stugivshchyna | Ovruch Court, 13/04/2009 |
| 172. | 20400/12 27/03/2012 | Valentina Vasilyevna TISHINA 18/01/1954 Ovruch | Ovruch Court, 23/06/2009 |
| 173. | 20450/12 15/03/2012 | Valentin Prokofyevich CHEREPENKO 05/09/1949 Donetsk | Kirovskyy District Court of Donetsk, 15/01/2010 |

| No. | Application no. and date of introduction | Applicant name date of birth place of residence | Relevant domestic decision |
|------|--|--|--|
| 174. | 20510/12 04/04/2012 | Mykola Opanasovych SUKHOKOBYLKA 13/06/1946 Kharkiv | 1) Dzerzhynskyy District Court of Kharkiv, 02/06/2010 2) Dzerzhynskyy District Court of Kharkiv, 28/09/2011 |
| 175. | 20631/12 27/03/2012 | Oleksandr Fedorovych KRUIY 04/05/1941 Zaporizhzhya | Dnipropetrovsk Administrative Court of Appeal, 14/06/2011 |
| 176. | 20918/12 28/02/2012 | Vira Ivanivna SHCHAKINA 04/03/1945 Kremenchuk | Avtozavodskyy District Court of Kremenchuk, 21/06/2011, as amended by the Poltava Regional Court of Appeal on 07/09/2011 |
| 177. | 21067/12 26/03/2012 | Mariya Denisivna OREL 1929 Reshetylivka | Narodych Court, 13/11/2007 |
| 178. | 21080/12 28/03/2012 | Valentyna Omelyanivna YAKYMENKO 17/03/1948 Reshetylivka | Kharkiv Administrative Court of Appeal, 20/04/2011 |
| 179. | 21556/12 04/04/2012 | Sergiy Anatoliyovych CHAPTSEV 20/04/1971 Korosten | 1) Korosten Court, 12/06/2009 2) Korosten Court, 12/07/2010 3) Korosten Court, 14/09/2010 |
| 180. | 21875/12 06/04/2012 | Nina Fedorivna KHONDOKA 06/06/1959 Kuznetsovsk | Kuznetsovsk Court, 02/12/2010 as amended by the Zhytomyr Administrative Court of Appeal on 23/05/2011 |
| 181. | 21917/12 04/04/2012 | Aleksandr Vasilyevich AFANASYEV 20/03/1959 Lugansk | 1) Donetsk Administrative Court of Appeal on 13/11/2008 2) Zhovtnevy District Court of Lugansk, 14/12/2010 (case no.7488/11) 3) Zhovtnevy District Court of Lugansk, 14/12/2010 (case 7486/11) 4) Zhovtnevy District Court of Lugansk, 21/01/2011 5) Zhovtnevy District Court of Lugansk, 21/01/2011 |
| 182. | 22030/12 06/04/2012 | Elena Nikolayevna ISAYEVA 09/06/1963 Ovruch | Ovruch Court, 09/06/2009 |
| 183. | 22048/12 05/04/2012 | Mariya Andriyivna PRUS 28/08/1941 Energodar | Energodar Court, 24/06/2011 |
| 184. | 22077/12 05/04/2012 | Nina Petrivna NIKOZA 16/06/1950 Energodar | Energodar Court, 23/12/2010 |
| 185. | 22557/12 04/04/2012 | Svetlana Ivanovna MEDVEDCHUK 13/01/1959 Krasnyy Luch | Krasnyy Luch Court, 31/08/2009 |
| 186. | 22566/12 03/04/2012 | Mykola Mykolayovych VARVADYUK 05/09/1968 Kolomyia | Kolomyia Court, 27/08/2009 |
| 187. | 22588/12 06/04/2012 | Yuriy Volodymyrovych CHIRKIN 27/11/1962 Reshetylivka | Reshetylivka Court, 14/12/2010 |
| 188. | 22753/12 02/04/2012 | Tatyana Nikolayevna GLUSHKOVA 26/12/1965 Lugansk | Leninskyy District Court of Lugansk, 28/01/2011 |

| No. | Application no. and date of introduction | Applicant name date of birth place of residence | Relevant domestic decision |
|------|--|--|--|
| 189. | 22813/12 09/04/2012 | Nina Kyrylivna BEZUSHKO 16/11/1970 Sumy | Zarichnyy District Court of Sumy, 26/09/2008 as partly amended by the Kharkiv Administrative Court of Appeal on 11/02/2009 |
| 190. | 22890/12 09/04/2012 | Nina Kyrylivna BEZUSHKO 16/11/1970 Sumy | Zarichnyy District Court of Sumy, 14/01/2011 as partly amended by the Kharkiv Administrative Court of Appeal on 11/05/2011 |
| 191. | 23503/12 13/04/2012 | Tetyana Mykolayivna DULKO 22/09/1973 Tovkachi | Ovruch Court, 27/05/2009 |
| 192. | 23508/12 13/04/2012 | Tetyana Mykolayivna DULKO 22/09/1973 Tovkachi | Ovruch Court, 06/05/2010 |
| 193. | 24317/12 31/01/2012 | Petro Andriyovych KOVTUNOVYCH 16/04/1955 Ovruch | Ovruch Court, 23/09/2010 |
| 194. | 24372/12 09/04/2012 | Mykola Mykolayovych ISAYKIN 17/05/1971 Ozerne | Zhytomyrskyy District Court of the Zhytomyr Region, 25/05/2011 |
| 195. | 24391/12 14/04/2012 | Volodymyr Mykolayovych KARTASHOV 03/01/1951 Krasnoarmiysk | Krasnoarmiysk Court, 09/12/2008 |
| 196. | 24534/12 14/04/2012 | Mykola Antonovych SHTANCHENKO 23/12/1936 Krasnoarmiysk | Donetsk Circuit Administrative Court, 19/11/2008 |
| 197. | 24535/12 14/04/2012 | Mykola Antonovych SHTANCHENKO 23/12/1936 Krasnoarmiysk | Krasnoarmiysk Court, 25/11/2009 |
| 198. | 24547/12 14/04/2012 | Sergiy Vasylyovych BOGATCHENKO 17/10/1960 Vasylkivka | Vasylkivka Court, 11/01/2010 |
| 199. | 24692/12 04/04/2012 | Mykola Yuriyovych RYBYSKYI 23/10/1967 Ovruch | Ovruch Court, 10/09/2009 |
| 200. | 25077/12 13/04/2012 | Sergiy Dmytrovych BOGUSH 01/05/1957 Tkhoryn | Ovruch Court, 26/05/2010 |
| 201. | 25089/12 17/04/2012 | Vasiliy Adamovich KOMARCHUK 13/08/1949 V. Chernigivka | Ovruch Court, 07/07/2009 |
| 202. | 25583/12 12/04/2012 | Sergiy Ivanovych PEDCHENKO 23/07/1975 Kirove | Korsnun-Shevchenkivsk Court, 29/12/2008 |
| 203. | 28471/12 25/04/2012 | Nina Vasilyevna ILCHENKO 19/12/1944 Raygorodok | Slavyansk Court, 29/05/2000 |
| 204. | 28472/12 25/04/2012 | Nikolay Lukich ILCHENKO 08/10/1938 Raygorodok | Slavyansk Court, 29/05/2000 |
| 205. | 28851/12 20/04/2012 | Irina Nikolayevna GALETSKAYA 15/05/1966 Kharkiv | Kyivskyy District Court of Kharkiv, 20/05/2010 as amended by Kharkiv Regional Court of Appeal on 22/03/2011 |
| 206. | 29539/12 07/05/2012 | Galyna Petrivna RUSETSKA 06/09/1953 Korosten Not known | Korosten Court, 09/06/2009 |

| No. | Application no. and date of introduction | Applicant name date of birth place of residence | Relevant domestic decision |
|------|--|---|--|
| 207. | 29648/12 20/04/2012 | Igor Ivanovich VITSENISIK 17/03/1961 Merefa | 1) Kharkivskyy District Court of Kharkiv Region, 19/04/2011 2) Kharkivskyy District Court of Kharkiv Region, 17/06/2011 3) Leninskyy District Court of Kharkiv, 08/10/2010 |
| 208. | 29881/12 20/04/2012 | KRUPA, PP Kyiv | Mykolayiv Regional Commercial Court, 10/06/2003 |
| 209. | 29911/12 26/04/2012 | Gera Stepanovych LYEKOMTSEV 17/10/1937 Zaporizhzhya | Dnipropetrovsk Court of Appeal of 24/05/2011 |
| 210. | 30725/12 14/05/2012 | Mykola Yuriyovych RYBYSKYI 23/10/1967 Ovruch | 1) Ovruch Court, 30/11/2009 2) Ovruch Court, 12/05/2010 |
| 211. | 32144/12 12/05/2012 | Yelyzaveta Pavlivna STAKHURA 29/07/1941 Zaporizhzhya | Dnipropetrovsk Administrative Court of Appeal, 05/07/2011 |
| 212. | 32549/12 25/04/2012 | Vladimir Ivanovich BLUDOV 06/06/1944 Kharkiv | Zhovtnevyi District Court of Kharkiv, 21/04/2010 |
| 213. | 32680/12 12/05/2012 | Mykola Oleksiyovych BULAKHOV 09/05/1951 Oleksandriya | 1) Higher Administrative Court, 9/12/2010 2) Oleksandriya Court, 17/06/2008 3) Oleksandriya Court, 01/06/2010 (case no. 2-1716/2010) 4) Oleksandriya Court, 01/06/2010 (case no. 2-1715/2010) |
| 214. | 33221/12 24/05/2012 | Dmytro Dmytrovych OKUN 09/11/1944 Zaporizhzhya | 1) Khortytskyy District Court of Zaporizhzhya, 7/05/2010 2) Khortytskyy District Court of Zaporizhzhya, 28/02/2011 |
| 215. | 33601/12 30/04/2012 | Sergey Nikolayevich PRUSAKOV 13/05/1960 Chervonyy Donets | Balakliya Court, 30/03/2009 as amended by the Kharkiv Administrative Court of Appeal, 06/08/2009 |
| 216. | 33624/12 22/05/2012 | Tamara Alekseyevna ZHOLUD 08/03/1951 Ovruch | 1) Ovruch Court, 07/04/2009 2) Ovruch Court, 12/10/2009 3) Ovruch Court, 13/05/2010 |
| 217. | 33625/12 24/05/2012 | Nadiya Vasylivna OLSHEVSKA 05/05/1958 Korosten | Narodychi Court, 28/09/2009 |
| 218. | 33876/12 25/05/2012 | Oleksandr Sergiyovych GLIBKO 14/03/1957 Zhytomyr | Bogunskyy District Court of Zhytomyr, 05/05/2010 |
| 219. | 34118/12 24/05/2012 | Nataliya Leonidivna RULEVSKA 12/11/1979 Sverdlovsk | Sverdlovsk Court, 15/04/2009 |
| 220. | 34161/12 14/05/2012 | Grygoriy Grygorovych SYUSEL 01/06/1954 Zaporizhzhya | Khortytskyy District Court of Zaporizhzhya, 25/11/2010 |
| 221. | 34484/12 30/05/2012 | Alla Viktorivna DEMBOVSKA 14/09/1962 Kuznetsovsk | Kuznetsovsk Court, 04/05/2011 |

| No. | Application no. and date of introduction | Applicant name date of birth place of residence | Relevant domestic decision |
|------|--|---|--|
| 222. | 34487/12 30/05/2012 | Olga Vasylivna GOROKHOVA 07/10/1958 Kuznetsovsk | Kuznetsovsk Court, 11/05/2011 as amended by the Zhytomyr Administrative Court of Appeal, 26/03/2012 |
| 223. | 34497/12 01/06/2012 | Galyna Ivanivna LESYK 20/02/1958 Irpin | Irpin Court, 23/09/2011 |
| 224. | 34589/12 03/05/2012 | Nikolay Dmitriyevich PORTNOV 09/12/1963 Miusynsk | 1) Lugansk Circuit Administrative Court, 09/06/2008 2) Krasnyy Luch Court, 26/01/2009 3) Krasnyy Luch Court, 26/01/2009 4) Krasnyy Luch Court, 13/04/2009 |
| 225. | 35024/12 31/05/2012 | Nina Trokhymivna KRYVOSHEYEVA 13/02/1954 Tarashcha | 1) Tarashcha Court, 04/06/2007 2) Tarashcha Court, 03/08/2009 3) Tarashcha Court, 15/07/2010 (case no. 2-787/2010) 4) Tarashcha Court, 27/12/2010 5) Tarashcha Court, 01/03/2011 |
| 226. | 35354/12 29/05/2012 | Sergey Aleksandrovich MIKHAYLOV 02/10/1966 Krasnyy Luch | 1) Krasnyy Luch Court, 06/08/2010 2) Krasnyy Luch Court, 10/12/2010 |
| 227. | 35366/12 02/06/2012 | Kateryna Vasylivna GOLOVLYOVA 01/05/1952 Ovruch | Ovruch Court, 20/02/2009 |
| 228. | 35659/12 26/05/2012 | Anatoliy Mitrofanovich KHUSTOCHKIN 01/07/1951 Raygorodok | 1) Slovyansk Court, 19/04/1999 2) Slovyansk Court, 05/11/1997 |
| 229. | 36076/12 29/05/2012 | Yevgeniy Pavlovych LEBED 26/02/1961 Kharkiv | Leninskyy District Court of Kharkiv, 30/06/2011 |
| 230. | 36351/12 30/05/2012 | Viktor Pavlovych ARAPOV 30/09/1957 Zaporizhzhya | Ordzhonikidze District Court of Zaporizhzhya, 24/12/2010 as amended by the Dnipropetrovsk Administrative Court of Appeal, 14/07/2011 |
| 231. | 38840/12 22/02/2012 | Yuriy Ivanovych MASHCHENKO 01/09/1963 Kyiv | Kyiv City Court of Appeal, 24/06/2008 |
| 232. | 39421/12 16/01/2012 | Nataliya Grygorivna ZDOTA 06/07/1976 Gorshchyk | Korosten Court, 19/11/2009 |
| 233. | 44747/12 12/04/2012 | Mariya Oleksiyivna ALEKSYEYEVA 1945 Tetiyiv | 1) Tetiyiv Court, 06/05/2011 2) Tetiyiv Court, 27/01/2010 as amended by judgment of the Kyiv Court of Appeal, 29/09/2011 |
| 234. | 61387/12 01/12/2011 | Oleksandr Petrovych DORDUKA 27/09/1959 KANIV | 1) Kaniv Court, 04/11/2008 as amended by the Kyiv Administrative Court of Appeal on 22/12/2009 2) Kaniv Court, 08/06/2011 |
| 235. | 11641/13 22/07/2009 | Valentina Nikolayevna BOYKO 08/02/1949 Nova Kakhovka | Nova Kakhovka Court, 21/01/2008 |
| 236. | 12661/13 08/08/2011 | Tatyana Yuryevna VASKO 15/01/1959 Sevastopol | Leninskyy District Court of Sevastopol, 22/07/2011 |

| No. | Application no. and date of introduction | Applicant name date of birth place of residence | Relevant domestic decision |
|------|--|--|---|
| 237. | 12663/13 14/06/2011 | Tatyana Yuryevna VASKO 15/01/1959 Sevastopol | Leninskyy District Court of Sevastopol, 01/12/2010 |
| 238. | 21480/13 27/11/2007 | Nina Petrovna PAVLENKO 26/02/1946 Pervomaysk | Pervomayskyy Court, 18/02/1992 |
| 239. | 27213/13 10/12/2011 | Leonid Ivanovych TIMAKOV 19/08/1941 Alchevsk | Alchevsk Court, 2/03/2011 |
| 240. | 27220/13 24/09/2009 | Fekla Antonovna MUKHINA 20/12/1923 Antratsyt | Antratsyt Court, 22/07/2009 |
| 241. | 28295/13 21/12/2010 | Raisa Nikolayevna KORZH 23/02/1962 Sverdlovsk | Labour Disputes Commission of the State enterprise "Mayak", 07/08/2008 |

APPENDIX 2

INADMISSIBLE APPLICATIONS

| No. | Application no. and date of introduction | Applicant name date of birth place of residence | Relevant domestic decision |
|------|--|--|--|
| 242. | 29227/10 19/05/2010 | Ivan Mykhaylovich CHUBYR 11/07/1929 Makiyivka | Girnytskyy District Court of Makiyivka, 20/06/2001 |
| 243. | 59349/11 12/09/2011 | Volodymyr Fedorovych SHYMANSKYY 17/02/1954 Chechelnyk | Chechelnyk Court, 07/12/2010 |
| 244. | 61732/11 27/09/2011 | Dmitriy Yuryevich BABARTSEV 23/08/1980 Slavyansk | Slovyansk Court, 11/10/2010 |
| 245. | 9341/12 07/02/2012 | Mykola Yosypovych GLYOSHKO 02/08/1955 Rivne | 1) Rivne Court, 30/04/2009 2) Rivne Court, 18/02/2011 |
| 246. | 18293/12 20/03/2012 | Tetyana Volodymyrivna GOLOVKOVA 10/10/1983 Enerгодар | Enerгодар Court, 23/06/2011, as modified by the Dnipropetrovsk Administrative Court of Appeal on 28/05/2013 |
| 247. | 25081/12 10/04/2012 | Anatoliy Oleksiyovych POTYEKHIN 19/06/1929 Zaporizhzhya | Dnipropetrovsk Administrative Court of Appeal, 07/10/2011 |
| 248. | 35206/12 16/05/2012 | Oksana Fedorivna PELEKH 08/06/1972 Yevpatoriya | Administrative Court of the Crimea, 29/04/2011 as amended by the Sevastopol Administrative Court of Appeal, 08/02/12 |
| 249. | 26028/13 03/11/2009 | Oleksandr Fedorovych SERDYUK 26/04/1962 Kremenchuk | Avtozavodskyy District Court of Kremenchuk, 05/05/2009 |

APPENDIX 3
APPLICATION TO BE STRUCK OUT

| No. | Application no. and date of introduction | Applicant name date of birth place of residence | Relevant domestic decision |
|------|--|--|---|
| 250. | 67987/10 03/06/2010 | Antonina Yosyfivna GORDEYUK 02/10/1934 Lviv | 1) Shevchenkivskyy District Court of Lviv, 01/04/2010 in light of the resolution of the same court dated 28/10/2010 2) Lviv Administrative Court of Appeal, 11/02/2010 |