



EUROPEAN COURT OF HUMAN RIGHTS
COUR EUROPÉENNE DES DROITS DE L'HOMME

FIFTH SECTION

CASE OF MOSKALENKO AND OTHERS v. UKRAINE

(Application no. 1270/12 and 249 other applications)

JUDGMENT

STRASBOURG

18 July 2013

This judgment is final. It may be subject to editorial revision.

In the case of Moskalenko and Others v. Ukraine,

The European Court of Human Rights (Fifth Section), sitting as a Committee composed of:

Boštjan M. Zupančič, *President*,

Ann Power-Forde,

Helena Jäderblom, *judges*,

and Stephen Phillips, *Deputy Section Registrar*,

Having deliberated in private on 25 June 2013,

Delivers the following judgment, which was adopted on that date:

PROCEDURE

1. The case originated in 250 applications against Ukraine lodged with the Court under Article 34 of the Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms (“the Convention”) by Ukrainian nationals, whose details are specified in the appended tables (“the applicants”).

2. The applicant Mr Vasiliy Spiridonovich Grunskiy died (application no. 38547/12). His spouse, Ms Valentina Petrovna Grunskaya, manifested the wish to pursue the application on his behalf.

3. The applicant Mr Petro Andriyovych Plyaka died (application no. 38936/12). His spouse, Ms Valentyna Oleksandrivana Kuzmina, manifested the wish to pursue the application on his behalf.

4. By letters dated 22 March 2013, the Government informed the Court that the applicants Mr Viktor Mykolayovych Motuzkov (application no. 36824/12) and Ms Olga Mykhaylivna Moroz (application no. 41253/12) had died. Copies of the letters were forwarded to the deceased applicants’ addresses on 27 March and 10 April 2013 respectively, by registered post for comments to be submitted by 23 April and 10 May 2013. The readers were warned that in the absence of response, the Court would assume that the applicants had died and that no individuals were entitled and wished to pursue the applications. No replies were received.

5. The Government (“the Government”) are represented by their Agent, Mr Nazar Kulchytskyy.

6. On 11 December 2012 the applications above were communicated to the Government of Ukraine.

THE FACTS

THE CIRCUMSTANCES OF THE CASE

4. On the dates set out in the appended tables domestic courts delivered decisions according to which the applicants were entitled to various pecuniary amounts or to have certain actions taken in their favour. The decisions became final and enforceable. However, the applicants were unable to obtain the enforcement of the decisions in due time.

5. Some of the applicants also made submissions concerning factual and legal matters unrelated to the above non-enforcement issues.

THE LAW

I. THE STANDING OF THE APPLICANTS IN APPLICATIONS Nos. 38547/12 AND 38936/12

6. The Court considers that in applications listed in paragraphs 2 and 3 (see above) the next-of-kin of the deceased applicants have standing to continue the proceedings in their stead (see, among other authorities, *Mironov v. Ukraine*, no. 19916/04, § 12, 14 December 2006).

II. ALLEGED VIOLATION OF ARTICLES 6 AND 13 OF THE CONVENTION AND OF ARTICLE 1 OF PROTOCOL No. 1

7. The applicants complained about the lengthy non-enforcement of the decisions given in their favour and about the lack of effective domestic remedies in respect of those complaints. They relied on, expressly or in substance, Articles 6 § 1 and 13 of the Convention and Article 1 of Protocol No. 1.

A. Applications set out in Appendix 1

8. In view of the similarity of the applications in terms of the principal legal issue raised, the Court finds it appropriate to join them.

9. The Court notes that the applicant in application no. 36824/12, Mr Viktor Mykolayovych Motuzkov, has died and that no heir has requested permission to pursue the application.

10. It also notes that the applicant in application no. 41253/12, Ms Olga Mykhaylivna Moroz, has died and that no heir has requested permission to pursue the application.

11. In the light of the foregoing, and in the absence of any special circumstances regarding respect for the rights guaranteed by the Convention or its Protocols, the Court, in accordance with Article 37 § 1 (a) of the Convention, considers that it is no longer justified to continue the examination of the applications. In view of the above, it is appropriate to strike the applications out of the list.

B. Applications set out in Appendix 2

12. In application no. 29644/12 the applicant complained that from 1 November 2011 the debtor had stopped to enforce the judgment of 21 January 2011, ordering the Pension Fund to carry out recalculation and payment of his pension. The Government observed that on 11 May 2011 the Donetsk Administrative Court of Appeal amended the judgment and decided that the period of recalculation and payment of the pension should be limited to 22 July 2011. Therefore, the judgment of 21 January 2011 did not cover the period in question. This application must, therefore, be declared inadmissible as manifestly ill-founded pursuant to Article 35 § 3 (a) of the Convention.

C. Applications set out in Appendix 3

13. In view of the similarity of the applications in terms of the principal legal issue raised, the Court finds it appropriate to join them.

14. The Court notes that the above complaints of the applicants enumerated in Appendix 3 (see paragraph 16 above) are not manifestly ill-founded within the meaning of Article 35 § 3 (a) of the Convention. It further notes that they are not inadmissible on any other grounds. They must therefore be declared admissible.

15. The Court finds that the decisions in the applicants' favour were not enforced in due time, for which the State authorities were responsible.

16. On 17 April 2013 the Government were requested to provide documents which confirmed the Government's claim that certain judgments debts had been paid. This information was to arrive at the Court by 17 May 2013. A faxed copy of the Government's observations was received by the Court on 17 May 2013; the annexes in support arrived on 3 June 2013. In application no. 41016/12 the Government submitted documents confirming that payment of part of the judgment debt had been effected before

November 2011; in application no. 52222/12 the documents established that the judgment debt was part paid before July 2011. In application no. 41356/12 an order from the ministry to the bank was submitted without confirmation from the bank that the order had been carried out. The Government have thus failed to establish in these three cases that the payment has been made in full.

17. The Government also submitted, with respect to a number of applications, that no violation of the applicant's rights had occurred. They noted that the Law of Ukraine "On Amending the Law of Ukraine On the State Budget for 2011" of 14 June 2011 and the Cabinet of Ministers Resolution no. 745 "On Providing Certain Amounts of Payments, Financed at the Expense of the State Budget", reduced the amounts allocated by the State budget for enforcement of judgments awarding social payments to the applicants and that the applicants' entitlements under the relevant legislation were accordingly reduced. They considered that the applicants' complaints were inadmissible as manifestly ill-founded.

18. The Court notes the judgments at issue are final and enforceable and have not complied with by the State for a lengthy period of time, for which the State authorities remain responsible. As the Court has already held in a similar case, the regulations on allocation of budgetary resources do not affect that position (see *Tsibulko and Others v. Ukraine* [Committee], nos. 65656/11 and Others, § 14, 11 June 2013). Moreover, the Court recalls its constant case-law specifying that the State's failure to comply with the enforceable judgments in view of its lack of budgetary funds, cannot justify non-enforcement (see *Voytenko v. Ukraine*, no. 18966/02, § 55, 29 June 2004). It therefore rejects the Government's objection to the admissibility of the applications and notes that the above complaints are not manifestly ill-founded within the meaning of Article 35 § 3 (a) of the Convention. It further notes that they are not inadmissible on any other grounds. They must therefore be declared admissible.

19 Having regard to its well-established case-law on the subject (see *Yuriy Nikolayevich Ivanov*, cited above, §§ 56-58 and 66-70), the Court finds that there has been a violation of Article 6 § 1 of the Convention and Article 1 of Protocol No. 1 on account of the prolonged non-enforcement of the decisions in the applicants' favour. It also considers that there has been a violation of Article 13 of the Convention in that the applicants did not have an effective domestic remedy to redress the damage created by such non-enforcement.

III. OTHER ALLEGED VIOLATIONS OF THE CONVENTION

20. Some of the applicants raised other complaints under the Convention which the Court has carefully examined. In the light of all the material in its possession, and in so far as the matters complained of are within its

competence, the Court finds that they do not disclose any appearance of a violation of the rights and freedoms set out in the Convention or its Protocols.

21. It follows that those complaints are manifestly ill-founded and must be rejected in accordance with Article 35 §§ 3 (a) and 4 of the Convention.

IV. APPLICATION OF ARTICLE 41 OF THE CONVENTION

22. Article 41 of the Convention provides:

“If the Court finds that there has been a violation of the Convention or the Protocols thereto, and if the internal law of the High Contracting Party concerned allows only partial reparation to be made, the Court shall, if necessary, afford just satisfaction to the injured party.”

23. In the present case, the Court considers it reasonable and equitable (see *Tsibulko and Others v. Ukraine* [Committee], nos. 65656/11, § 19, 11 June 2013) to award 2,000 euros (EUR) to each of the applicants in Appendix 3. This sum is to cover any pecuniary and non-pecuniary damage, as well as costs and expenses.

24. The Court further notes that the respondent State has an outstanding obligation to enforce the judgments which remain enforceable.

25. The Court considers it appropriate that the default interest rate should be based on the marginal lending rate of the European Central Bank, to which should be added three percentage points.

FOR THESE REASONS, THE COURT UNANIMOUSLY

1. *Decides* to join the applications set out in Appendix 1, and to strike them out of its list of cases in accordance with Article 37 § 1 (b) of the Convention;
2. *Declares* inadmissible the application indicated in Appendix 2;
3. *Decides* to join the applications set out in Appendix 3;
4. *Declares* admissible the complaints of the applicants, listed in Appendix 3, under Article 6 § 1 and Article 13 of the Convention and Article 1 of Protocol No. 1 about the lengthy non-enforcement of the decisions given in their favour and about the lack of effective domestic remedies in respect of those complaints, and declares inadmissible the remainder of the applications;

5. *Holds* that there has been a violation of Article 6 § 1 of the Convention and of Article 1 of Protocol No. 1;
6. *Holds* that there has been a violation of Article 13 of the Convention;
7. *Holds*
 - (a) that within three months the respondent State is to enforce the domestic decisions in the applicants' favour which remain enforceable, and is to pay EUR 2,000 (two thousand euros) to each applicant or his or her estate in respect of pecuniary and non-pecuniary damage, and costs and expenses, plus any tax that may be chargeable to the applicants on the above amounts which are to be converted into the national currency at the rate applicable at the date of settlement;
 - (b) that from the expiry of the above-mentioned three months until settlement simple interest shall be payable on the above amounts at a rate equal to the marginal lending rate of the European Central Bank during the default period plus three percentage points.

Done in English, and notified in writing on 18 July 2013, pursuant to Rule 77 §§ 2 and 3 of the Rules of Court.

Stephen Phillips
Deputy Registrar

Boštjan M. Zupančič
President

APPENDIX 1
(applications struck out of the Court's list of cases)

No.	Application no. and date of introduction	Applicant name date of birth place of residence	Relevant domestic decision
1.	36824/12 07/06/2012	Viktor Mykolayovych MOTUZKOV 13/09/1938 Irmino	Stakhanov Court, 25/11/2010
2.	41253/12 25/06/2012	Olga Mykhaylivna MOROZ 19/07/1951 Bila Tserkva	Bila Tserkva Court, 07/04/2011

APPENDIX 2
(inadmissible application)

No.	Application no. and date of introduction	Applicant name date of birth place of residence	Relevant domestic decision
3.	29644/12 19/03/2012	Pavel Vasilyevich GONCHAROV 28/04/1953 Artemivsk	Artemivsk Court, 21/01/2011

APPENDIX 3
(admissible applications)

No.	Application no. and date of introduction	Applicant name date of birth place of residence	Relevant domestic decision
4.	1270/12 24/12/2011	Oleksandr Petrovych MOSKALENKO 02/12/1960 Chernigiv	Desnyanskyy District Court of Chernigiv, 29/01/2010
5.	1789/12 28/12/2011	Oleksandr Vasylovych NESHCHERET 15/02/1959 Nizhyn Viktor Vasylovych NESHCHERET 20/03/1955 Kyiv	Nizhyn Court, 28/04/2010
6.	1886/12 20/12/2011	Oksana Ruslanivna DMYTRENKO 17/01/1985 Gorodnytsya	Zhytomyr Circuit Administrative Court, 26/01/2009
7.	3593/12 06/01/2012	Dmytro Demyanovych SHEVCHUK 01/11/1946 Stebliv	Korsun-Shevchenkivsky Court, 08/11/2010
8.	3889/12 10/01/2012	Olena Andriyivna NEVMERZHYTSKA 25/05/1977 Korosten Vitaliy Volodymyrovych NEVMERZHYTSKY 12/01/1977 Korosten	Applicant 1 1) Korosten Court, 29/10/2010 2) Korosten Court, 10/04/2009 Applicant 2 1) Korosten Court, 22/11/2010 2) Korosten Court, 06/07/2009

No.	Application no. and date of introduction	Applicant name date of birth place of residence	Relevant domestic decision
9.	6438/12 16/01/2012	Volodymyr Mykolayovych PARKHOMCHUK 01/01/1949 Gorshchyk	Korosten Court, 08/12/2009
10.	15808/12 03/03/2012	Aleksandr Nikolayevich PRYADKO 01/04/1941 Primorskiy	1) Feodosiya Court, 10/03/2010 2) Feodosiya Court, 23/11/2010
11.	16355/12 24/02/2012	Yuriy Nikolayevich MALYGIN 30/06/1967 Druzhkova	1) Druzhkivka Court, 31/01/2011 2) Druzhkivka Court, 04/04/2011 3) Druzhkivka Court, 13/07/2011
12.	20522/12 04/04/2012	Volodymyr Ivanovych NESTERENKO 18/06/1958 Kharkiv	Kharkivskyy District Court of Kharkiv Region, 01/08/2011
13.	22072/12 05/04/2012	Sofiya Yosypivna FEDULOVA 13/07/1941 Energodar	Energodar Court, 13/07/2011
14.	22189/12 02/04/2012	Anatoliy Fedorovych DEREVYANCHUK 24/07/1956 Lviv	Lviv Administrative Court of Appeal, 01/08/2011
15.	22942/12 03/04/2012	Petro Grygorovych KOVAL 02/07/1951 Uman	Uman Court, 30/06/2011
16.	23201/12 31/03/2012	Petro Mykhaylovych KNYGA 05/07/1962 Ovruch	Ovruch Court, 14/04/2009
17.	24088/12 12/04/2012	Trofym Trofymovych AZARENKO 08/09/1949 Zaporizhzhya	Leninskyy District Court of Zaporizhzhya, 12/11/2010
18.	24150/12 06/04/2012	Anatoliy Pavlovich KROKHIN 30/01/1953 Kramatorsk	1) Kramatorsk Court, 24/04/2009 2) Donetsk Circuit Administrative Court, 28/01/2009
19.	24165/12 19/04/2012	Mykola Andriyovych PONYADKOV 22/06/1954 Kharkiv	Zhovtnevyy District Court of Kharkiv, 26/11/2010
20.	24584/12 06/04/2012	Sergiy Ivanovych PUKLICH 27/10/1955 Lugansk	Kamyanobrid Court, 04/03/2011
21.	24644/12 14/04/2012	Inna Mykolayivna LYAKHOVETSKA 27/07/1965 Kharkiv	Kyyivskyy District Court of Kharkiv, 07/02/2011
22.	24704/12 13/04/2012	Kostyantyn Andriyovych SAMARETS 21/12/1949 Maliyivka	Borova Court, 04/03/2010
23.	25079/12 10/04/2012	Leonid Vasylyovych CHUGUYENKO 07/04/1949 Zaporizhzhya	Khortytskyy District Court of Zaporizhzhya, 30/11/2010
24.	25083/12 10/04/2012	Valentyn Volodymyrovych LAVRENTYEV 28/07/1951 Zaporizhzhya	Komunarskyy District Court of Zaporizhzhya, 23/12/2010
25.	25086/12 10/04/2012	Nina Ivanivna DEMYANENKO 12/02/1951 Zaporizhzhya	Khortytskyy District Court of Zaporizhzhya, 16/02/2011

No.	Application no. and date of introduction	Applicant name date of birth place of residence	Relevant domestic decision
26.	25194/12 10/04/2012	Vyacheslav Oleksandrovych DYENYEZHIN 24/11/1957 Zaporizhzhya	Khortytskyy District Court of Zaporizhzhya, 17/12/2010
27.	25345/12 25/04/2012	Yevgen Viktorovych KOMAROV 15/02/1957 Kharkiv	Moskovskyy District Court of Kharkiv, 18/07/2011
28.	25346/12 25/04/2012	Anatoliy Stepanovych NAZARUK 07/06/1959 Kharkiv	Zhovtnevyy District Court of Kharkiv, 08/08/2011
29.	25389/12 17/04/2012	Aleksandr Vasylevich GOLOVINOV 18/04/1956 Khorosheve	1) Kharkivskyy District Court of Kharkiv Region, 25/07/2011 2) Kharkivskyy District Court of Kharkiv Region, 16/02/2010
30.	25402/12 13/04/2012	Lyubov Matviyivna FEDORENKO 08/07/1954 Zaporizhzhya	Komunarskyy District Court of Zaporizhzhya, 23/12/2010
31.	25405/12 13/04/2012	Oleksandr Rodionovych DUDCHYK 02/12/1926 Zaporizhzhya	Komunarskyy District Court of Zaporizhzhya, 30/12/2010
32.	25432/12 12/04/2012	Oleg Oleksandrovych ZAKHARCHENKO 18/05/1967 Zaporizhzhya	Komunarskyy District Court of Zaporizhzhya, 23/12/2010
33.	25475/12 21/04/2012	Volodymyr Ivanovych MEDVEDSKYY 09/09/1949 Kyiv	Obolonskyy District Court of Kyiv, 16/12/2010
34.	25487/12 19/04/2012	Oleg Vasylyovych OPATSKYY 25/04/1949 Kaniv	Kaniv Court, 16/06/2011
35.	25533/12 19/04/2012	Mykola Zakharovych SMOLYARENKO 01/01/1952 Boguslav	1) Boguslav Court, 28/12/2007 2) Boguslav Court, 29/08/2008
36.	25623/12 20/04/2012	Valentyna Petrivna KORCHEVSKA 17/11/1965 Zasky	1) Ovruch Court, 25/03/2010 2) Ovruch Court, 11/03/2010
37.	25656/12 23/04/2012	Yuliya Vasylivna KARPENKO 20/07/1945 Dnipropetrovsk	Samarskyy District Court of Dnipropetrovsk, 01/02/2011
38.	25661/12 13/04/2012	Sergiy Petrovych TARASYUK 29/06/1961 Borova	Borova Court, 21/04/2011
39.	25702/12 05/04/2012	Leonyd Ivanovych PYPCHENKO 01/01/1945 Krasnokamenka	Tsentralnyy District Court of Simferopol, 20/04/2011
40.	27214/12 25/04/2012	Nikolay Ivanovich YAKOVLEV 02/01/1956 Merefa	1) Leninskyy District Court of Kharkiv, 13/08/2010 2) Kharkivskyy District Court of Kharkiv Region, 18/05/2011
41.	27221/12 18/04/2012	Nataliya Danylivna KUZMENKO 03/02/1959 Kharkiv	1) Moskovskyy District Court of Kharkiv, 31/08/2011 2) Moskovskyy District Court of Kharkiv, 25/06/2010
42.	27503/12 25/04/2012	Ganna Viktorivna KLYMOVA 28/06/1962 Zaporizhzhya	Shevchenkivskyy District Court of Zaporizhzhya, 27/04/2011

No.	Application no. and date of introduction	Applicant name date of birth place of residence	Relevant domestic decision
43.	27657/12 10/04/2012	Volodymyr Mykolayovych KONSTANTINOV 20/12/1965 Melitopol	Melitopol Court, 02/12/2010
44.	27664/12 21/04/2012	Ivan Pavlovych SERDYUK 20/01/1965 Poltava	Kyyivskyy District Court of Poltava, 10/12/2010
45.	27780/12 17/04/2012	Sergiy Mykolayovych PARNYUK 21/11/1958 Kharkiv	1) Moskovskyy District Court of Kharkiv, 08/08/2011 2) Moskovskyy District Court of Kharkiv, 28/04/2011 3) Moskovskyy District Court of Kharkiv, 26/06/2009
46.	27883/12 25/04/2012	Petro Pavlovych TYKHONOV 19/02/1957 Ovruch	Zhytomyr Circuit Administrative Court, 21/01/2009
47.	28038/12 26/04/2012	Valentyna Terentiyivna PAPKA 25/06/1940 Ovruch	1) Zhytomyr Circuit Administrative Court, 09/10/2008 2) Ovruch Court, 04/06/2009 3) Ovruch Court, 09/06/2009 4) Ovruch Court, 11/12/2009
48.	28039/12 25/04/2012	Oleksandr Anatoliyovych PANFELYUK 15/11/1973 Koptivshchyna	Ovruch Court, 29/09/2009
49.	28062/12 28/04/2012	Yuriy Petrovych KOSTYUK 05/05/1954 Lviv	Sykhivskyy District Court of Lviv, 28/05/2010
50.	28261/12 28/04/2012	Volodymyr Vasylyovych GNURA 28/07/1962 Lviv	Lviv Circuit Administrative Court, 31/12/2008
51.	28266/12 28/04/2012	Mariya Vasylivna PASENYUK 01/12/1955 Stesteva	Snyatyn Court, 18/11/2009
52.	28292/12 17/04/2012	Rayisa Dmytrivna DOLGOVA 14/06/1962 Pishchane	Reshetlivka Court, 08/10/2010
53.	28308/12 30/04/2012	Tatayana Yakovlevna CHUYKO 20/01/1961 Kharkiv	Kyyivskyy District Court of Kharkiv, 30/06/2011
54.	28310/12 30/04/2012	Olga Sergeyevna CHUYKO 16/04/1983 Kharkiv	Kyyivskyy District Court of Kharkiv, 07/04/2011
55.	28318/12 30/04/2012	Pavel Nikolayevich YASKO 04/05/1961 Kharkiv	Moskovskyy District Court of Kharkiv, 31/08/2011
56.	28346/12 28/04/2012	Anatoliy Mykolayovych PANCHENKO 18/06/1963 Lviv	Sykhivskyy District Court of Lviv, 08/12/2009
57.	28353/12 21/04/2012	Leonid Yakovych MOROZ 08/03/1941 Zaporizhzhya	Shevchenkivskyy District Court of Zaporizhzhya, 06/08/2010

No.	Application no. and date of introduction	Applicant name date of birth place of residence	Relevant domestic decision
58.	28410/12 30/04/2012	Dmitriy Yakovlevich GERASIMENKO 05/11/1953 Merefa	1) Kharkivskyy District Court of Kharkiv Region, 21/07/2010 2) Kharkivskyy District Court of Kharkiv Region, 24/11/2010 3) Kharkivskyy District Court of Kharkiv Region, 12/05/2011
59.	28510/12 26/04/2012	Viktor Mykhaylovych BONDARENKO 13/03/1954 Poltava	Oktyabrskyy District Court of Poltava, 22/06/2011
60.	28531/12 27/03/2012	Oleksandr Borysovych KHOMENKO 06/10/1962 Kaniv	Kaniv Court, 20/10/2008
61.	28626/12 30/04/2012	Ganna Mykhaylivna FEDORYCH 08/08/1958 Lviv	Sykhivskyy District Court of Lviv, 19/05/2010
62.	29370/12 28/04/2012	Volodymyr Viktorovych VOLOBUYEV 24/05/1965 Kharkiv	Kharkiv Administrative Court of Appeal, 09/03/2010
63.	29642/12 27/04/2012	Valeriy Anatoliyovych BABICHEV 23/06/1950 Zaporizhzhya	Komunarskyy District Court of Zaporizhzhya, 30/12/2010
64.	29643/12 27/04/2012	Volodymyr Leonidovych ZHYDKYKH 16/08/1950 Zaporizhzhya	Komunarskyy District Court of Zaporizhzhya, 23/12/2010
65.	29654/12 25/04/2012	Nikolay Ivanovich SPITSYN 05/06/1957 Kharkiv	Zhovtnevyy District Court of Kharkiv, 10/08/2010
66.	29662/12 25/04/2012	Nikolay Demyanovich ROSTOVSKIY 11/12/1949 Kharkiv	Moskovskyy District Court of Kharkiv, 06/06/2011
67.	29668/12 24/04/2012	Olga Ivanivna CHUNIKHINA 09/05/1958 Kharkiv	Moskovskyy District Court of Kharkiv, 29/04/2011
68.	29670/12 24/04/2012	Oleksandr Mykolayovych SLOMINTSEV 20/01/1964 Kharkiv	1) Moskovskyy District Court of Kharkiv, 05/07/2011 2) Moskovskyy District Court of Kharkiv, 08/04/2011
69.	29732/12 24/04/2012	Anatoliy Andriyovych VELYKORIDNYI 17/05/1956 Kharkiv	Kyyivskyy District Court of Kharkiv, 18/02/2010
70.	29749/12 07/05/2012	Mykola Mykhaylovych KUKLA 23/08/1940 Poltava	Kyyivskyy District Court of Poltava, 10/12/2010
71.	30118/12 11/05/2012	Ganna Trokhymivna SHEVLYAKOVA 04/09/1952 Lugansk	Donetsk Administrative Court of Appeal, 27/09/2011
72.	30927/12 16/05/2012	Yuriy Dmytrovych VELITSKYI 18/11/1958 Zaporizhzhya	Zhovtnevyy District Court of Zaporizhzhya, 18/02/2011

No.	Application no. and date of introduction	Applicant name date of birth place of residence	Relevant domestic decision
73.	30935/12 16/05/2012	Ganna Mykolayivna GRYB 03/04/1938 Ovruch	Ovruch Court, 24/06/2009
74.	30977/12 05/05/2012	Oleksiy Mykolayovych MUKOVSKYY 26/01/1946 Zaporizhzhya	Zhovtnevyi District Court of Zaporizhzhya, 05/04/2011
75.	31045/12 14/05/2012	Rayisa Mykolayivna RYBYNSKA 12/05/1973 Ovruch	Ovruch Court, 14/12/2009
76.	31128/12 16/05/2012	Bella Mykolayivna FAYNYTSKA 20/09/1930 Tokmak	Tokmak Court, 12/08/2010
77.	31522/12 10/05/2012	Eleonora Mykolayivna VOLOSHCHUK 29/04/1945 Zaporizhzhya	1) Shevchenkivskyy District Court of Zaporizhzhya, 29/07/2011 2) Dnipropetrovsk Administrative Court of Appeal, 15/09/2011
78.	31668/12 18/05/2012	Oksana Nikolayevna GUSAREVICH 07/07/1982 Pershotravneve	Ovruch Court, 15/03/2010
79.	31869/12 10/05/2012	Paraskoviya Yevdokymivna ORLOVA 01/10/1940 Zaporizhzhya	Komunarskyy District Court of Zaporizhzhya, 30/12/2010
80.	31873/12 10/05/2012	Vira Vasylivna YABLOKOVA 29/10/1929 Zaporizhzhya	Komunarskyy District Court of Zaporizhzhya, 17/01/2011
81.	31889/12 19/05/2012	Ganna Mykhaylivna BORDYUK 22/12/1933 Ponykovytsya	Lviv Administrative Court of Appeal, 15/06/2011
82.	32214/12 18/05/2012	Nina Petrivna NAUMENKO 08/03/1941 Enerгодар	Enerгодар Court, 11/07/2011
83.	32467/12 17/05/2012	Valentina Petrovna BESARABCHIK 24/06/1958 Ovruch	Ovruch Court, 15/01/2010
84.	32529/12 25/04/2012	Lyudmila Petrovna KOBELCHUK 01/09/1970 Ovruch	Ovruch Court, 14/10/2010
85.	32670/12 21/05/2012	Valeriya Stepanivna DUBROVA 01/05/1933 Stakhanov	Stakhanov Court, 16/11/2010
86.	32844/12 17/05/2012	Petr Vasilyevich GOLOVANENKO 05/12/1951 Yasinovataya	Donetsk Circuit Administrative Court, 20/08/2007
87.	32858/12 25/05/2012	Tamara Nikolayevna TOVKACH 30/07/1963 Pisochyn	Kharkivskyy District Court of Kharkiv Region, 10/01/2011
88.	32924/12 25/05/2012	Valentyna Mykolayivna KUDRAN 20/05/1948 Ovruch	Ovruch Court, 16/04/2010
89.	33016/12 22/05/2012	Tamara Vladimirovna KONCHAKOVSKAYA 06/12/1960 Ovruch	Ovruch Court, 10/08/2010
90.	33099/12 22/05/2012	Galina Filippovna GUSAR 13/03/1970 Sloboda Sholomkivska	Ovruch Court, 23/09/2009

No.	Application no. and date of introduction	Applicant name date of birth place of residence	Relevant domestic decision
91.	33368/12 17/05/2012	Yevgeniy Veniaminovich PYSARYEV 11/11/1954 Zaporizhzhya	Shevchenkivskyy District Court of Zaporizhzhya, 28/02/2011
92.	33413/12 25/05/2012	Nadezhda Grigoryevna PROTASOVA 30/05/1951 Ovruch	Ovruch Court, 25/03/2010
93.	33453/12 30/05/2012	Tetyana Petrivna STUS 04/10/1964 Berestya	Dubrovysya Court, 14/01/2011
94.	33471/12 25/05/2012	Tamara Fedorivna KOSTYUCHOK 24/03/1963 Berestya	Lviv Administrative Court of Appeal, 26/04/2011
95.	33935/12 24/05/2012	Lidiya Oleksiyivna ANDREYEVA 12/09/1938 Stakhanov	Stakhanov Court, 16/06/2011
96.	34144/12 18/05/2012	Sergiy Mykhaylovych KRAVCHENKO 11/08/1949 Zaporizhzhya	Shevchenkivskyy District Court of Zaporizhzhya, 29/12/2010
97.	34328/12 28/05/2012	Aleksey Nikolayevich IVANOV 27/03/1953 Selydove	Selydove Court, 14/03/2011
98.	34389/12 10/04/2012	Valentina Aleksandrovna PSHENICHKO 07/05/1944 Balakliya	Balakliya Court, 27/08/2010
99.	34443/12 04/06/2012	Olga Aleksandrovna BORSHCH 28/03/1939 Borshchovka	Balakliya Court, 01/12/2010
100.	34482/12 10/04/2012	Aleksandra Fedoseyevna PIVOVAR 03/11/1935 Balakliya	Balakliya Court, 10/08/2010
101.	34498/12 23/05/2012	Raisa Stepanovna NIKITINA 10/03/1942 Balakliya	Balakliya Court, 23/06/2010
102.	34785/12 10/04/2012	Aleksandr Vasilyevich BUDANTSEV 12/01/1942 Krasnyy Donets	Balakliya Court, 15/11/2010
103.	35359/12 29/05/2012	Kseniya Anatoliyivna VYGOVSKA 03/02/1976 Ovruch	Ovruch Court, 09/12/2009
104.	35371/12 19/05/2012	Fedir Ivanovych BURMIY 11/10/1925 Khmelnitskyy	Khmelnitskyy Court, 01/04/2008
105.	35644/12 10/04/2012	Nina Yevdokimovna DESYATNIK 15/11/1941 Andriyivka	Balakliya Court, 09/07/2010
106.	35648/12 10/04/2012	Nina Alekseyevna VASILENKO 22/10/1944 Andriyivka	Balakliya Court, 15/06/2010
107.	35651/12 10/04/2012	Vladimir Lavrentyevich ZADOROZHNYI 06/10/1943 Andriyivka	Balakliya Court, 27/10/2010
108.	35669/12 21/05/2012	Nataliya Volodymyrivna POMINCHUK 27/06/1964 Antonovychi	Ovruch Court, 08/07/2009

No.	Application no. and date of introduction	Applicant name date of birth place of residence	Relevant domestic decision
109.	35726/12 20/04/2012	Angelina Mykhaylivna BOGUSH 25/07/1982 Ovruch	Ovruch Court, 11/03/2010
110.	35833/12 28/05/2012	Fedir Antonovych GORB 19/03/1957 Pisochyn	Kharkivskyy District Court of Kharkiv Region, 29/07/2011
111.	36107/12 28/05/2012	Stanislav Volodymyrovych SOKOLOV 21/09/1968 Oleksandriya	Oleksandriya Court, 31/03/2009
112.	36215/12 05/06/2012	Pavlo Volodymyrovych NEVMERZHYTSKY 29/05/1972 Ovruch	Ovruch Court, 27/02/2009
113.	36364/12 29/05/2012	Petro Kostyantynovych VYGOVSKYY 10/08/1975 Ovruch	Ovruch Court, 09/12/2009
114.	36376/12 18/05/2012	Nina Dmitriyevna DZHALILOVA 18/09/1949 Lugansk	Artemivskyy District Court of Lugansk, 17/06/2009
115.	36823/12 05/06/2012	Nataliya Petrivna KOSTYUCHENKO 13/07/1974 Ovruch	1) Ovruch Court, 08/10/2009 2) Ovruch Court, 30/07/2010
116.	36974/12 10/04/2012	Oleksandr Fedorovych KRUPY 04/05/1941 Zaporizhzhya	Dnipropetrovsk Administrative Court of Appeal, 12/07/2011
117.	36982/12 31/05/2012	Mykola Ivanovych KOSTYUSHKO 08/03/1945 Korosten	1) Korosten Court, 12/10/2009 2) Korosten Court, 22/11/2010
118.	37708/12 05/06/2012	Galyna Stepanivna SUBBOTINA 07/02/1937 Irmino	Stakhanov Court, 29/04/2011
119.	38078/12 09/06/2012	Viktor Adamovich GUSAR 18/02/1964 Sloboda Sholomkivska	Ovruch Court, 23/09/2009
120.	38166/12 11/06/2012	Nina Trofymivna UVAROVA 18/08/1928 Lugansk	Leninskyy District Court of Lugansk, 08/12/2008
121.	38211/12 07/06/2012	Vitaliy Nikolayevich POKSHIVANOV 23/12/1947 Bila Tserkva	Kramatorsk Court, 31/01/2011
122.	38413/12 05/06/2012	Fedir Yekymovych LOPTYEV 14/08/1935 Radomyshl	Radomyshl Court, 08/07/2011
123.	38543/12 10/05/2012	Nikolay Vasiliyevich BATRAK 08/07/1959 Donetsk	Kyyivskyy District Court of Donetsk, 04/06/2010
124.	38547/12 05/06/2012	Vasiliy Spiridonovich GRUNSKIY 06/09/1948 Raygorodok	1) Slovyansk Court, 05/04/1999 2) Slovyansk Court, 28/10/1997
125.	38671/12 11/06/2012	Nina Valeryevna KRIVOLAPCHUK 10/08/1972 Krasylivka	Ovruch Court, 15/01/2010
126.	38678/12 12/06/2012	Anatoliy Dmytrovych AKSYONOV 02/09/1954 Ovruch	Ovruch Court, 17/02/2009

No.	Application no. and date of introduction	Applicant name date of birth place of residence	Relevant domestic decision
127.	38694/12 13/06/2012	Igor Valentinovich MELNIK 07/07/1969 Bondari	Ovruch Court, 11/06/2009
128.	38697/12 01/06/2012	Anatoliy Grigoryevich KUZAVA 05/08/1950 Izyum	Izyum Court, 10/02/2011
129.	38794/12 13/06/2012	Mariya Oksentiyivna KOVALCHUK 05/08/1967 Radyzhiv	Volodymyrets Court, 21/07/2011
130.	38826/12 12/06/2012	Valeriy Andriyovych ROMANENKO 14/03/1960 Kharkiv	Chervonozavodskyy District Court of Kharkiv, 08/09/2010
131.	38936/12 19/05/2012	Petro Andriyovych PLYAKA 05/02/1947 Dergachi	Dergachi Court, 31/05/2010
132.	39033/12 16/06/2012	Alyona Anatoliyivna GOLOYAD 10/11/1981 Poltava	Leninskyy District Court of Poltava, 15/03/2010
133.	39040/12 16/06/2012	Mykola Borysovych LISOVYY 04/10/1946 Poltava	Oktyabrskyy District Court of Poltava, 06/09/2011
134.	39198/12 16/06/2012	Petro Andriyovych ROZPUTKO 04/06/1947 Poltava	Kyyivskyy District Court of Poltava, 30/09/2011
135.	39199/12 16/06/2012	Viktor Oleksandrovych PASHCHENKO 21/06/1948 Poltava	Oktyabrskyy District Court of Poltava, 04/04/2011
136.	39415/12 16/01/2012	Sofiya Yukhymivna PARKHOMCHUK 27/03/1954 Gorshchyk	Korosten Court, 08/12/2009
137.	39418/12 16/01/2012	Kateryna Ivanivna SLOBOZHENYUK 20/02/1927 Gorshchyk	Korosten Court, 30/11/2009
138.	39422/12 16/01/2012	Nataliya Anatoliyivna FEDORCHUK 28/02/1970 Gorshchyk	Korosten Court, 09/12/2009
139.	39599/12 19/06/2012	Anatoliy Vasylyovych MARYNYCH 10/05/1960 Khmelnyskyy	Khmelnyskyy Court, 01/02/2010
140.	39618/12 09/06/2012	Vira Fedorivna KAMINSKA 15/03/1944 Khmelnyskyy	Khmelnyskyy Court, 04/05/2011
141.	39953/12 20/06/2012	Grigoriy Motelevich LIVSHIN 06/11/1958 Yevpatoriya	Yevpatoriay Court, 10/04/2007
142.	39965/12 19/06/2012	Viktor Pavlovich KABLUCHKO 17/04/1954 Chutove	Chutove Court, 07/06/2011
143.	40136/12 19/06/2012	Ganna Grygorivna RYBYNSKA 14/04/1946 Malyy Kobyllyn	Ovruch Court, 20/03/2009
144.	40502/12 21/06/2012	Oleg Oleksandrovych GURYN 12/02/1962 Malyy Trostyanets	Oktyabrskyy District Court of Poltava, 28/09/2010

No.	Application no. and date of introduction	Applicant name date of birth place of residence	Relevant domestic decision
145.	40528/12 20/05/2012	Yuriy Mykolayovych KUZMIN 17/05/1965 Syevyerodonetsk	Syevyerodonetsk Court, 21/06/2007
146.	40585/12 20/05/2012	Oleksiy Mykolayovych DEREVYANKO 27/02/1957 Novi Sanzhary	Novi Sanzhary Court, 01/02/2011
147.	40596/12 20/05/2012	Nelya Feodosiyivna SENYCH 07/04/1963 Bila Tserkva	Bila Tserkva Court, 01/12/2008
148.	40686/12 20/05/2012	Valeriy Kostyantynovych LYUTYKH 19/05/1948 Pervomayskyy	Pervomayskyy Court, 18/11/2009
149.	40779/12 21/06/2012	Mykola Ivanovych KOBYLYNSKY 05/07/1948 Malyy Kobyllyn	Ovruch Court, 17/08/2009
150.	40780/12 21/06/2012	Yuriy Yakovych RYBYSKY 05/09/1943 Malyy Kobyllyn	Ovruch Court, 07/08/2009
151.	40861/12 18/06/2012	Metodiy Romanovych MYKOLAYCHUK 25/05/1962 Svytaziv	Sokal Court, 09/02/2011
152.	40920/12 22/06/2012	Vladimir Stepanovich KOTOVICH 11/01/1960 Lugansk	Leninskyy District Court of Lugansk, 28/02/2011
153.	40948/12 22/06/2012	Sergey Grigoryevich MEDKO 24/06/1958 Antratsyt	Antratsyt Court, 05/11/2008
154.	41016/12 25/06/2012	Nataliya Oleksiyivna SAVCHENKO 09/11/1951 Bila Tserkva	Bila Tserkva Court, 04/02/2011
155.	41068/12 22/06/2012	Volodymyr Petrovych YEFIMOV 26/06/1919 Sumy	Kovpakivskyy District Court of Sumy, 29/06/2011
156.	41076/12 21/06/2012	Oksana Petrovna KOVALCHUK 08/09/1973 Gladkoviychi	Ovruch Court, 25/05/2010
157.	41095/12 18/06/2012	Igor Anatolyevich BUTUZOV 10/08/1955 Yevpatoriya	Yevpatoriya Court, 03/04/2007
158.	41141/12 25/06/2012	Olena Fedorivna OVDIYENKO 19/09/1956 Bila Tserkva	Bila Tserkva Court, 04/04/2011
159.	41147/12 25/06/2012	Nina Ivanivna STULINA 19/02/1959 Bila Tserkva	Bila Tserkva Court, 24/01/2011
160.	41151/12 25/05/2012	Tamara Stepanivna DOMBROVSKA 17/05/1943 Bila Tserkva	Bila Tserkva Court, 22/04/2011
161.	41176/12 20/06/2012	Oleksandr Gennadiyovych KLESHCHEV 22/01/1963 Odesa	Odesa Circuit Administrative Court, 25/03/2009
162.	41242/12 20/06/2012	Mykola Mykhaylovych KNYSH 14/05/1952 Kharkiv	Moskovskyy District Court of Kharkiv, 10/05/2011

No.	Application no. and date of introduction	Applicant name date of birth place of residence	Relevant domestic decision
163.	41303/12 20/06/2012	Lidiya Mykhaylivna VDOVENKO 10/03/1938 Reshetylivka	1) Reshetylivka Court, 15/02/2010 2) Reshetylivka Court, 11/03/2010
164.	41356/12 22/06/2012	Mariya Vasylivna YAKUKHNO 15/08/1949 Ovruch	1) Ovruch Court, 12/03/2009 2) Ovruch Court, 04/01/2010 3) Ovruch Court, 23/08/2010
165.	42430/12 25/06/2012	Valentina Rakhmanovna TISHCHENKO 09/11/1950 Podrudy	Ovruch Court, 22/07/2010
166.	42455/12 26/06/2012	Fedir Fedorovych YUMASHEV 29/08/1960 Poltava	Poltava Regional Court of Appeal, 02/03/2011
167.	42574/12 29/06/2012	Anatoliy Nikolayevich TESLENKO 15/08/1946 Sloviansk	1) Slovyansk Court, 06/11/1997 2) Slovyansk Court, 16/08/1999
168.	42578/12 29/06/2012	Viktor Alekseyevich SAVCHENKO 21/02/1951 Raygorodok	Slovyansk Court, 15/03/1999
169.	43161/12 14/06/2012	Anna Ivanovna POGORELOVA 29/04/1944 Kostyantynivka	Kostyantynivka Court, 30/06/2011
170.	43250/12 25/06/2012	Vitaliy GULYAYEV-ZAYTSEV 07/04/1947 Simferopol	Kyyivskyy District Court of Simferopol, 13/08/2009
171.	43251/12 03/07/2012	Vyacheslav Alekseyevich DAVIDICH 25/10/1940 Snizhne	Snizhne Court, 25/07/2011
172.	43253/12 03/07/2012	Oleg Mikhaylovich TLUSTYY 05/11/1965 Snizhne	Snizhne Court, 08/06/2011
173.	43264/12 03/07/2012	Igor Nikolayevich SENCHENKO 17/05/1965 Snizhne	1) Snizhne Court, 25/03/2011 2) Snizhne Court, 08/06/2011
174.	43476/12 03/07/2012	Anatoliy Fedorovich SHIBETSKIY 03/05/1961 Snizhne	Snizhne Court, 09/06/2011
175.	43689/12 25/06/2012	Olga Vasylivna PRYKHODKO 22/04/1948 Tarashcha	Tarashcha Court, 19/11/2010
176.	43786/12 04/05/2012	Mykola Ivanovych LYTVYNETS 13/02/1962 Kharkiv	Ordzhonikidzevskyy District Court of Kharkiv, 06/07/2011
177.	44102/12 04/07/2012	Kostyantyn Petrovych REDKO 22/01/1969 Ovruch	Ovruch Court, 28/09/2009
178.	44141/12 07/05/2012	Valentin Petrovich OVSYANKIN 04/04/1956 Lugansk	Artemivskyy District Court of Lugansk, 25/11/2010
179.	44165/12 25/06/2012	Oleksandr Petrovych KOROLYOV 06/03/1951 Sevastopol	Leninskyy District Court of Sevastopol, 07/06/2010
180.	44366/12 03/07/2012	Yelena Anatolyevna GONCHAROVA 15/06/1964 Snizhne	Snizhne Court, 14/01/2011

No.	Application no. and date of introduction	Applicant name date of birth place of residence	Relevant domestic decision
181.	44958/12 10/07/2012	Oleksiy Mykolayovych TARAS 28/05/1947 Miliyevo	Lviv Administrative Court of Appeal, 14/06/2011
182.	45374/12 10/07/2012	Grygoriy Ivanovych GOLOVAKHIN 18/10/1950 Kharkiv	Moskovskyy District Court of Kharkiv, 18/06/2010
183.	46114/12 05/07/2012	Nataliya Mykolayivna PERSHKO 17/03/1980 Kyrdany	Ovruch Court, 26/03/2009
184.	46143/12 13/07/2012	Ganna Vasylivna SHEVCHUK 28/02/1937 Bila Tserkva	Bila Tserkva Court, 06/07/2011
185.	46155/12 13/07/2012	Rayisa Vasylivna PAVSHENYUK 31/01/1944 Zhytomyr	Zhytomyr Circuit Administrative Court, 22/10/2008
186.	46265/12 12/07/2012	Yuriy Grygorovych KOPYSHYNSKY 09/04/1963 Ovruch	Ovruch Court, 12/06/2009
187.	46729/12 15/07/2012	Mariya Iosifovna KORZH 14/05/1962 Pershotravneve	Ovruch Court, 27/05/2009
188.	46897/12 15/07/2012	Nikolay Ivanovich KORZH 22/03/1958 Pershotravneve	Ovruch Court, 28/05/2009
189.	46908/12 24/07/2012	Zinayida Mykhaylivna PISHCHUGINA 09/02/1939 Lugansk	Artemivskyy District Court of Lugansk, 28/02/2011
190.	46915/12 24/07/2012	Viktor Viktorovych DEMOCHKO 03/06/1963 Zhuky	Poltava Court, 12/05/2010
191.	47986/12 23/07/2012	Angelina Fedorivna LUTOVINOVA 26/01/1936 Stakhanov	Stakhanov Court, 04/05/2011
192.	47989/12 20/07/2012	Ivan Yakovlevich GAPONOV 10/10/1952 Petrivka	Stanytsya Luganska Court, 05/05/2011
193.	48034/12 25/07/2012	Rayisa Mykhaylivna NORYNCHAK 23/10/1972 Krasylivka	Ovruch Court, 19/05/2010
194.	48041/12 19/07/2012	Mykola Fedorovych PALAMARENKO 15/09/1934 Tarashcha	1) Tarashcha Court, 19/08/2010 2) Tarashcha Court, 11/02/2008
195.	48336/12 24/07/2012	Viktor Anatoliyovych BILOUS 31/01/1958 Poltava	Kyyivskyy District Court of Poltava, 31/05/2011
196.	48432/12 20/07/2012	Mykhaylo Vasylyovych BARANNIK 18/06/1952 Kyiv	Darnytskyy District Court of Kyiv, 03/02/2011
197.	48819/12 26/07/2012	Lidiya Vasylivna KOROLYOVA 17/12/1964 Chernigiv	Desnyanskyy District Court of Chernigiv, 02/02/2011

No.	Application no. and date of introduction	Applicant name date of birth place of residence	Relevant domestic decision
198.	49131/12 24/05/2012	Yevgen Panasovych ULYBIN 24/04/1954 Chernigiv	1) Desnyanskyy District Court of Chernigiv, 04/01/2010 2) Desnyanskyy District Court of Chernigiv, 04/02/2011 3) Desnyanskyy District Court of Chernigiv, 23/06/2011
199.	49256/12 24/07/2012	Vasyl Petrovych PERSHKO 10/01/1979 Ovruch	Ovruch Court, 02/04/2010
200.	49739/12 21/07/2012	Bronislav Adamovych BURKOVSKYY 25/03/1921 Slavuta	Slavuta Court, 01/04/2008
201.	49923/12 02/08/2012	Leonid Ivanovych SERBIN 20/09/1952 Rivne	Rivne Court, 23/03/2011
202.	50054/12 24/07/2012	Lyudmyla Dmytrivna PESHKO 21/11/1970 Ovruch	Ovruch Court, 17/03/2010
203.	50336/12 04/08/2012	Mykola Grygorovych RYBYTSKYY 01/01/1940 Ovruch	Ovruch Court, 23/02/2009
204.	50402/12 14/03/2012	Irina Pavlovna KOROVNIK 22/12/1969 Ovruch	Ovruch Court, 07/05/2009
205.	50545/12 01/08/2012	Mykola Ivanovych KOVALCHUK 01/06/1957 Rivne	Zhytomyr Administrative Court of Appeal, 06/06/2011
206.	51205/12 07/07/2012	Mykhaylo Grygorovych RUDYUK 17/09/1954 Zhytomyr	Bogunskyy District Court of Zhytomyr, 15/11/2010
207.	51212/12 09/07/2012	Oleksandr Valeriyovych KURYLYOV 23/04/1957 Poltava	Oktyabrskyy District Court of Poltava, 06/05/2011 (additional Judgment)
208.	51663/12 19/06/2012	Nina Petrivna MOZGOVA 19/01/1947 Svitlovodsk	Svitlovodsk Court, 16/11/2010
209.	51972/12 21/07/2012	Lidiya Fedorivna SAMKO 13/12/1953 Sumy	Kharkiv Administrative Court of Appeal, 16/05/2011
210.	52021/12 28/04/2012	Grygoriy Fedorovych NOVIKOV 02/05/1954 Kyiv	Obolonskyy District Court of Kyiv, 22/10/2010
211.	52222/12 07/06/2012	Vitaliy Volodymyrovych FABRYKANT 16/04/1955 Odesa	Suvorovskyy District Court of Odesa, 17/12/2010
212.	52518/12 07/02/2012	Viktor Volodymyrovych BONDAR 08/01/1962 Kyiv	Kyiv City Court of Appeal, 21/04/2011
213.	52553/12 25/08/2012	Anatoliy Vasylovych BUDKO 05/02/1958 Novi Sanzhary	Novi Sanzhary Court, 09/09/2010
214.	52559/12 16/08/2012	Andriy Ivanovych PYROZHENKO 24/08/1965 Cherkasy	Sosnivskyy District Court of Cherkasy, 08/12/2010

No.	Application no. and date of introduction	Applicant name date of birth place of residence	Relevant domestic decision
215.	52592/12 20/06/2012	Grigoriy Motelevich LIVSHIN 06/11/1958 Yevpatoriya	Yevpatoriya Court, 14/02/2007
216.	52600/12 17/08/2012	Nadezhda Mikhaylovna PETROVA 15/02/1951 Lugansk	Zhovtnevy District Court of Lugansk, 28/03/2011
217.	52609/12 20/08/2012	Yaroslav Leonidovych NECHYPORUK 18/12/1976 Lutsk	1) Lutsk Court, 01/11/2007 2) Lutsk Court, 08/07/2005
218.	52610/12 15/02/2012	Igor Vitaliyovych VYGOVSKYY 20/11/1959 Zhytomyr	Bogunskyy District Court of Zhytomyr, 25/10/2010
219.	52611/12 26/04/2012	Olena Narymanivna SOBOL 15/01/1973 Ovruch	1) Ovruch Court, 08/10/2009 2) Ovruch Court, 18/12/2009 3) Ovruch Court, 16/02/2010
220.	52612/12 24/07/2012	Nataliya Mykolayivna PERSHKO 17/03/1980 Kyrdany	Ovruch Court; 02/09/2010
221.	52618/12 11/08/2012	Pavlo Volodymyrovych NEVMERZHYTSKY 29/05/1972 Ovruch	Ovruch Court, 20/02/2009 (additional Judgment)
222.	52631/12 28/08/2012	Nina Ivanivna KOBLYNSKA 02/10/1957 Kyrdany	Ovruch Court, 23/07/2009
223.	52682/12 20/06/2012	Oleksandr Oleksandrovych VOLOSHCHUK 02/01/1958 Nova Kakhovka	Odesa Administrative Court of Appeal, 18/05/2011
224.	52756/12 20/06/2012	Volodymyr Volodymyrovych KOROTYNSKY 19/11/1967 Poltava	Oktyabrskyy District Court of Poltava, 10/06/2011
225.	52915/12 20/06/2012	Alla Petrivna RYBAK 06/04/1954 Bila Tserkva	Bila Tserkva Court, 02/04/2010
226.	52920/12 20/06/2012	Larysa Ivanivna LIPOVA 12/08/1949 Bila Tserkva	Bila Tserkva Court, 27/12/2010
227.	52924/12 20/06/2012	Ninel Mykhaylivna LAVRENYUK 16/08/1964 Bila Tserkva	Bila Tserkva Court, 01/12/2008
228.	52927/12 20/06/2012	Grygoriy Yukhymovych DOROSHENKO 01/12/1942 Bila Tserkva	Bila Tserkva Court, 15/02/2007
229.	52941/12 20/06/2012	Nina Oleksandrivna MOMOTYUK 30/07/1951 Bila Tserkva	Bila Tserkva Court, 13/03/2009
230.	52993/12 20/06/2012	Lyubov Oleksiyivna TYKHONENKO 24/03/1945 Bila Tserkva	Bila Tserkva Court, 26/05/2010
231.	53008/12 20/06/2012	Nadiya Mykolayivna BONDAR 29/09/1944 Bila Tserkva	Bila Tserkva Court, 12/12/2007

No.	Application no. and date of introduction	Applicant name date of birth place of residence	Relevant domestic decision
232.	53033/12 07/07/2012	Volodymyr Pavlovych SOBOLYEV 04/02/1947 Krasnyy Luch	Krasnyy Luch Court, 19/08/2009
233.	53089/12 07/07/2012	Ivan Petrovych ZUBAKIN 19/06/1952 Miusynsk	Krasnyy Luch Court, 25/08/2010
234.	53094/12 20/06/2012	Mariya Grygorivna SUBOTOVYCH 25/07/1959 Bila Tserkva	Bila Tserkva Court, 14/07/2010
235.	53102/12 07/07/2012	Volodymyr Mykolayovych ZHOLOS 05/03/1953 Krasnyy Luch	Krasnyy Luch Court, 23/07/2009
236.	53197/12 23/06/2012	Mykola Mykolayovych CHERKASKYKH 08/03/1965 Rubizhne	Rubizhne Court, 29/09/2009
237.	53335/12 20/06/2012	Sergiy Fedosiyovych DUBNYTSKYI 03/05/1959 Pervomaysk	Lugansk Circuit Administrative Court, 02/10/2008
238.	53372/12 06/08/2012	Anatoliy Oleksandrovych MYKHAYLOV 29/12/1952 Solonytsivka	Dergachi Court, 14/02/2011
239.	53565/12 20/06/2012	Sergiy Viktorovych GOLOVAN 13/07/1962 Semenivka	Semenivka Court, 29/09/2010
240.	53670/12 08/08/2012	Oleksandr Mykhaylovych SHABANOV 28/10/1949 Stakhanov	Stakhanov Court, 23/06/2009
241.	53706/12 10/04/2012	Dmytro Sergiyovych BOGUSH 06/11/1984 Tkhoryn	Ovruch Court, 11/03/2010
242.	53712/12 19/07/2012	Sergey Anatolyevich CHERKASOV 19/01/1962 Lugansk	Leninskyy District Court of Lugansk, 06/05/2010
243.	53845/12 11/08/2012	Andrey Nikolayevich PIVOVARCHUK 14/07/1945 Ovruch	Ovruch Court, 27/09/2010
244.	58056/12 29/08/2012	Mykola Danylovych OVADCHUK 02/01/1959 Ovruch	Ovruch Court, 27/03/2009
245.	58605/12 30/07/2012	Anatoliy Leonidovich VISLYIY 08/01/1956 Donetsk	1) Donetsk Regional Court of Appeal, 26/08/2010 2) Kirovskyy District Court of Donetsk, 10/06/2009
246.	58836/12 28/08/2012	Nataliya Mykolayivna PERSHKO 17/03/1980 Kyrdany	Ovruch Court, 10/02/2010
247.	59570/12 05/09/2012	Fedir Mykolayovych SIMAKOV 05/08/1926 Cherkasy	Prydniprovskyy District Court of Cherkasy, 27/09/2011
248.	61501/12 14/09/2012	Volodymyr Sergiyovych RUBTSOV 29/08/1945 Bryanka	Bryanka Court, 15/09/2010
249.	61611/12 20/09/2012	Vira Oleksiyivna POGULYAYKO 15/02/1937 Kyiv	Obolonskyy District Court of Kyiv, 14/09/2009

No.	Application no. and date of introduction	Applicant name date of birth place of residence	Relevant domestic decision
250.	63164/12 25/09/2012	Volodymyr Oleksandrovych TROTSENKO 11/05/1940 Kherson	1) Komsomolskyy District Court of Kherson, 14/12/2011 2) Komsomolskyy District Court of Kherson, 01/02/2011 3) Suvorovskyy District Court of Kherson, 08/06/2011