

EUROPEAN COURT OF HUMAN RIGHTS COUR EUROPÉENNE DES DROITS DE L'HOMME

FIFTH SECTION

CASE OF PYSARSKYY AND OTHERS v. UKRAINE

(Application no. 20397/07 and 164 other applications)

JUDGMENT

STRASBOURG

20 June 2013

This judgment is final. It may be subject to editorial revision.



In the case of Pysarskyy and Others v. Ukraine,

The European Court of Human Rights (Fifth Section), sitting as a Committee composed of:

Boštjan M. Zupančič, President,

Ann Power-Forde,

Helena Jäderblom, judges,

and Stephen Phillips, Deputy Section Registrar,

Having deliberated in private on 11 June 2013,

Delivers the following judgment, which was adopted on that date:

PROCEDURE

- 1. The case originated in 165 applications against Ukraine lodged with the Court under Article 34 of the Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms ("the Convention") by Ukrainian nationals, a company based in Ukraine and a Russian national, whose details are specified in the appended tables ("the applicants").
- 2. The applicants Mr Volodymyr Adamovych Umanets (application no. 22064/11) and Mr Petro Dmytrovych Neskoromyuk (application no. 22018/11) died. Their son, Mr Stanislav Volodymyrovych Umanets, and sister, Ms Mariya Dmytrivna Morgun, respectively, manifested the wish to pursue the applications on their behalf.
- 3. By letters dated 11 February 2013, the Government informed the Court that the applicants Mr Yukhym Mykolayovych Nishchymenko (application no. 14893/11) and Ms Praskovya Ivanivna Kiriyachenko (application no. 20025/11) had died. Copies of the letters were forwarded to the deceased applicants' addresses, respectively, on 18 and 7 March 2013 by registered post for comments to be submitted by 18 and 8 April 2013. The readers were warned that in the absence of response, the Court would assume that the applicants had died and that no individuals were entitled and wished to pursue the applications. No replies were received.
- 4. The Government ("the Government") are represented by their Agent, Mr Nazar Kulchytskyy.
- 5. On 20 November 2012 the applications above were communicated to the Government of Ukraine.
- 6. The Russian Government, having been informed of their right to intervene in the proceedings in respect of the applicant in application no. 17575/11 (Article 36 § 1 of the Convention and Rule 44 of the Rules of Court), indicated that they did not wish to exercise that right.

THE FACTS

THE CIRCUMSTANCES OF THE CASE

- 7. On the dates set out in the appended tables domestic courts and labour disputes commissions delivered decisions according to which the applicants were entitled to various pecuniary amounts or to have certain actions taken in their favour. The decisions became final and enforceable. However, the applicants were unable to obtain the enforcement of the decisions in due time.
- 8. Some of the applicants also made submissions concerning factual and legal matters unrelated to the above non-enforcement issues.

THE LAW

- I. THE STANDING OF THE APPLICANTS IN APPLICATIONS Nos. 22064/11 and 22018/11
- 9. The Court considers that the applicants' heirs or next-of-kin in applications nos. 22064/11 and 22018/11 (see paragraph 2 above) have standing to continue the proceedings in the applicants' stead (see, among other authorities, *Mironov v. Ukraine*, no. 19916/04, § 12, 14 December 2006).

II. ALLEGED VIOLATION OF ARTICLES 6 AND 13 OF THE CONVENTION AND OF ARTICLE 1 OF PROTOCOL No. 1

10. The applicants complained about the lengthy non-enforcement of the decisions given in their favour and about the lack of effective domestic remedies in respect of those complaints. They relied on, expressly or in substance, Articles 6 § 1 and 13 of the Convention and Article 1 of Protocol No. 1.

A. Applications set out in Appendix 1

11. In view of the similarity of the applications in terms of the principal legal issue raised, the Court finds it appropriate to join them.

- 12. The Court notes that the applicant in application no. 14893/11, Mr Yukhym Mykolayovych Nishchymenko, has died and that no heir has requested permission to pursue the application.
- 13. It also notes that the applicant in application no. 20025/11, Ms Praskovya Ivanivna Kiriyachenko, has died and that no heir has requested permission to pursue the application.
- 14. In the light of the foregoing, and in the absence of any special circumstances regarding respect for the rights guaranteed by the Convention or its Protocols, the Court, in accordance with Article 37 § 1 (a) of the Convention, considers that it is no longer justified to continue the examination of the applications. In view of the above, it is appropriate to strike the applications out of the list.

B. Applications set out in Appendix 2

- 15. In view of the similarity of the applications in terms of the principal legal issue raised, the Court finds it appropriate to join them.
- 16. In their observations with respect to application no. 10520/11 the Government submitted that the applicant complained about lengthy non-enforcement of the judgment of the Barvinkovo Court of 30 April 2010, but the above judgment had never been delivered by that court. The Barvinkovo Court rendered a judgment in the applicant's favour on 17 May 2010 and the findings of the judgment are different from the findings of the judgment of 30 April 2010. The Government claimed that the application was an abuse of the right of individual application should be declared inadmissible pursuant to Article 35 § 3 (a) of the Convention. The applicant argued that he had obtained a copy of the judgment of 30 April 2010 in the Barvinkovo Court and learned about the judgment of 17 May 2010 from the Government's observations.
- 17. The Court observes that it appears from the case-file materials that the judgment, enforcement of which the applicant seeks to obtain from the Ukrainian authorities, was delivered by the Barvinkovo Court on 17 May 2010. It was apparently a clerical error that the applicant was provided with the judgment dated 30 April 2010. The Court, therefore, rejects the Government's objection that the application is an abuse of the right of individual application within the meaning of Article 35 § 3 (a) of the Convention.
- 18. The Court notes that the above complaints of the applicants enumerated in Appendix 2 (see paragraph 10 above) are not manifestly ill-founded within the meaning of Article 35 § 3 (a) of the Convention. It further notes that they are not inadmissible on any other grounds. They must therefore be declared admissible.
- 19. The Court finds that the decisions in the applicants' favour were not enforced in due time, for which the State authorities were responsible.

20. Having regard to its well-established case-law on the subject (see *Yuriy Nikolayevich Ivanov*, cited above, §§ 56-58 and 66-70), the Court finds that there has been a violation of Article 6 § 1 of the Convention and Article 1 of Protocol No. 1 on account of the prolonged non-enforcement of the decisions in the applicants' favour. It also considers that there has been a violation of Article 13 of the Convention in that the applicants did not have an effective domestic remedy to redress the damage created by such non-enforcement.

III. OTHER ALLEGED VIOLATIONS OF THE CONVENTION

- 21. Some of the applicants raised other complaints under the Convention which the Court has carefully examined. In the light of all the material in its possession, and in so far as the matters complained of are within its competence, the Court finds that they do not disclose any appearance of a violation of the rights and freedoms set out in the Convention or its Protocols.
- 22. It follows that those complaints are manifestly ill-founded and must be rejected in accordance with Article 35 §§ 3 (a) and 4 of the Convention.

IV. APPLICATION OF ARTICLE 41 OF THE CONVENTION

23. Article 41 of the Convention provides:

"If the Court finds that there has been a violation of the Convention or the Protocols thereto, and if the internal law of the High Contracting Party concerned allows only partial reparation to be made, the Court shall, if necessary, afford just satisfaction to the injured party."

- 24. In the present case, the Court considers it reasonable and equitable (see *Kononova and Others v. Ukraine* [Committee], no. 11770/03 and 89 other applications, § 24, 6 June 2013) to award 2,000 euros (EUR) to each of the applicants in Appendix 2. This sum is to cover any pecuniary and non-pecuniary damage, as well as costs and expenses.
- 25. The Court further notes that the respondent State has an outstanding obligation to enforce the judgments which remain enforceable.
- 26. The Court considers it appropriate that the default interest rate should be based on the marginal lending rate of the European Central Bank, to which should be added three percentage points.

FOR THESE REASONS, THE COURT UNANIMOUSLY

- 1. Decides to join the applications set out in Appendix 1, and to strike them out of its list of cases in accordance with Article 37 § 1 (b) of the Convention;
- 2. Decides to join the applications set out in Appendix 2;
- 3. Declares admissible the complaints of the applicants, listed in Appendix 2, under Article 6 § 1 and Article 13 of the Convention and Article 1 of Protocol No. 1 about the lengthy non-enforcement of the decisions given in their favour and about the lack of effective domestic remedies in respect of those complaints and declares inadmissible the remainder of the applications;
- 4. *Holds* that there has been a violation of Article 6 § 1 of the Convention and of Article 1 of Protocol No. 1;
- 5. Holds that there has been a violation of Article 13 of the Convention;

6. Holds

- (a) that within three months the respondent State is to enforce the domestic decisions in the applicants' favour which remain enforceable, and is to pay EUR 2,000 (two thousand euros) to each applicant or his or her estate in respect of pecuniary and non-pecuniary damage, and costs and expenses, plus any tax that may be chargeable to the applicants on the above amounts which are to be converted into the national currency at the rate applicable at the date of settlement;
- (b) that from the expiry of the above-mentioned three months until settlement simple interest shall be payable on the above amounts at a rate equal to the marginal lending rate of the European Central Bank during the default period plus three percentage points.

Done in English, and notified in writing on 20 June 2013, pursuant to Rule 77 §§ 2 and 3 of the Rules of Court.

Stephen Phillips Deputy Registrar Boštjan M. Zupančič President

APPENDIX 1 (applications struck out of the Court's list of cases)

No.	Application no. and date of introduction	Applicant name date of birth	Relevant domestic decisions
1.	14893/11 01/03/2011	Yukhym Mykolayovych NISHCHYMENKO 1923	Kyiv Circuit Administrative Court, 08/12/2008
2.	20025/11 21/03/2011	Praskoviya Ivanivna KIRIYACHENKO 1932	Barvinkovo Court, 14/12/2009

APPENDIX 2 (admissible applications)

No.	Application no. and date of introduction	Applicant name date of birth	Relevant domestic decisions
3.	20397/07 21/04/2007	Mykhaylo Gavrylovych PYSARSKYY 1964	1) Berdychiv Court, 04/10/2006
4.	1190/08 21/12/2007	Borys Denysovych LUKYANENKO 1948	2) Berdychiv Court, 12/10/2006 Oleksandriya Court, 14/05/2007
5.	1392/08 17/12/2007	Vyacheslav Viktorovych KORNEYEV 1947	Korolyovskyy District Court of Zhytomyr, 26/05/2006, as amended by the Zhytomyr Regional Court of Appeal, 07/08/2006
6.	14610/08 04/02/2008	Svitlana Anatoliyivna ZAKHARENKO 1959	Prymorskyy District Court of Odesa, 19/06/2006, as amended by the Odesa Regional Court of Appeal, 02/10/2007
7.	30537/08 10/06/2008	Aleksandr Petrovich KURILO 1965	Konotop Court, 18/02/2008
8.	44807/09 05/08/2009	Mykola Ivanovych KUZUB 1950	Darnytskyy District Court of Kyiv, 19/10/2009
9.	61346/09 03/11/2009	Valentyna Petrivna KOTSYURUBA 1940	Saksaganskyy District Court of Kryvyy Rig, 21/04/2008
10.	64036/10 25/10/2010	Aleksandr Andreyevich RUBANOVICH 1941	Rozdilna Court, 19/06/2009
11.	75147/10 10/12/2010	Vira Vasylivna KRUGLYK 1965	Rivne Court, 05/11/2007
12.	3515/11 04/12/2010	Aleksandr Dmitriyevich MEDVEDEV 1955	Lysychansk Court, 02/02/2009
13.	3856/11 16/12/2010	Nadiya Ivanivna RYSKINA 1926	Tarashcha Court, 18/01/2008
14.	3972/11 30/12/2010	Valeriy Vasilyevich TSUKANOV 1964	Kirovogradskyy District Court of the Kirovograd Region, 25/12/2002
15.	4231/11 08/01/2011	Anatoliy Pavlovych TESLENKO 1953	1) Kharkiv Administrative Court of Appeal, 04/11/2009 2) Barvinkovo Court, 22/02/2010
16.	6367/11 19/01/2011	Mykola Mykolayovych NIKOLAYENKO 1948	Zhytomyr Circuit Administrative Court, 26/09/2008
17.	6691/11 19/01/2011	Viktor Semenovych VLASENKO 1955	Barvinkovo Court, 22/01/2010
18.	6806/11 19/01/2011	Petro Mykolayovych TVARDOVSKYY 1957	Barvinkovo Court, 12/03/2010
19.	7039/11 18/01/2011	Anna Ivanovna YEVMENKO 1965	Krasnyy Luch Court, 28/07/2005
20.	7043/11 18/01/2011	Lyudmila Ivanovna SHEMET 1961	Krasnyy Luch Court, 16/06/2005

No.	Application no. and date of introduction	Applicant name date of birth	Relevant domestic decisions
21.	7045/11 18/01/2011	Nadezhda Ivanovna KIRGIZOVA 1965	Krasnyy Luch Court, 13/05/2005
22.	7047/11 18/01/2011	Yuriy Alekseyevich KIRGIZOV 1965	Krasnyy Luch Court, 21/07/2005
23.	7166/11 20/01/2011	Leonid Ivanovych GEBULTIVSKYY 1953	Tetiyiv Court, 29/11/2007
24.	7180/11 24/01/2011	Marchel Gavrylovych KONSTANTYNOVYCH 1934	Pershotravnevyy District Court of Chernivtsi, 27/11/2006
25.	7406/11 24/01/2011	Georgiy Dmytrovych KOSTASH 1934	Glyboka Court, 14/05/2009, as amended by the Chernivtsi Regional Court of Appeal on 15/07/2009
26.	7413/11 24/01/2011	Vitaliy Vasylyovych KOSTASH 1987	Glyboka Court, 14/05/2009
27.	7524/11 26/01/2011	Yosyp Vasylyovych YATSENKO 1962	Zamostyanskyy District Court of Vinnytsya, 27/02/2007
28.	7575/11 17/01/2011	Mykola Fedorovych PETRUSENKO 1941	Zhytomyr Circuit Administrative Court, 16/01/2008
29.	7653/11 28/01/2011	Petro Grygorovych GUMENYUK 1953	Zamostyanskyy District Court of Vinnytsya, 07/05/2007, quashed by the Kyiv Administrative Court of Appeal on 14/02/2012.
30.	7931/11 19/01/2011	Yuriy Ivanovich KLYUYEV 1959	Oleksandriya Court, 07/12/1998
31.	8077/11 28/01/2011	Oksana Viktorivna ZHYROVA 1984	Krolevets Court, 17/06/2009
32.	8086/11 25/01/2011	KVF SEMKO, TOV	Kirovograd Regional Commercial Court, 18/12/2009
33.	8120/11 25/01/2011	Volodymyr Andriyovych ULYANCHENKO 1942	Zhytomyr Circuit Administrative Court, 23/10/2008
34.	8128/11 26/01/2011	Volodymyr Ivanovych LUCHKO 1967	Zamostyanskyy District Court of Vinnytsya, 27/02/2007
35.	8131/11 25/01/2011	Petro Oleksiyovych BORODIYCHUK 1948	Tetiyiv Court, 14/11/2007
36.	8134/11 25/01/2011	Mykola Oleksandrovych SKORBENKO 1938	Tetiyiv Court, 04/12/2007
37.	8244/11 24/01/2011	Igor Viktorovich ZAKHARYIN 1967	Artemivsk Court, 08/04/2010
38.	8565/11 26/01/2011	Yuriy Grygorovych SEMENYURA 1960	Tetiyiv Court, 22/11/2007
39.	9029/11 28/01/2011	Varvara Yakivna PROKOPCHUK 1936	Tetiyiv Court, 26/11/2007
40.	9553/11	Oleksandra Tykhonivna SHPAK	1) Yagotyn District Court of the Kyiv Region, 27/03/2008
	06/02/2011 9592/11	1942 Oleksandr Andriyovych MAYBORODA	2) Kyiv Administrative Court of Appeal, 19/01/2010
41.	28/01/2011	1931	Tetiyiv Court, 11/12/2007 1) Yagotyn District Court of the Kyiv Region, 27/03/2008
42.	9625/11 04/02/2011	Vitaliy Vasylyovych SHPAK 1946	2) Kyiv Administrative Court of Appeal, 20/05/2010
43.	9747/11 27/01/2011	Mykhayla Andriyovych PROKOPCHUK 1952	Tetiyiv Court, 22/11/2007
44.	9922/11 05/02/2011	Mykola Ivanovych BONDARENKO 1947	1) Kharkiv Administrative Court of Appeal, 07/09/2009 2) Kharkiv Administrative Court of Appeal, 15/12/2009
45.	10069/11 03/02/2011	Yaroslav Mykhaylovych MARUNCHAK 1954	1) Oleksandriya Court, 11/04/2008 2) Oleksandriya Court, 29/10/2007
46.	10236/11 04/02/2011	Lyubov Vasylivna PANCHENKO 1957	Tetiyiv Court, 03/12/2007
47.	10314/11 03/02/2011	Ivan Ivanovych MELNYK 1956	Tetiyiv Court, 16/11/2007

No.	Application no. and date of introduction	Applicant name date of birth	Relevant domestic decisions
48.	10516/11	Viktor Andriyovych PETRIN	1) Barvinkovo Court, 22/02/2010
40.	05/02/2011	1951	2) Barvinkovo Court, 11/03/2010
49.	10520/11 05/02/2011	Volodymyr Vasylyovych LITVINOV 1955	Barvinkovo Court, 17/05/2010
50.	10569/11 08/02/2011	Volodymyr Leonidovych OPANASYUK 1960	Tetiyiv Court, 07/12/2007
51.	10582/11 01/02/2011	Grygoriy Mykolayovych TKACHUK 1949	Tetiyiv Court, 31/01/2008
52.	10623/11 03/02/2011	Mykhaylo Ivanovych SVYATKIN 1937	1) Zhytomyr Circuit Administrative Court, 29/10/2007
53.	10807/11 01/02/2011	Nadiya Anatoliyivna KHRESHCHENYUK 1961 Grygoriy Valentynovych KHRESHCHENYUK	Zhytomyr Circuit Administrative Court, 07/11/2008 Zamostyanskyy District Court of Vinnytsya, 24/05/2007 Zamostyanskyy District Court of Vinnytsya, 24/05/2007
54.	11004/11 28/01/2011	1959 Sergiy Dmytrovych KOLOMIYETS 1979	Zamostyanskyy District Court of Vinnytsya, 22/12/2006
	20/01/2011	17/7	1) Kharkiv Administrative Court of Appeal, 02/11/2009
55.	11024/11 03/02/2011	Oleksiy Mykolayovych SHUSTOV 1951	2) Barvinkovo Court, 12/05/2009, as amended by the Kharkiv Administrative Court of Appeal, 09/09/2009
			3) Barvinkovo Court, 10/03/2010
56.	11185/11 08/02/2011	Kyrylo Oleksandrovych SEMENOV 1923	Zhytomyr Circuit Administrative Court, 10/12/2007
57.	11191/11 01/02/2011	Stefaniya Mykhaylivna MATIYESHYN 1961	Chervonograd Court, 15/03/2010
58.	11231/11 10/02/2011	Volodymyr Gerasymovych GRYBENKO 1925	Tarashcha Court, 12/08/2008
59.	11569/11 09/02/2011	Vitaliy Stepanovych VYGOVSKYY 1928	Zhytomyr Circuit Administrative Court, 13/11/2007
60.	11624/11 09/02/2011	Volodymyr Mykolayovych GAVRYLENKO 1954	1) Barvinkovo Court, 11/11/2009
<i>C</i> 1	11629/11	Nikolay Nikolayevich GUKOV	2) Barvinkovo Court, 11/11/2009
61.	10/02/2011	1949	Krasnodon Court, 01/11/2002
62.	11697/11	Anatoliy Mykolayovych MAGDA	1) Barvinkovo Court, 03/06/2009 2) Kharkiv Administrative Court of Appeal, 29/09/2009
	08/01/2011	1959	3) Barvinkovo Court, 22/01/2010
63.	11707/11 09/02/2011	Yevgen Volodymyrovych ZHAGLOVSKYY 1959	Zamostyanskyy District Court of Vinnytsa, 06/03/2007
64.	11866/11 09/02/2011	Sergiy Ivanovych CHUKHNO 1962	Barvinkovo Court, 17/11/2009
65.	12109/11 19/01/2011	Oleksandr Gnatovych TARASYUK 1931	Zhytomyr Circuit Administrative Court, 14/10/2008
66.	12216/11 08/02/2011	Oleksandr Mykhaylovych SAVLUK 1947	Tetiyiv Court, 06/12/2007
67.	12264/11 09/02/2011	Vasyl Vasylyovych CHILIY 1959	Barvinkovo Court, 14/12/2009
68.	12335/11 11/02/2011	Anatoliy Yakovych BURLACHENKO 1938	Tetiyiv Court, 23/03/2006
69.	12595/11 09/02/2011	Petro Ivanovych DOVGAL 1952	1) Barvinkovo Court, 28/04/2010
70.	12696/11 09/02/2011	Mykola Pavlovych RESHETNYAK 1953	2) Barvinkovo Court, 28/04/2010 1) Kharkiv Administrative Court of Appeal, 01/10/2009 2) Kharkiv Administrative Court of Appeal, 11/11/2009

No.	Application no. and date of introduction	Applicant name date of birth	Relevant domestic decisions
71.	12699/11 10/02/2011	Valentyna Ivanivna GRYBENKO 1929	Tarashcha Court, 12/08/2008
72.	12715/11 16/02/2011	Volodymyr Mykhaylovych NAZARENKO 1953	Barvinkovo Court, 22/01/2010
73.	12717/11 16/02/2011	Mykhaylo Aksentiyovych SHLYANCHAK 1949	Tetiyiv Court, 26/11/2007
74.	12721/11 11/02/2011	Vasyl Ivanovych DONETS 1952	Tetiyiv Court, 30/11/2007
75.	13062/11 11/02/2011	Ivan Pavlovych SLOMINSKYY 1961	Tetiyiv Court, 07/12/2007
76.	13091/11 14/02/2011	Viktor Ivanovych KAZNADZEY 1956	Tetiyiv Court, 07/12/2007
77.	13093/11 15/02/2011	Volodymyr Ivanovych PYZHEVSKYY 1956	Tetiyiv Court, 28/03/2008
78.	13196/11 11/02/2011	Galyna Mykhaylivna KAMINSKA 1927	Zhytomyr Circuit Administrative Court, 11/01/2008
79.	13318/11 12/02/2011	Inna Volodymyrivna VASKOVSKA 1970	Lugyny Court, 08/05/2007
80.	13333/11 17/02/2011	Oleksandr Viktorovych GRYGORYEV 1968	Barvinkovo Court, 30/04/2010
81.	13399/11 14/02/2011	Fedir Oleksiyovych GARKUSHA 1957	Barvinkovo Court, 30/04/2010
82.	13564/11	Volodymyr Ivanovych AKYMENKO	1) Kharkiv Administrative Court of Appeal, 08/09/2009
02.	17/02/2011	1964 Mykola Andriyovych PRYKHODKO	2) Barvinkovo Court, 22/02/2010
83.	15/02/2011 13568/11	1931 Oleksandr Stepanovych KULISH	Zhytomyr Circuit Administrative Court, 25/10/2007
84.	16/02/2011	1954	Zhytomyr Circuit Administrative Court, 18/09/2008
85.	13599/11 14/02/2011	Volodymyr Yukhymovych BUNDYUK 1954	Kharkiv Administrative Court of Appeal, 29/09/2009
86.	13866/11 23/02/2011	Pavlo Andriyovych SOKUR 1961	Zhytomyr Circuit Administrative Court, 30/10/2007
87.	13885/11 21/02/2011	Mikhail Davydovich ZAKHARCHENKO 1951	Kirovskyy District Court of Donetsk, 17/02/2009 Kirovsyyy District Court of Donetsk, 27/05/2009
88.	13892/11	Leonid Sergiyovych LESKOV	Vinnytskyy District Court of the Vinnytsya Region, 11/10/2006
89.	18/02/2011 14006/11	Leonid Grygorovych POLISHCHUK	Tetiyiv Court, 29/01/2008
90.	15/02/2011 14188/11 22/02/2011	1951 Oleksandr Leonidovych ZYKOV	Lviv Circuit Administrative Court, 03/12/2008
91.	23/02/2011 14427/11 24/02/2011	1958 Anatoliy Andriyovych YATSENKO 1957	Zhytomyr Circuit Administrative Court, 17/10/2007
92.	14584/11 04/02/2011	Leonid Viktorovych TSESAR 1962	Oleksandriya Court, 23/10/2008
93.	14589/11 08/02/2011	1962 Sergiy Mykolayovych ARKHYPOV 1961	Tetiyiv Court, 04/12/2007
	14698/11	Igor Anatoliyovych SAVENKOV 1962	
94.	23/02/2011	Svitlana Grygorivna SAVENKOVA 1960	Kramatorsk Court, 25/10/2006
95.	14700/11 25/02/2011	Lyudmila Dmitriyevna BELOKONENKO 1942	Krasnyy Luch Court, 28/04/2004
96.	14709/11 25/02/2011	Valentina Mikhaylovna TOKAREVA 1951	Krasnyy Luch Court, 12/02/2003
97.	14723/11 25/02/2011	Anatoliy Vladimirovich TOKAREV 1952	Krasnyy Luch Court, 26/07/2005
98.	14728/11 25/02/2011	Vitaliy Valentinovich PUZYRKOV 1955	Krasnyy Luch Court, 27/07/2005

No.	Application no. and date of introduction	Applicant name date of birth	Relevant domestic decisions
99.	14732/11 22/02/2011	Mykhaylo Andriyanovych KRYVOBIK 1928	Zhytomyr Circuit Administrative Court, 02/11/2007
100.	14744/11 25/02/2011	Yevgeniy Vitalyevich PUZYRKOV 1983	Krasnyy Luch Court, 27/07/2005
101.	14855/11 24/02/2011	Anatoliy Volodymyrovych CHEREPANSKYY 1955	Zhytomyr Circuit Administrative Court, 06/12/2007
102.	14861/11 21/02/2011	Leonid Ksenofontovych SIMONOV 1947	1) Barvinkovo Court, 12/05/2009, as amended by the Kharkiv Administrative Court of Appeal on 03/11/2009
103.	14903/11 22/02/2011	Petro Oleksandrovych KARASYOV 1950	2) Kharkiv Administrative Court of Appeal, 19/11/2009 Zhytomyr Circuit Administrative Court, 12/01/2009
104.	15094/11 24/02/2011	Sergiy Yakovych VORONYUK 1966	Starokostyantyniv Court, 30/06/2006
105.	15133/11 15/02/2011	Mykola Petrovych LEBID 1951	Oktyabrskyy District Court of Poltava, 19/12/2008, as amended by the Kharkiv Administrative Court of Appeal, 24/11/2009
106.	15473/11 24/02/2011	Igor Vasylyovych BORTNIK 1969	Starokostyantyniv Court, 20/11/2006
107.	15480/11 02/03/2011	Valentyn Oleksiyovych VASYLYEV 1971	Zhytomyr Circuit Administrative Court, 22/10/2007
108.	15513/11 08/02/2011	Leonid Viktorovych TSESAR 1962	Oleksandriya Court, 04/11/2008
109.	15529/11 23/02/2011	Volodymyr Dmytrovych LUTSYK 1962	Chervonograd Court, 14/05/2001
			1) Zhovtnevyy District Court of Kharkiv, 15/06/2009
110.	15536/11 28/02/2011	Zlatana Georgiyivna TARAN 1950	 Zhovtnevyy District Court of Kharkiv, 17/09/2009 Zhovtnevyy District Court of Kharkiv, 17/06/2010 Zhovtnevyy District Court of Kharkiv, 17/11/2010 Zhovtnevyy District Court of Kharkiv, 30/12/2010
111.	15882/11 02/03/2011	Anatoliy Dmytrovych TATARULYA 1936	Kyivskyy District Court of Poltava, 26/09/2005 Pecherskyy District Court of Kyiv, 18/05/2010
112.	16144/11 01/03/2011	Nadiya Grygorivna MOROZOVA 1942	Lysychansk Court, 18/02/2005
113.	16152/11	Galina Nikolayevna ZAKHAROVA	1) Lugansk Regional Commercial Court, 06/11/2007
113.	04/03/2011	1957	2) Lugansk Regional Commercial Court, 19/04/2010
114.	16164/11 03/03/2011	Volodymyr Valeriyovych ZALOZNYY 1973	Dnipropetrovsk Regional Commercial Court, 22/05/2006
115.	16200/11 04/03/2011	Mykola Volodymyrovych NESHCHERET 1974	Lysychansk Court, 24/02/2005
116.	16286/11 03/03/2011	Vadym Oleksiyovych PLATOV 1952	Kharkiv Administrative Court of Appeal, 29/10/2009
117.	16288/11 02/03/2011	Volodymyr Stepanovych STOLYARCHUK 1950	Tetiyiv Court, 12/06/2008
118.	16529/11 01/03/2011	Volodymyr Yukhymovych STEPANOV 1938	Tetiyiv Court, 03/12/2007
119.	16555/11 04/03/2011	Tadey Vladyslavovych BARANOVSKYY 1933	Chervonograd Court, 12/12/2008
120.	16799/11 05/03/2011	Pavel Pavlovich MOVCHAN 1939	Kuybyshevskyy District Court of Donetsk, 12/10/1999 Kuybyshevskyy District Court of Donetsk, 27/06/2000
121.	16983/11 05/02/2011	Viktor Iosifovich GRIBOVSKIY 1951	1) Nova Kakhovka Court, 11/05/2011
122.	17145/11 09/03/2011	Yuzefa Tofilivna VIKTORIVSKA 1926	Zhytomyr Circuit Administrative Court, 26/02/2008

No.	Application no. and date of introduction	Applicant name date of birth	Relevant domestic decisions
123.	17212/11 28/01/2011	Valentin Aleksandrovich MUKHONKO 1951	Krasnyy Luch Court, 30/10/2002
124.	17573/11 22/02/2011	Yevgeniya Ivanovna VORONINA 1944	Odesa Administrative Court of Appeal, 29/07/2009
125.	17575/11 10/03/2011	Olena Petrivna ZAYTSEVA 1986	Nova Kakhovka Court, 13/02/2009
126.	17581/11 11/03/2011	Mykola Ivanovych BONDARENKO 1958	Oleksandriya Court, 28/01/2008
127.	17648/11 09/03/2011	Stanislav Dominikovych BYSTRITSKYY No information	Baranivtsi Court, 31/03/1999
128.	17732/11 10/03/2011	Petro Petrovych BEZUGLYY 1952	Tetiyiv Court, 27/11/2007
129.	18134/11 02/03/2011	Fedir Ivanovych PARTYKA 1941	Chervonograd Court, 31/10/2003
130.	18334/11	Tetyana Yevgeniyivna BADALOVA	1) Bilogirsk Court, 19/11/2007
	10/03/2011	1955	2) Bilogirsk Court, 18/02/2010
131.	18376/11 03/03/2011	Vasyl Yuriyovych BELEN 1962	Zakarpattya Regional Commercial Court, 05/12/2007
	03/03/2011	1702	1) Oleksandriya Court, 24/07/2007
132.	18448/11 15/03/2011	Vasyl Vasylyovych KULISH 1955	2) Oleksandriya Court, 10/11/2008
			3) Oleksandriya Court, 10/11/2008
133.	18524/11 26/02/2011	Oleksiy Stepanovych BARANOV 1927 Polina Stepanivna BARANOVA 1936	Trostyanets Court, 18/10/2004
134.	18819/11 16/03/2011	Kateryna Mykolayivna KALENSKA 1926	Zhytomyr Circuit Administrative Court, 02/12/2008
135.	18968/11 10/03/2011	Oleksandr Yakovych TSYTSKUN 1958	1) Mukachevo Court, 08/12/2006
	10/03/2011	1750	2) Mukachevo Court, 18/01/2007
136.	18978/11 10/03/2011	Yeva Antoninovna TSYTSKUN 1959	1) Mukachevo Court, 08/12/2006 2) Mukachevo Court, 22/01/2007
137.	18982/11	Valeriy Leonidovych OLIYNYK	Okhtyrka Court, 05/03/2008
137.	19/03/2011	1976	· ·
138.	19014/11 14/03/2011	Lyudmila Fedorovna POLYAKOVA 1949	1) Slovyansk Court, 06/09/1999 2) Labour Disputes Commission of the Sodovyy Zavod, OJSC, 27/09/2001
			3) Slovyansk Court, 12/04/2002
139.	19115/11 14/03/2011	Viktor Andriyovych VASYLYUSHCHENKO 1958	Starokostyantyniv Court, 10/10/2006
140.	19148/11 16/03/2011	Tamara Ivanivna STELMAKH 1935	1) Lugansk Circuit Administrative Court, 19/05/2008
	19170/11	Anatoliy Volodymyrovych KLYMENKO	2) Artemivskyy District Court of Lugansk, 10/11/2008
141.	23/02/2011 19510/11	1956 Anatoliy Mykhaylovych GONCHARUK	Oleksandriya Court, 13/05/2008
142.	11/03/2011	1956	Tetiyiv Court, 23/10/2007
143.	20037/11 11/03/2011	Mykola Oleksiyovych BOYCHENKO 1957	Oleksandriya Court, 28/01/2008
144.	20119/11 14/03/2011	Petro Ivanovych PROZHOGA 1959	1) Oleksandriya Court, 14/04/2008
	20250/11	Valentina Nikolayevna BUCHOK	2) Oleksandriya Court, 11/09/2008
145.	17/03/2011	1965	Proletarskyy District Court of Donetsk, 02/09/2009

No.	Application no. and date of introduction	Applicant name date of birth	Relevant domestic decisions
146.	20320/11 21/03/2011	Ganna Sergiyivna ZHYTOVA 1936	Zhytomyr Circuit Administrative Court, 14/02/2008
147.	20390/11 24/03/2011	Nina Mykolayivna PROKOPETS 1968	Irpen Court, 04/12/2007
148.	20447/11 22/03/2011	Valentyna Mykhaylivna BARSUK 1960	Tetiyiv Court, 04/12/2007
149.	20455/11 22/03/2011	Sophiya Ivanivna SOLOVEY 1943	Tetiyiv Court, 31/01/2008
150.	20543/11 16/03/2011	Galina Stepanovna CHERNYAVSKAYA 1954	Kostyantynivka Court, 26/06/2002
151.	20549/11 22/03/2011	Petro Vasylyovych BARSUK 1954	Tetiyiv Court, 03/12/2007
152.	20599/11 22/03/2011	Oksana Mykolayivna RYEZNIKOVA 1979	Lugansk Circuit Administrative Court, 30/03/2009
153.	20792/11 21/03/2011	Mykola Oleksiyovych PLYS	1) Kharkiv Administrative Court of Appeal, 29/10/2009
154.	20962/11 19/03/2011	Valentina Aleksandrovna FEDICHEVA 1951	2) Barvinkovo Court, 22/02/2010 Kostyantynivka Court, 09/02/2001
155.	21360/11 23/03/2011	Lidiya Prokopivna PALAMARCHUK 1953	Tetiyiv Court, 26/11/2007
156.	21364/11 23/03/2011	Nelya Dmytrivna KORDUN 1950	Tetiyiv Court, 22/11/2007
157.	21404/11 23/03/2011	Vasyl Oleksiyovych POTIYENKO 1936	Tetiyiv Court, 10/12/2007
158.	21409/11 23/03/2011	Vira Oleksandrivna GORBUNOVA 1957	Tetiyiv Court, 28/11/2007
159.	21512/11 23/03/2011	Anatoliy Petrovych DIKHTYARUK 1954	Tetiyiv Court, 12/12/2007
160.	21523/11 14/03/2011	Sergiy Mykhaylovych PAVLOV 1929	Yenakiyeve Court, 05/11/2008
161.	21779/11 28/03/2011	Yuriy Oleksiyovych SHKURKO 1960	Barvinkovo Court, 28/12/2009
162.	22018/11 28/03/2011	Petro Dmytrovych NESKOROMYUK 1951	Tetiyiv Court, 03/12/2007
163.	22032/11 24/03/2011	Galyna Grygorivna NAGAYCHUK 1949	Tetiyiv Court, 22/11/2007
164.	22064/11 24/03/2011	Volodymir Adamovych UMANETS 1946	Tetiyiv Court, 10/12/2007
165.	22112/11 24/03/2011	Lyudmyla Oleksandrivna ZVIZDOVSKA 1965	Tetiyiv Court, 10/12/2007