



EUROPEAN COURT OF HUMAN RIGHTS
COUR EUROPÉENNE DES DROITS DE L'HOMME

FIFTH SECTION

CASE OF VARAVA AND OTHERS v. UKRAINE

(Application no. 12405/06 and 118 other applications)

JUDGMENT

*This version was rectified on 11 March 2013
under Rule 81 of the Rules of Court*

STRASBOURG

17 January 2013

This judgment is final. It may be subject to editorial revision.

In the case of Varava and Others v. Ukraine,

The European Court of Human Rights (Fifth Section), sitting as a Committee composed of:

Boštjan M. Zupančič, *President*,

Ann Power-Forde,

Helena Jäderblom, *judges*,

and Stephen Phillips, *Deputy Section Registrar*,

Having deliberated in private on 18 December 2012,

Having noted that the underlying legal issue in the applications is already the subject of well-established case-law of the Court (see *Yuriy Nikolayevich Ivanov v. Ukraine*, no. 40450/04, 15 October 2009),

Delivers the following judgment, which was adopted on that date:

PROCEDURE

1. The case originated in 119 applications against Ukraine lodged with the Court under Article 34 of the Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms (“the Convention”) by Ukrainian nationals and companies based in Ukraine and a Russian national, whose details are specified in the appended tables (“the applicants”).

2. In the course of the proceedings Mr Borovskyy (application no. 39477/07) died, and his wife, Ms Borovska expressed the wish to pursue the application.

3. The Ukrainian Government (“the Government”) were represented by their Agent, Mr N. Kultchytskyy, of the Ministry of Justice.

4. The applications, which mainly concern non-enforcement of domestic decisions given in the applicants’ favour and excessive delays in the enforcement of decisions, were communicated to the Government on various dates.

5. On various dates the Government submitted to the Court a number of unilateral declarations aimed at resolving the non-enforcement issues raised in seventeen applications (the applications concerned are specified in the appended tables). The Government requested the Court to strike the applications concerned out of the list of cases pursuant to Article 37 § 1 (c) of the Convention on the basis of the declarations. The Court examined the declarations and decided to reject the Government’s request.

6. The Russian Government, having been informed of their right to intervene in the proceedings in respect of the applicant in application no. 12172/08 (Article 36 § 1 of the Convention and Rule 44 of the Rules of Court), indicated that they did not wish to exercise that right.

THE FACTS

THE CIRCUMSTANCES OF THE CASE

7. On the dates set out in the appended table the domestic courts and commissions on labour disputes delivered decisions according to which the applicants were entitled to various pecuniary amounts and/or to have certain actions taken in their favour. The decisions became final and thus enforceable. However, the applicants were unable to secure the enforcement of these decisions in full or in due time as a result of the national authorities' failure to take action.

8. Some of the applicants also made submissions concerning factual and legal matters unrelated to the above non-enforcement issues.

THE LAW

I. JOINDER OF THE APPLICATIONS

9. In view of the similarity of the applications in terms of the principal legal issue raised, the Court finds it appropriate to join them.

II. THE STANDING OF THE APPLICANT'S WIFE IN APPLICATION No. 39477/07

10. The Court notes that it has not been disputed that Ms Borovska is entitled to pursue application no. 39477/07 on behalf of the applicant, Mr Borovskyy. The Court finds that she has standing to continue the present proceedings in the applicant's stead (see, among other authorities, *Mironov v. Ukraine*, no. 19916/04, § 12, 14 December 2006).

III. ALLEGED VIOLATION OF ARTICLES 6 AND 13 OF THE CONVENTION AND OF ARTICLE 1 OF PROTOCOL No. 1

11. The applicants complained about the prolonged non-enforcement of the domestic court decisions given in their favour and the lack of effective remedies in domestic law in respect of their grievances. They relied on, expressly or in substance, Articles 6 and 13 of the Convention and Article 1 of Protocol No. 1.

12. The Court notes that the applicants' above complaints are not manifestly ill-founded within the meaning of Article 35 § 3 (a) of the

Convention. It further notes that they are not inadmissible on any other grounds. They must therefore be declared admissible.

13. The Court finds that the decisions in the applicants' favour were not enforced in due time, for which the State authorities were responsible.

14. Having regard to its well-established case-law on the subject (see *Yuriy Nikolayevich Ivanov*, cited above, §§ 56-58 and 66-70), the Court finds that there has been a violation of Article 6 § 1 of the Convention and Article 1 of Protocol No. 1 on account of the prolonged non-enforcement of the decisions in the applicants' favour. It also considers that there has been a further violation of Article 13 of the Convention since the applicants did not have an effective domestic remedy to redress the damage caused by such non-enforcement.

IV. OTHER ALLEGED VIOLATIONS OF THE CONVENTION

15. Some of the applicants raised other complaints under the Convention which the Court has carefully examined. In the light of all the material in its possession, and in so far as the matters complained of are within its competence, the Court finds that they do not disclose any appearance of a violation of the rights and freedoms set out in the Convention or its Protocols.

16. It follows that those complaints are manifestly ill-founded and must be rejected in accordance with Article 35 §§ 3 (a) and 4 of the Convention.

V. APPLICATION OF ARTICLE 41 OF THE CONVENTION

17. Article 41 of the Convention provides:

“If the Court finds that there has been a violation of the Convention or the Protocols thereto, and if the internal law of the High Contracting Party concerned allows only partial reparation to be made, the Court shall, if necessary, afford just satisfaction to the injured party.”

18. In the present case, bearing in mind its previous decision on the matter (see *Kharuk and Others v. Ukraine* [Committee], no. 703/05 and 115 other applications, § 25, 26 July 2012), the Court considers it reasonable and equitable to award 3,000 euros (EUR) to each applicant in the applications which concern non-enforcement delays exceeding three years (the applications tabulated in Appendix 1) and EUR 1,500 to each applicant in the remaining other applications (the applications tabulated in Appendix 2). These sums are to cover any pecuniary and non-pecuniary damage, as well as costs and expenses.

19. The Court further notes that the respondent State has an outstanding obligation to enforce the decisions which have not been enforced.

20. The Court considers it appropriate that the default interest rate should be based on the marginal lending rate of the European Central Bank, to which should be added three percentage points.

FOR THESE REASONS, THE COURT UNANIMOUSLY

1. *Decides* to join the applications;
2. *Declares* the applicants' complaints under Article 6 § 1 and Article 13 of the Convention and Article 1 of Protocol No. 1 about the prolonged non-enforcement of the decisions given in their favour and the lack of effective domestic remedies in respect of those grievances admissible and the remainder of the applications inadmissible;
3. *Holds* that there has been a violation of Article 6 § 1 of the Convention and Article 1 of Protocol No. 1;
4. *Holds* that there has been a violation of Article 13 of the Convention;
5. *Holds*
 - (a) that the respondent State is to enforce the domestic decisions in the applicants' favour which have not been enforced and is to pay, within three months, EUR 3,000 (three thousand euros) to each applicant or his or her estate in the applications tabulated in Appendix 1 and EUR 1,500 (one thousand five hundred euros) to each applicant or his or her estate in the applications tabulated in Appendix 2 in respect of pecuniary and non-pecuniary damage and costs and expenses, plus any tax that may be chargeable to the applicants on the above amounts which are to be converted into the national currency at the rate applicable at the date of settlement;
 - (b) that from the expiry of the above-mentioned three months until settlement simple interest shall be payable on the above amounts at a rate equal to the marginal lending rate of the European Central Bank during the default period plus three percentage points.

Done in English, and notified in writing on 17 January 2013, pursuant to Rule 77 §§ 2 and 3 of the Rules of Court.

Stephen Phillips
Deputy Registrar

Boštjan M. Zupančič
President

APPENDIX 1
(non-enforcement delays more than three years)

No.	Application no. and date of introduction	Applicant's name and date of birth (if known)	Enforceable domestic decisions
1.	12405/06 17/03/2006	Nina Grygorivna VARAVA 21/05/1948 Vasyl Mykolayovych VARAVA 02/03/1971 Ivan Mykolayovych DOROSHENKO 01/07/1957 Olena Panteleymonivna CHYCH 19/02/1931 Nataliya Anatolivna MOROZ 14/09/1959 Ivan Ivanovych SHEBITKO 07/07/1941 Lidiya Mykhaylivna SHEBITKO 02/03/1942 Viktor Vasylyovych KOTOCHIGOV 24/11/1949 Vasyl Grygorovych SHERSTYUK 16/04/1955	Oktyabryskyy District Court of Poltava, 05/08/2004
2.	42557/06 18/10/2006	Viktor Kyrylovych KYRYK 14/01/1952	Shevchenkivskyy District Court of Kyiv, 01/11/2004
3.	48587/06 14/11/2006	Oleksandr Ivanovych POLEZHAY 25/06/1934	1) Labour Disputes Commission of the company "Chysti Metaly", 21/01/1998 № 52 2) Labour Disputes Commission of the company "Chysti Metaly", 14/08/1998, № 69
4.	2787/07 16/12/2006	Valeriy Nikolayevich NESTERENKO 03/01/1961	Izmayil Court, 10/03/2005
5.	3856/07 20/12/2006	Aleksandr Viktorovich DUBOVENKO 05/01/1958	Torez Court, 13/04/2004
6.	8104/07 18/01/2007	Vasiliy Aleksandrovich TERNOVIK 18/01/1960	Novogrodivka Court, 06/10/2000
7.	16271/07 26/03/2007	Boris Afanasyevich KASYANOV 20/11/1944	1) Pavlograd Court, 04/03/2002 2) Pavlograd Court, 28/11/2002
8.	22030/07 07/05/2007	Vladimir Leonidovich SHULGA 24/08/1967	Tsentralyy District Court of Mykolayiv, 27/07/2006
9.	33514/07 17/07/2007	Oleg Vladimirovich DUKH 14/04/1937	Tsentralno-Mistskyy District Court of Gorlovka, 15/08/2002
10.	39477/07 23/08/2007	Ivan Petrovych BOROVSYY 23/03/1944	Fastiv Court, 13/11/2006
11.	41191/07 05/09/2007	Viktor Ivanovych BERESTOVYY 05/03/1956	Komsomolskyy District Court of Kherson ¹ , 10/09/2004
12.	42244/07 18/09/2007	Sergey Vasilyevich POPOV 13/01/1950	1) Labour Disputes Commission of the Slavyanskyy Keramichnyy Kombinat, 02/10/2000 2) Labour Disputes Commission of the Slavyanskyy Keramichnyy Kombinat, 14/11/2000 3) Labour Disputes Commission of the Slavyanskyy Keramichnyy Kombinat, 18/04/2001 4) Labour Disputes Commission of the Slavyanskyy Keramichnyy Kombinat, 12/02/2002

1. Rectified on 11 March 2013; the text read "Kharkiv".

No.	Application no. and date of introduction	Applicant's name and date of birth (if known)	Enforceable domestic decisions
13.	55854/07 20/11/2007	Tetyana Fedorivna DUDINA 06/03/1961	Vinnitsya Regional Administrative Court, 14/09/2007
14.	6761/08 17/01/2008	Viktor Yeliseyevich KHAPUN 10/04/1944	1) Torez Court, 06/05/2003 2) Torez Court, 06/11/2006 3) Donetsk Regional Court of Appeal, 11/02/2008
15.	8598/08 04/02/2008	Georgiy Dmitriyevich UNGURYAN 09/05/1950	Sverdlovsk Town Court of the Lugansk Region, 21/04/2003
16.	12461/08 29/02/2008	Grygoriy Ivanovych ZHYZHKA 25/03/1956	Kyiv City Court of Appeal, 18/08/2005
17.	13357/08 31/01/2008	Oleksandr Ivanovych SKYBA 07/04/1961	Chervonograd Court, 20/05/2002
18.	13361/08 31/01/2008	Mykola Mykolayovych SHELEMEKH 18/12/1969	Chervonograd Court, 20/05/2002
19.	24392/08 15/05/2008	Antonina Mykhaylivna GOLUBNYCHA 26/08/1944 Alla Mykolayivna SHEVCHUK 22/03/1963	1) Korolovskyy (District) Court of Zhytomyr, 25/01/2006 (as amended by Kyiv Administrative Court of Appeal, 30/10/2007) applicant 1 2) Zhytomyr Regional Administrative Court, 18/03/2008 3) Zhytomyr Regional Administrative Court, 12/12/2007 ¹ applicant 2 4) Zhytomyr Regional Administrative Court, 12/12/2007
20.	26074/08 06/02/2008	Anatoliy Semenovich BABCHUK 1941	Krasnyy Luch Court, 16/01/2002
21.	35999/08 16/07/2008	Dmytro Oleksandrovych CHERNOV 15/01/1978	Shakhtarsk Town Court of the Donetsk Region, 11/09/2001
22.	42283/08 21/08/2008	Denys Anatoliyovych PANTELEYKO 19/05/1968	28 November 2005, Pecherskyy District Court of Kyiv, as amended by the Kyiv City Court of Appeal on 08/06/2006
23.	43167/08 11/08/2008	Fedir Yakovych YURCHUK 02/04/1946	Berdychiv Court, 18/09/2006
24.	44770/08 24/06/2008	Pavel Yuryevich GOTRA 29/11/1950	Krasnyy Luch Court, 19/02/2003
25.	9387/09 04/02/2009	Olga Vasilyevna PASKAR unspecified	Kharkivskyy District Court of the Kharkiv Region, 19/10/2006
26.	10119/09 02/02/2009	Aleksey Mikhaylovich ALYAKIN 28/12/1951	Krasnyy Luch Town Court of the Lugansk Region, 28/08/2007
27.	11905/09 03/02/2009	Andriy Oleksiyovych ZHDANOV 22/10/1962	Zhytomyr District Court of the Zhytomyr Region, 29/12/2006
28.	12494/09 24/02/2009	Oleksandr Mykolayovych BABYUK 29/05/1961	Tetiiv District Court of the Kyiv Region, 10/12/2007
29.	16490/09 17/03/2009	Vadim Gennadyevich YUDENKOV 1950	1) Kerch Town Court, 03/09/2004 2) Kerch Town Court, 27/07/2005
30.	19852/09 01/04/2009	Dmitriy Petrovich KULENTOV 25/05/1955	1) Kerch Town Court of the Autonomous Republic of Crimea, 29/07/2004 2) Kerch Town Court of the Autonomous Republic of Crimea, 07/12/2004
31.	21618/09 17/04/2009	Nikolay Ignatyevich NOSYREV 17/10/1936	Pecherskiy District Court of Kyiv, 18/07/2006
32.	24686/09 22/04/2009	Yuriy Viktorovych RUZAKOV 16/01/1955	Zamostyanskiy District Court of Vinnitsya, 30/03/2007
33.	25285/09 22/04/2009	Grygoriy Oleksandrovych ZAYCHUK 08/04/1961	Zamostyanskiy District Court of Vinnitsya, 30/03/2007
34.	26361/09 04/03/2009	Gennadiy Ivanovich IOSIPOVICH 27/05/1941	1) Slovyansk Town Court of the Donetsk Region, 20/10/1997 2) Slovyansk Town Court of the Donetsk Region, 08/02/2002

1. Rectified on 11 March 2013; the text read "02/12/2007".

No.	Application no. and date of introduction	Applicant's name and date of birth (if known)	Enforceable domestic decisions
35.	64581/09 27/11/2009	Irina Vladimirovna RYBINA 29/01/1968	Krasnyy Luch Court, 10/06/2005
36.	66129/09 01/12/2009	Nikolay Dmitriyevich KOSAREV 1927	Krasnyy Luch Court, 20/03/2007
37.	664/10 26/11/2009	Andriy Oleksiyovych TELESHUN 06/02/1959	Oleksandriya Court, 19/05/2008
38.	1300/10 17/12/2009	Petro Mykolayovych KOSTENYUK 09/06/1949	Dnipropetrovsk Administrative Court of Appeal, 25/09/2008
39.	16517/10 12/03/2010	Stepan Mykolayovych SOLOGUB 20/07/1959	Pershotravnevyy (District) Court of Chernivtsi, 25/05/1999
40.	19998/10 17/03/2010	Yuriy Viktorovych VOLOCHAY 12/04/1969	Kharkiv Administrative Court of Appeal, 08/07/2008
41.	20029/10 17/03/2010	Volodymyr Anatoliyovych STETSYUK 02/11/1977	Avtozavodskyy (District) Court of Kremenchuk, 03/04/2008
42.	20034/10 17/03/2010	Igor Yaroslavovych STEFANIV 25/10/1967	Kharkiv Administrative Court of Appeal, 03/11/2008
43.	24595/10 16/04/2010	Leonid Petrovich SOKOLOV 09/10/1942	Krasnyy Luch Court, 04/01/2003
44.	25199/10 19/04/2010	Tetyana Vasylivna OLIYNYK 04/08/1969	Velyki Burluki Court, 20/08/2007
45.	25271/10 20/04/2010	Olga Mykolayivna SIRENKO 24/10/1979	Velykyy Burluk Court, 20/08/2007
46.	25351/10 23/04/2010	Igor Pavlovych PAVLOV 24/08/1966	Krasnyy Liman Court, 15/01/2001
47.	25354/10 23/04/2010	Oleksandr Mykolayovych ROZHKOV 13/12/1953	Krasnyy Liman Court, 24/11/2003
48.	25632/10 23/04/2010	Mykola Ivanovych YERMAK 30/11/1953	Krasnyy Liman Court, 24/11/2003
49.	25640/10 23/04/2010	Svitlana Mykolayivna YERMAK 16/09/1953	Krasnyy Liman Court, 24/11/2003
50.	25644/10 23/04/2010	Tamara Maksymivna KOLESNYK 15/04/1950	Krasnyy Liman Court, 24/11/2003
51.	25701/10 23/04/2010	Lyudmyla Mykolayivna BESCHESTNA 21/01/1965	Krasnyy Liman Court, 12/12/2003
52.	25710/10 23/04/2010	Vasyl Pavlovych MYASOYEDOV 13/01/1951	Krasnyy Liman Court, 12/12/2003
53.	25714/10 23/04/2010	Vasyl Vasylyovych MYASOYEDOV 05/01/1975	Krasnyy Liman Court, 12/12/2003
54.	25737/10 23/04/2010	Stanislav Anatoliyovych CHERNOMAZ 01/03/1961	Krasnyy Liman Court, 12/12/2003
55.	25741/10 23/04/2010	Nadiya Sergiyivna BOLESNA 12/03/1953	Krasnyy Liman Court, 12/12/2003
56.	25791/10 23/04/2010	Nina Mykolayivna KNYAZYEVA 05/05/1950	Krasnyy Liman Court, 24/11/2003
57.	25806/10 23/04/2010	Yevgen Viktorovych SYDORENKO 26/01/1980	Krasnyy Liman Court, 16/12/2003
58.	25810/10 23/04/2010	Anatoliy Panteliyovych GRYNIOV 16/01/1954	Krasnyy Liman Court, 12/12/2003
59.	25818/10 23/04/2010	Tetyana Vitaliyivna TYMCHENKO 15/06/1974	Krasnyy Liman Court, 16/12/2003
60.	25836/10 23/04/2010	Vitaliy Markovych KNYAZYEV 29/10/1952	Krasnyy Liman Court, 16/12/2003
61.	25837/10 23/04/2010	Valentyna Anatoliyivna SHARKO 09/07/1954	Krasnyy Liman Court, 12/12/2003
62.	25843/10 23/04/2010	Andriy Borysovych BESCHESTNYI 18/09/1966	Krasnyy Liman Court, 12/12/2003
63.	25847/10 23/04/2010	Oleksandr Oleksandrovych YEN 21/06/1982	Krasnyy Liman Court, 16/12/2003
64.	25856/10 23/04/2010	Andriy Anatoliyovych KOZLOV 22/11/1974	Krasnyy Liman Court, 20/01/2004
65.	25860/10 23/04/2010	Lyudmyla Ivanivna KOZLOVA 20/07/1949	Krasnyy Liman Court, 20/01/2004
66.	25892/10 23/04/2010	Valentyna Ivanivna YEN 21/06/1962	Krasnyy Liman Court, 30/01/2004
67.	26006/10 20/04/2010	Viktor Oleksiyovych BURDYUKOV 24/02/1951	Velyki Burluky Court, 03/08/2007
68.	26183/10 16/04/2010	Vyacheslav Andreyevich KUZOVENIN 13/07/1939	Krasnyy Luch Court, 18/10/2007
69.	26201/10 16/04/2010	Yelena Nikolayevna PODLESNOVA 19/01/1973	Krasnyy Luch Court, 13/11/2008

No.	Application no. and date of introduction	Applicant's name and date of birth (if known)	Enforceable domestic decisions
70.	26204/10 16/04/2010	Zinaida Anatolyevna BAYEVA 30/05/1964	Krasnyy Luch Court, 05/03/2003
71.	26212/10 16/04/2010	Nikolay Ivanovich SARAFANOV 25/04/1943	Krasnolutchskyy Court, 07/02/2008
72.	26686/10 23/04/2010	Sergiy Fedorovych BAYRACHNYY 03/04/1966	Krasnyy Liman Court, 12/12/2003
73.	26706/10 23/04/2010	Valeriy Oleksandrovych SHARKO 07/05/1978	Krasnyy Liman Court, 12/12/2003
74.	26711/10 23/04/2010	Sergiy Ivanovych KALINICHENKO 23/02/1959	Krasnyy Liman Court, 16/12/2003
75.	26714/10 23/04/2010	Oleksandr Sergiyovych KALINICHENKO 30/06/1981	Krasnyy Liman Court, 16/12/2003
76.	26720/10 23/04/2010	Oleksandr Mykolayovych MISHURA 05/10/1960	Krasnyy Liman Court, 16/12/2003
77.	27446/10 27/04/2010	Volodymyr Yevgenovych GUSYATYNSKY 18/09/1961	Chervonograd Court, 27/05/2004
78.	28953/10 05/05/2010	Mykola Dmytrovych GRECHANY 21/04/1949	Zarichnyy Court, 15/01/2008
79.	29958/10 04/02/2010	Yuriy Lvovich GROMOV 30/03/1955	Pryluky Court, 13/05/2002
80.	30275/10 14/05/2010	Fedir Ivanovych PAVLENKO 15/05/1975	1) Avtozavodskyy District Court of Kremenchuk, 11/06/2008 2) Avtozavodskyy District Court of Kremenchuk, 02/09/2008
81.	30942/10 25/05/2010	Dmytro Leonidovych BYKOV 26/04/1945	Pecherskyy District Court of Kyiv, 15/12/2008
82.	31345/10 13/05/2010	Valentina Petrovna PETUKHOVA 17/01/1950	Krasnyy Luch Court, 15/06/2006
83.	31381/10 13/05/2010	Anatoliy Ivanovich KOVAL 02/01/1949	Krasnyy Luch Court, 18/05/2005
84.	31396/10 13/05/2010	Natalya Aleksandrovna GRAB 19/07/1969	Krasnyy Luch Court, 11/05/2005
85.	31554/10 13/05/2010	Vyacheslav Ivanovich FEDOROV 02/01/1965	Krasnyy Luch Court, 12/05/2005
86.	32390/10 28/05/2010	Liliya Vladimirovna ZAUERUKHA 08/12/1961	Krasnyy Luch Court, 11/05/2005
87.	32399/10 28/05/2010	Lidiya Arkadyevna SOTNIKOVA 01/02/1963	Krasnyy Luch Court, 12/05/2005
88.	32426/10 28/05/2010	Nadezhda Ivanovna PROVOTOROVA 10/09/1952	1) Krasnyy Luch Court, 27/10/2003 ¹ 2) Krasnyy Luch Court, 01/06/2005
89.	32963/10 28/05/2010	Yelena Valeryevna SOSNITSKAYA 05/04/1971	Krasnyy Luch Court, 11/05/2005
90.	32969/10 28/05/2010	Nellya Mikhaylovna NIKOLAYENKO 10/06/1943	Krasnyy Luch Court, 29/06/2005
91.	33147/10 20/05/2010	Ganna Sergiyivna SHOBOTENKO 02/01/1951	Brovary Court, 27/11/2007
92.	35970/10 14/06/2010	Yevgeniy Oleksandrovych LYPKOVSKYY 21/06/1982	Desnyanskyy District Court of Chernigiv, 03/03/2008
93.	29616/09 ² 22/05/2009	Aleksandr Gennadyevich MOROKA 13/07/1959	1) Kerch Town Court of the Autonomous Republic of Crimea, 27/09/2004 2) Kerch Town Court of the Autonomous Republic of Crimea, 03/12/2004
94.	36404/10 16/06/2010	Volodymyr Vasylyovych KHVOST 07/12/1967	Novozavodskyy District Court of Chernigiv, 10/04/2006
95.	36761/10 25/06/2010	Vasyl Ivanovych TSYGANCHUK 04/01/1963	Pershotravnevyy District Court of Chernivtsi, 11/10/2007
96.	38228/10 15/06/2010	Anatoliy Aleksandrovich DZYUBAN 02/01/1951	Kuybishevskyy District Court of Donetsk, 24/06/2003
97.	40538/10 08/07/2010	Viktor Mykolayovych FEDOROV 06/04/1951	Golosiyivskyy District Court, 29/11/2006

1. Rectified on 11 March 2013; the text read "23/10/2003";

2. Rectified on 11 March 2013; the text read:

36266/10 16/06/2010	Mykola Andriyovych NESOLYONYY 14/08/1922	Lugansk Circuit Administrative Court, 07/05/2009
------------------------	--	--

No.	Application no. and date of introduction	Applicant's name and date of birth (if known)	Enforceable domestic decisions
98.	48338/10 12/08/2010	Volodymyr Viktorovych GALBA 19/01/1964	Zamostyansky (District) Court of Vinnytsya, 15/05/2007
99.	50971/10 16/08/2010	Iryna Rudolfivna KRAVCHENKO 06/03/1955 Larysa Grygorivna KRAVCHENKO 21/06/1976	1) Pervomaysk Court, 14/02/2008 2) Pervomaysk Court, 11/01/2008
100.	52232/10 27/08/2010	Stanislav Viktorovich BOLOTSKIKH 05/12/1974	Korabelnyy District Court, 01/10/2008
101.	52657/10 05/09/2010	Ivan Ivanovych PADALKA 20/01/1949	Obukhiv Court, 01/02/2008
102.	52685/10 30/08/2010	Viktor Mykhaylovych BARTENYEV 09/08/1945	1) Stakhaniv Court, 10/10/2007 2) Stakhaniv Court, 27/10/2008
103.	53402/10 02/06/2009	Sergey Fyodorovich PANASYUK 15/06/1968	1) Krasnyy Lutch Court, 15/09/2004 2) Krasnyy Lutch Court, 23/06/2005
104.	54727/10 05/09/2010	Nataliya Oleksandrivna PROTSYSHYNA 1978	Bogunsky District Court of Zhytomyr, 20/07/2007
105.	54730/10 05/09/2010	Tetyana Vitaliyivna MUDRYCHENKO 05/05/1957	Bogunsky District Court of Zhytomyr, 20/07/2007
106.	55863/10 14/09/2010	Tatyana Aleksandrovna CHEREVKO 04/05/1973	Krasnyy Lutch Court, 17/05/2005
107.	56062/10 07/09/2010	Liliya Vladimirovna CHUMAK 26/03/1972	Krasnyy Lutch Court, 21/06/2005
108.	56978/10 17/09/2010	Mykola Ivanovych SMYESHKO 28/08/1948	Stakhaniv Court, 11/02/2008
109.	58958/10 28/09/2010	Lyudmila Petrovna YEREMINA 22/12/1946	1) Krasnyy Luch Court, 19/09/2002 2) Krasnyy Luch Court, 23/06/2005
110.	2109/11 17/12/2010	Viktoriya Vasilyevna KONDAKOVA 19/01/1981	Krasnyy Luch Court, 14/08/2002
111.	4347/11 05/01/2011	Oleksandr Andriyovych DOROSHO 24/07/1962	Avtozavodskyy (District) Court of Kremenchuk, 08/09/2008
112.	4443/11 05/01/2011	Volodymyr Grygorovych LEVCHENKO 14/08/1957	Avtozavodskyy (District) Court of Kremenchuk; 01/10/2008
113.	4676/11 05/01/2011	Vasyl Oleksiyovych LYTUVNOV 17/03/1955	Avtozavodskyy (District) Court of Kremenchuk, 19/09/2008
114.	4710/11 05/01/2011	Yuriy Viktorovych VOLOCHAY 12/04/1969	Avtozavodskyy (District) Court of Kremenchuk, 15/06/2009
115.	7104/11 17/12/2010	Olga Nikolayevna KONDAKOVA 16/09/1955	Krasnyy Luch Court, 16/12/2002

APPENDIX 2
(non-enforcement delays less than three years)

No.	Application no. and date of introduction	Applicant's name and date of birth (if known)	Enforceable domestic decisions
116.	14865/07 02/03/2007	Aleksandr Grigoryevich MYSAK 09/09/1961	Leninskyy District Court of Sevastopol, 26/09/2006
117.	12172/08 19/02/2008	Dagir Magomedovych KOGERMANOV 22/08/1949	Mukachevo Town Court of the Zakarpattia Region, 18/07/2006
118.	15144/09 03/03/2009	Lyudmila Eduardovna TSOLINA 26/06/1937	Yevpatoriya Town Court of the Autonomous Republic of Crimea, 02/03/2007
119.	23348/09 15/04/2009	Vasiliy Mikhaylovich GABOV 25/09/1961	1) Krasnoarmiysk Town Court of the Donetsk Region, 23/05/2008 2) Krasnoarmiysk Town Court of the Donetsk Region, 11/06/2008