



EUROPEAN COURT OF HUMAN RIGHTS
COUR EUROPÉENNE DES DROITS DE L'HOMME

FIFTH SECTION

CASE OF ALPATOV AND OTHERS v. UKRAINE

(Application no. 7321/05 and 107 other applications)

JUDGMENT

*This version was rectified on 4 February 2013
under Rule 81 of the Rules of Court*

STRASBOURG

18 December 2012

This judgment is final. It may be subject to editorial revision.

In the case of Alpatov and others v. Ukraine,

The European Court of Human Rights (Fifth Section), sitting as a Committee composed of:

Angelika Nußberger, *President*,

André Potocki,

Aleš Pejchal, *judges*,

and Stephen Phillips, *Deputy Section Registrar*,

Having deliberated in private on 27 November 2012,

Having noted that the underlying question in the applications is already the subject of well-established case-law of the Court and that the parties had the ample opportunity to comment on it and on any other aspects of the case,

Delivers the following judgment, which was adopted on that date:

PROCEDURE

1. The case originated in 108 applications against Ukraine lodged with the Court under Article 34 of the Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms (“the Convention”) by 118 Ukrainian nationals and companies based in Ukraine, whose details are specified in the annexed tables (“the applicants”).

2. The Ukrainian Government (“the Government”) were represented by their Agent, Mr N. Kultchytsky, of the Ministry of Justice.

3. The applications, which mainly concern the issues of lengthy non-enforcement of domestic decisions given in the applicants’ favour, were communicated to the Government on various dates. The Government have submitted observations concerning some of the applications. Having been initially adjourned in accordance with the *Yuriy Nikolayevich Ivanov* pilot judgment (see *Yuriy Nikolayevich Ivanov v. Ukraine*, no. 40450/04, ECHR 2009-... (extracts)), the proceedings in the applications have been resumed in February 2012 (for further details see *Kharuk and others v. Ukraine* [Committee], no.703/05, §§ 4-6, 26 July 2012).

4. On various dates the Government submitted to the Court unilateral declarations concerning all the present applications, and requested the Court to strike the applications out of the list of cases pursuant to Article 37 § 1 (c) of the Convention on the basis of the declarations. The Court examined the declarations and decided to reject the Government’s requests.

THE FACTS

I. THE CIRCUMSTANCES OF THE CASE

A. Non-enforcement issues

5. On the dates set out in the annexed tables domestic courts and commissions on labour disputes delivered decisions according to which the applicants were entitled to various pecuniary amounts and/or to have certain actions taken in their favour. The decisions became enforceable. However, the applicants were unable to obtain the enforcement of the decisions in due time because of the authorities' failure to take specific budgetary or regulatory measures, because of the introduction of bans on the attachment and sale of property belonging to State-owned or controlled companies, or because of the bailiffs' omissions.

B. Other matters

6. Some of the applicants also made submissions concerning factual and legal matters unrelated to the above non-enforcement issues.

THE LAW

I. JOINDER OF THE APPLICATIONS

7. In view of the similarity of the applications in terms of the principal legal issues raised, the Court finds it appropriate to join them.

II. ALLEGED VIOLATION OF ARTICLES 6 AND 13 OF THE CONVENTION AND OF ARTICLE 1 OF PROTOCOL No. 1

8. The applicants complained about the lengthy non-enforcement of the decisions given in their favour and about the lack of effective domestic remedies in respect of those complaints. They relied, expressly or in substance, on Articles 6 and 13 of the Convention and Article 1 of Protocol No. 1 which read, in so far as relevant, as follows:

Article 6

“In the determination of his civil rights and obligations ... everyone is entitled to a ... hearing within a reasonable time by [a] tribunal...”

Article 13

“Everyone whose rights and freedoms as set forth in [the] Convention are violated shall have an effective remedy before a national authority notwithstanding that the violation has been committed by persons acting in an official capacity.”

Article 1 of Protocol No. 1

“Every natural or legal person is entitled to the peaceful enjoyment of his possessions. No one shall be deprived of his possessions except in the public interest and subject to the conditions provided for by law and by the general principles of international law...”

Everyone whose rights and freedoms as set forth in [the] Convention are violated shall have an effective remedy before a national authority notwithstanding that the violation has been committed by persons acting in an official capacity.”

A. Admissibility

9. The Court notes that the applicants’ above complaints are not manifestly ill-founded within the meaning of Article 35 § 3 (a) of the Convention. It further notes that they are not inadmissible on any other grounds. They must therefore be declared admissible.

B. Merits

10. The Court notes that the decisions in the applicants’ favour remained unenforced for lengthy periods of time, for which the authorities were responsible.

11. The Court reiterates that it has already found violations of the Convention in similar cases (see Kharuk and others, cited above, §§ 17-19).

12. Having examined all the material in its possession, the Court finds no fact or argument capable of persuading it to reach a different conclusion in the present cases.

13. There has accordingly been a violation of Article 6 § 1 of the Convention and Article 1 of Protocol No. 1 on account of the prolonged non-enforcement of the decisions in the applicants’ favour and a violation of Article 13 of the Convention in that the applicants did not have an effective domestic remedy to redress the damage created by such non-enforcement.

III. OTHER ALLEGED VIOLATIONS OF THE CONVENTION

14. Some of the applicants raised other complaints under the Convention which the Court has carefully examined. In the light of all the material in its possession, and in so far as the matters complained of are within its competence, the Court finds that they do not disclose any appearance of a violation of the rights and freedoms set out in the Convention or its Protocols.

15. It follows that those complaints are manifestly ill-founded and must be rejected in accordance with Article 35 §§ 3 (a) and 4 of the Convention.

IV. APPLICATION OF ARTICLE 41 OF THE CONVENTION

16. Article 41 of the Convention provides:

“If the Court finds that there has been a violation of the Convention or the Protocols thereto, and if the internal law of the High Contracting Party concerned allows only partial reparation to be made, the Court shall, if necessary, afford just satisfaction to the injured party.”

A. Damage, costs, and expenses

17. In line with the approach applied in *Kharuk and others* (cited above, §§ 23-27), the Court considers it reasonable and equitable to award 3,000 euros (EUR) to each applicant in the applications which concern non-enforcement delays exceeding three years (the applications tabulated in Annex 1) and EUR 1,500 to each applicant in the other applications (the applications tabulated in Annex 2). These sums are to cover any pecuniary and non-pecuniary damage, as well as costs and expenses.

18. The Court further notes that the respondent State has an outstanding obligation to enforce the decisions which have not been enforced.

B. Default interest

19. The Court considers it appropriate that the default interest rate should be based on the marginal lending rate of the European Central Bank, to which should be added three percentage points.

FOR THESE REASONS, THE COURT UNANIMOUSLY

1. *Decides* to join the applications;
2. *Declares* the applicants' complaints under Article 6 § 1 and Article 13 of the Convention and Article 1 of Protocol No. 1 about the lengthy non-enforcement of the decisions given in their favour and about the lack of effective domestic remedies in respect of those complaints admissible and the remainder of the applications inadmissible;
3. *Holds* that there has been a violation of Article 6 § 1 of the Convention and of Article 1 of Protocol No. 1;
4. *Holds* that there has been a violation of Article 13 of the Convention;
5. *Holds*
 - (a) that the respondent State is to enforce the domestic decisions in the applicants' favour which have not been enforced and is to pay, within three months, EUR 3,000 (three thousand euros) to each applicant or his or her estate in the applications tabulated in Annex 1 and EUR 1,500 (one thousand five hundred euros) to each applicant or his or her estate in the applications tabulated in Annex 2 in respect of pecuniary and non-pecuniary damage and costs and expenses, plus any tax that may be chargeable to the applicants on the above amounts which are to be converted into the national currency at the rate applicable at the date of settlement;
 - (b) that from the expiry of the above-mentioned three months until settlement simple interest shall be payable on the above amounts at a rate equal to the marginal lending rate of the European Central Bank during the default period plus three percentage points.

Done in English, and notified in writing on 18 December 2012, pursuant to Rule 77 §§ 2 and 3 of the Rules of Court.

Stephen Phillips
Deputy Registrar

Angelika Nußberger
President

ANNEX 1
(non-enforcement delays more than three years)

No.	Application no. and date of introduction	Applicant's name and date of birth (if known)	Enforceable domestic decisions
1.	7321/05 08/02/2005	Oleg Veniaminovich ALPATOV 1949	14 March 2000, Novogrodivka Court
2.	13333/05 22/03/2005	Boris Ivanovich KARLOV 13/09/1950	25 January 2001 and 25 October 2002, Khartzysk Court
3.	16716/05 14/03/2005	Vladimir Nikolayevich SOKOLOV 16/11/1956	15. July 2003 and 28 May 2004 Krasnyy Luch Court
4.	40631/05 04/11/2005	Tamara Antonovna YAROSHENKO 25/05/1928	27 October 2000, Leninskyy District Court of Luhansk
5.	43801/05 09/11/2005	TIPIKO, TOV	05 August 2004, Commercial Court of the Zakarpattia Region
6.	7478/06 27/01/2006	Viktor Vsevolodovich BONDALET 04/05/1948	10 August 2004, Shahtarsk Court
7.	26577/06 15/06/2006	Tatyana Vladimirovna MURENETS 18/11/1972	25 November 1999 and 10 February 2006, Nova Kakhovka Court
8.	29112/06 30/06/2006	Anatoliy Ivanovych ROMANOV 05/01/1951	5 January 2006, Dzerzhynsk Court
9.	31936/06 29/07/2006	Gennadiy Viktorovich KUDINOV 25/03/1970	14 June 2004, Leninskyy District Court of Kirovograd
10.	46311/06 27/10/2006	Volodymyr Borysovych TURITSA 24/11/1956	17 April 2006, Gorodenka Court, as amended by the judgment of the Ivano-Frankivsk Court of Appeal of 26 February 2008
11.	48065/06 10/11/2006	Igor Fedorovich DERMANSKIY 30/07/1969	16 April 1997, Artemivskyy District Court of Luhansk
12.	6212/07 27/12/2006	Angelina Ivanivna KOZAK 28/11/1942	8 November 2004, Stryi Court
13.	6731/07 14/12/2006	FIRMA DEMEK, TOV	21 August 2001, Commercial Court of the Donetsk Region,
14.	6759/07 15/01/2007	Oleksiy Ivanovych ZUBENKO 13/12/1957	20 January 2001, Bluznukivskyy District Court of the Kharkiv Region
15.	7937/07 10/02/2007	Volodymyr Ilarionovych KONDRATYEV 1956	17 March 2000, Bryanka Court
16.	8849/07 09/02/2007	Ilya Vladimirovich CHERKAS 11/08/1955	19 December 2005, Velykonovosilkivsk Court
17.	10033/07 09/02/2007	Yekaterina Iosifovna PERERVA 05/09/1942	13 November 2001, Rozdolne Court

No.	Application no. and date of introduction	Applicant's name and date of birth (if known)	Enforceable domestic decisions
18.	11074/07 26/02/2007	Mykola Vasylyovych GUSEV 17/12/1945	5 September 2006, Poltava Regional Court of Appeal, quashed on 26 January 2009 and a new judgment of the Poltava Regional Court of Appeal of 18 May 2009 in the same case
19.	14676/07 14/03/2007	Valeriy Vatslavych ZHURAKIVSKYY 13/11/1958	1 November 2006, Berdychiv Court
20.	20132/07 31/03/2007	Sergey Mikhaylovich SERGEYEV 15/07/1957	6 July 2006, Kyivskyy District Court of Kharkiv
21.	31187/07 24/05/2007	Irina Ernatovna KRAVTSOVA 26/03/1967	22 November 2004, Leninskyy District Court of Luhansk
22.	31441/07 21/06/2007	Liliya Nikolayevna LOGINOVA 28/08/1956	1. 26 August 2005, Novogrodivka Court 2. 26 December 2005, Novogrodivka Court
23.	48049/07 23/10/2007	Volodymyr Petrovych BOYKO 14/04/1960	24 May 2004, Mohyliv-Podilsk Court
24.	51917/07 14/11/2007	Georgiy Ivanovych POGOSKYY 02/07/1953	6 December 2005, Commercial Court of the Poltava Region
25.	4790/08 24/12/2007	Vadim Stanislavovich DMITRIYEV 15/03/1979	01 June 2005, Krasnyy Luch Court
26.	9033/08 07/02/2008	Tatyana Sergeyevna PUGACH 11/10/1954	15 February 2002 , Yenakievo Court
27.	14461/08 27/02/2008	Boris Nikolayevich LYSYUK 09/03/1982	1 October 2003, Commercial Court of the Donetsk Region
28.	14599/08 03/03/2008	Lyubov Sergeyevna DMITRENKO 11/11/1947	30 May 2005, Krasnyy Luch Court
29.	19753/08 07/04/2008	Volodymyr Mykhaylovych LOPUSHANSKY 17/08/1955	13 December 2005, Arbuzynka Court, as amended by the Mykolaiv Regional Court of Appeal on 7 April 2006
30.	19791/08 11/04/2008	Valeriy Aleksandrovich LANOVENKO 1938	16 November 2006, Fastov Court
31.	28121/08 27/05/2008	Svetlana Petrovna BOYEVA 29/02/1960	27 May 2005, Krasnyy Luch Court
32.	28203/08 27/05/2008	Aleksey Nikolayevich TEMCHUR 04/02/1956	18 July 2005, Krasnyy Luch Court
33.	28974/08 07/06/2008	Lyubov Gilyaryevna KHLYNINA 22/08/1956	11 May 2005, Krasnyy Luch Court
34.	28975/08 07/06/2008	Viktor Frantsevich ALMIZOV 25/05/1940	30 March 2007, Krasnyy Luch Court
35.	28991/08 07/06/2008	Tatyana Ivanovna LAKIYCHUK 02/07/1949	21 May 2007, Krasnyy Luch Court

No.	Application no. and date of introduction	Applicant's name and date of birth (if known)	Enforceable domestic decisions
36.	29382/08 07/06/2008	Lyudmila Ivanovna SILENKO 05/06/1951	7 May 2004, Torez Court
37.	35562/08 15/07/2008	Tatyana Mikhaylovna VINOGRADOVA 30/10/1950	20 July 2005, Krasnyy Luch Court
38.	37108/08 17/06/2008	Leonid Petrovich VITSKO 02/09/1956	18 July 2005, Krasnyy Luch Court
39.	37112/08 17/06/2008	Tamara Ivanovna DIKAYA 24/04/1951	27 December 2005, Krasnyy Luch Court
40.	50079/08 24/09/2008	Zoya Grigoryevna IZOTOVA 26/02/1954	1. 5 February 2001, labour disputes commission 2. 14 March 2001, Kostyantynivka Court 3. 21 May 2001, labour disputes commission 4. 14 December 2001, Kostyantynivka Court
41.	51743/08 06/10/2008	Yuriy Konstantinovich IVANOV 16/12/1946	30 April 2003, Gagarinskyy District Court of Sevastopol
42.	498/09 09/12/2008	Anton Oleksandrovych SKRYPCHENKO 15/10/1957	1. 22 September 2004, Kyivskyy District Court of Odesa 2. 19 April 2006, Kyivskyy District Court of Odesa
43.	12803/09 16/02/2009	Lyudmila Viktorovna PROTSKO 12/02/1953	1. 28 April 2004, Kostyantynivka Court 2. 28 September 2006, Kostyantynivka Court
44.	13589/09 16/02/2009	Vladimir Vladimirovich ZAZVORKA 21/06/1956	4 November 2001, labour disputes commission
45.	17848/09 15/03/2009	1. Tatyana Ilyinichna VAKHETOVA 05/02/1952	1 December 1999, Kostyantynivka Court
		2. Sergey Viktorovich VOLOSUNOV 05/08/1963	15 January 2001, labour disputes commission
		3. Yekaterina Vasilyevna MUDREYKO 29/11/1950	25 January 2001, Kostyantynivka Court
		4. Vladimir Yakovlevich KRIVENKO 21/01/1941	12 February 2001, labour disputes commission
		5. Nadezhda Vasilyevna KACHURA 30/07/1950	12 March 2001, Kostyantynivka Court
		6. Lyudmila Petrovna KOVALENKO 25/08/1954	23 April 2001, Kostyantynivka Court
		7. Aleksandr Mikhaylovich NETESA 11/03/1943	13 October 2004, Kostyantynivka Court
		8. Tamara Mikhaylovna SERDYUCHENKO 25/03/1950	7 December 2001, Kostyantynivka Court

No.	Application no. and date of introduction	Applicant's name and date of birth (if known)	Enforceable domestic decisions
		9. Nataliya Nikolayevna CHAUS 25/09/1956	9 December 2004, Kostyantynivka Court
		10. Nelli Grigoryevna PEREMETINA 30/08/1945	22 May 2006, Kostyantynivka Court
46.	20353/09 26/03/2009	Viktor Ivanovich ROMANENKO 16/05/1960	1. 11 April 2006, Zaliznychnyy District Court of Simferpol 2. 7 December 2006 ¹ , Yevpatoriya Court
47.	26329/09 04/03/2009	Nina Dmitriyevna VOLKOVA 13/12/1944	1.20 October 1997, Slovyansk Court 2.4 June 1998, Slovyansk Court 3. 10 March 1999, Slovyansk Court 4.21 May 2002, Vyshgorod Court
48.	33507/09 05/06/2009	Natalya Mikhaylovna BAMBALOVA 08/01/1954	13 November 2000, labour disputes commission
49.	44881/09 04/08/2009	Valentyna Ivanivna KHAVRYCH 04/03/1964	6 November 2007, Kamyanka Court
50.	44926/09 06/08/2009	Lyudmila Alekseyevna YAROSHEVSKAYA 16/08/1949	20 December 2006, Dzerzhinsky District Court of Kharkiv
51.	48274/09 26/08/2009	Aleksandra Mikhaylovna KOROVNIKOVA 10/01/1936	23 August 2002, Torets Court
52.	51879/09 13/09/2009	Fedir Romanovych SHEVELEV 1922	1. 11 February 2008, Donetsk Regional Administrative Court 2. 03 November 2008, Donetsk Regional Administrative Court
53.	56226/09 06/10/2009	ASKO, MKP	30 July 2004, Commercial Court of the Kherson Region
54.	59492/09 26/10/2009	Denis Aleksandrovich SECHKAREV 17/09/1978	11 October 2006, Krasnyy Luch Court
55.	62399/09 13/11/2009	Leonid Viktorovich TSESAR 1962	12 December 2007, Oleksandriya Court, as amended by the Dnipropetrovsk Regional Court of Appeal on 23 December 2008
56.	4252/10 12/01/2010	Mykola Petrovych VINNICHENKO 08/05/1953	24 December 2007, Shevchenkivskyi District Court of Zaporizhzhya
57.	12476/10 20/02/2010	Ivan Petrovych FUTALO 16/03/1959	20 December 2005, Sokal Court
58.	14075/10 19/02/2010	Stanislav Fedorovych SHEVCHENKO 01/11/1945	1. 30 May 2005, Oleksandriya Court 2. 17 March 2009, Oleksandriya Court

1. Rectified on 4 February 2013; the text read “6 December”.

No.	Application no. and date of introduction	Applicant's name and date of birth (if known)	Enforceable domestic decisions
59.	14108/10 24/02/2010	Antonina Mytrofanivna TKACHENKO 29/06/1950	27 February 2009, Oleksandriya Court
60.	14171/10 28/02/2010	Grygoriy Ivanovych TERNAVSKYY 15/08/1927	07 April 2009, Kalanchak Court
61.	14743/10 04/03/2010	Igor Pavlovich KOSMACHOV 31/08/1972	22 May 2006, Korabelnyy District Court of Mykolayiv
62.	14824/10 26/02/2010	Valentyna Pavlivna TERNAVSKA 25/04/1927	7 April 2009, Kalanchak Court
63.	14873/10 05/03/2010	Anatoliy Vladimirovich GAVRILENKO 06/09/1974	22 May 2006, Korabelnyy District Court of Mykolayiv
64.	19497/10 21/03/2010	Tamara Grygorivna GROMOVA 25/12/1934	26 November 2008, Zhytomyr Regional Administrative Court
65.	20291/10 01/04/2010	Nataliya Yuryevna SOSHENKO 04/05/1953	1. 20 May 2005, Komsomolskyy District Court of Kherson 2. 20 July 2006, Komsomolskyy District Court of Kherson 3. 16 October 2006, Komsomolskyy District Court of Kherson, 4. 3 May 2007, Komsomolskyy District Court of Kherson
66.	23262/10 02/04/2010	Nadiya Georgiyivna MAKOVOZ 25/03/1954	11 January 2008, Pervomaysk Court
67.	23950/10 12/04/2010	Nataliya Ivanivna DAVYDENKO 26/01/1956	1.28 February 2008, Pervomaysk Court 2. 20 March 2008, Pervomaysk Court
68.	24642/10 17/04/2010	Nikolay Aleksandrovich SPODIN 03/08/1928	1. 15 May 2008, Leninskyy District Court of Sevastopol 2. 8 October 2009, Leninskyy District Court of Sevastopol 3. 21 January 2010, Leninskyy District Court of Sevastopol
69.	25981/10 23/04/2010	Nelya Yevgeniyivna UTKINA 28/06/1958	5 February 2007, Zamostyanskyy District Court of Vinnytsya
70.	25997/10 21/04/2010	Oleksiy Mykolayovych KACHAYLO 04/06/1949	20 February 2009, Okhtyrka Court
71.	29072/10 07/05/2010	Roman Mykhaylovych KOMAR 18/03/1950	14 June 2001, Frankivskyy District Court of Lviv Region

No.	Application no. and date of introduction	Applicant's name and date of birth (if known)	Enforceable domestic decisions
72.	29963/10 30/04/2010	Oleksandr Fedorovych SHVETS 11/03/1945	19 November 2007, Dniprovskyy District Court of Kherson
73.	33114/10 20/05/2010	Nataliya Borysivna ABRAMENKO 29/03/1958	18 December 2007, Brovary Court
74.	33135/10 20/05/2010	Igor Yevgeniyovych SHOBOTENKO 12/04/1973	20 December 2007, Brovary Court
75.	33139/10 20/05/2010	Vadym Yevgeniyovych SHOBOTENKO 14/02/1978	6 December 2007, Brovary Court
76.	33161/10 20/05/2010	Pavlo Vyacheslavovych KUCHUGURNYY 02/10/1964	1. 13 November 2008, Artemivskyy District Court of Luhansk 2. 26 February 2009, Artemivskyy District Court of Luhansk 3. 16 March 2009, Artemivskyy District Court of Luhansk
77.	33164/10 20/05/2010	Iryna Anatoliyivna RYABUSHCHYTS unspecified	1 April 2008, Brovary Court
78.	34350/10 09/06/2010	Mykola Nykyforovych NOVAK 11/10/1959	28 May 2008, Oleksandriya Court as amended on 14 April 2009 by the Dnipropetrovsk Administrative Court of Appeal
79.	35024/10 14/06/2010	Svitlana Kalenykivna FINKEVYCH 18/03/1956	8 November 2002, Luts'k Court
80.	35077/10 06/06/2010	Grygoriy Oleksandrovych OBUSHCHAK 14/02/1960	2 March 2007, Staromistskyy District Court of Vinnytsya
81.	35424/10 14/06/2010	Iryna Oleksandrivna OVCHINNIKOVA 06/12/1979	4 April 2008, Desnyanskyy District Court of Chernigiv, as amended on 8 July 2009 by Kyiv Administrative Court of Appeal
82.	35890/10 16/06/2010	Vladimir Dmitriyevich FISAK 18/06/1955	20 July 2005, Dzerzhynsk Court
83.	38178/10 26/06/2010	Yevgeniy Ivanovich ZELYUNKO 25/08/1937	26 January 2009, Zhytomyr Regional Administrative Court
84.	41281/10 24/06/2010	Volodymyr Petrovych MAZURAKA 26/02/1958	19 November 2003, Chervonograd Court
85.	42642/10 17/02/2010	Irina Romilovna KARPACHEVA 14/06/1958	28 May 2008, Kostyantynivka Court ¹
86.	51453/10 26/08/2010	Grigoriy Mikhaylovich SUPRUN 20/07/1955	20 August 2006, Svitlovodsk Court

1. Rectified on 4 February 2013; the text read "21 March 2002 and 28 May 2008".

No.	Application no. and date of introduction	Applicant's name and date of birth (if known)	Enforceable domestic decisions
87.	56269/10 20/09/2010	Terentiy Semenovich GERASYMOV 24/04/1954	9 April 2009, Zhytomyr Regional Administrative Court
88.	59584/10 28/09/2010	Yuriy Mykhaylovych ZHGUTOV 15/06/1926	12 December 2007, Novozavodskyy District Court of Chernigiv
89.	66363/10 30/10/2010	Valeriy Yegorovich KOMBAYEV 21/04/1942	10 June 2008, the Crimea Court of Appeal
90.	69158/10 17/11/2010	Vasyl Mykytovych ILCHENKO 1927	1. 2 November 2007, Zhytomyr Regional Administrative Court 2. 7 October 2008, Zhytomyr Regional Administrative Court
91.	75025/10 07/12/2010	Viktor Alekseyevich LAPSHIN 02/01/1943	18 August 2009, Kalininskyy District Court of Donetsk
92.	671/11 17/12/2010	Tetyana Volenivna TABACHENKO 09/01/1978	17 June 2009, Leninskyy District Court of Luhansk, became enforceable on 2 October 2009
93.	1391/11 27/12/2010	Gennadiy Sergiyovych ALDABAYEV 20/05/1940	30 January 2008, Zhytomyr Regional Administrative Court
94.	2157/11 15/12/2010	Valentina Petrovna TATARCHENKO 02/04/1950	17 September 2002, Kostyantynivka Court
95.	3217/11 08/12/2010	Leonid Ivanovych BOBIK 05/06/1935	2 March 2009, Zhytomyr Regional Administrative Court
96.	1513/11 23/12/2010	Vitaliy Viktorovich TOLKACHOV 08/06/1984	20 June 2006, Antratsyt Court

ANNEX 2
(non-enforcement delays less than three years)

No.	Application no. and date of introduction	Applicant's name and date of birth (if known)	Enforceable domestic decisions
97.	10704/07 22/02/2007	Natali Valeriyivna NOVYTSKA 02/08/1976	24 November 2005, Suvorovskyy District Court of Kherson, quashed on 3 June 2008
98.	3863/08 11/01/2008	Yuriy Tymofiyovych OPANASYUK unspecified	25 May 2005, Kyiv Harrison Military Court, became enforceable on 22 February 2006 and was enforced in full in November 2008
99.	18167/08 17/03/2008	Tatyana Ivanovna MIKHAL 1951	21 October 2005, Zhovtnevyi District Court of Dnipropetrovsk, quashed on 18 September 2007 ¹
100.	27320/08 28/05/2008	Vasyl Mykolayovych GEYTOTA 09/01/1961	6 February 2006, Kolomyia Court, enforced on 28 January 2008
101.	35012/08 11/06/2008	Kostyantyn Antonovych ZUBKO 20/02/1954	16 June 2006, Pecherskyy District Court of Kyiv, quashed on 25 February 2009
102.	46147/09 12/11/2008	Pavel Ivanovich BONDAR 16/04/1960	13 August 2007, Donetsk Regional Administrative Court, quashed on 12 November 2009
103.	4980/10 13/01/2010	Vladimir Nikolayevich KARTASHOV 03/01/1951	6 February 2008, Donetsk Regional Administrative Court, quashed on 3 June 2010
104.	12100/10 15/02/2010	Svitlana Ivanivna DUBOVENKO 24/08/1937	16 January 2008, Zarichnyi District Court of Sumy, quashed on 19 August 2010
105.	19148/10 21/03/2010	Sergey Aleksandrovich KHMELEVSKIY 27/05/1960 Vyacheslav Iosifovich KULBACHKO 18/03/1956	2 July 2009, Makiivka Court, enforced on 14 July 2011
106.	48233/10 05/08/2010	Mykola Volodymyrovych KOKHANOVSKYY 11/02/1961	2 June 2009, Khmelnytskyi Court, as amended on 12 January 2010 by the Khmelnytsk Regional Court of Appeal
107.	71356/10 23/11/2010	Leonid Anatolyevich ZARAYSKIY 12/12/1961	26 September 2008, Lysychansk Court, quashed on 7 April 2011
108.	3282/11 29/12/2010	Oleksandr Petrovych DORDUKA unspecified	4 November 2008, Kaniv Court, as amended by the Kyiv Administrative Court of Appeal on 22 December 2009

1. Rectified on 4 February 2013; the text read “28 September”.