

## EUROPEAN COURT OF HUMAN RIGHTS COUR EUROPÉENNE DES DROITS DE L'HOMME

#### FIFTH SECTION

#### **DECISION**

Suzana RISTOVA and others against the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia (Applications nos. 27254/07, 27722/07, 29415/07, 29451/07, 29653/07, 31204/07)

The European Court of Human Rights (Fifth Section), sitting on 16 November 2010 as a Committee composed of:

Rait Maruste, President,

Mirjana Lazarova Trajkovska,

Zdravka Kalaydjieva, judges,

and Stephen Phillips, Deputy Section Registrar,

Having regard to the above applications,

Having regard to the formal declarations accepting a friendly settlement of the case,

Having deliberated, decides as follows:

#### **PROCEDURE**

All applicants are Macedonian nationals. Their personal details are listed in the Annex I. They are all represented before the Court by Mr B. Grozdanovski, a lawyer practising in Skopje. The Macedonian Government ("the Government") were represented by their Agent, Mrs R. Lazareska Gerovska.

On 22 April 2010 the Court decided to communicate the applicants' complaint concerning the length of civil proceedings in which they claimed work-related allowances. The essential information as to the domestic proceedings in respect of each application is indicated in Annex II.



## 2 RISTOVA AND FIVE OTHER CASES V. THE FORMER YUGOSLAV REPUBLIC OF MACEDONIA DECISION

On 4 June 2010 and 30 August 2010 respectively, and on 22 July 2010 only in respect of application no. 31204/07, the Court received friendly settlement declarations signed by the parties under which the applicants agreed to waive any further claims against the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia in respect of the facts giving rise to the applications against an undertaking by the Government to pay each of them the amounts specified in the table below to cover any non-pecuniary damage as well as costs and expenses, which would be converted into Macedonian Denars at the rate applicable on the date of payment, and would be free of any taxes that may be applicable. This sum would be payable to the personal accounts of the applicants within three months from the date of notification of the decision taken by the Court pursuant to Article 37 § 1 of the European Convention on Human Rights. In the event of failure to pay this sum within the said three-month period, the Government undertook to pay simple interest on it, from expiry of that period until settlement, at a rate equal to the marginal lending rate of the European Central Bank during the default period plus three percentage points. The payment would constitute the final resolution of the case.

1.	27254/07	3,550 euros
2.	27722/07	3,550 euros
3.	29415/07	3,600 euros
4.	29451/07	2,620 euros
5.	29653/07	4,440 euros
		4,460 euros (to the first, second, third and fourth
6.	31204/07	applicant)
		3,560 euros (to the fifth and sixth applicant)

#### THE LAW

The Court takes note of the friendly settlement reached between the parties. It is satisfied that the settlement is based on respect for human rights as defined in the Convention and its Protocols and finds no public policy reasons to justify a continued examination of the applications (Article 37 § 1 *in fine* of the Convention).

In view of the above, it is appropriate to strike the cases out of the list.

For these reasons, the Court unanimously

Decides to strike the applications out of its list of cases.

Stephen Phillips Deputy Registrar Rait Maruste President

### ANNEX I

Application number(s)	Applicant(s)	Date of Birth	Place of Residence
27254/07	Ms Suzana Ristova	1961	
_,_,,,	Mr Marijan Abrasev	1967	
	Ms Trajana Panova	1955	Veles
	Ms Mirjana Pesankova	1961	
	Ms Menka Janevska	1956	
	Ms Nevenka Atanasovska	1963	
	Ms Vesna Malezanova	1959	
	Ms Zora Petrovska	1956	
	Ms Cveta Ordeva	1940	Veles
	Ms Borjanka Ilieva	1951	
	Ms Suzana Ristova	1961	
	Ms Milka Markova	1948	
27722/07	Ms Gjulfera Demirova	1954	
	Ms Bogdanka Cvetkovska	1960	
	Ms Gjurgja Pesova	1955	
	Ms Todorka Brankovik	1965	Colosevo village
29415/07	Ms Stojna Ivanova	1961	
	Ms Velika Jovanova	1961	Veles
	Ms Dobrica Stojanovska	1942	
	Ms Rodna Andovska	1954	
29451/07	Ms Snezana Paunova	1952	
	Ms Marika Dimcevska	1958	
	Ms Atidze Asanova	1956	
	Ms Gordana Andreeva	1954	
	Ms Blaguna Mitevska	1952	
	Ms Jagoda Stojkovska	1959	
	Ms Biljana Trimanova	1952	
	Ms Liljana Dimovska	1959	
	Ms Angja Gjurcinovska	1967	Veles
	Ms Magdalena Jovanovska	1969	, 5155
	Ms Slavica Vidoska	1955	
	Ms Svetla Dimova	1956	
	Ms Biljana Ivanova	1963	
	Ms Spasija Cokova	1945	
	Ms Kaliopa Nakinova	1953	
	Ms Mirka Vasileva	1958	
	Ms Vaska Gogova	1956	
	Ms Vasilka Panova	1957	
	Ms Suzana Terzieva	1966	
	(Andova)		
	Ms Marija Mirova	1961	
	Ms Karolina Pavlovska	1968	
	Ms Vera Petrova	1967	



# 4. RISTOVA AND FIVE OTHER CASES V. THE FORMER YUGOSLAV REPUBLIC OF MACEDONIA DECISION

29653/07	Ms Menka Trajkova Ms Liljana Soleva Ms Grozda Stevanovska Ms Nada Trajkova Ms Dilbera Dimova	1944 1946 1957 1945 1945	Veles
	Ms Slavica Stefanovska Ms Snezana Angelova Ms Mukades Demirova Ms Liljana Kocovska Ms Cveta Dimova	1962 1963 1962 1961 1948	
31204/07	Ms Marija Jovanovska ("the first applicant") Ms Lence Zdravkin ("the second applicant") Ms Ubavka Jovanovska ("the third applicant") Ms Nadezda Cabovska ("the fourth applicant") Ms Milka Ilkovska ("the fifth applicant") Ms Desanka Trikik ("the sixth applicant")	1963 1967 1962 1965 1957 1953	Veles

# RISTOVA AND FIVE OTHER CASES V. THE FORMER YUGOSLAV REPUBLIC OF MACEDONIA DECISION

### ANNEX II

No.	Appl. Nos.	Date of lodging the application with the Court	Court proceedings initiated on	Subject matter	Final decision
1.	27254/07	31 May 2007	18 December 1996	Compensation for unpaid salary and pension and disability contributions	14 February 2007
2.	27722/07	29 May 2007	27 February 1997	Compensation for unpaid salary and pension and disability contributions	18 January 2007
3.	29415/07	22 June 2007	27 February 1997	Compensation for pension and disability contributions	1 February 2007
4.	29451/07	22 June 2007	16 January 1997	Compensation for pension and disability contributions	15 February 2007
5.	29653/07	25 June 2007	27 February 1997	Compensation for pension and disability contributions	28 February 2007
6.	31204/07	17 July 2007	1997	Compensation for unpaid salary and	7 March 2007 (served on 11 April 2007)
			16 January 1997	pension and disability contributions	14 December 2006