



EUROPEAN COURT OF HUMAN RIGHTS
COUR EUROPÉENNE DES DROITS DE L'HOMME

1959 · 50 · 2009

FIRST SECTION

**CASE OF RYABOV
and 151 other “Privileged pensioners” cases v. RUSSIA**

(Applications nos. 4563/07, 19923/08, 29853/08, 35836/08, 37062/08, 37064/08, 37069/08, 37072/08, 37568/08, 37717/08, 38120/08, 38832/08, 39479/08, 39532/08, 39601/08, 40675/08, 40676/08, 40678/08, 41157/08, 41158/08, 41161/08, 41163/08, 41794/08, 41804/08, 41806/08, 41807/08, 41810/08, 41820/08, 41822/08, 41824/08, 41825/08, 41828/08, 41911/08, 41975/08, 41981/08, 42005/08, 42006/08, 44357/08, 44361/08, 44617/08, 45200/08, 45204/08, 45207/08, 45243/08, 45246/08, 45253/08, 45258/08, 45261/08, 45265/08, 45833/08, 45834/08, 46047/08, 46210/08, 46211/08, 46215/08, 46218/08, 46965/08, 46968/08, 47762/08, 47768/08, 47774/08, 47776/08, 47779/08, 47783/08, 47878/08, 48025/08, 48045/08, 48049/08, 48054/08, 48056/08, 48587/08, 48606/08, 48854/08, 48861/08, 48877/08, 48942/08, 48956/08, 49322/08, 49325/08, 49411/08, 49415/08, 49563/08, 51002/08, 52521/08, 52557/08, 52563/08, 52566/08, 53574/08, 53579/08, 53583/08, 53587/08, 53589/08, 53593/08, 53595/08, 53600/08, 53603/08, 53605/08, 53607/08, 53611/08, 53614/08, 53617/08, 53620/08, 53623/08, 53629/08, 53632/08, 54367/08, 54379/08, 54384/08, 54392/08, 54396/08, 54398/08, 54399/08, 54400/08, 54431/08, 54456/08, 54470/08, 54473/08, 54507/08, 54513/08, 54526/08, 54530/08, 54590/08, 54593/08, 54596/08, 54602/08, 54605/08, 54608/08, 56037/08, 56774/08, 56778/08, 56781/08, 56784/08, 56786/08, 56789/08, 56801/08, 56806/08, 56813/08, 56816/08, 56827/08, 56832/08, 56837/08, 58306/08, 58344/08, 59027/08, 59599/08, 59626/08, 59628/08, 59698/08, 59699/08, 59703/08, 60036/08, and 4507/09)

JUDGMENT

STRASBOURG
17 December 2009

FINAL

17/03/2010

This judgment will become final in the circumstances set out in Article 44 § 2 of the Convention. It may be subject to editorial revision.

In the case of Ryabov and 151 other “Privileged pensioners” cases
v. Russia,

The European Court of Human Rights (First Section), sitting as a
Chamber composed of:

Christos Rozakis, *President*,

Nina Vajić,

Anatoly Kovler,

Elisabeth Steiner,

Dean Spielmann,

Giorgio Malinverni,

George Nicolaou, *judges*,

and Søren Nielsen, *Section Registrar*,

Having deliberated in private on 26 November 2009,

Delivers the following judgment, which was adopted on that date:

PROCEDURE

1. The case originated in 152 applications (nos. 4563/07, 19923/08, 29853/08, 35836/08, 37062/08, 37064/08, 37069/08, 37072/08, 37568/08, 37717/08, 38120/08, 38832/08, 39479/08, 39532/08, 39601/08, 40675/08, 40676/08, 40678/08, 41157/08, 41158/08, 41161/08, 41163/08, 41794/08, 41804/08, 41806/08, 41807/08, 41810/08, 41820/08, 41822/08, 41824/08, 41825/08, 41828/08, 41911/08, 41975/08, 41981/08, 42005/08, 42006/08, 44357/08, 44361/08, 44617/08, 45200/08, 45204/08, 45207/08, 45243/08, 45246/08, 45253/08, 45258/08, 45261/08, 45265/08, 45833/08, 45834/08, 46047/08, 46210/08, 46211/08, 46215/08, 46218/08, 46965/08, 46968/08, 47762/08, 47768/08, 47774/08, 47776/08, 47779/08, 47783/08, 47878/08, 48025/08, 48045/08, 48049/08, 48054/08, 48056/08, 48587/08, 48606/08, 48854/08, 48861/08, 48877/08, 48942/08, 48956/08, 49322/08, 49325/08, 49411/08, 49415/08, 49563/08, 51002/08, 52521/08, 52557/08, 52563/08, 52566/08, 53574/08, 53579/08, 53583/08, 53587/08, 53589/08, 53593/08, 53595/08, 53600/08, 53603/08, 53605/08, 53607/08, 53611/08, 53614/08, 53617/08, 53620/08, 53623/08, 53629/08, 53632/08, 54367/08, 54379/08, 54384/08, 54392/08, 54396/08, 54398/08, 54399/08, 54400/08, 54431/08, 54456/08, 54470/08, 54473/08, 54507/08, 54513/08, 54526/08, 54530/08, 54590/08, 54593/08, 54596/08, 54602/08, 54605/08, 54608/08, 56037/08, 56774/08, 56778/08, 56781/08, 56784/08, 56786/08, 56789/08, 56801/08, 56806/08, 56813/08, 56816/08, 56827/08, 56832/08, 56837/08, 58306/08, 58344/08, 59027/08, 59599/08, 59626/08, 59628/08, 59698/08, 59699/08, 59703/08, 60036/08, and 4507/09) against the Russian Federation lodged with the Court under Article 34 of the Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms (“the Convention”) by 156

Russian citizens whose names and dates of birth are tabulated in the Annex (“the applicants”). The applications' dates of introduction are also tabulated in the Annex.

2. The applicants were represented, respectively, by Mr M. Antonov, Mr I. Fedotov, Mr V. Glukhov, Ms O. Gurova, Mr G. Migay, Mr. Y. Pakin, and Ms L. Yerokhina, consultants from the Moscow Region. The Russian Government (“the Government”) were represented by Mr G. Matyushkin, Representative of the Russian Federation at the European Court of Human Rights.

3. On 12 February 2009 the President of the First Section decided to give notice of the applications to the Government. It was also decided to examine the merits of the applications at the same time as their admissibility (Article 29 § 3). The Government objected to the joint examination of the admissibility and merits, but the Court rejected this objection.

THE FACTS¹

4. The applicants are pensioners who live in the Moscow Region. Before retirement they used to work in hazardous industries. They had a dispute with a pension authority about the scope of their privileged pensions and appealed to the Region's district and town courts.

5. In September 2003–November 2006 the courts held for the applicants and ordered the pension authority to recalculate the pensions. The courts based their findings on the Law on Labour Pensions. These judgments became binding and were executed.

6. On the pension authority's request, in October 2007–June 2008 the district and town courts quashed their judgments due to discovery of new circumstances. The courts found, in particular, that the judgments had ignored the interpretation of the Law on Labour Pensions given by the Supreme Court in December 2005 and March 2007.

7. The applicants' cases were remitted for a rehearing and eventually dismissed.

1. Factual details concerning individual applications are given in the Annex.

THE LAW

I. JOINDER OF THE APPLICATIONS

8. As the applications are similar in terms of both fact and law, the Court decides to join them.

II. ALLEGED VIOLATION OF ARTICLE 6 § 1 OF THE CONVENTION AND OF ARTICLE 1 OF PROTOCOL No. 1

9. The applicants complained under Article 6 of the Convention and Article 1 of Protocol No. 1 that the quashing of the binding judgments was unjustified. Insofar as relevant, these Articles read as follows:

Article 6 § 1

“In the determination of his civil rights and obligations ..., everyone is entitled to a fair ... hearing ... by [a] ... tribunal...”

Article 1 of Protocol No. 1

“Every natural or legal person is entitled to the peaceful enjoyment of his possessions. No one shall be deprived of his possessions except in the public interest and subject to the conditions provided for by law and by the general principles of international law.

The preceding provisions shall not, however, in any way impair the right of a State to enforce such laws as it deems necessary to control the use of property in accordance with the general interest or to secure the payment of taxes or other contributions or penalties.”

A. Admissibility

10. The Government argued that the applications were inadmissible. The Supreme Court's interpretations of the Law on Labour Pensions revealed fundamental errors in the district and town courts' reasoning, and hence those judgments had had to be quashed. The quashing had been legitimate, lawful, and compliant with the principle of legal certainty. The quashing was meant to ensure a uniform and coherent functioning of the State pension scheme and to protect the public purse from undue depletion.

11. The applicants argued that their applications were admissible. The quashing had been unjustified because the district and town courts did take into account the interpretation of 2005, and because the interpretation of 2007 had been given after the judgments. In any event, a legislative

interpretation of laws might come only from a lawmaker, not from a court. Besides, the pension authority had missed the statutory time-limit for the quashing, and the courts had extended that limit without good reason.

12. The Court notes that the applications are not manifestly ill-founded within the meaning of Article 35 § 3 of the Convention. It further notes that they are not inadmissible on any other grounds. They must therefore be declared admissible.

B. Merits

13. The Court reiterates that for the sake of legal certainty implicitly required by Article 6, final judgments should generally be left intact. They may be disturbed only to correct fundamental defects (see *Ryabykh v. Russia*, no. 52854/99, §§ 51–52, ECHR 2003-IX). Quashing of judgments because of newly-discovered circumstances is not by itself incompatible with this requirement, but the manner of its application may be (see *Pravednaya v. Russia*, no. 69529/01, §§ 27–34, 18 November 2004).

14. In the case at hand, the domestic courts justified the quashing with the Supreme Court's two interpretations of the Law on Labour Pensions.

As to the interpretation of 2005, the Court considers that differing judicial interpretations of a law represent a ground for an ordinary appeal, rather than a discovery warranting a quashing of a binding judgment (see *Yerogova v. Russia*, no. 77478/01, § 34, 19 June 2008).

As to the interpretation of 2007, the Court reiterates that newly-discovered circumstances are circumstances that exist during the trial, remain hidden from the court, and become known after trial. Since the interpretation of 2007 was posterior to the Town Court's judgments, it did not justify the quashing either (see *Yerogova*, cited above, § 33).

15. It follows that the quashing of the applicants' judgments was unjustified, and that there has, accordingly, been a violation of Article 6 § 1 of the Convention and Article 1 of Protocol No. 1.

III. APPLICATION OF ARTICLE 41 OF THE CONVENTION

16. Article 41 of the Convention provides:

“If the Court finds that there has been a violation of the Convention or the Protocols thereto, and if the internal law of the High Contracting Party concerned allows only partial reparation to be made, the Court shall, if necessary, afford just satisfaction to the injured party.”

A. Damage, costs, and expenses

17. In respect of pecuniary damage, the applicants claimed sums ranging from 0 euros (EUR) to EUR 11,344. According to the applicants, these sums represented the difference between the pensions they had been receiving after the quashing and the pensions they would have received if there had been no quashing. The Government argued that this claim was excessive and unreasonable.

18. The Court rejects this claim in view of its speculative character (see *Tarnopolskaya and Others v. Russia*, nos. 11093/07, 14558/07, 19660/07, 30166/07, 46736/07, 52681/07, 52985/07, 10633/08, 10652/08, 12694/08, 15437/08, 16691/08, 19447/07, 19457/08, 20857/08, 20872/08, 22546/08, 25820/08, 25839/08, and 25845/08, § 51, 9 July 2009).

19. In respect of non-pecuniary damage, the applicants claimed sums ranging from EUR 2,000 to EUR 10,000. The Government contested this claim as ill-founded.

20. In respect of costs and expenses incurred before the Court, the applicants claimed sums ranging from EUR 0 to EUR 1,640. The Government noted that any possible award should cover only proven expenses.

21. The Court reiterates that it is an international judicial authority contingent on the consent of the States signatory to the Convention, and that its principal task is to secure the respect for human rights, rather than compensate applicants' losses minutely and exhaustively. Unlike in national jurisdictions, the emphasis of the Court's activity is on passing public judgments that set human-rights standards across Europe.

22. For this reason, in cases involving many similarly situated victims a unified approach may be called for. This approach will ensure that the applicants remain aggregated and that no disparity in the level of the awards will have a divisive effect on the applicants.

23. In view of the above, making its assessment on equitable and reasonable bases, the Court awards each applicant EUR 2,000 in respect of non-pecuniary damage, and costs and expenses.

B. Default interest

24. The Court considers it appropriate that the default interest should be based on the marginal lending rate of the European Central Bank, to which should be added three percentage points.

FOR THESE REASONS, THE COURT UNANIMOUSLY

1. *Decides* to join the applications;
2. *Declares* the applications admissible;
3. *Holds* that there has been a violation of Article 6 § 1 of the Convention and Article 1 of Protocol No. 1;
4. *Holds*
 - (a) that the respondent State is to pay each applicant, within three months from the date on which the judgment becomes final in accordance with Article 44 § 2 of the Convention, EUR 2,000 (two thousand euros), plus any tax that may be chargeable to the applicants, in respect of non-pecuniary damage, and costs and expenses, to be converted into Russian roubles at the rate applicable at the date of settlement;
 - (b) that from the expiry of the above-mentioned three months until settlement simple interest shall be payable on the above amount at a rate equal to the marginal lending rate of the European Central Bank during the default period plus three percentage points;
5. *Dismisses* the remainder of the applicants' claims for just satisfaction.

Done in English, and notified in writing on 17 December 2009, pursuant to Rule 77 §§ 2 and 3 of the Rules of Court.

Søren Nielsen
Registrar

Christos Rozakis
Presiden

8 RYABOV AND 151 OTHER “PRIVILEGED PENSIONERS” CASES v. RUSSIA JUDGMENT

ANNEX

Application no.	Introduced on	Applicant	Born in	Court	Judgment of	Quashed on
4563/07	26/12/06	Ryabov Vladimir Pavlovich	1928	Elektrostal Town Court	01/06/06	22/11/07
19923/08	22/03/08	Zavedeyev Vladimir Nikolayevich	1938	Elektrostal Town Court	25/05/06	09/10/07
29853/08	25/05/08	Kochkolda Svetlana Pavlovna	1938	Korolyov Town Court	13/04/05	26/11/07
35836/08	24/06/08	Fedosova Olga Mikhaylovna	1949	Elektrostal Town Court	21/09/06	17/01/08
37062/08	17/06/08	Titova Tamara Nikolayevna	1950	Elektrostal Town Court	11/09/06	24/01/08
37064/08	17/06/08	Motorina Mariya Mikhaylovna	1931	Elektrostal Town Court	16/08/06	14/02/08
37069/08	19/06/08	Andronova Tamara Mikhaylovna	1928	Elektrostal Town Court	23/10/06	04/03/08
37072/08	25/06/08	Vasyunina Lyudmila Leontyevna	1948	Elektrostal Town Court	08/09/06	22/02/08
37568/08	01/07/08	Titov Yevgeniy Nikolayevich	1947	Elektrostal Town Court	11/09/06	24/01/08
37717/08	02/07/08	Knyazev Yuriy Anatolyevich	1952	Elektrostal Town Court	05/10/06	05/03/08
38120/08	16/07/08	Yevseyeva Nina Vasilyevna	1941	Elektrostal Town Court	18/09/06	25/03/08
38832/08	16/07/08	Usova Valentina Mikhaylovna	1945	Elektrostal Town Court	18/09/06	25/03/08
39479/08	19/07/08	Lazarenko Tatyana Mikhaylovna	1953	Elektrostal Town Court	15/09/06	31/03/08
39532/08	02/08/08	Khrisova Antonina Dmitriyevna	1957	Elektrostal Town Court	20/11/06	14/03/08
39601/08	02/08/08	Baranova Lyudmila Ivanovna	1955	Elektrostal Town Court	26/09/06	11/03/08
40675/08	18/07/08	Bovtalo Nikolay Ivanovich	1950	Elektrostal Town Court	20/10/06	23/01/08
40676/08	19/07/08	Shmakov Vladimir Dmitriyevich	1951	Elektrostal Town Court	06/10/06	22/02/08
40678/08	19/07/08	Shmakova Tatyana Aleksandrovna	1952	Elektrostal Town Court	06/10/06	22/02/08
41157/08	23/07/08	Shcherbakov Sergey Germanovich	1952	Elektrostal Town Court	21/09/06	12/02/08
41158/08	02/08/08	Bezikon Alla Vladimirovna	1958	Elektrostal Town Court	20/11/06	14/03/08
41161/08	28/07/08	Gorenshteyn Valentina Alekseyevna	1935	Elektrostal Town Court	23/10/06	04/04/08
41163/08	29/07/08	Yevseyeva Emiliya Fyodorovna	1939	Shchyolkovo Town Court	31/07/06	04/03/08
41794/08	04/07/08	Musorina Galina Ilyichna	1939	Shchyolkovo Town Court	20/11/06	17/01/08
41804/08	27/06/08	Tishchenko Mikhail Kirillovich	1944	Shchyolkovo Town Court	13/10/06	12/02/08
41806/08	23/04/08	Sergeyenko Yuriy Mikhaylovich	1932	Elektrostal Town Court	25/05/06	27/11/07
41807/08	04/07/08	Levkina Lyubov Sergeyevna	1950	Shchyolkovo Town Court	21/11/06	14/01/08
41810/08	04/07/08	Rusin Vasilii Pavlovich	1931	Elektrostal Town Court	19/09/06	07/02/08
41820/08	08/07/08	Popova Galina Ivanovna	1953	Noginsk Town Court	18/09/03	14/01/08
41822/08	09/07/08	Odina Olga Ivanovna	1951	Elektrostal Town Court	21/09/06	11/02/08
41824/08	09/07/08	Tikhomirov Viktor Feoktistovich	1946	Elektrostal Town Court	16/10/06	15/01/08
41825/08	09/07/08	Bulatova Galina Vasilyevna	1951	Elektrostal Town Court	21/09/06	24/03/08
		Butskikh Amalia Efimovna	1930	Elektrostal Town Court	21/09/06	24/03/08
		Chuvatkin Vladimir Yakovlevich	1925	Elektrostal Town Court	21/09/06	24/03/08
41828/08	09/07/08	Borisova Zinaida Nilovna	1925	Elektrostal Town Court	16/08/06	15/01/08
41911/08	09/08/08	Kharitonova Tatyana Valentinovna	1956	Elektrostal Town Court	12/10/06	26/03/08
41975/08	28/06/08	Ionova Svetlana Dmitriyevna	1951	Elektrostal Town Court	27/10/06	28/02/08

RYABOV AND 151 OTHER “PRIVILEGED PENSIONERS” CASES v. RUSSIA JUDGMENT 9

Application no.	Introduced on	Applicant	Born in	Court	Judgment of	Quashed on
41981/08	05/07/08	Smirnov Yuriy Aleksandrovich	1930	Elektrostal Town Court	23/10/06	18/03/08
42005/08	26/07/08	Sukonkina Galina Aleksandrovna	1938	Elektrostal Town Court	21/09/06	14/01/08
42006/08	26/07/08	Sukonkin German Alekseyevich	1934	Elektrostal Town Court	21/09/06	04/03/08
44357/08	28/08/08	Gunina Natalya Prokofyevna	1952	Elektrostal Town Court	03/10/06	13/03/08
44361/08	09/08/08	Anokhina Lyubov Ivanovna	1948	Shchyolkovo Town Court	22/09/06	04/03/08
44617/08	08/07/08	Arkhipova Aleksandra Anatolyevna	1937	Elektrostal Town Court	21/08/06	21/03/08
45200/08	22/08/08	Pichugina Yekaterina Pavlovna	1958	Elektrostal Town Court	28/06/06	31/03/08
45204/08	21/08/08	Parshenkova Olga Viktorovna	1959	Elektrostal Town Court	18/09/06	25/03/08
		Kuzmina Yevdokiya Pavlovna	1945	Elektrostal Town Court	18/09/06	25/03/08
45207/08	22/08/08	Zelova Praskovya Sergeyevna	1927	Elektrostal Town Court	09/10/06	27/02/08
45243/08	22/08/08	Semencheva Nadezhda Anatolyevna	1954	Elektrostal Town Court	05/10/06	10/04/08
45246/08	21/08/08	Chaykova Galina Grigoriyevna	1947	Elektrostal Town Court	15/09/06	26/03/08
45253/08	05/08/08	Bugreyeva Yelena Stepanovna	1930	Elektrostal Town Court	07/11/06	27/03/08
45258/08	15/08/08	Mikhaylova Tamara Ivanovna	1957	Elektrostal Town Court	03/10/06	13/03/08
45261/08	15/08/08	Inkina Tamara Aleksandrovna	1949	Elektrostal Town Court	11/10/06	31/03/08
45265/08	16/08/08	Rakova Natalya Sergeyevna	1951	Elektrostal Town Court	28/09/06	19/02/08
45833/08	01/08/08	Myachin Sergey Fyodorovich	1953	Elektrostal Town Court	04/10/06	28/03/08
45834/08	17/07/08	Khokhlova Valentina Mikhaylovna	1929	Elektrostal Town Court	16/11/06	26/03/08
46047/08	19/08/08	Starchukova Zinaida Ivanovna	1933	Shchyolkovo Town Court	13/11/06	11/03/08
46210/08	30/08/08	Fakhrtdinov Aleksandr Gayasovich	1945	Voskresensk Town Court	14/04/05	09/04/08
46211/08	03/09/08	Roslyakova Svetlana Aleksandrovna	1939	Voskresensk Town Court	20/06/05	06/03/08
46215/08	30/08/08	Romanov Yevgeniy Petrovich	1954	Elektrostal Town Court	03/10/06	13/03/08
46218/08	30/08/08	Roslyakova Yelena Aleksandrovna	1952	Voskresensk Town Court	04/04/06	11/04/08
46965/08	14/08/08	Antonov Mikhail Alekseevich	1953	Elektrostal Town Court	21/11/06	25/03/08
46968/08	02/09/08	Savinova Valentina Maksimovna	1941	Elektrostal Town Court	27/10/06	25/03/08
47762/08	16/09/08	Dubanova Tatyana Sergeyevna	1948	Elektrostal Town Court	23/10/06	26/03/08
47768/08	22/09/08	Pershin Viktor Ivanovich	1956	Elektrostal Town Court	09/11/06	19/02/08
47774/08	05/09/08	Tyuvayev Nikolay Vasilyevich	1952	Elektrostal Town Court	23/10/06	26/03/08
47776/08	05/09/08	Fedotova Galina Aleksandrovna	1951	Voskresensk Town Court	25/04/05	20/02/08
47779/08	13/09/08	Poloskov Viktor Leonidovich	1925	Elektrostal Town Court	30/10/06	31/03/08
47783/08	06/09/08	Romanova Nadezhda Viktorovna	1929	Voskresensk Town Court	19/05/05	12/03/08
47878/08	14/08/08	Zenina Valentina Nikityevna	1940	Elektrostal Town Court	17/10/06	27/03/08
48025/08	25/08/08	Pavlova Tatyana Anatolyevna	1953	Elektrostal Town Court	21/09/06	21/03/08
48045/08	22/08/08	Krayushkina Lyubov Aleksandrovna	1947	Elektrostal Town Court	27/10/06	28/02/08
48049/08	22/08/08	Perevitskaya Marina Vladislavovna	1953	Elektrostal Town Court	27/10/06	28/02/08
48054/08	23/08/08	Gusarova Maria Efimovna	1933	Elektrostal Town Court	14/08/06	03/03/08
48056/08	22/08/08	Krasilnikova Rimma Nikolayevna	1949	Elektrostal Town Court	27/09/06	20/03/08
48587/08	16/09/08	Shamova Galina Vasilyevna	1951	Elektrostal Town Court	23/10/06	02/04/08
48606/08	16/09/08	Denis Valentina Fedorovna	1948	Elektrostal Town Court	09/11/06	02/04/08
48854/08	07/09/08	Samsonov Valentin Nikolayevich	1946	Elektrostal Town Court	20/11/06	20/03/08
48861/08	07/09/08	Ogurtsova Antonina Ivanovna	1929	Elektrostal Town Court	23/10/06	27/03/08

10 RYABOV AND 151 OTHER “PRIVILEGED PENSIONERS” CASES v. RUSSIA JUDGMENT

Application no.	Introduced on	Applicant	Born in	Court	Judgment of	Quashed on
48877/08	20/09/08	Kazina Tatyana Konstantinovna	1949	Elektrostal Town Court	21/08/06	21/03/08
48942/08	12/09/08	Bryunina Tatyana Germanovna	1949	Elektrostal Town Court	13/10/06	13/03/08
48956/08	16/09/08	Sapunov Vladimir Ignatyevich	1939	Elektrostal Town Court	20/11/06	28/03/08
49322/08	19/09/08	Saprykin Igor Nikolayevich	1950	Elektrostal Town Court	30/10/06	27/03/08
49325/08	19/09/08	Ivanova Nina Nikolayevna	1951	Elektrostal Town Court	30/10/06	20/03/08
49411/08	22/09/08	Galochkina Irina Lvovna	1959	Elektrostal Town Court	15/09/06	26/03/08
49415/08	22/09/08	Goncharenko Viktor Grigoryevich	1948	Elektrostal Town Court	15/09/06	26/03/08
49563/08	16/09/08	Trimasova Nina Vasilyevna	1934	Elektrostal Town Court	21/09/06	25/03/08
51002/08	02/10/08	Kolosovskaya Lyudmila Vasilyeva	1929	Elektrostal Town Court	25/10/06	07/06/08
52521/08	22/09/08	Lukina Galina Pavlovna	1956	Elektrostal Town Court	15/09/06	26/03/08
52557/08	30/08/08	Feofanov Anatoliy Leonidovich	1947	Voskresensk Town Court	26/04/05	17/03/08
52563/08	27/08/08	Mosina Natalya Nikolayevna	1952	Elektrostal Town Court	23/10/06	26/03/08
52566/08	21/08/08	Kovyrshina Larisa Vasilyevna	1959	Elektrostal Town Court	14/09/06	26/03/08
53574/08	14/08/08	Igonin Oleg Vasilyevich	1946	Elektrostal Town Court	30/10/06	26/03/08
53579/08	03/09/08	Larkova Raisa Zakharovna	1947	Voskresensk Town Court	04/07/05	06/03/08
53583/08	08/09/09	Mitichev Yevgeniy Vasilyevich	1955	Voskresensk Town Court	21/03/06	12/03/08
53587/08	21/08/08	Petrova Lyudmila Vasilyevna	1930	Elektrostal Town Court	21/09/06	21/03/08
53589/08	22/08/08	Yefimova Zoya Fedorovna	1946	Elektrostal Town Court	04/10/06	26/03/08
53593/08	23/07/08	Zavyalova Kseniya Petrovna	1935	Elektrostal Town Court	25/09/06	24/01/08
53595/08	26/07/08	Solomatin Mikhail Pavlovich	1925	Elektrostal Town Court	20/11/06	17/03/08
53600/08	09/07/08	Volchukova Mariya Ivanovna	1932	Elektrostal Town Court	31/07/06	24/01/08
53603/08	18/09/08	Tulyakova Olga Viktorovna	1955	Elektrostal Town Court	18/10/06	26/03/08
53605/08	05/09/08	Rukityanskaya Nina Mikhaylovna	1945	Elektrostal Town Court	27/10/06	27/03/08
53607/08	05/09/08	Rukityanskiy Vladimir Dmitriyevich	1941	Elektrostal Town Court	27/10/06	02/04/08
53611/08	20/08/08	Kukuy Irina Stepanovna	1935	Elektrostal Town Court	09/11/06	02/04/08
53614/08	19/08/08	Starkova Mariya Vasilyevna	1932	Elektrostal Town Court	12/10/06	21/02/08
53617/08	13/08/08	Bogatov Akim Fedorovich	1928	Elektrostal Town Court	12/10/06	27/03/08
53620/08	20/06/08	Alferova Nadezhda Mikhaylovna	1956	Elektrostal Town Court	13/09/06	11/02/08
53623/08	02/09/08	Nazina Yuliya Pavlovna	1929	Elektrostal Town Court	09/11/06	25/03/08
53629/08	13/08/08	Bondar Anatoliy Ivanovich	1929	Elektrostal Town Court	10/11/06	13/03/08
53632/08	24/09/08	Romanova Galina Dmitriyevna	1952	Elektrostal Town Court	27/10/06	25/03/08
54367/08	09/08/08	Khusyainova Rauza Safovna	1950	Shchyolkovo Town Court	21/08/06	04/03/08
54379/08	11/08/08	Dent Yuriy Semenovich	1937	Shchyolkovo Town Court	17/11/06	15/02/08
54384/08	22/07/08	Mokrinskaya Marina Nikolayevna	1959	Elektrostal Town Court	20/10/06	23/01/08
54392/08	18/08/08	Kuznetsova Aleksandra Petrovna	unknown	Elektrostal Town Court	06/10/06	22/02/08
54396/08	54396/08	Panfilova Olga Georgiyevna	1954	Voskresensk Town Court	12/07/05	28/02/08
54398/08	04/07/08	Subbotina Tatyana Vasilyevna	1950	Shchyolkovo Town Court	13/11/06	09/01/08
54399/08	03/07/08	Andrianova Antonina Aleksandrovna	1937	Elektrostal Town Court	17/10/06	27/03/08
54400/08	03/07/08	Kvasova Olga Yuryevna	1958	Elektrostal Town Court	09/11/06	19/02/08
54431/08	19/09/08	Musinov Viktor Nikolayevich	1947	Elektrostal Town Court	13/10/06	13/03/08
54456/08	05/06/08	Romantsova Mariya Yakovlevna	1939	Elektrostal Town Court	19/09/06	11/03/08

RYABOV AND 151 OTHER “PRIVILEGED PENSIONERS” CASES v. RUSSIA JUDGMENT 11

Application no.	Introduced on	Applicant	Born in	Court	Judgment of	Quashed on
54470/08	12/08/08	Khlopova Tatyana Nikolayevna	1950	Elektrostal Town Court	06/10/08	28/02/08
54473/08	22/07/08	Lyalkina Galina Ivanovna	1924	Elektrostal Town Court	17/11/06	28/03/08
54507/08	24/06/08	Obyedkova Tamara Mikhaylovna	1951	Elektrostal Town Court	16/08/06	23/01/08
54513/08	13/08/08	Khakimova Zaynyad	1927	Elektrostal Town Court	28/09/06	21/02/08
54526/08	12/08/08	Zaytseva Valentina Leonidovna	1947	Elektrostal Town Court	12/10/06	19/03/08
54530/08	08/08/08	Chelnokova Lyudmila Yakovlevna	1941	Elektrostal Town Court	05/10/06	10/04/08
54590/08	31/07/08	Shatilov Dmitriy Mikhaylovich	1952	Elektrostal Town Court	09/10/06	02/04/08
54593/08	13/08/08	Yefimenko Vladimir Aleksandrovich	1946	Elektrostal Town Court	15/10/06	26/03/08
54596/08	13/08/08	Fedorova Valentina Nikolayevna	1934	Elektrostal Town Court	18/10/06	27/03/08
54602/08	29/07/08	Solomatina Rimma Mikhaylovna	1930	Elektrostal Town Court	21/11/06	19/03/08
54605/08	29/07/08	Klimov Viktor Yegorovich	1941	Elektrostal Town Court	30/10/06	02/04/08
54608/08	18/07/08	Dubovitskaya Nina Ivanovna	1938	Elektrostal Town Court	29/09/06	28/02/08
56037/08	21/10/08	Musatova Galina Ivanovna	1960	Voskresensk Town Court	12/09/06	22/04/08
56774/08	06/10/08	Pusep Viktor Vasilyevich	1952	Voskresensk Town Court	24/05/05	08/04/08
56778/08	06/09/08	Sidorova Tatyana Petrovna	1954	Elektrostal Town Court	19/10/06	20/03/08
56781/08	30/08/08	Romanova Tatyana Semenovna	1954	Elektrostal Town Court	03/10/06	13/03/08
56784/08	04/09/08	Zotova Tamara Yuryevna	1951	Voskresensk Town Court	10/08/06	04/03/08
56786/08	12/09/08	Chernikov Aleksey Grigoryevich	1955	Voskresensk Town Court	06/03/06	12/03/08
56789/08	09/09/08	Yamshchikova Lidiya Andriyanovna	1946	Elektrostal Town Court	18/10/06	26/03/08
56801/08	03/09/08	Sidorova Nadezhda Petrovna	1927	Elektrostal Town Court	20/11/06	28/03/08
56806/08	05/09/08	Tyuvayeva Nadezhda Vasilyevna	1954	Elektrostal Town Court	23/10/06	28/03/08
56813/08	03/09/08	Chernetskaya Polina Vasilyevna	1928	Elektrostal Town Court	16/08/06	14/03/08
56816/08	14/08/08	Chernomurov Yuriy Nikolayevich	1952	Elektrostal Town Court	13/09/06	18/02/08
56827/08	10/09/08	Tsybenko Liya Borisovna	1957	Elektrostal Town Court	15/11/06	03/04/08
56832/08	02/10/08	Kashtanova Tatyana Vladimirovna	1947	Elektrostal Town Court	25/10/06	07/06/08
56837/08	25/09/08	Yeliseyeva Galina Vasilyevna	1948	Elektrostal Town Court	05/10/06	10/04/08
58306/08	17/10/08	Akatova Lidiya Alekseyevna	1927	Elektrostal Town Court	31/07/06	31/03/08
58344/08	29/04/08	Vaskina Valentina Nikolayevna	1946	Elektrostal Town Court	31/05/06	06/11/07
59027/08	08/10/08	Gurova Olga Ivanovna	1956	Elektrostal Town Court	21/11/06	07/06/08
59599/08	25/09/08	Rogatin Vyacheslav Aleksandrovich	1955	Voskresensk Town Court	11/05/06	03/04/08
59626/08	30/08/08	Moskalenko Vladimir Vasilyevich	1948	Voskresensk Town Court	16/02/06	05/03/08
59628/08	01/09/08	Bulekov Pavel Fyodorovich	1930	Voskresensk Town Court	18/04/06	03/03/08
59698/08	16/08/08	Krylov Yuriy Vladimirovich	1949	Elektrostal Town Court	21/09/06	11/03/08
59699/08	20/09/08	Fomichev Nikolay Petrovich	1929	Voskresensk Town Court	05/08/05	26/03/08
59703/08	08/10/08	Sharova Larisa Vasilyevna	1947	Elektrostal Town Court	20/10/06	27/03/08
60036/08	22/11/08	Ivanova Nadezhda Vladimirovna	1955	Elektrostal Town Court	25/10/06	10/06/08
4507/09	19/11/08	Bakhireva Natalya Dmitriyevna	1956	Elektrostal Town Court	26/10/06	07/06/08